

A GUIDE TO THE WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT AND RELATED LITIGATION

By Renn C. Fowler & Robert D. L'Heureux

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I - INTRODUCTION

- I. BACKGROUND
- II. LEGISLATIVE HISTORY AND SOURCES OF LAW

CHAPTER II - OVERVIEW

- I. THE STATUTORY AND REGULATORY SCHEME
- II. JUDICIAL APPEALS
- III. COVERED AGENCY
- IV. COVERED POSITION
- V. COVERED PERSONNEL ACTIONS

CHAPTER III - OSC OPERATIONS

- I. OSC JURISDICTION
- II. OVERVIEW OF OSC OPERATIONS

CHAPTER IV - WHISTLEBLOWING

- I. THE DISCLOSURE—PROTECTED CONDUCT
 - A. Subject Matter of Disclosures
 - B. Violation of Law, Rule or Regulation
 - 1. Gross Mismanagement
 - 2. Gross Waste of Funds
 - 3. Abuse of Authority
 - 4. Public Health and Safety
 - C. Specificity Requirement
 - D. Reasonable Belief
 - E. Inside Disclosures
 - F. Outside Disclosures
 - G. "Any" Disclosure; Disclosures to the Wrongdoer; Job-Related Disclosures
 - 1. Job-Related Disclosures
 - H. Imputed Protected Conduct - Constructive Disclosures
- II. UNPROTECTED CONDUCT
 - A. Prohibited Disclosures
 - B. Actions Which are Not Disclosures
- III. PRACTICE TIPS
 - A. Checklist for Disclosures
- IV. ALTERNATIVE PROTECTIONS
 - A. Communications to Inspectors General
 - B. Communications Not Rising to the Level of Whistleblowing
 - C. Inspector General Act of 1978
 - D. Disclosures Contained in Grievances and Appeals
 - E. Dissent and Criticism
 - F. Environmental Disclosures

CHAPTER V - INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION

- I. STATUTORY BASIS
- II. THE INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION APPEAL
 - A. The OAA and the Elective IRA

1. The OAA
2. The Elective IRA
- III. THE EXHAUSTION REQUIREMENT
 - A. Exhaustion: An Overview
 - B. Same Theory/Basis Rule
 1. The Correct Label Rule
 2. The Demise of the Correct Label Rule
 - C. Scope of Review
 - D. Scope of Review and Elective IRAs
- IV. THE DEADLINES AND TIMELINESS
 - A. Statutory and Regulatory Provisions.
 - B. No Front-End Time Limits
 - C. Premature IRA Appeals
 - D. The 60-Day Time Limit is Not Subject to Waiver
 - E. OSC's Close-Out Letters
- V. CONTENT OF THE IRA APPEAL
- VI. STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS IN IRA APPEALS
 - A. The Statutory and Regulatory Requirements
 - B. Eligibility
 - C. When to File and the Exhaustion Requirement
 - D. Where and What to File, and the Agency Response
 1. The Stay Request
 2. The Agency Response
 3. The Advocacy of a Stay Request
 - E. The Administrative Judge's Ruling
 - F. The Criteria of Substantial Likelihood and Extreme Hardship
 - G. Duration and Enforcement of a Stay
 - H. Challenging a Stay Ruling
 - I. Stays and *Res Judicata*
 - J. Protective Orders
- VII. DISCOVERY
 - A. The Regulatory Basis for Discovery
 1. Subpoena Authority in IRA Appeals
 - B. The Importance of Discovery
 1. Scope of Discovery
 2. Discovery Tools
 3. Appellant's Discovery
 4. Agency Discovery
 5. Resolving Discovery Disputes
 - C. *McGrath*: the Board and IRA Discovery
 - D. Discovery and Jurisdiction: The Nonfrivolous Allegation of Jurisdiction
 - E. Discovery on Damages
 1. Requests for Rule 35 Exams
 - F. Discovery from OSC
- VIII. MOTION PRACTICE IN IRA APPEALS
 - A. The Advocacy and Mechanics of Motion Practice
 - B. Appellant's Jurisdictional Burden
 - C. Jurisdictional Checklist — the Elements of Protected Whistleblowing
 1. The Show Cause Order and the Motion to Dismiss
 2. Jurisdictional Challenges Based on Timeliness
 - D. Res Judicata, Collateral Estoppel
 - E. Other Motions

CHAPTER VI - CORRECTIVE AND DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS

- I. OSC DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS
 - A. Procedure

- B. Particularity Required
- C. Rights of Charged Employees
- D. The Answer to the OSC Complaint
- E. The Decision
- F. Penalties
- G. Appeal-Judicial Review
- H. The Elements of a Charge of Reprisal for Whistleblowing in a Disciplinary Action Complaint
 - 1. Proving Reprisal
 - 2. Proving the Sanction
 - 3. Examples of Penalties
- I. Practice Tips
 - 1. Checklist for Dealing with Disciplinary Actions
- II. OSC CORRECTIVE ACTIONS
 - A. Timeline
 - B. Complaint Contents
 - C. OSC Intake Procedures
 - 1. Notices
 - D. Screening
 - 1. Fast-Track Screening
 - 2. Communication with the Agency and Complainant
 - E. OSC Corrective Action
 - 1. The OSC Corrective Action Letter
 - 2. Agency Response
 - 3. OSC Petitions to the MSPB
 - 4. The Role of the Agency Representative in an OSC Corrective Action
 - 5. The Role of the Complainant's Representative

CHAPTER VII - OSC INVESTIGATIONS

- I. FIELD INVESTIGATION
 - A. Assignment and Notification
 - B. OSC's Investigatory Powers
 - C. OSC Contacts with the Complainant
 - D. OSC's Investigation at the Agency
 - E. Checklist for Agency Representative
 - F. On-Site investigations
 - 1. Witness Interviews
 - 2. Subject and Adverse Witness Interviews
 - 3. Subject/Witness Rights in OSC Investigations
 - 4. Agency Participation in OSC Investigation
 - G. OSC Closure Without Enforcement
 - 1. The Preliminary Determination
 - H. Responses to the Preliminary Determination
 - I. Settlement/ADR
 - 1. Corrective Action Cases
 - 2. Disciplinary Action Cases

CHAPTER VIII - OSC STAYS

- I. STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS
 - A. The Initial Stay
 - B. Additional Stays and the Agency's Input
- II. OSC PROCEDURE
- III. CHECKLIST FOR STAY OPPOSITION
- IV. INFORMAL STAYS
- V. PRACTICE TIPS
 - A. Agency Representatives
 - B. Complainant's Representatives

CHAPTER IX - BURDENS OF PROOF

- I. LEGISLATIVE PURPOSE
- II. APPELLANTS AND IRA APPEALS
 - A. The Burden of Proof
 1. Jurisdiction
 2. *Prima Facie* Case
 - B. The Standard of Proof
 - C. The Agency and Jurisdiction
- III. PROVING, DISPROVING JURISDICTION
 - A. The Administrative Judge's Show Cause Order
 - B. Nonfrivolous Allegations of Jurisdiction
 1. Nonfrivolous Allegations and the *Geyer* Elements
 2. Specificity and Documentation
 - C. The Role of the Administrative Judge and the Agency Submission
 - D. Covered Agency, Covered Position
 1. Covered Agencies
 2. Covered Positions
- IV. PROVING, DISPROVING OSC EXHAUSTION
 - A. Appellant's Burden and the Exhaustion Requirement
 1. Elective IRA Appeals
 - B. The Exhaustion Elements: Time and Substance
 1. Proceedings Have Been Exhausted
 2. Same Disclosure, Same Theory Rule
 3. Determining What was Alleged to OSC
 4. Proving and Disproving the OSC Complaint
- V. PROVING, DISPROVING PROTECTED CONDUCT
 - A. Nonfrivolous Allegations of Protected Conduct
 1. Allegations of Reasonable Belief
 - B. Nonfrivolous Allegations *vis-a-vis* 5 USC § 2302(b)(8)
 1. Gross Mismanagement, Gross Waste of Funds
 2. Violation of Any Law, Rule, or Regulation
 3. Abuse of Authority
 4. Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety
 - C. Reasonableness and the Necessity for a Hearing
 - D. The Test of Reasonable Belief
 - E. Proving, Disproving Job-Related Disclosures
- VI. PROVING, DISPROVING CAUSATION
 - A. Because of/Contributing Factor
 - B. Contributing Factor: Knowledge-Time Test
 - C. Improper Mixing of Burdens and Evidence: Contributing Factor, the Agency Defense
 1. The Agencies' Short-Lived "Totality of the Circumstances" Defense
 - D. The *Per Se* Knowledge/Timing Test
 1. The Time Component
 2. The Component of Actual and Constructive Knowledge
 3. Constructive Knowledge
 4. The Agency and the Knowledge/Timing Test
 - E. Proving and Disproving Causation Outside the Knowledge/Timing Test
 1. Circumstantial Evidence of Reprisal: Knowledge Plus
 2. Direct Evidence of Reprisal; Threats and Other Statements of Animus
- VII. PROVING/DISPROVING PRETEXT
 - A. Findings of Pretext
 1. Adverse Action
 2. Nonselection
 - B. Agency Investigations as Pretext
- VIII. THE AGENCY IN IRA APPEALS

- A. The Agency Defenses
 - 1. Direct Defenses
 - 2. No Jurisdiction
 - 3. Unprotected Disclosure
 - 4. Failure to Exhaust: Same Basis Rule
 - 5. The Merits: No Contributing Factor
 - 6. No Knowledge
 - 7. Too Much Time Between Personnel Action and Knowledge
- B. Affirmative Defense: Clear and Convincing
 - 1. The Clear and Convincing Standard
 - 2. The Merits of the Personnel Action are Not at Issue in an IRA Appeal
 - 3. Whether or Not the Agency Would Have Taken the Same Action in the Absence of Appellant's Disclosure
 - a. The Trilogy Criteria
 - b. Balancing Supporting Evidence and Retaliatory Motive
 - c. Comparative Evidence

CHAPTER X - DIRECT APPEALS

- I. OTHERWISE APPEALABLE ACTIONS
 - A. Election of Forums
 - B. Time for Filing
 - 1. No Front-End Time Period
 - 2. OAA Initiated with OSC Processed as OAA
 - C. Appellant's Appeal
 - D. The Agency's Underlying Personnel Action
- II. THE AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE AND REPRISAL FOR WHISTLEBLOWING
 - A. Representations of Whistleblowing as an Affirmative Defense: Appellant's Pleading Requirements
 - B. The Burdens in an Affirmative Defense of Whistleblowing
 - 1. The Burdens in a Postal Service Appeal
- III. THE AGENCY AND THE AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE
 - A. The Issue: Absent the Protected Disclosure, Would the Same Action Have Been Taken?
 - B. The Trilogy
 - 1. Strength of Supporting Evidence and Retaliatory Motive
 - a. Supporting Evidence
 - b. Retaliatory Motive
 - c. Balancing Motive and Supporting Evidence
 - d. Comparative Evidence
- IV. CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE
 - A. Board Jurisdiction Over Constructive Discharge Appeals
 - 1. The Interrelationship of Jurisdiction and the Merits in Constructive Discharge Appeals
 - B. Constructive Discharge Allegations and the Test of Involuntariness
 - C. Allegations of Reprisal
 - D. Constructive Discharge and Otherwise Appealable Actions
 - E. IRA Appeals and Constructive Discharges
- V. PRACTICE TIPS FOR AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES AND CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE CLAIMS
 - A. The Propriety of the Agency Action
 - B. The Proposing and Deciding Officials
 - C. The Appeal and MSPB
 - D. Ferreting Out the Affirmative Defenses
 - 1. Discovery and Affirmative Defenses

CHAPTER XI - REMEDIES

- I. NATURE OF CORRECTIVE ACTION
- II. INTERIM RELIEF
 - A. Undue Disruption

- B. Compliance
- C. Interim Relief in IRA Appeals
- III. MAKE WHOLE RELIEF
 - A. Back Pay
 - B. Clean Record
 - C. Restoration
- IV. CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES
 - A. Process and Procedure
 - B. Consequential Damages Defined
 - 1. Medical Costs Incurred; Future Expenses
 - C. Attorney Fees and Costs
 - D. 5 USC § 1214(g)
 - E. 5 USC § 7701(g)
 - F. 5 USC § 1204
 - G. Process and Procedure
 - H. Traditional Entitlement
 - I. Fees Under the WPA; Settlements
 - J. Prevailing Party
 - K. Fees, Expenses, and Costs Incurred
 - L. Reasonableness of Fees
- V. TRANSFER PREFERENCE
- VI. OTHER REMEDIES
- VII. REFERRAL TO OSC
- VIII. SETTLEMENT

APPENDIX

- 5 USC § 1212. Powers and Functions of the Office of Special Counsel
- 5 USC § 1213. Provisions Relating to Disclosures of Violations of Law, Gross Mismanagement, and Certain Other Matters
- 5 USC § 1214. Investigation of Prohibited Personnel Practices; Corrective Action
- 5 USC § 1215. Disciplinary Action
- 5 USC § 1221. Individual Right of Action in Certain Reprisal Cases
- 5 USC § 2302. Prohibited Personnel Practices
- 5 CFR Part 1209. Practices And Procedures For Appeals And Stay Requests Of Personnel Actions Allegedly Based On Whistleblowing
- 5 CFR § 1201 Spt. D. Procedures for Original Jurisdiction Cases
- 5 CFR Part 1800 Filing of Complaints and Allegations
- Form OSC-11
- Form OSC-12
- OSC POLICY STATEMENT: STAYS
- OSC Form Letters

TABLE OF CASES