

A GUIDE TO FEDERAL SECTOR LABOR ARBITRATION

2nd Edition

By Ernest C. Hadley

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION TO ARBITRATION

- I. THE CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ACT
- II. RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF LABOR ORGANIZATIONS
 - A. Covered Employees
 - 1. Supervisors and Managers
 - 2. Confidential Employees
 - 3. Personnel Employees
 - 4. Professional Employees
 - 5. National Security Employees
 - 6. Investigators and Auditors
 - 7. Military Employees
 - B. Agencies Covered
 - C. Collective Bargaining
 - D. Grievances and Arbitration
 - 1. Exclusivity of Remedies
 - 2. Election of Remedy
 - 3. Complaints of Discrimination
 - 4. Chapter 43 and 75 Actions
 - 5. Prohibited Personnel Practices
 - 6. Other Actions within MSPB Jurisdiction
 - 7. Postal Service Employees
 - 8. Excepted Service Employees
- III. RIGHTS AND DUTIES OF AGENCIES
 - A. Management Rights
 - B. Grievance and Arbitration Procedures
 - C. Management Duties
 - 1. Provision of Union Office Space
- IV. LABOR-MANAGEMENT RELATIONS

CHAPTER 2: GRIEVANCE AND ARBITRATION PROCEDURES

- I. THE GRIEVANCE AND ARBITRATION PROCESS
 - A. Federal Mediation and Conciliation Service
 - 1. Arbitrator Review Board
 - 2. Placement on Arbitration Roster
 - 3. Obtaining and Selecting Arbitrators

- 4. Conduct of Hearings
 - 5. Post–Hearing Procedures
 - B. American Arbitration Association
 - 1. Initiation of Arbitration
 - 2. Placement on Arbitration Roster
 - 3. Obtaining and Selecting Arbitrators
 - 4. Procedures following Appointment of Arbitrator
 - 5. Conduct of Hearings
 - 6. Post–Hearing Procedures
 - C. Expedited Arbitration
- II. PRELIMINARY ISSUES
 - A. Role of the Arbitrator
 - B. Procedural vs. Substantive Arbitrability
 - C. Pleading Requirements
 - 1. Management Requirements
 - 2. Right to Grieve
 - D. Waiver of Arbitration Rights
 - 1. Last Chance Settlements
 - E. Timeliness
 - 1. Determining Timeliness
 - 2. Waiving or Extending Time Limits
 - 3. Continuing and Recurring Violations
 - 4. Laches
 - F. Exhaustion of Grievance Process
 - G. Substantive Arbitrability
 - 1. Partial Resolution at Grievance Stage
 - 2. Mootness
 - 3. Examinations, Certifications and Appointments
 - 4. Classification Issues
 - 5. Multiple Grievances
 - 6. Laws, Rules and Regulations
 - 7. Unfair Labor Practices
 - H. Duty to Expedite
 - 1. Multiple Grievances

CHAPTER 3: RIGHT TO REPRESENTATION

- I. UNION AS EXCLUSIVE REPRESENTATIVE
 - A. Duty of Fair Representation
 - 1. Union Membership
 - 2. Other Discrimination
 - B. Agency Interference
 - 1. Designation of Representative
 - C. Disqualification of Representative
- II. UNION RIGHT TO BE PRESENT
 - A. Formal Discussions

1. Formality Requirement
2. Topic of Discussion
3. Waiver of Right to be Present
- B. Investigative Interviews
 1. Examination Requirement
 2. Employees Covered
 3. Agency Representative
 4. Reasonable Belief
 5. Request for Representation
 6. Nature of Representation
 7. Non–Union Representatives
- C. Negotiated Rights
- III. RIGHTS OF UNION REPRESENTATIVES
 - A. Protection from Reprisal
 - B. Official Time
 - C. Leave Time
- IV. ATTORNEYS AND OTHER REPRESENTATIVES
 - A. Disciplinary Actions
 - B. Performance Actions
 - C. Criminal Investigations—*Miranda* Rights
- V. MANAGEMENT RIGHT TO REPRESENTATION

CHAPTER 4: HEARINGS AND EVIDENCE

- I. PREHEARING PRACTICES AND PROCEDURES
 - A. Factual Investigation
 1. Union's Right to Information
 2. Employee's Right to Information
 - B. Discovery
 1. Methods of Discovery
 2. Subpoenas
 - C. Legal Research
 - D. Site of Hearing
 - E. Continuances and Delays
 1. *Ex Parte* Hearings
 - F. Hearing Preparation
 - G. Prehearing Conferences
- II. HEARING PRACTICE AND PROCEDURES
 - A. Conduct of Representatives
 - B. Rules of Evidence
 1. Hearsay
 2. Chain of Custody
 3. Observations of Arbitrator
 4. Settlement Discussions
 - C. Order of Presentation of Evidence
 1. Admission of Evidence

- D. Transcripts
- III. DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE
 - A. Documents as Corroborating Evidence
 - B. Post-Hoc Documents
 - C. Suppression of Illegally Obtained Evidence
 - D. Failure to Sign Statement
 - E. Introduction of Documents at Hearing
- IV. WITNESSES
 - A. Witness Lists
 - 1. Prehearing Conferences
 - B. Official Time
 - 1. Travel Expenses
 - C. Unavailability of Witnesses
 - 1. Failure to Produce
 - 2. Refusal of Witness to Testify
 - 3. Unavailability of Witness
 - D. Failure to Question Witness
 - E. Compelling Union Witness to Testify for Agency
 - F. Credibility of Witnesses
 - G. Limiting Testimony
- V. POST-HEARING PROCEDURES
 - A. Bench Decisions
 - B. Briefs
 - 1. Use of Public Documents

CHAPTER 5: STANDARDS OF ARBITRATION

- I. CONTRACT INTERPRETATION
 - A. Intent of Parties
 - B. Contract Language
 - 1. Dictionary Meanings
 - 2. Adverse Inference Against Proposing Party
 - 3. Adding Language through Interpretation
 - 4. Failure to Address Specific Time Frames
 - 5. Implied Exclusions
 - 6. Conflicting Provisions
 - 7. Conflict with Statute
 - 8. Discretionary vs. Mandatory Language
 - C. Incorporation by Reference
 - D. Interpreting Contract as a Whole
 - 1. Use of Other Provisions
 - E. Bargaining History
 - F. Past Practices
 - 1. Abandonment of Past Practice
 - G. Established Policies
 - H. Oral Agreements

- I. Parol Evidence
- J. Management Rights
 - 1. Management Operational Needs
 - 2. Ambiguous Contract Provisions
 - 3. Agreements to Bargain
 - 4. Promulgation of Rules and Regulations
 - 5. Unauthorized Acts
- K. Good Faith Misunderstanding of Provision
 - 1. No Meeting of Minds
- L. Effective Date of Contract
- M. Potential Breaches of Contract
- II. EFFECT OF STATUTES AND REGULATIONS
 - A. Effect of Statutes
 - 1. Interpreting Statutes
 - 2. Contracts Imposing Additional Requirements
 - B. Effect of Regulations
 - 1. OPM Interpretation of Regulations
 - 2. Federal Personnel Manual
 - C. Agency Interpretation of Regulations
 - 1. Future Regulations
 - 2. Agency Instructions
 - D. Absence of Law or Regulation
- III. APPLICATION OF LEGAL STANDARDS
 - A. Burdens of Proof
 - B. Decisions of Courts
 - C. Decisions of FLRA
 - D. Past Arbitration as Precedent
 - E. Harmless Error

CHAPTER 6: DISCIPLINE

- I. STATUTORY OVERVIEW
 - A. Suspensions Less Than 15 Days
 - B. Other Minor Disciplinary Actions
 - C. Major Adverse Actions
 - 1. Election of Remedies
 - 2. MSPB Standards Applicable to Arbitration
- II. JUST CAUSE CONCEPT
 - A. Burden of Proof
 - 1. Just Cause Factors
 - B. Notice of Charges
 - C. Failure to Follow Contract Provisions
 - 1. Counseling
 - 2. Delay in Imposing Discipline
 - D. Failure to Enforce Regulations
 - E. Off-Duty Misconduct

- F. Criminal Conduct
 - 1. Effect of Pleas
- G. Cancellation of Personnel Action
- III. SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES
 - A. Absence without Leave
 - 1. Sick Leave
 - 2. "Sick Outs"
 - 3. Annual Leave
 - B. Insubordination
 - 1. Work First, Grieve Later Rule
 - 2. Clarity of Order
 - 3. Oral Orders
 - 4. Mental Illness
 - 5. Immunity
 - 6. Warning of Discipline
 - 7. Union Officials
 - C. Profane Language
 - 1. Insulting and Derogatory Language
 - D. Falsification of Documents
 - 1. Negligent Falsification
 - 2. Employment Applications
 - E. False Statements during Investigation
 - F. Misuse of Vehicles
 - G. Alcohol and Drug-Related Offenses
 - H. Theft of Government Property
 - 1. Criminal Convictions
 - I. Threats
 - J. Fighting
- IV. MITIGATION OF PENALTIES
 - A. Application of Discipline
 - 1. The *Douglas* Factors
 - 2. The "Nexus" Requirement
 - 3. Seriousness of Offense
 - 4. Type of Employment
 - 5. Past Discipline
 - 6. Past Performance
 - 7. Length of Service
 - 8. Agency's Need for Discipline
 - 9. Consistency of Penalties
 - 10. Prior Warnings
 - 11. Reasons for Misconduct
 - 12. Provocation
 - 13. Timeliness of Discipline
 - B. Pending Grievances
 - C. Multiple Charges
 - D. Probationary Employees

CHAPTER 7: WORK PERFORMANCE

- I. STATUTORY OVERVIEW
 - A. Performance Appraisal Systems
 - B. Performance-based Personnel Actions
 - C. MSPB Appeal and Arbitration Rights
 - 1. MSPB Appeal Rights
 - 2. Grievance and Arbitration Rights
 - 3. EEO Complaints
- II. PERFORMANCE APPRAISALS
 - A. Performance Appraisal Process
 - B. Performance Appraisal Plans
 - 1. Standards of Appraisal Review
 - 2. Performance Standards
 - 3. Objectivity Requirement
 - 4. Absolute Standards
 - C. Performance Ratings
 - 1. Interim Performance Reviews
 - 2. Performance Counseling
 - 3. Performance Notes
 - 4. Rating Quotas
 - 5. Subjective Criteria
- III. PERFORMANCE-BASED PERSONNEL ACTIONS
 - A. Burden of Proof
 - 1. Communication of Standards
 - 2. Mitigation of Penalties
 - 3. Chapter 75 Performance Cases
 - B. Performance Improvement Plans
 - C. Performance on Detail
 - D. Within-Grade Increases
- IV. PERFORMANCE AWARDS
 - A. Standard of Review
 - B. Award Conditions and Amounts
 - 1. 100% Union Officials
 - C. Past Practices
- V. PROMOTIONS
 - A. Nonselection and Preselection
 - B. Selection Criteria
 - C. Training
 - D. Career Ladder Promotions
 - E. Rescission of Promotion
 - F. Selection for Non-Union Positions

CHAPTER 8: CONDITIONS OF EMPLOYMENT

- I. WORK HOURS
 - A. Fair Labor Standards Act
 - B. Sick Leave
 - 1. Medical Certificates
 - 2. Advanced Sick Leave
 - 3. Accommodation Efforts
 - C. Annual Leave
 - 1. Emergency Annual Leave
 - D. Administrative Leave
 - E. Enforced Leave
- II. PREMIUM PAY
 - A. Overtime
 - 1. Safety Dressing Time
 - 2. Work on Holidays
 - 3. Compensatory Time for Religious Purposes
 - 4. Employees under Investigation
 - 5. Breaks
 - B. Standby Time
 - C. Environmental Differential Pay
 - 1. Scientific Evidence
 - 2. Time Period Covered
 - D. Normal Duty
 - E. Travel Time
- III. POSITION CLASSIFICATION AND WORK DUTIES
 - A. Temporary Assignment of Higher Level Duties
 - B. Details
 - C. Assignments outside of Job Description
 - 1. Changes in Job Description
 - D. Reassignments
- IV. FITNESS FOR DUTY EXAMINATIONS
- V. REPRISAL FOR UNION ACTIVITY
 - A. Soliciting Union Membership
 - B. Protection for Witnesses
- VI. HEALTH AND SAFETY CONDITIONS
 - A. Alternative Remedies
 - B. Drug Testing
- VII. REDUCTIONS-IN-FORCE
 - A. Retention Standing
 - 1. Competitive Areas
 - 2. Competitive Levels
 - 3. Order of Retention
 - 4. Release and Assignment Rights
 - 5. Union Officials
 - 6. Appeal Rights
 - B. Replacement by Contract Workers
- VIII. EMPLOYEES' FREE SPEECH RIGHTS

- A. Dress Codes
- B. Libelous Statements
- IX. RECORDKEEPING ON EMPLOYEES

CHAPTER 9: DISCRIMINATION

- I. STATUTORY OVERVIEW
 - A. Forms of Discrimination
 - B. Election of Forum
- II. THEORIES OF DISCRIMINATION
 - A. The Theory of Intentional Discrimination
 - 1. Just Cause and Discrimination
 - 2. The *McDonnell Douglas* Analysis
 - 3. Rebutting a Finding of Discrimination
 - 4. Direct Evidence Cases
 - B. The Theory of Adverse Impact
 - 1. Bona Fide Occupational Requirements
 - C. Theory of Hostile Environment Harassment
 - D. Theory of Reasonable Accommodation
 - 1. Reassignment
 - 2. Religious Accommodation
- III. GRIEVANCES OVER EEO COMPLAINTS
 - A. Waiver of Prospective EEO Rights
 - B. Decisions of the EEOC
- IV. ADMINISTRATIVE DISCRIMINATION COMPLAINTS
 - A. Agency Processing of Complaints
 - 1. EEO Counselors and the Precomplaint Stage
 - 2. Notice of Final Interview
 - 3. Formal Complaints
 - 4. Investigations
 - 5. Hearing
 - 6. Decisions without a Hearing
 - 7. Final Decisions
 - 8. Appeal of Final Agency Decisions
 - 9. Requests for Reconsideration

CHAPTER 10: WHISTLEBLOWING COMPLAINTS by Eleanor Laws

- I. PROTECTED DISCLOSURES
 - A. Statutory Provision
- II. HISTORY OF WHISTLEBLOWING PROVISIONS
- III. AVENUES OF REDRESS
 - A. Office of Special Counsel
 - B. MSPB
 - 1. Actions within Board Jurisdiction
 - 2. Individual Right of Action

- C. Negotiated Grievance Process
- IV. ELECTION OF GRIEVANCE PROCEDURE
 - A. Statutory Provision
 - B. Election
 - 1. Exclusivity of Election
 - C. Disclosures in Grievance Process
- V. ELEMENTS OF WHISTLEBLOWING CLAIM
 - A. Protected Disclosure
 - 1. Definition
 - B. Reasonable Belief
 - 1. Content of Disclosure
 - C. Contributing Factor
 - 1. Knowledge/Timing Test
 - 2. Definition of Knowledge
 - 3. Timing
 - 4. Other Proof of Contributing Factor
- VI. AGENCY BURDEN OF PROOF
 - A. Clear and Convincing Evidence
 - B. Factors to Consider
- VII. ARBITRATOR'S REMEDIAL POWERS
 - A. Statutory Provision
 - 1. Effective Date of Statute
 - 2. Stay of Personnel Action
 - 3. MSPB Stay Regulations
 - 4. Contributing Factor
 - 5. Agency Burden
 - 6. Extreme Hardship
 - B. Back Pay
 - C. Consequential Damages
- VIII. DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS

CHAPTER 11: REMEDIES

- I. FASHIONING REMEDIES
 - A. Settlement Agreements
 - 1. Last Chance Agreements
 - B. Violations without Remedy
 - 1. Cease and Desist Orders
 - C. Back Pay
 - 1. Back Pay Act
 - 2. Reinstatement without Back Pay
 - 3. Overtime
 - 4. Interest
 - 5. Other Benefits
 - 6. Back Pay through Settlement
 - 7. Mitigation of Damages

- D. Conditional Awards
 - 1. Interim Awards
- E. Performance Appraisals
- F. Promotions
 - 1. Priority Consideration
 - 2. Other Remedies
- G. Disciplinary Relief
- II. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES
 - A. Statutory Authority
 - 1. Retroactivity
 - B. Types of Compensatory Damages
 - 1. Past Pecuniary Damages
 - 2. Future Pecuniary Damages
 - 3. Nonpecuniary Damages
 - C. Proof of Causation
 - D. Damages in Arbitration
 - 1. Authority to Award
- III. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES
 - A. Statutory Authority
 - B. Application of Liquidated Damages
- IV. ATTORNEY FEES
 - A. Time for Filing
 - B. Content of Filing
 - C. Prevailing Party Status
 - D. Attorney–Client Relationship
 - 1. Union Counsel
 - 2. Non–Attorney Representatives
 - E. Interest of Justice Standard
 - 1. Prohibited Personnel Practices
 - 2. Clearly without Merit
 - 3. Gross Procedural Error
 - 4. Substantially Innocent
 - F. Amount of Awards
 - 1. Private Counsel
 - 2. Union Counsel
 - G. Costs of Arbitration
 - 1. Litigation Costs

CHAPTER 12: REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS by Eleanor Laws

- I. FLRA REVIEW—EXCEPTIONS TO ARBITRATION AWARDS
 - A. Proper Parties
 - B. Time for Filing
 - 1. Waiver of Time Limits
 - C. Procedural Requirements
 - D. Opposition to Exceptions

- 1. Time for Filing
 - E. Standard of Review
 - 1. Contrary to Law, Rule or Regulation
 - 2. Grounds Similar to Private Sector Cases
 - F. Judicial Review of FLRA Decisions
- II. EMPLOYEE APPEAL RIGHTS—STATUTORY FRAMEWORK
- III. MIXED CASES
 - A. Merit Systems Protection Board
 - 1. Time for Filing Appeal
 - 2. Contents of Appeal
 - 3. Standard and Scope of Review
 - 4. Timing of Discrimination Allegation
 - 5. Evidentiary Support for Allegation
 - B. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission
 - 1. Exhaustion of Board Remedies
 - 2. Time for Seeking Review
 - 3. Method of Filing
 - 4. Standard and Scope of Review
 - 5. Timing of Discrimination Allegation
 - C. Resolution of MSPB/EEOC Disputes
 - 1. Special Panel Cases
 - D. Judicial Review of Mixed Cases
 - 1. Time Limits
 - 2. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies
 - 3. Standard of Review
 - 4. Appeals from District Court
 - 5. Jurisdictional Issues
 - 6. Procedural Matters
 - 7. Discrimination Claims Abandoned
- IV. PURE DISCRIMINATION CASES
 - A. Time Limit
 - B. Scope of Review
 - C. Standard of Review
 - D. EEOC Reconsideration
 - E. Judicial Review
 - 1. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies
 - 2. Time Limit
 - 3. Standard of Review
 - F. Appeal of District Court Decisions
- V. EEOC REVIEW OF FLRA DECISIONS
 - A. Time Limits
 - B. Scope of Review
 - C. Standard of Review
 - D. Requests for Reconsideration
 - E. Judicial Review
- VI. PERFORMANCE AND MISCONDUCT CASES

- A. Time Limits
 - B. Scope of Review
 - C. Standard of Review
 - 1. Error of Law—Board Principles
 - 2. Not Supported by Substantial Evidence
- VII. OFFICE OF PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT APPEALS
- A. Reconsideration with Arbitrator
 - 1. Time Limits
 - 2. Reconsideration on Merits
 - B. Judicial Review
 - 1. Time Limits
 - 2. Discretionary Review