

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	1
CHAPTER 2: THE CIVIL SERVICE REFORM ACT: WHERE DID IT COME FROM AND WHAT DOES IT DO.....	3
I. MERIT SYSTEMS PROTECTION BOARD	4
II. FEDERAL LABOR RELATIONS AUTHORITY	5
III. GRIEVANCE-ARBITRATION.....	5
IV. OFFICE OF PERSONNEL MANAGEMENT	6
V. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL (OSC)	7
VI. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION EEOC	7
CHAPTER 3: ADVERSE ACTIONS—THE STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS	9
I. CONDUCT OR PERFORMANCE?	9
II. NONDISCIPLINARY ACTIONS UNDER CHAPTER 75.....	9
III. ADVERSE ACTIONS: DEFINED AND DISTINGUISHED	10
A. THE “BOLLING CRITERIA”	10
IV. ADVERSE ACTIONS: THE LEGAL AND REGULATORY FRAMEWORK	11
V. ADVERSE ACTIONS: THE STATUTORY OUTLINE	12
VI. ADVERSE ACTIONS: GOVERNMENT-WIDE REGULATIONS	12
VII: ADVERSE ACTIONS: THE CONSTITUTIONAL RESTRICTIONS	13
VIII. COVERED ACTIONS AND EMPLOYEES.....	16
A. COVERED EMPLOYEES	17
B. THE ELECTION OF REMEDIES FOR COVERED BARGAINING UNIT EMPLOYEES	22
C. EMPLOYEES WITHOUT APPEAL RIGHTS	23
D. POSSIBLE CHALLENGES BY EMPLOYEES WHO LACK ORDINARY MSPB APPEAL RIGHTS	25
E. APPEALABLE ACTIONS TO THE MSPB AND EXCLUSIONS	26
1. MSPB-Covered Actions and Definitions.....	28
a. Removals	28
b. Suspensions for More Than 14 Days.....	29
(i) A Troublesome Issue: Is it One Appealable Suspension or Two or More Unappealable Suspensions.....	29
(ii) The Long Suspension	30

c.	Reduction in Grade or Pay.....	30
d.	Furlough.....	31
e.	Constructive Adverse Actions: MSPB-Covered Actions in Disguise—Some Threshold Concerns.....	32
(i)	Constructive Removals	33
(ii)	Constructive Suspensions; Enforced Leave	40
(iii)	Constructive Demotions.....	42
f.	Indefinite Suspensions	44
(i)	Notice Considerations	45
(ii)	Other Factors	45
(iii)	The Three Covered Situations.....	46
g.	Enforced Leave	54
IX.	THE PROOF REQUIREMENTS OF AN ADVERSE ACTION: CHARGE; NEXUS; PENALTY	55
A.	THE REASON FOR THE ADVERSE ACTION.....	56
B.	NEXUS	56
C.	PENALTY REASONABLENESS	63
X.	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES	67
A.	HARMFUL PROCEDURAL ERROR.....	67
B.	PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES	68
1.	Prohibited Discrimination.....	69
2.	Whistleblower Reprisal	72
C.	DUE PROCESS.....	76

CHAPTER 4: ADVERSE ACTIONS—THE AGENCY’S ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS 81

I.	THE FUNDAMENTALS OF THE ADVERSE ACTION PROCESS	81
A.	INVESTIGATION: FACT-FINDING DRIVES EVERYTHING	82
1.	Agency Informal Investigations.....	83
2.	Management Inquiries and Administrative Investigations	83
3.	Privacy Act Restraints on Agency Investigations.....	84
4.	Agency Warnings and the Duty to Cooperate and Respond in an Agency Investigation; Some Situations Require Specific Care	86
5.	Right to Representation in Inquiry or Investigation.....	91
a.	Right to Representation in IG Investigations.....	92
6.	Workplace Searches	92
7.	Reporting Requirements and False Statements in Inquiries or Investigations.....	94
B.	CHARGES: THE MOST IMPORTANT THING.....	95
1.	Cause as Will Promote Service Efficiency is the Sole “Statutory Charge”	95
2.	The Three Parts of a Charge.....	95
a.	The Label	96
b.	The Elements.....	96
c.	The Specification	96
3.	Structuring the Charge	97

4.	The Rules of Charging	97
5.	Notice: The Statutory Requirement.....	97
6.	The Golden Rule: The Rule Against Splitting	98
	a. Distinguishing Between Charges and Factual Narrative.....	98
7.	The Three Kinds of Charges.....	99
	a. The Specific Label Charge	99
	b. The Generic Charge	99
	c. The Narrative Charge	100
	d. Narrative and General Charges v. Specific Label Charges	101
8.	The Use of Alternative, Easier-to-Prove Charges	102
9.	A Few Key Charges	102
10.	The Complexity of Charging Revisited: Words Matter.....	104
11.	Keys to Picking the Right Charge	105
12.	Charge Framing Snafus: 11 Deadly Sins	105
C.	THE PROPOSAL: THE MOST IMPORTANT DOCUMENT	106
	1. Thirty Days Advance Notice; Seven Days to Respond.....	106
	a. Collapsing the Notice Period Under the Crime Provision.....	107
	(i) Reasonable Cause	108
	b. Indefinite Suspensions and the Crime Provision	108
	2. Status During Notice Period.....	109
	3. Content and Substance of the Proposal Notice.....	110
	a. The Specific Reasons and the Adequacy of Notice	110
	b. Amendments of the Proposal.....	111
	c. Nexus in the Proposal	112
	d. Penalty in the Proposal.....	112
	e. Material Relied Upon and the Proposal Notice.....	114
	f. Oral or Written Response.....	115
	g. Proposal Checklist	115
	4. Role of the Proposing Official.....	116
D.	RESPONSE PHASE: THE MOST IMPORTANT ENTITLEMENT	116
	1. The Operation of the Reply Process	118
	a. The Reply Official.....	118
	b. Scope of the Reply	119
	(i) Record of the Response	120
	c. Additional or Supplemental Investigation	120
E.	THE FINAL DECISION	121
	1. The Importance of the Final Decision.....	121
	2. The Regulatory Requirements.....	122
	3. The Final Decision and the Agency Charge(s).....	122
	a. The Final Decision and Lesser-Included Offenses	125
	b. The Final Decision and Prior Misconduct.....	125
	c. Amendment or Rescission	125
	4. The Final Decision and the Agency Penalty	126
	a. Penalty Advocacy and the Final Decision.....	130
	(i) The Essential Factors.....	130
	(ii) <i>Douglas</i> Factor Worksheet	131
	5. The Deciding Official	132
	a. Too Much Deciding Official Involvement	133

b.	<i>Ex parte</i> Contacts	133
c.	The Danger in Changing the Deciding Official.....	135
6.	Other Mistakes	137
F.	THE SHORT SUSPENSION	138

CHAPTER 5: PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS..... 141

I.	CHAPTER 43 AND 5 CFR, PART 432— THE IMPORTANT TERMS AND DEFINITIONS	141
II.	EMPLOYEES COVERED	143
III.	PROCEDURAL RIGHTS	143
IV.	THE SUBSTANTIVE RIGHTS (OR WHAT THE AGENCY MUST PROVE IN A CHAPTER 43 ACTION)	146
A.	WHETHER OPM APPROVED THE AGENCY'S PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM.....	147
B.	WHETHER THE AGENCY COMMUNICATED TO THE APPELLANT THE PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AND CRITICAL ELEMENTS OF THE POSITION	150
C.	WHETHER THE APPELLANT'S PERFORMANCE STANDARDS ARE VALID UNDER 5 USC § 4302(B)(1)	150
1.	Objective Standards.....	151
a.	The Nature of the Job.....	152
b.	The Level at Which a Standard is Written.....	152
c.	The Problem With "Backwards" Standards.....	153
d.	"Fleshing Out" Standards That Are Inadequately Written.....	154
2.	Realistic Standards.....	156
a.	Absolute Standards.....	156
b.	Unattainable Standards	158
D.	WHETHER THE AGENCY WARNED THE APPELLANT OF THE INADEQUACIES OF HIS OR HER PERFORMANCE DURING THE APPRAISAL PERIOD AND GAVE HIM OR HER A REASONABLE OPPORTUNITY TO DEMONSTRATE ACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE	161
E.	WHETHER THE APPELLANT'S PERFORMANCE REMAINED UNACCEPTABLE IN ONE OR MORE OF THE CRITICAL ELEMENTS FOR WHICH HE OF SHE WAS PROVIDED AN OPPORTUNITY TO DEMONSTRATE ACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE	165
1.	Reliance on Subelements.....	165
2.	Reliance on Evidence Outside the PIP and the Roller Coaster Employee	166
3.	Evidentiary Considerations	167
V.	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES	169
VI.	CHAPTER 43 OR CHAPTER 75?	171
VII.	SES EMPLOYEES	176

CHAPTER 6: PERFORMANCE-BASED ACTIONS: THE AGENCY’S ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS.....	181
I. A PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM APPROVED BY OPM.....	181
II. ESTABLISHMENT OF PERFORMANCE STANDARDS AND CRITICAL ELEMENTS AND COMMUNICATION OF THOSE TO THE EMPLOYEE.....	182
A. EMPLOYEE PARTICIPATION	182
B. ESTABLISHMENT OF STANDARDS.....	184
III. COMMUNICATION OF PERFORMANCE STANDARDS TO EMPLOYEES	185
IV. THE AGENCY HAS WARNED THE APPELLANT OF THE INADEQUACIES OF HIS PERFORMANCE DURING THE APPRAISAL PERIOD AND GIVEN THE EMPLOYEE A REASONABLE OPPORTUNITY TO DEMONSTRATE ACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE	186
A. CHAPTER 75 VERSUS CHAPTER 43.....	186
B. NOTIFICATION OF UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE.....	189
C. THE PIP ITSELF	189
V. ISSUANCE OF A PROPOSAL, THE EMPLOYEE’S REPLY AND THE AGENCY DECISION	192
A. THE PROPOSAL.....	192
B. THE EMPLOYEE’S REPLY	193
C. AGENCY DECISION.....	194
VI. THE POST-DECISION PROCESS.....	194
APPENDIX 1: SAMPLE OPPORTUNITY NOTICE—EXAMPLE ONE	195
APPENDIX 2: SAMPLE OPPORTUNITY NOTICE—EXAMPLE TWO.....	199
APPENDIX 3: SAMPLE PROPOSAL NOTICE	203
APPENDIX 4: SAMPLE DECISION NOTICE	207