

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND SCOPE	1
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. OTHER STATUTES PROVIDING WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION.....	2
III. USEFUL MSPB AND OSC REPORTS ON WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION.....	3
IV. HOW THIS BOOK IS ORGANIZED.....	3
CHAPTER 2: OVERVIEW.....	5
I. INITIAL EFFORTS TO PROTECT FEDERAL EMPLOYEES.....	5
II. THE CSRA.....	5
III. THE WPA OF 1989.....	6
IV. THE 1994 AMENDMENTS.....	8
V. WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT ACT OF 2012 (WPEA).....	9
VI. THE NO FEAR ACT	12
CHAPTER 3: OSC OPERATIONS.....	13
I. OSC RESPONSIBILITIES AND JURISDICTION	13
II. OSC OPERATIONS.....	14
III. COMPLAINTS, DISCLOSURES, AND REFERRALS	15
A. PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE COMPLAINTS.....	15
B. REFERRALS FROM MSPB	19
C. OSC <i>SUA SPONTE</i>	19
D. PROCESSING PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE COMPLAINTS (E.G., REPRISAL FOR WHISTLEBLOWING)	19
1. The OSC Statutory Framework for Processing and Investigating PPP Complaints.....	20
2. The Complaint, Investigatory Process and IRAs.....	22
3. ADR, Mediation	23
4. Investigating Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaints.....	24
a. Initial IPD Contacts	26
(i) OSC-54	26
(ii) Initial Assessment.....	27
(iii) Initial Discussion and Confidentiality.....	27
(iv) Initial Agency Contact and Agency Liaisons.....	27
b. The OSC Investigation and the Complainant: What to Do; What to Anticipate	28
c. The OSC Investigation and the Agency: What to Do; What to Anticipate.....	29
d. Agency Preparation for IPD Investigation.....	29
e. IPD Interviews of Agency Witnesses	30
f. Subject and Adverse Witness Interviews.....	33
g. Subject and Witness Rights in OSC Investigations.....	33
h. Closing the Investigation	34
(i) The Preliminary Determination	34
i. The IPD Decision to Go Forward.....	34
E. WHISTLEBLOWER DISCLOSURES TO OSC	34
1. Processing Whistleblower Disclosures	38
CHAPTER 4: OSC AND THE MSPB—CORRECTIVE AND DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS	47
I. CORRECTIVE, DISCIPLINARY AND OTHER OSC ACTION GENERALLY.....	47
A. CORRECTIVE ACTIONS.....	47
B. DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS.....	51
1. When the Agency Takes Disciplinary Action.....	51
a. The Complaint.....	52
b. The Rights and Entitlements of the Charged Official and the Answer	53
3. Sanctions Against the Charged Official	54
4. Discovery.....	54
5. OSC’s Burden of Proof.....	55
a. Element One: Authority of the Charged Official.....	56

b.	Element Two: Whether the Aggrieved Employee Made a Protected Disclosure	56
c.	Element Three: Charged Official's Misuse of Authority	56
d.	Element Four: Nexus	57
6.	The Penalty	57
II.	OSC (AND AGENCY ADVERSE ACTIONS) WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL CASES	59

CHAPTER 5: MSPB PROCESSING OF INDIVIDUALS' REPRISAL AND OTHER PROTECTED ACTIVITY CLAIMS—OAS AND IRAS61

I.	IRAS AND OAS	61
II.	SOME HISTORY	61
III.	THE OAA	62
IV.	THE IRA	62
A.	COVERED EMPLOYEES AND AGENCIES	63
B.	COVERED PERSONNEL ACTIONS	64
1.	Stays	65
2.	Time and Exhaustion	65
3.	No Front-End Time Requirement	66
4.	Premature IRAs	66
C.	THE CONTENTS OF THE OSC COMPLAINT	66
1.	The Adequate Basis Rule	66
D.	SOME UNIQUE ASPECTS OF AN IRA ACTION AT THE MSPB	67
1.	The Content of the IRA Appeal	67
2.	Appellant's Jurisdictional Burden and the Pure IRA: Nonfrivolous Allegations	69
E.	THE MERITS HEARING	70

CHAPTER 6: WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL CLAIMS AND THE ELECTION OF A REMEDY ..73

I.	AN ELECTION MUST BE KNOWING AND INFORMED	73
II.	A VALID ELECTION WILL LIMIT THE APPELLANT TO CERTAIN ISSUES	74
III.	HOW IS IT DETERMINED AS TO WHICH PROCESS IS ELECTED	74
IV.	WHAT ABOUT THE ADMINISTRATIVE GRIEVANCE PROCESS?	74
V.	THE NATURE OF THE PERSONNEL ACTION AND NOT WHETHER THE TERM "REPRISAL" OR "PROHIBITED PERSONNEL ACTION" IS USED DETERMINES WHETHER AN ELECTION HAS BEEN MADE	74

CHAPTER 7: STAYS75

I.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY GUIDANCE FOR INDIVIDUAL-APPELLANT STAYS	75
II.	A CLOSER SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT APPELLANT STAY REQUESTS	79
A.	WHO MAY REQUEST A STAY	79
B.	WHEN TO FILE	79
C.	WHERE TO FILE	81
D.	HOW TO FILE	81
E.	WHAT TO FILE: THE GROUNDS FOR A STAY	81
F.	THE AGENCY RESPONSE	82
G.	STAY RULINGS: THE PROCEDURAL REQUIREMENTS	82
H.	STAY RULINGS: THE MERITS; GROUNDS FOR A STAY; THE ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK	82
I.	STAY DURATION; INTERIM COMPLIANCE	86
J.	CHALLENGING A STAY: BOARD REVIEW	86
III.	OSC STAY REQUESTS	88
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY GUIDANCE FOR OSC STAYS	88
B.	OSC STAY REQUESTS: SUM AND SUBSTANCE	92
C.	THE INITIAL STAY	92
D.	STAY EXTENSIONS; AGENCY OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT	93
E.	OSC STAY ACTIVITY	94
F.	THE ADVOCACY AND TACTICS IN STAY LITIGATION	94

CHAPTER 8: ELEMENTS OF A REPRISAL CLAIM MADE BY EMPLOYEES OR APPLICANTS—A PRIMER97

I.	IRAS AND OAS	97
II.	COVERED IRA EMPLOYEES OR APPLICANTS	98

III.	THE COMMON ELEMENTS—PROTECTED DISCLOSURE, RETALIATORY RESULT	99
A.	ELEMENT (1)—A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE UNDER (B)(8) OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY UNDER (B)(9)	101
1.	5 USC 2302(b)(8).....	101
2.	5 USC 2302(b)(9).....	102
B.	ELEMENT (2)—THE CONNECTION BETWEEN THE DISCLOSURE OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY AND THE PERSONNEL ACTION.....	102
IV.	IRA FILING REQUIREMENTS AND EXHAUSTION—ELEMENTS (3) AND (4).....	105
A.	CASES ABOUT EXHAUSTION AND FILING	105
V.	AGENCY BURDEN—“CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE”	106

CHAPTER 9: A CLOSER LOOK AT THE ELEMENTS: PROTECTED DISCLOSURES AND PROTECTED ACTIVITY107

I.	THE FIRST ELEMENT—A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE.....	108
A.	CATEGORIES OF WHISTLEBLOWING	108
B.	NON FRIVOLOUS ALLEGATIONS.....	108
II.	THE REASONABLE BELIEF STANDARD	110
A.	ALLEGATIONS MUST BE DETAILED AND SPECIFIC.....	110
B.	FAILURE TO SEEK CLARIFICATION	111
C.	BELIEF SHARED BY OTHER EMPLOYEES.....	111
D.	EMPLOYEE’S RELIANCE ON REPORTS OF THOSE WHO ARE IN A POSITION TO KNOW	112
E.	EXPERTISE OR PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE OF WHISTLEBLOWER.....	112
1.	Cases Involving the Whistleblower’s Expertise or Personal Knowledge	112
F.	RESPONSE BY AGENCY TO DISCLOSURE	113
G.	RELIANCE ON HEARSAY OR RUMOR	113
H.	A SPECULATIVE BELIEF	114
I.	SPECIFIC CONDITION OF THE EMPLOYEE.....	114
J.	KNOWLEDGE AT TIME OF DISCLOSURE	114
K.	MOTIVATION IS NOT RELEVANT	114
III.	THE CATEGORIES OF WRONGDOING	115
A.	ANY VIOLATION OF ANY LAW, RULE, OR REGULATION	115
1.	Cases Involving “Violation of Any Law, Rule or Regulation” Claims	117
B.	ABUSE OF AUTHORITY.....	119
1.	Cases That Have Ruled on the “Abuse of Authority” Standard.....	120
C.	GROSS MISMANAGEMENT OR GROSS WASTE OF FUNDS	123
1.	Two Separate Categories but Substantial Similarities	123
2.	Debatable Differences Exception.....	124
3.	Recent Debatable Differences Cases Following the WPEA	126
3.	Gross Waste of Funds and Gross Mismanagement Cases.....	128
D.	A SUBSTANTIAL AND SPECIFIC DANGER TO PUBLIC HEALTH OR SAFETY	130
1.	Cases Involving “Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety” Disclosures	133
2.	Cases in Which Appellants Were Not Successful in Proving a Reasonable Belief as to a Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety Claim.....	134
IV.	PROTECTION WITHOUT A DISCLOSURE.....	134
A.	PERCEIVED WHISTLEBLOWER.....	134
B.	ASSOCIATION WITH A WHISTLEBLOWER	136

CHAPTER 10: WHEN A DISCLOSURE IS NOT A DISCLOSURE139

I.	PROHIBITED BY LAW OR EXECUTIVE ORDER.....	139
II.	DISCLOSURES OF INFORMATION IN THE “NORMAL COURSE OF DUTIES”	141

CHAPTER 11: OTHER ASPECTS OF A PRIMA FACIE CASE: A PERSONNEL ACTION AND A CONTRIBUTING FACTOR143

I.	WHETHER THE AGENCY, BASED ON A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE, TOOK, FAILED TO TAKE, OR THREATENED TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION.....	144
A.	A PERSONNEL ACTION	144
B.	CASES INVOLVING PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	145
1.	The Broader Categories of Personnel Actions: 5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(ix) and (xii).....	145

a.	Cases Involving “Decisions Concerning Pay, Benefits, or Awards, or Concerning Education or Training If the Education or Training May Reasonably Be Expected to Lead to an Appointment, Promotion, Performance Evaluation, or Other Action Described”—5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(ix)	145
b.	Cases Involving “Any Other Significant Change in Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions”—5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(xii)	146
2.	Other Cases Involving Actions Qualifying as “Personnel Actions”	146
3.	Other Cases Involving Actions Not Qualifying As “Personnel Actions”	148
C.	THE NEWEST “PERSONNEL ACTION”: NONDISCLOSURE REQUIREMENTS	148
D.	SECURITY CLEARANCE ACTIONS NOT COVERED AS PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	149
E.	FAILURE TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION	149
F.	THREATENING TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION.....	149
G.	CONTRIBUTING FACTOR (WHETHER THE PERSONNEL ACTION WAS “BASED ON” A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE)..	151
1.	Knowledge/Timing Test.....	152
a.	Timing	152
(i)	Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Met.....	152
(ii)	Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Not Met	154
b.	Knowledge	154
2.	Other Ways to Prove a Contributing Factor	155

CHAPTER 12: THE AGENCY’S BURDEN: IT WOULD HAVE TAKEN THE ACTION IN THE ABSENCE OF WHISTLEBLOWING OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY157

I.	CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE.....	157
A.	THE CARR FACTORS, BRIEFLY.....	157
B.	ANALYZING THE AGENCY’S BURDEN: <i>WHITMORE</i>	157
II.	THE CARR FACTORS ANALYSIS	159
A.	CARR FACTOR ONE: THE STRENGTH OF THE AGENCY’S EVIDENCE IN SUPPORT OF ITS PERSONNEL ACTION....	159
B.	CARR FACTOR TWO: THE EXISTENCE AND STRENGTH OF ANY MOTIVE TO RETALIATE ON THE PART OF THE AGENCY OFFICIALS WHO WERE INVOLVED IN THE DECISION	160
1.	Cases Illustrating Considerations in Determining Motive.....	160
C.	CARR FACTOR THREE: ANY EVIDENCE THAT THE AGENCY TAKES SIMILAR ACTIONS AGAINST EMPLOYEES WHO ARE NOT WHISTLEBLOWERS, BUT WHO ARE OTHERWISE SIMILARLY SITUATED	161
III.	CASES INVOLVING CLEAR AND CONVINCING DETERMINATION.....	162

CHAPTER 13: REMEDIES, DAMAGES, AND RELIEF169

I.	CORRECTIVE ACTION, IN GENERAL.....	169
II.	TRANSFER PREFERENCE	170
III.	ATTORNEY FEES	171
IV.	MAKE WHOLE RELIEF	175
V.	COMPENSATORY AND CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES.....	175
A.	PROCESS, PROCEDURE.....	180
B.	BOARD CASE LAW ON CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES	182
VI.	INTERIM RELIEF	187

CHAPTER 14: ADMINISTRATIVE AND JUDICIAL REVIEW191

I.	PETITIONS FOR REVIEW	192
II.	JUDICIAL REVIEW	195
A.	REVIEW OF IRAS OR OAAS	196
B.	REVIEW OF MSPB DECISIONS ON OSC DISCIPLINARY AND CORRECTIVE ACTIONS.....	197
1.	Disciplinary Actions.....	197
2.	Corrective Actions.....	197
III.	REVIEW OF AN ARBITRATOR’S DECISION ON A WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY CLAIM.....	197

CHAPTER 15: NATIONAL SECURITY EMPLOYEES: THE PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE PROTECTING EMPLOYEES WITH ACCESS TO CLASSIFIED INFORMATION199

I.	STATUTORY EXCLUSIONS.....	199
II.	THE MODEST EXCEPTION	199
III.	PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE, PPD.....	199

A.	THE IMPORTANT DEFINITIONS.....	200
1.	Covered Employees and “Intelligence Community Element”	200
2.	Personnel Action	200
3.	Protected Disclosure	200
B.	PROHIBITED RETALIATION IN THE INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY	200
C.	PROHIBITED RETALIATION AFFECTING ELIGIBILITY FOR ACCESS TO CLASSIFIED INFORMATION	201
D.	IG EXTERNAL REVIEW PANEL	201
E.	ISSUANCE OF POLICIES AND PROCEDURES AND NOTICE TO EMPLOYEES	202
F.	REVIEW OF REGULATIONS IMPLEMENTING 5 USC 2303.....	202
G.	GENERAL PROVISIONS.....	202
IV.	OTHER DOD INTELLIGENCE EMPLOYEES.....	202
V.	INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT (ICWPA)	202
APPENDIX 1: 5 USC 1201–1222		203
APPENDIX 2: 5 USC 2301, 2302, 2304, AND 7703.....		223
APPENDIX 3: 5 CFR 1201—PRACTICES AND PROCEDURES.....		229
APPENDIX 4: 5 CFR 1209—PRACTICES AND PROCEDURES FOR APPEALS AND STAY REQUESTS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS ALLEGEDLY BASED ON WHISTLEBLOWING.....		273
APPENDIX 5: 5 CFR 1800—FILING OF COMPLAINTS AND ALLEGATIONS		279
APPENDIX 6: WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT ACT OF 2012.....		283
APPENDIX 7: PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE – PPD-19		295
APPENDIX 8: OSC FORMS AND GUIDANCE		303
A.	OSC-11—COMPLAINT OF POSSIBLE PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE OR OTHER PROHIBITED ACTIVITY AND OSC-11A—COMPLAINTS ALLEGING REPRISAL FOR WHISTLEBLOWING: ADDITIONAL DISCLOSURE AND PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	305
B.	OSC-12—INFORMATION ABOUT FILING A WHISTLEBLOWER DISCLOSURE WITH THE OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL.....	321
C.	OSC NOTICE: POLICY STATEMENT ON PERSONAL LEGAL REPRESENTATION AT INTERVIEWS.....	329
D.	OSC-53—HOW YOUR COMPLAINT WILL BE PROCESSED BY THE OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL	331
E.	OSC-54 — WHAT TO EXPECT WHEN YOUR COMPLAINT IS REFERRED FOR FURTHER INVESTIGATION	333
F.	YOUR ROLE IN AN OSC INVESTIGATION	335
G.	OSC-49—POLICY STATEMENT ON DISCLOSURE OF INFORMATION ABOUT PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE COMPLAINTS	337
H.	OSC POLICY STATEMENT ON STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS	341
I.	GUIDANCE FOR SUBMISSION OF AGENCY REPORT TO OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL (OSC) PURSUANT TO 5 USC § 1213(C).....	343
J.	OSC FACT SHEET—HOW COMPLAINTS ARE RECEIVED AND PROCESSED	347
TABLE OF CASES.....		349