

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	13
AGE DISCRIMINATION	15
ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION.....	31
ATTORNEY FEES	33
CLASS ACTIONS	77
COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	93
CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES: EMPLOYMENT RELATED	197
CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE/RETIREMENT	199
COURT PROCEDURES AND ISSUES	207
DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION	211
DISCIPLINE.....	401
DISPARATE IMPACT	407
EEO INVESTIGATIONS.....	413
EEOC APPELLATE REVIEW	425
EQUAL PAY ACT	429
EVIDENCE.....	435
GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEES RIGHTS ACT OF 1991	451
HARASSMENT (NOT SEXUAL).....	453
HEARINGS (EEOC) AND AJ AUTHORITY	493
INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS	533
LABOR-RELATIONS AND EEO	551
LAWS, REGULATIONS,AND GUIDANCE	553
LEGITIMATE NONDISCRIMINATORY REASONS (INADEQUACY OF)	563
MIXED CASES	573
NATIONAL ORIGIN DISCRIMINATION	585
NONSELECTION CLAIMS	591
OFFICIAL TIME.....	629
PERFORMANCE-RELATED CASES	633
PROCEDURES	635
RACE DISCRIMINATION	725
RELIGIOUS DISCRIMINATION	741
REMEDIES AND OTHER RELIEF	755
REPRESENTATION	793
REPRISAL/RETALIATION.....	795
SECURITY CLEARANCES AND STATE SECRETS	855
SETTLEMENT	859
SEX (GENDER) DISCRIMINATION	903
SEXUAL HARASSMENT	925
SEXUAL ORIENTATION	963
SUMMARY JUDGMENT	965
TIMELINESS	1005
TABLE OF CASES.....	1053
INDEX	1095

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
I. HOW TO USE THIS BOOK.....	1
A. LEGEND FOR CASE CITATIONS	1
B. TERMS OF REFERENCE	1
II. SUMMARY OF RECENT TRENDS IN THE LAW	2
A. AGE DISCRIMINATION	2
B. ATTORNEY FEES	2
C. CLASS ACTIONS	3
D. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	3
E. DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION.....	5
F. EEO INVESTIGATIONS	6
G. EQUAL PAY ACT.....	6
H. EVIDENCE.....	6
I. HEARINGS (EEOC) AND AJ AUTHORITY	6
J. LEGITIMATE NONDISCRIMINATORY REASONS.....	7
K. NATIONAL ORIGIN DISCRIMINATION	7
L. PROCEDURES	7
M. RACE DISCRIMINATION.....	8
N. RELIGIOUS DISCRIMINATION.....	8
O. REMEDIES AND OTHER RELIEF	8
P. REPRISAL/RETALIATION	9
Q. SETTLEMENT	9
R. SEX (GENDER) DISCRIMINATION.....	9
S. SEXUAL HARASSMENT	10
T. SEXUAL ORIENTATION.....	10
U. SUMMARY JUDGMENT.....	10
V. TIMELINESS.....	10
W. OTHER CASES OF INTEREST	11
AFFIRMATIVE ACTION	13
AGE DISCRIMINATION	15
I. PROOF OF AGE DISCRIMINATION	15
A. IN GENERAL	15
B. AGE DIFFERENCE EVIDENCE	16
C. DIRECT EVIDENCE OF AGE DISCRIMINATION/COMMENTS.....	17
D. DISPARATE IMPACT	18
E. DISPARATE TREATMENT	19
F. LIQUIDATED DAMAGES	20
G. TAX CONSEQUENCES OF A LUMP SUM PAYMENT	20
II. DISCRIMINATION WITHIN THE PROTECTED AGE GROUP—PREFERENCE FOR OLDER EMPLOYEES OVER YOUNGER EMPLOYEES WITHIN THE PROTECTED AGE GROUP	20
III. DISMISSALS	21
IV. OLDER WORKERS BENEFIT PROTECTION ACT (OWBPA).....	21
A. ADEA REQUIREMENTS MET.....	21
B. ADEA VIOLATED, REQUIREMENT NOT MET.....	22
C. ADEA VIOLATION, EFFECT UPON OTHER BASES OF DISCRIMINATION	22
V. MIXED MOTIVE AGE CASES.....	22
VI. THE “SAME ACTOR” INFERENCE	23
VII. LAWSUIT IN FEDERAL DISTRICT COURT	23
VIII. NONSELECTION AGE CASES.....	24
IX. MANDATORY AGE LIMITS	29
X. REPRISAL BASED ON UNDERLYING AGE COMPLAINT	30
ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION.....	31
ATTORNEY FEES	33

I.	WHO IS AN ATTORNEY?.....	33
II.	PREVAILING PARTY.....	33
III.	HOURS CLAIMED.....	36
IV.	RATE CLAIMED.....	40
V.	DOCUMENTATION OF CLAIMS.....	48
VI.	STANDARD FOR PAYMENT.....	50
VII.	REDUCTIONS (LACK OF SUCCESS AND ACROSS-THE-BOARD) UPHELD OR REVERSED.....	51
VIII.	FEE ENHANCEMENT.....	65
IX.	ATTORNEY FEE AWARD UNWARRANTED.....	66
X.	ATTORNEY FEES AS SANCTIONS.....	66
XI.	OFFERS OF RESOLUTION/OFFER OF JUDGMENT.....	67
XII.	AGE PLUS OTHER BASES OF DISCRIMINATION.....	67
XIII.	NO FEES FOR PURSUIT OF A CRIMINAL ACTION AGAINST THE ALLEGED HARASSER.....	67
XIV.	ATTORNEY CANNOT UNILATERALLY FILE AN APPEAL WITH THE COMMISSION.....	67
XV.	NEED FOR TWO ATTORNEYS.....	68
XVI.	TAXATION ISSUES.....	69
XVII.	AUTHORITY TO AWARD FEES FOR COURT OR MSPB WORK.....	70
XVIII.	OUT OF TOWN COUNSEL.....	70
XIX.	OTHER.....	73
CLASS ACTIONS		77
I.	CLASS CERTIFIED.....	77
II.	CLASS NOT CERTIFIED.....	82
III.	PROVISIONAL CERTIFICATION OF A CLASS.....	87
IV.	CLASS DECERTIFIED.....	88
V.	FAILURE TO PROVE CLASS CLAIMS.....	88
VI.	DISABILITY HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CLASS CLAIM.....	88
VII.	NOTICE TO CLASS MEMBERS.....	89
VIII.	NO DISMISSAL FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM.....	89
IX.	SETTLEMENT OF CLASS ACTIONS.....	89
X.	TIMELINESS ISSUES.....	90
XI.	OTHER.....	91
COMPENSATORY DAMAGES		93
I.	UP TO \$5,000.....	93
II.	\$5,001 TO \$10,000.....	108
III.	\$10,001 TO \$50,000.....	119
IV.	\$50,001 TO \$100,000.....	150
V.	OVER \$100,000.....	165
VI.	COMPENSATORY DAMAGES DENIED.....	177
VII.	EXCLUSIONS AND AVAILABILITY.....	179
VIII.	COLLATERAL SOURCE RULE.....	180
IX.	“GOOD FAITH” DISABILITY EXCLUSION.....	181
X.	COMPENSATORY DAMAGES: MOOTNESS.....	183
XI.	NO CLAIM FILED FOR COMPENSATORY DAMAGES OR NO EVIDENCE SUBMITTED TO SUPPORT A CLAIM.....	183
XII.	PECUNIARY DAMAGES—PAST AND FUTURE.....	184
XIII.	LARGE AWARDS WITHOUT MEDICAL EVIDENCE OF HARM.....	192
XIV.	LOSS OF EARNING CAPACITY.....	193
XV.	ADEQUACY OF CLAIM.....	194
XVI.	DE NOVO COURT REVIEW OF AMOUNT.....	195
XVII.	REDUCTION OF DAMAGES AS A SANCTION.....	195
XVIII.	OTHER.....	195
CONSTITUTIONAL ISSUES: EMPLOYMENT RELATED		197
CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE/RETIREMENT		199
COURT PROCEDURES AND ISSUES		207
DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION		211
I.	NOTICE TO AGENCY OF DISABILITY.....	211
II.	DISABILITY OR NOT.....	211

A.	THE ADA AMENDMENTS ACT OF 2008.....	212
1.	Rejection of the “Reasoning” and “Demanding Standards” of Supreme Court and Lower Court Decisions and the EEOC’s Disability Definition	212
2.	Seeking to Assure the Broader Reinterpretation of the “Substantially Limits” Language.....	212
3.	Expanding the Definition of “Major Life Activities”	213
4.	Changes to the “Regarded as” Prong	213
5.	Other Changes.....	213
6.	Will the ADA Amendments Act Apply to Cases Based on Facts That Occurred Prior to January 1, 2009?	213
7.	Cases Applying the ADA Amendments Act	214
B.	SUBSTANTIAL IMPAIRMENT	215
1.	The Side Effects of Medication.....	217
C.	MAJOR LIFE ACTIVITIES	218
1.	Concentration	218
2.	Eating	218
3.	Lifting.....	219
4.	Interacting With Others	219
5.	Performing Manual Tasks.....	220
6.	Reading	220
7.	Reproduction/Sexual Relations.....	221
8.	Seeing	221
9.	Sleeping	222
10.	Speaking	223
11.	Walking.....	223
12.	Working.....	224
13.	Waste Elimination.....	225
D.	PERCEIVED OR REGARDED AS HAVING A DISABILITY	225
1.	The ADA Amendments Act of 2008	226
2.	Cases	226
E.	RECORD OF A DISABILITY	232
F.	ASSOCIATION WITH PERSONS WITH A DISABILITY	233
G.	EXCLUSIONS FROM THE DEFINITION OF AN INDIVIDUAL WITH A DISABILITY.....	234
1.	The Illegal Use of Drugs Exclusion.....	234
H.	AGENCIES NOT REQUIRED TO PROVIDE A PERSONAL USE ACCOMMODATION.....	234
I.	IS AN INDIVIDUAL REQUIRED TO GET TREATMENT THAT WOULD ELIMINATE HIS OR HER DISABILITY?	235
J.	TEMPORARY DISABILITIES.....	235
K.	SPECIFIC DISABILITIES.....	236
1.	AIDS/HIV.....	236
2.	Alcoholism.....	236
3.	Allergic Reaction	236
4.	Arthritis.....	237
5.	Asthma/Ability to Breath	237
6.	Back Injury.....	237
7.	Bipolar Disorder.....	239
8.	Carpal Tunnel Syndrome.....	239
9.	Cancer	240
10.	Depression and Anxiety	240
11.	Diabetes	241
12.	Drug & Alcohol Disabilities—Former Illegal Drug Users	244
13.	Dyslexia	245
14.	Epilepsy/Seizure Disorder.....	245
15.	Hearing Impairments	246
16.	Infertility.....	248
17.	Knee Injury.....	248
18.	Lupus.....	249
19.	Marfan’s Syndrome.....	249
20.	Migraine Headaches	249
21.	Monocular Vision	250
22.	Multiple Sclerosis	250
23.	Neck and Shoulder Injury	250
24.	Paranoia.....	250

25.	Post Traumatic Stress Disorder.....	251
26.	Psoriasis.....	251
27.	Prescription Drugs.....	251
28.	Sarcoidosis.....	251
29.	Seeing.....	252
30.	Sensitivity to Fragrance.....	252
31.	Sinusitis.....	252
32.	Sleep Apnea.....	252
33.	Speaking.....	253
34.	Stress Related Disabilities.....	253
35.	Tourette's Syndrome.....	253
36.	Miscellaneous.....	253
III.	QUALIFIED INDIVIDUAL WITH A DISABILITY.....	254
A.	IN GENERAL.....	254
B.	QUALIFICATION STANDARDS / ESSENTIAL FUNCTIONS.....	262
IV.	REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION.....	267
A.	IN GENERAL.....	267
B.	SPECIFIC DISABILITIES (AS TO ACCOMMODATION).....	275
1.	Alcoholism.....	275
2.	Arthritis.....	275
3.	Asthma.....	275
4.	Back Injuries.....	276
5.	Carpal Tunnel Syndrome.....	277
6.	Diabetes.....	277
7.	Difficulties Standing.....	277
8.	Fragrance Sensitivity.....	278
9.	Hearing Impairments.....	278
10.	Lupus.....	282
11.	Mobility Impairments.....	282
12.	Paralyzed Arm.....	282
13.	Psychiatric Impairments.....	283
14.	Seeing Impairments.....	283
15.	Sleep Disorders.....	283
16.	Miscellaneous Impairments.....	284
C.	REQUESTING ACCOMMODATION.....	284
1.	No Request for an Accommodation.....	285
D.	DELAY IN PROVIDING REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION.....	286
1.	Delay to Determine Medical Condition.....	290
E.	AN EMPLOYEE IS NOT ENTITLED TO THE ACCOMMODATION OF HIS OR HER CHOICE.....	290
F.	UNDUE HARDSHIP.....	295
G.	NEXUS BETWEEN DISABILITY AND REQUESTED ACCOMMODATION.....	297
H.	THE INTERACTIVE PROCESS.....	299
I.	SPECIFIC ACCOMMODATIONS.....	301
1.	Absences—Lengthy or Indefinite Absence or Arriving at Work Whenever Complainant Is Able.....	301
2.	A Chair—Ergonomic or Other.....	303
3.	Job Coach.....	304
4.	Light Duty/Limited Duty.....	304
5.	Modified Job Assignments.....	308
6.	No Contact With a Supervisor or Employee.....	309
7.	Parking Space.....	310
8.	Plastic Shield.....	312
9.	Promotion.....	312
10.	Reader for Individuals With Sight Impairments.....	312
11.	Reassignment.....	312
12.	Modified Work Schedule.....	321
13.	Smoke Free Work Environment.....	323
14.	Supervisory Change (A New Supervisor).....	323
15.	Work at Home/Telecommuting.....	323
16.	Working at a Different Agency Location.....	329

17.	Workstation Close to a Restroom.....	330
18.	Providing Interview Questions in Writing	330
J.	FAILURE TO ACCOMMODATE AS A CONSTRUCTIVE DISCHARGE.....	331
K.	GOOD FAITH EFFORTS AT REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION AS A DEFENSE TO PAYMENT OF COMPENSATORY DAMAGES	332
L.	ADEQUACY OF AGENCY INVESTIGATION OF REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION	334
M.	TEMPORARY REASONABLE ACCOMMODATIONS	334
N.	EXECUTIVE ORDER AND EEOC GUIDANCE CONCERNING REQUIRED REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION PROCEDURES.....	335
V.	DISPARATE TREATMENT DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION.....	337
VI.	PERFORMANCE AND CONDUCT STANDARDS	343
A.	U.S. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION GUIDANCE.....	343
B.	THE MISCONDUCT EXCLUSION	343
VII.	DIRECT THREAT AND RISK OF HARM DEFENSES.....	346
VIII.	DISABILITY-RELATED INQUIRIES/INQUIRY DISCRIMINATION.....	358
IX.	REQUESTS FOR MEDICAL INFORMATION AND RECORDS.....	364
X.	CONFIDENTIALITY OF MEDICAL INFORMATION AND RECORDS	368
XI.	MEDICAL AND FITNESS-FOR-DUTY EXAMINATIONS	379
XII.	CLASS ACTION CLAIMS	386
XIII.	DISABILITY HARASSMENT CLAIMS.....	388
XIV.	NONSELECTION BECAUSE OF DISABILITY CLAIMS.....	389
XV.	PROMOTING THE EMPLOYMENT OF INDIVIDUAL WITH DISABILITIES.....	392
XVI.	RELATIONSHIP OF THE REHABILITATION ACT/ADA TO OWCP, DISABILITY RETIREMENT AND LONG TERM CARE BENEFITS	392
A.	OWCP (OFFICE OF WORKERS' COMPENSATION PROGRAMS)	394
B.	DISABILITY RETIREMENT	394
C.	LONG TERM CARE INSURANCE	395
XVII.	RELATIONSHIP OF REHABILITATION ACT/ADA TO UNION NEGOTIATED AGREEMENTS	395
XVIII.	RETALIATION BASED UPON DISABILITY	395
XIX.	TRAINING AS PART OF A REMEDY FOR DISABILITY DISCRIMINATION.....	396
XX.	THE EFFECT OF REPRESENTATIONS CONCERNING MEDICAL CONDITION IN A FORUM NOT CONSIDERING AN ASSERTION OF A VIOLATION OF THE ADA/REHABILITATION ACT	396
XXI.	ADEQUACY OF AGENCY INVESTIGATIONS—THE NEED TO ASK THE “RIGHT QUESTIONS”.....	396
XXII.	RELATIONSHIP OF THE REHABILITATION ACT/ADA TO THE FAMILY AND MEDICAL LEAVE ACT (FMLA).....	397
XXIII.	COMMISSION JURISDICTION AND POSSIBLE PREEMPTION BY OTHER STATUTES	397
XXIV.	PLACING AND EMPLOYEE IN EMERGENCY OFF-DUTY STATUS	398
XXV.	REMEDIAL RELIEF AFTER FINDING OF DISCRIMINATION	398
XXVI.	MISCELLANEOUS	399
	DISCIPLINE.....	401
	DISPARATE IMPACT	407
	EEO INVESTIGATIONS.....	413
I.	INADEQUATE INVESTIGATIONS.....	413
II.	RIGHT OF UNION TO BE REPRESENTED	422
III.	OTHER.....	422
	EEOC APPELLATE REVIEW.....	425
I.	REVIEW OF AJ DECISIONS	425
II.	REVIEW OF FINAL AGENCY DECISIONS	426
III.	REVIEW OF AGENCY FINAL ORDER.....	426
IV.	REVIEW OF OFO DECISIONS (I.E., RECONSIDERATION)	427
V.	REVIEW OF MSPB DECISIONS.....	427
VI.	REVIEW OF PREHEARING AND HEARING RULINGS.....	428
VII.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS	428
	EQUAL PAY ACT.....	429
	EVIDENCE.....	435
I.	COMMISSION DETERMINATION IN COURT	435
II.	CREDIBILITY RULINGS.....	435
III.	DIRECT EVIDENCE.....	435
IV.	AGE DIFFERENCE EVIDENCE.....	437
V.	RACE OR SEX PLUS	437

VI.	MIXED-MOTIVE	437
VII.	CONTINUING VIOLATIONS—BACKGROUND EVIDENCE	443
VIII.	THE SAME ACTOR INFERENCE	444
IX.	MEDICAL RECORDS	444
X.	PRIVILEGE/CONFIDENTIAL	444
XI.	“CAT’S PAW” OR “RUBBER STAMP” EVIDENCE	445
XII.	“ME TOO” EVIDENCE	446
XIII.	TEMPORARY AND PROBATIONARY EMPLOYEES AS SIMILARLY SITUATED COMPARATORS	446
XIV.	HEIGHTENED BURDEN IN “REVERSE DISCRIMINATION” CASES	447
XV.	STATISTICAL EVIDENCE	447
XVI.	OTHER	447

GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEES RIGHTS ACT OF 1991 451

HARASSMENT (NOT SEXUAL) 453

I.	AGE HARASSMENT CLAIMS	453
II.	DISABILITY HARASSMENT CLAIMS	454
III.	NATIONAL ORIGIN HARASSMENT	458
IV.	RACE HARASSMENT CLAIMS	460
V.	RELIGIOUS HARASSMENT CLAIMS	468
VI.	REPRISAL HARASSMENT CLAIMS	468
VII.	SEX (GENDER) HARASSMENT CLAIMS	472
VIII.	SAME SEX HARASSMENT	476
IX.	PROOF OF DISCRIMINATION—SUFFICIENTLY SEVERE OR PERVASIVE	478
X.	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES	483
XI.	FRAGMENTATION OF HARASSMENT CLAIMS	487
	A. REMEDY FOR IMPROPER FRAGMENTATION	489
XII.	SUFFICIENT TO STATE A CLAIM	489
XIII.	PROOF—BASED UPON A PROTECTED CLASS?	490
XIV.	RUDE TO EVERYONE CLAIM	491

HEARINGS (EEOC) AND AJ AUTHORITY 493

I.	REQUEST FOR HEARING	493
II.	SANCTIONS	493
	A. DEFAULT JUDGMENTS	493
	B. DISMISSAL OF COMPLAINT	500
	C. ADVERSE INFERENCE	501
	D. MONEY SANCTIONS	507
	E. SUSPENSION OR OTHER ACTIONS AGAINST REPRESENTATIVES	510
	F. EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE/BARRING TESTIMONY	510
	G. DENIAL OF HEARING	512
	H. FAILURE TO PRODUCE COMPLAINT FILE	518
III.	DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE	519
IV.	DISMISSALS FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM	519
V.	DECISIONS WITHOUT A HEARING/STANDARDS	520
VI.	TELEPHONE TESTIMONY	521
VII.	VIDEO HEARINGS	523
VIII.	BIAS CLAIMS	524
IX.	AGENCY FAILURE TO PROCESS	525
X.	REQUESTS FOR RECUSAL	525
XI.	AUTHORITY TO ADD A BASIS OF DISCRIMINATION / MOTION TO AMEND	525
XII.	REFRAMING OR INCLUDING ADDITIONAL ISSUES OR BASES	526
XIII.	CREDIBILITY DETERMINATIONS	527
XIV.	WITNESSES	529
XV.	BIFURCATED HEARINGS	529
XVI.	CLASS ACTIONS	529
XVII.	FAILURE TO PROVIDE INTERIM RELIEF	529
XVIII.	OTHER	530

INDEPENDENT CONTRACTORS 533

LABOR-RELATIONS AND EEO 551

LAWS, REGULATIONS, AND GUIDANCE 553

I. GENETIC INFORMATION NONDISCRIMINATION ACT OF 2008 (GINA)—PUB.L. 110-233, 122 STAT. 881, CODIFIED AT 42 USC 2000FF ET SEQ..... 553

A. COVERAGE..... 553

B. IMPORTANT DEFINITION 553

C. PRACTICES PROHIBITED OR RESTRICTED 553

D. EXCEPTIONS AS TO ACQUISITION 553

E. RULES ON CONFIDENTIALITY AND LIMITED EXCEPTIONS TO DISCLOSURE 553

F. EFFECT ON OTHER LAWS 553

G. REMEDIES AND ENFORCEMENT 553

II. FINAL REGULATIONS TO IMPLEMENT GINA—29 CFR PART 1635 553

III. THE LILLY LEDBETTER FAIR PAY ACT OF 2009 556

IV. THE ADA AMENDMENTS ACT OF 2008 557

A. REJECTION OF THE “REASONING” AND “DEMANDING STANDARDS” OF SUPREME COURT AND LOWER COURT DECISIONS AND THE EEOC’S DISABILITY DEFINITION..... 557

B. SEEKING TO ASSURE THE BROADER REINTERPRETATION OF THE “SUBSTANTIALLY LIMITS” LANGUAGE 557

C. EXPANDING THE DEFINITION OF “MAJOR LIFE ACTIVITIES” 557

D. CHANGES TO THE “REGARDED AS” PRONG..... 558

E. OTHER CHANGES 558

V. THE AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT: APPLYING PERFORMANCE AND CONDUCT STANDARDS TO EMPLOYEES WITH DISABILITIES (OCTOBER 14, 2008) 558

VI. COMPLIANCE MANUAL, SECTION 12, RELIGIOUS DISCRIMINATION, NO. 915.033 (JULY 22, 2008)..... 559

VII. QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS: PROMOTING EMPLOYMENT OF INDIVIDUALS WITH DISABILITIES IN THE FEDERAL WORKFORCE (SEPTEMBER 30, 2008)..... 560

VIII. EEOC ENFORCEMENT GUIDANCE: UNLAWFUL DISPARATE TREATMENT OF WORKERS WITH CAREGIVING RESPONSIBILITIES, NO. 915.002 (MAY 23, 2007) 560

A. TOPICS..... 560

B. DISPARATE TREATMENT 560

C. PREGNANCY-RELATED ISSUES..... 560

D. DISABILITY, HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT AND REPRISAL..... 560

IX. INSTRUCTIONS TO FEDERAL AGENCIES FOR EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY MANAGEMENT DIRECTIVE 715 (EEO MD-715) (JULY 20, 2004) 560

X. EEOC ENFORCEMENT GUIDANCE ON PREGNANCY DISCRIMINATION AND RELATED ISSUES 561

XI. EEOC ENFORCEMENT GUIDANCE ON RETALIATION AND RELATED ISSUES..... 561

XII. EEOC ENFORCEMENT GUIDANCE ON NATIONAL ORIGIN DISCRIMINATION..... 561

LEGITIMATE NONDISCRIMINATORY REASONS (INADEQUACY OF) 563

MIXED CASES 573

I. MIXED CASE OR NOT 573

II. DISMISSAL 574

III. SPECIAL PANEL 574

IV. UNMIXED BY MSPB DECISION 575

V. EEOC’S REVIEW OF MSPB DECISION 575

VI. UNTIMELINESS 578

VII. IMPACT OF MSPB DECISION 578

VIII. INEXTRICABLY INTERTWINED 578

IX. RIGHT TO HEARING AT MSPB ON EEO ISSUES..... 579

X. HOLDING EEO COMPLAINT IN ABEYANCE 580

XI. NOTIFICATION OF MIXED CASE PROCESS 580

XII. COURT REVIEW 581

XIII. APPEAL FROM GRIEVANCE-ARBITRATION..... 581

XIV. MSPB MIXED CASE DISCRIMINATION FINDINGS 581

XV. “FIRMLY ENMESHED” IN THE EEO PROCESS 581

XVI. COURT-RELATED ISSUES 582

NATIONAL ORIGIN DISCRIMINATION 585

I. HOLIDAYS..... 585

II. DISPARATE TREATMENT 585

III. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT—NATIONAL ORIGIN—STRAY COMMENT..... 585

IV. FOREIGN ACCENT 586

V. “SPEAK ENGLISH ONLY” RULES..... 588

VI.	NONSELECTION.....	589
VII.	OTHER.....	590
NONSELECTION CLAIMS		591
I.	CLAIMS OF NONSELECTION BECAUSE OF AGE.....	591
II.	CLAIMS OF NONSELECTION BECAUSE OF DISABILITY.....	596
III.	CLAIMS OF NONSELECTION BECAUSE OF NATIONAL ORIGIN.....	598
IV.	CLAIMS OF NONSELECTION BECAUSE OF RACE.....	600
V.	CLAIMS OF NONSELECTION BECAUSE OF REPRISAL.....	606
VI.	CLAIMS OF NONSELECTION BECAUSE OF SEX.....	610
VII.	MULTIPLE BASES.....	613
VIII.	RACE PLUS.....	620
IX.	ACCENT OR LANGUAGE ISSUES.....	621
X.	FAILURE OF AGENCY TO ARTICULATE AN ADEQUATE REASON.....	621
XI.	“CLEARLY BETTER QUALIFIED”.....	625
XII.	NOT “CLEARLY BETTER QUALIFIED”.....	626
XIII.	REQUIRED RETENTION OF RECORDS IN SELECTION CASES.....	627
XIV.	DISABILITY INQUIRIES DURING SELECTION PROCESS.....	627
XV.	DISCRIMINATION BUT NO POSITION RELIEF.....	628
XVI.	OTHER.....	628
OFFICIAL TIME.....		629
PERFORMANCE-RELATED CASES.....		633
PROCEDURES		635
I.	DISMISSALS OF COMPLAINTS.....	635
A.	FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM/GENERALLY (1614.107(A)(1)).....	635
B.	PREVIOUSLY FILED CLAIM (1614.107(A)(1)).....	653
C.	FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM/HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT (1614.107(A)(1)).....	655
D.	FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM/REPRISAL (1614.107(A)(1)).....	671
E.	FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM/DRESS AND APPEARANCE ISSUES (1614.107(A)(1)).....	682
F.	FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM/NO AVAILABLE REMEDY OR NOT WITHIN PURVIEW (1614.107(A)(1)).....	683
G.	FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM/COLLATERAL ATTACK (1614.107(A)(1)).....	684
H.	MOOT AND PREMATURE COMPLAINTS (1614.107(A)(5)).....	688
I.	PREMATURE/PRELIMINARY STEP COMPLAINTS (1614.107(A)(5)).....	693
J.	FAILURE TO LOCATE COMPLAINANT (1614.107(A)(6)).....	694
K.	PENDING CIVIL ACTION (1614.107(A)(3)).....	694
L.	ABUSE OF PROCESS (1614.107(A)(9)).....	695
M.	ELECTION OF REMEDIES (1614.107(A)(4)).....	698
N.	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE (1614.107(A)(7)).....	701
O.	SPIN-OFF COMPLAINTS (1614.107(A)(8)).....	706
II.	LIKE OR RELATED CLAIMS.....	706
III.	FRAGMENTATION.....	707
IV.	CONSOLIDATION.....	710
V.	JOINDER OF AGENCY PARTIES.....	710
VI.	AMENDMENT OF COMPLAINT.....	711
VII.	STANDING.....	711
VIII.	EEO COUNSELOR/EEO OFFICE ERROR.....	718
IX.	REPRESENTATIVE/ATTORNEY ERROR.....	719
X.	AGENCY ERROR.....	720
XI.	OFFICIAL TIME ISSUES.....	720
XII.	INTENT TO WITHDRAW COMPLAINT.....	721
XIII.	NO COMMISSION JURISDICTION FOR SOME OFF-DUTY CONDUCT BY COWORKER.....	721
XIV.	MY DOG ATE MY COMPLAINT FORMS.....	721
XV.	IMPROPER SERVICE OF HEARING REQUEST.....	721
XVI.	LAST CHANCE AGREEMENT WAIVERS.....	722
XVII.	OTHER.....	722
RACE DISCRIMINATION		725
I.	DISMISSAL.....	725
II.	NONSELECTION.....	726

III.	HARASSMENT/HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT	728
IV.	CLASS ACTION	732
V.	DISPARATE TREATMENT/ACCOMMODATION	732
VI.	DENIAL OF OVERTIME.....	734
VII.	DISCIPLINE.....	734
VIII.	TRAINING AND PROMOTIONAL OPPORTUNITIES	737
IX.	REASSIGNMENT	737
X.	SETTLEMENT.....	738
XI.	RACIAL PROFILING	738
XII.	DISPARATE IMPACT	738

RELIGIOUS DISCRIMINATION 741

I.	DISMISSAL	741
II.	A PREFERENCE OR RELIGIOUS OBLIGATION?/REQUIRED BY BELIEFS	741
III.	DAYS OFF.....	742
IV.	RELIGIOUS DRESS	748
V.	OBSERVANCE AT WORK.....	749
VI.	HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT	749
VII.	DISCIPLINE.....	750
VIII.	MIXED CASES.....	750
IX.	DISPARATE TREATMENT/MIXED MOTIVE.....	751
X.	UNDUE HARDSHIP.....	752

REMEDIES AND OTHER RELIEF 755

I.	REINSTATEMENT	755
II.	PLACEMENT IN POSITION SOUGHT.....	759
III.	OFFER OF THE POSITION DENIED OR A SUBSTANTIALLY EQUIVALENT POSITION	762
IV.	RETROACTIVE PROMOTION, PERFORMANCE OR OTHER AWARDS.....	763
V.	FRONT PAY AWARDS.....	765
VI.	BACK PAY AWARDS/MITIGATION	767
VII.	TRAINING AND OTHER RELIEF	781
VIII.	ADJUSTMENT FOR INCREASED TAXES	784
IX.	DAMAGES PAYABLE TO THE ESTATE	786
X.	ALTERING EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES	786
XI.	DISCRIMINATION BUT NO POSITION RELIEF	786
XII.	INTERIM RELIEF	786
XIII.	OTHER.....	787

REPRESENTATION 793

I.	SANCTIONS/SUSPENSION.....	793
II.	CONFLICT OF INTEREST	793
III.	TIMELINESS/RESPONSIBILITY FOR.....	793
IV.	NONATTORNEY REPRESENTATIVES	794
V.	FILING COMPLAINTS	794

REPRISAL/RETALIATION..... 795

I.	<i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE/NEXUS	795
II.	KNOWLEDGE OF PROTECTED ACTIVITY.....	799
III.	OPPOSITION REPRISAL	799
IV.	PARTICIPATION REPRISAL	804
V.	NONSELECTION REPRISAL	807
VI.	FITNESS FOR DUTY AS REPRISAL	809
VII.	DISCIPLINE OR PERFORMANCE REASONS AS REPRISAL	810
VIII.	AWARDS AS REPRISAL.....	820
IX.	JOB REFERENCES AS REPRISAL	820
X.	REASSIGNMENT AS REPRISAL.....	822
XI.	LEAVE-RELATED REASON AS REPRISAL	824
XII.	PROTECTED ACTIVITY.....	825
XIII.	SUMMARY JUDGMENT	826
XIV.	MIXED MOTIVE.....	827
XV.	REASONABLY LIKELY TO DETER/DIRECT EVIDENCE/ <i>PER SE</i>	828

XVI.	DISABILITY RETALIATION.....	845
XVII.	ADEA RETALIATION.....	846
XVIII.	REPRISAL HARASSMENT CLAIMS.....	847
XIX.	SEXUAL ORIENTATION.....	849
XX.	CLASS ACTION REPRISAL CLAIMS.....	849
XXI.	CLAIMS BY REPRESENTATIVES.....	849
XXII.	CREDIBILITY-BASED FINDINGS.....	850
XXIII.	EVIDENCE/CAT'S PAW.....	851
XXIV.	ASSOCIATION REPRISAL.....	851
XXV.	OTHER.....	852

SECURITY CLEARANCES AND STATE SECRETS 855

SETTLEMENT 859

I.	COURT JURISDICTION IN BREACH CLAIMS.....	859
II.	GENERAL PRINCIPLES.....	859
	A. SETTLEMENT AS A CONTRACT.....	859
	B. ADEQUACY OF CONSIDERATION.....	859
	C. "MEETING OF THE MINDS".....	866
	D. RATIFICATION OF AN AGREEMENT.....	868
	E. TYPICALLY LIMITING INTERPRETATION TO FOUR CORNERS.....	868
	F. VAGUENESS.....	869
III.	DISMISSALS.....	870
IV.	AGENCY BURDEN TO PROVIDE EVIDENCE OF COMPLIANCE.....	871
V.	SPECIFIC PROVISIONS.....	871
	A. PRIORITY CONSIDERATION.....	871
	B. CONFIDENTIALITY.....	872
	C. THE OLDER WORKERS' BENEFIT PROTECTION ACT.....	873
	D. EXPUNGEMENT OF RECORDS.....	876
	E. NEUTRAL REFERENCES.....	877
VI.	BREACH OF A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT.....	878
VII.	NO BREACH OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT.....	886
VIII.	CLAIM OF DELAY IN IMPLEMENTATION AS BREACH.....	890
IX.	CHANGE IN CIRCUMSTANCES AS VOIDING THE AGREEMENT.....	891
X.	CLAIMS OF COERCION, MISREPRESENTATION AND MISTAKE, INCOMPETENCY.....	891
XI.	CURING AN ALLEGED BREACH.....	893
XII.	LACHES AS A DEFENSE TO AN ALLEGATION OF BREACH.....	893
XIII.	COMPENSATORY DAMAGES NOT AVAILABLE FOR BREACH.....	893
XIV.	UNENFORCEABLE/UNAUTHORIZED AGREEMENTS.....	894
XV.	LACK OF AUTHORITY FOR AGENCY TO ENFORCE A SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT.....	896
XVI.	LACK OF EEOC AUTHORITY TO ENFORCE AN MSPB OR GRIEVANCE SETTLEMENT.....	897
XVII.	WAIVER CLAUSES.....	897
XVIII.	TAX CONSEQUENCES.....	897
XIX.	CHALLENGE TO OR RELIANCE ON AN EEO SETTLEMENT IN ANOTHER CASE.....	898
XX.	OFFERS OF FULL RELIEF.....	898
XXI.	SUBSEQUENT ACTS OF DISCRIMINATION/REPRISAL AS SEPARATE COMPLAINTS.....	898
XXII.	CONFIDENTIALITY OF SETTLEMENT NEGOTIATIONS.....	899
XXIII.	ATTORNEY FEES.....	899
XXIV.	TIMELINESS.....	900
XXV.	RETURN OF BENEFITS.....	900

SEX (GENDER) DISCRIMINATION 903

I.	PREGNANCY-RELATED DISCRIMINATION.....	903
II.	DIRECT EVIDENCE.....	906
III.	DISCIPLINE.....	907
IV.	NONSELECTION.....	908
V.	TRANSFER OR REASSIGNMENT.....	908
VI.	<i>BONA FIDE</i> OCCUPATIONAL QUALIFICATION (BFOQ) CLAIMS.....	910
VII.	GENDER STEREOTYPE CLAIMS.....	912
VIII.	TRANSGENDER ISSUES.....	915
IX.	DRESS ISSUES.....	916

X.	SEX PLUS.....	917
XI.	EQUAL PAY ACT.....	917
XII.	NO REMEDY AVAILABLE.....	918
XIII.	SEX (GENDER) HARASSMENT CLAIMS.....	918
XIV.	DISMISSALS.....	920
XV.	TRAINING REMEDY.....	921
XVI.	SEX-BASED V. SEXUAL.....	921
XVII.	OTHER.....	922

SEXUAL HARASSMENT 925

I.	DISMISSALS.....	925
II.	UNWELCOMENESS.....	926
III.	SEVERE OR PERVASIVE.....	929
IV.	BECAUSE OF SEX.....	941
V.	SEXUAL IN NATURE.....	941
VI.	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: COWORKER OR CLIENT HARASSMENT.....	943
VII.	AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE: SUPERVISOR HARASSMENT.....	949
VIII.	DEFENSE NOT AVAILABLE/TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTION.....	955
IX.	CLAIMS OF SEXUAL FAVORITISM.....	957
X.	SAME SEX HARASSMENT.....	957
XI.	EEO COMPLAINTS BY INDIVIDUALS ACCUSED OF SEXUAL HARASSMENT (OR BECAUSE OF SEXUAL HARASSMENT INVESTIGATIONS).....	958
XII.	CREDIBILITY ISSUES AND WHETHER CONDUCT OCCURRED.....	958
XIII.	SEXUAL HARASSMENT-RELATED CHARGES.....	960

SEXUAL ORIENTATION 963

SUMMARY JUDGMENT 965

I.	THE EEOC STANDARDS.....	965
II.	IMPROPERLY MAKING CREDIBILITY DETERMINATIONS/RESOLVING CONFLICTS/NOT DEVELOPING RECORD.....	967
III.	GRANTING SUMMARY JUDGMENT TO THE NON-MOVING PARTY.....	982
IV.	IMPROPERLY FRAGMENTING CLAIMS.....	983
V.	DECISION ON THE RECORD.....	983
VI.	CASES BY BASIS.....	983
A.	DISABILITY.....	983
B.	SEX.....	989
C.	RACE.....	991
D.	NATIONAL ORIGIN.....	992
E.	RETALIATION.....	993
F.	AGE.....	994
G.	EQUAL PAY ACT.....	995
H.	RELIGION.....	996
VII.	CASES BY ISSUE.....	996
A.	TRANSFER/REASSIGNMENT.....	996
B.	TERMINATION OF APPOINTMENT.....	997
C.	DISCIPLINE/PERFORMANCE.....	997
D.	HARASSMENT.....	998
E.	NONSELECTION.....	1000
F.	ASSIGNMENT OF WORK.....	1002
VIII.	OTHER.....	1002

TIMELINESS 1005

I.	BURDEN OF PROOF.....	1005
II.	START OF TIME PERIOD.....	1009
III.	ACTUAL OR CONSTRUCTIVE KNOWLEDGE.....	1012
IV.	CLAIMS OF MISINFORMATION/CONFUSION.....	1017
V.	“REASONABLE SUSPICION” OF DISCRIMINATION.....	1021
VI.	CONTACT BUT NO INTENT TO FILE.....	1026
VII.	PLACE OR METHOD OF CONTACTING.....	1027
VIII.	SERVICE ON ATTORNEY/REPRESENTATIVE.....	1030
IX.	UNREASONABLE DELAY (AND LACHES)/DUE DILIGENCE.....	1031

X.	CLAIMS OF INCAPACITATION/COERCION/ABSENCE/EMERGENCY/DISABILITY	1032
XI.	SOMEONE IN THE HOUSEHOLD AT FAULT	1036
XII.	ACTIVE MILITARY DUTY	1037
XIII.	FEAR OF REPRISAL TO JUSTIFY AN UNTIMELY EEO COMPLAINT	1037
XIV.	CONTINUING OR RECURRING VIOLATIONS/LIKE OR RELATED.....	1038
XV.	ATTEMPT TO RESOLVE THROUGH MANAGEMENT DOES NOT TOLL TIME PERIOD.....	1046
XVI.	DENIAL OF OFFICIAL TIME NOT AN EXCUSE.....	1047
XVII.	MAILING PRESUMPTION	1047
XVIII.	EQUITABLE TOLLING/LACHES.....	1048
XIX.	OTHER (TIMELINESS IN REQUESTS FOR RECONSIDERATION, APPEALS TO COMMISSION, APPEALS FROM FAD, ETC.)	1050
TABLE OF CASES.....		1053
INDEX		1095