

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY.....	785
CHAPTER 3: HEARING.....	1191
CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE.....	1323
CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW.....	1473
CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS	1725
CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND MITIGATION	2111
CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....	2243

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES	2659
CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....	2767
CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....	2909
CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION	3067
CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....	3321
CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS.....	3747
CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....	4167
CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT	4367
CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	4755
CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....	4965
BIBLIOGRAPHY	4987
TABLE OF CASES	4995
INDEX	5145

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
I. REFORM ACT.....	1
A. CAPSULE HISTORY	1
B. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL	3
II. MSPB ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATION.....	4
A. IMPARTIAL ADJUDICATION	5
1. <i>De Novo</i> Review of Agency Actions	6
a. Deference to OPM Regulations	7
b. Consideration of Agency Regulations	7
2. Prohibition Against Advisory Opinion; Internal Guidance; Request for Advisory Opinion	8
B. ORGANIZATION	9
1. Clerk	10
2. Office of Appeals Counsel	11
C. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGES	13
1. Delegations of Authority	14
a. Administrative Law Judges Adjudicating Specialized Cases	14
2. <i>Judges' Handbook</i> ; Internal Guidance.....	14
a. Qualifications of Administrative Judge	14
3. Regulatory Responsibilities	15
a. Waiver of Procedural Regulations	15
b. Judges' Position Description, Performance Standards	16
c. Regional Director (Chief Administrative Judge) Position Description and SES Performance Plan	17
4. Quality Review	20
D. BOARD DECISIONS; PRECEDENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE	20
1. Nonprecedential Final Orders.....	21
2. Arbitration Award.....	21
E. CASES OF PARTICULAR SIGNIFICANCE	21
1. Sensitive, Public Interest Appeal	22
2. Referral to OPM, OSC	22
F. MSPB RECORDS	22
1. Gaining Access; Review Procedure	25
2. Precluding Access	25
a. Redaction of Initial Decision	26
b. Sealing of Record or Files	26
c. Attempt to Preclude Publication of Decision.....	29
d. Expungement of Record	29
e. Classified Information	29
G. RULEMAKING PETITIONS.....	30
H. RESPONSIBILITY OF PARTIES IN MSPB CASES	30
III. JURISDICTIONAL OVERVIEW	31
A. SOURCES OF JURISDICTION	33
1. Original Jurisdiction Cases.....	33
2. Jurisdiction Through Agency Regulation	34
3. Appealable Actions	34
a. Adverse Action	35
b. Performance-Based Action	35
c. Demonstration Project	35
B. PRELIMINARY APPELLATE JURISDICTIONAL ANALYSIS	37
1. Lack of Jurisdiction; Failure to State a Claim	38
IV. EMPLOYEES WHO MAY APPEAL; APPEALABLE ISSUES	38
A. NATURE OF CIVIL SERVICE APPOINTMENTS	40
B. CONCEPTS COMMON TO DEFINITION OF "EMPLOYEE" FOR COMPETITIVE AND EXCEPTED SERVICE	40

1.	Current Continuous Service	41
a.	Break in Service	42
b.	Service During Detail or in Acting Position.....	45
2.	Not Serving a Probationary or Trial Period Under an Initial Appointment.....	46
3.	Counting Service Time in a Prior Position or Appointment; <i>McCormick</i>	47
a.	Time in Nonpermanent Appointment as a Component of Current Continuous Service.....	53
C.	COMPETITIVE SERVICE EMPLOYEES	58
1.	Other Than a Temporary Appointment Limited to One Year or Less.....	60
D.	EXCEPTED SERVICE EMPLOYEES.....	62
1.	1990 Civil Service Due Process Amendments; Nonpreference Eligible Employees.....	62
a.	Excepted Service Employees Excluded From Due Process Amendments.....	63
2.	Preference Eligible Status.....	69
a.	Documentation.....	73
b.	Disabled Veteran.....	75
c.	Derivative Preference Eligible Status.....	75
3.	Effect of Grievance Settlement; Labor Agreement	77
4.	Period of Non-Pay Status.....	77
5.	Same or Similar Position	78
a.	Factual Dispute Concerning Similarity of Positions	84
b.	In an Executive Agency	87
6.	Appointment Pending Conversion to Competitive Service	90
E.	DETERMINATION OF PROBATION	94
1.	Probationary Classification Problems.....	94
a.	Appointment From Register	94
b.	Transfer	96
c.	Temporary Appointment Pending Establishment of a Register (TAPER).....	97
d.	Career Reinstatement	97
2.	Calculating Year of Service.....	99
a.	Incorrect Determination of End of First Year of Employment	101
b.	Effective Time and Date of Inexplicit Termination Notice	105
c.	Significance of SF-50; Unclear Appointment Date.....	105
d.	WAE Appointment	106
e.	Military Service.....	106
3.	Tacking of Prior Service: Competitive Service Probation.....	108
a.	Same Agency	113
b.	Same Line of Work.....	114
4.	Agreement to Serve Probationary Period; Waiver of Preexisting Appeal Right	117
5.	Imposition of Probation Following Break in Service	120
6.	Representation by Agency That Probation Is Not Required; Equitable Estoppel	120
a.	Lack of Notice of Probationary Period	121
b.	Creation of Probationary Period Not Required by Statute or Regulation	121
F.	APPEAL RIGHTS OF PROBATIONER.....	123
1.	Appeal of Probationary Termination.....	124
a.	Actions Other Than Termination.....	125
2.	Classification of Probationers and Their Appeals	125
a.	Competitive Service Term Appointee; Trial Period.....	126
b.	Probationary Supervisor	127
3.	Jurisdictional Issue; Right to Hearing.....	130
a.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Agreement; Agency Regulation.....	133
b.	Other Contract.....	133
c.	Harmful Error Analysis; <i>Stephen</i>	133
d.	Relation to Suitability Determination	135
4.	Preappointment Conditions	138
a.	Harmful Error Analysis: Lack of Proper Advance Notice, Other Procedural Error	139
b.	Entitlement to Hearing.....	144
c.	Measure of Substantive Review	145
5.	Postappointment Reasons.....	145
a.	Pre- and Postappointment Distinctions.....	145
6.	Defective or Untimely Termination Notice	151
a.	Termination by Unauthorized Official.....	152
7.	Discrimination and Partisan Politics.....	153

a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations	153
b.	Partisan Political Reason	155
c.	Marital Status	157
d.	Other Discrimination	164
8.	Constitutional Claim	164
9.	Involuntary Resignation.....	166
G.	LOSS OF APPEAL RIGHTS BY CHANGE IN POSITION.....	166
1.	Movement Between Positions in Same Agency; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation.....	166
a.	Movement to Position Through Settlement Agreement	173
2.	Movement From One Agency to Another; Transfer; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation	173
H.	TEMPORARY AND TERM APPOINTMENTS	177
1.	Competitive Service Temporary, Term Appointees	180
2.	Excepted Service Preference Eligible Temporary Appointees	185
3.	Excepted Service Nonpreference Eligible Temporary Appointees.....	185
4.	Particular Temporary or Irregular Schedule Appointments.....	186
a.	TAPER	186
b.	Seasonal; On-Call	186
c.	Intermittent	190
d.	Full-Time/Part-Time.....	191
e.	Postal Service Light Duty.....	191
f.	Indefinite Appointment	191
g.	Federal Career Intern Program	191
h.	Student Temporary Employment Program; Student Career Experience Program	197
5.	Jurisdictional Effect of Lapse of Term or Temporary Appointment	198
6.	Appeal Right if Termination Occurs Before End of Expiration of Limited Appointment.....	200
I.	PARTICULAR APPOINTMENTS.....	201
1.	Nonappropriated Fund	201
2.	Veterans Readjustment Act	202
3.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	207
a.	Exceptions.....	209
4.	Senior Executive Service.....	211
5.	Administrative Law Judge.....	211
6.	Disabled Employee.....	211
7.	Employees in Confidential, Policy-Making, Policy-Determining Positions; Presidential Appointee.....	214
a.	White House, Executive Office of the President Employees	218
8.	Alien; Noncitizen	218
9.	Students.....	218
10.	Judicial Branch	220
11.	Government Corporation.....	221
12.	Postal Service	222
a.	One Year of Qualifying Service; Current Continuous Service in Same or Similar Position	226
b.	Postal Supervisors, Managers	231
c.	Postal Personnel Officials, Confidential Employees	236
d.	Postal Service Employees Who Lack Preference Eligibility, Who Have No Negotiated Grievance Procedures, and Who Are Neither Managers nor Personnelists	241
13.	Contractors.....	244
14.	Others.....	244
J.	AGENCIES WITH SPECIALIZED PERSONNEL SYSTEMS: MSPB JURISDICTIONAL EXCLUSIONS AND MODIFICATIONS	245
1.	Department of Homeland Security	245
a.	Human Resources Management System's Rise and Demise	245
b.	Transportation Security Agency: Screeners; Other Employees	246
(i)	Probationer	248
(ii)	Other TSA Employees.....	249
c.	RIF.....	253
2.	Federal Aviation Administration.....	253
a.	2012 Legislation Restoring Back Pay Authority as a Component of MSPB Jurisdiction	255
b.	2000 Legislation Restoring MSPB Jurisdiction; Back Pay Issues	256
c.	1996 Legislation Removing MSPB Jurisdiction.....	264
3.	Department of Defense National Security Personnel System	264
4.	District of Columbia	264
5.	Central Intelligence Agency; Defense Department Intelligence; Other Intelligence or Security Agencies.....	265

6.	Federal Bureau of Investigation	266
7.	Canal Zone.....	266
8.	National Archives	266
9.	National Guard Technicians.....	266
10.	Tennessee Valley Authority Employees.....	268
11.	Library of Congress; GAO; Congressional Employees.....	268
a.	Ramspeck Act	269
12.	Smithsonian Institution	269
13.	Bureau of Indian Affairs.....	269
14.	MSPB Employees	269
15.	Department of Veterans Affairs.....	270
a.	USERRA Coverage.....	275
b.	Actions Against Healthcare Professionals Not Involving Professional Conduct or Competence.....	275
(i)	Involuntary Retirement, Resignation.....	276
c.	Department of Veterans Affairs Veterans Canteen Service	279
16.	Agriculture: Stabilization and Conservation Service; Cooperative Extension Services	281
17.	Department of Defense Education Activity.....	281
18.	Office of Independent Counsel.....	282
19.	Foreign Service.....	282
20.	World Bank	283
K.	NATURE OF PERSONNEL ACTION APPEALED.....	283
1.	Possible Adverse Action; Proposal	284
2.	Suspension	284
a.	Paper Suspension	284
b.	Consolidation of Short Suspensions.....	285
c.	Calculating Duration of Suspension	286
d.	Erroneous Imposition of Suspension Exceeding 14 Days	287
e.	Indefinite Suspension	288
3.	Position Change; Nonselection.....	288
a.	Rank Reduction	289
b.	Nonselection	289
c.	Loss of Promotional or Earnings Opportunities; Change in Work Schedule.....	291
d.	Disciplinary Reassignment; Unified Penalties	293
e.	Disabled Employee	294
4.	Pay and Classification Changes; Debt; Leave	294
a.	Classification	295
b.	Pay System Conversion; Grade Reduction	297
c.	Correction of Pay, Grade	301
d.	Reduction in Pay; Locality Pay Issue; Pay System Change; Failure to Obtain Pay Increase.....	306
e.	Misrepresentation Concerning Pay Rates	311
f.	Termination of Premium Pay; Bonus; LEAPA; Seniority, Overtime Adjustments; Severance Pay	312
g.	Retirement Credit, Contributions, and Incentives; Individual Retirement Record.....	318
h.	Debt Collection, Recoupment: Agency, OPM Involvement	319
i.	Leave Dispute; Administrative Leave	322
5.	Pay and Compensation Claims: Role of OPM.....	324
6.	Promotion Claim	324
a.	Termination of Temporary Promotion	325
b.	Return Right—Overseas Employee	327
7.	Back Pay Dispute	327
a.	Retirement Payment	327
8.	Resignation.....	327
a.	Abandonment of Position	327
9.	Mandatory Retirement	329
10.	OWCP Benefits	330
11.	Insurance Programs.....	331
12.	Requests for Reinstatement: Non-Military Personnel.....	337
a.	Failure to Rehire	337
b.	Reinstatement Rights—Occupational Illness or Injury; Others.....	337
13.	Performance Standard; Rating; PIP.....	338
14.	Prohibited Personnel Practices; Allegations of Discrimination	338
15.	Merit System Principles Violations	340

16. Constitutional Violation	341
17. Miscellaneous Issues	345
L. EFFECT OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING AGREEMENT GRIEVANCE OR RELATED PROCEDURES; 5 USC 7121	346
1. Postal Service Employees	349
a. Effect of EEO Allegation or EEO Complaint	350
2. Administrative Grievance System	351
3. Statutory Grievance System; Foreign Service Grievance Board	351
4. Employee Choice: Adverse Action; Performance Case	351
5. Labor Contract Exclusivity	352
a. Appeal Right With EEO Allegation	353
b. USERRA Claim	355
c. RIF	358
d. Acceptable Level of Competence Determination; Within-Grade Increase	359
6. Problems Arising From Choice of Labor Contract Procedure	359
a. Incorrect or Inadequate Advice From Agency	360
b. Dispute Over Bargaining Unit Status or Arbitrability; Ineffective Elections; Cross-Filing; Withdrawal of Grievance	361
c. Defunct Union	364
d. Union Action on Behalf of Employee	366
e. What Constitutes Filing of Grievance	368
f. Premature Elections	369
g. Belated Grievance	370
h. Failure to Obtain Arbitration Hearing	370
7. Allegation of Discrimination	373
8. Indefinite Suspension	374
9. Appeal Right With Arbitration Award; Employees of Agencies Other Than Postal Service	375
10. Unfair Labor Practice Charge	376
M. GRADE AND PAY RETENTION	378
1. <i>Atwell</i>	380
a. Allegation of Discrimination	382
b. Restoration Action	382
2. Absence of Retention; Benefits Declined	382
3. Appeal of RIF; Classification	383
4. Termination of Pay Retention	385
V. UNIFORMED SERVICE EMPLOYMENT AND REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT; VETERANS EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES ACT ...	385
A. APPEAL RIGHTS BASED ON MILITARY SERVICE AND VETERANS PREFERENCE	385
1. Regulations Governing USERRA, VEOA Claims	390
2. Judge's Responsibility	392
3. Hearing Entitlement; Board Disposition	393
4. Exclusivity of VEOA Appeal; Joinder of USERRA Claim	397
B. UNIFORMED SERVICE EMPLOYMENT AND REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT	397
1. USERRA Statutory Structure	402
a. Related EEO Violation; Prohibited Personnel Practice Allegation	407
b. Affirmative Defense	409
2. Time for USERRA Appeal	410
a. Laches	412
b. Waiver of Right to Appeal	412
3. Permissive Exhaustion of Labor Department Remedy	414
4. Liberal Pleading Standard	417
a. Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegations	422
b. Summary Disposition of Claim	423
5. Burden of Proof	423
a. Analysis of Alleged Discrimination or Reprisal Based on Military Service	427
b. Circumstantial Evidence; Statistics	432
c. Discrimination Motivated by Lower-Level Supervisor; Cat's Paw	434
d. Disability Incurred While in Military Service	436
e. Disparate Impact Theory Inapplicable	437
f. Reprisal Against the Exercise of USERRA Rights	439
6. Recovery Period	440
a. Nonretroactive Substantive Application	442
b. Vietnam Era Veterans' Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974	445

7.	Covered Personnel; Agencies	446
a.	Contractor Employee	451
b.	Relatives of Service Members	453
8.	Military Restoration Rights	453
a.	National Guard Return Rights; 38 USC 2024(d)	457
b.	Length of Service Before Loss of Restoration Right	461
c.	Conditions of Discharge From Military Service	462
d.	Effect of Release From Service for Disability	462
e.	Delay in Requesting Restoration Following Military Service	466
f.	Elimination of Position Through RIF	466
9.	Other Personnel Action, Benefits	468
a.	Dismissal From Employment; Demotion; Abandonment of Civilian Career	468
b.	Constructive Adverse Action	473
c.	Suspension	474
d.	Failure to Appoint	474
e.	Failure to Consider Employee for Vacant Positions; Manipulation or Abolition of Positions	479
f.	Denial of Priority Consideration	482
g.	Performance Appraisal	483
h.	Noncompetitive Promotion; Bid Assignment; Escalator Principle; Interim Promotion	483
i.	Reassignment	490
j.	Retirement Benefits	491
k.	Education Benefits	492
l.	Military Leave; <i>Butterbaugh</i>	492
m.	Charge to Leave	500
n.	Harassment; Hostile Working Environment	501
o.	Reprisal	504
p.	Change in Employment Status; Reemployment; Benefits Following Restoration to Duty	506
q.	Ready Reserve Status	514
C.	VETERANS EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES ACT	514
1.	Statutory Structure	517
a.	Burden of Proof	518
b.	Related EEO Violation, Prohibited Personnel Practice, Other Challenges	518
2.	Covered Personnel	519
a.	Statutory Exclusions	527
3.	Definition of Agency	530
4.	Time for VEOA Appeal	532
5.	Mandatory Exhaustion of Department of Labor Remedy; Time for Complaint	533
a.	Specificity Required for Labor Department Complaint	537
b.	Equitable Tolling of Time Limits; Waiver of Administrative Exhaustion Requirement	538
c.	Effect of Settlement Reached by Department of Labor	549
d.	Termination of Proceedings to Pursue Case in Court	549
6.	Liberal Pleading Standard	550
7.	Basis for Veterans Preference	552
8.	General Operation and Application of Veterans Preference on Appointment Process	553
a.	Category Rating System	554
b.	Excepted Service Position; "Positive Factor"; Attorneys	557
c.	Title 10 Intelligence Position	572
d.	Geographic Extent of Competition	572
e.	Qualifications for Position; Exclusion From Consideration; Consideration of Experience	573
f.	Education Requirement	583
g.	Time-In-Grade Requirement	584
h.	Assessment of Medical Fitness	586
i.	Consideration for Position but Nonselection; Limitation on Consideration Imposed by the Applicant	586
j.	Improper Assessment of Qualifications	588
k.	Disabled Veteran	590
l.	Age Limit on Appointment	590
9.	Disciplinary Case	596
10.	Reassignment; Transfer	596
11.	Retirement Benefit	597
12.	Other Benefits	597
13.	Appointment and Promotion Processes Challenges	597

a.	Necessity for Application.....	598
b.	Competitive Appointment Procedures; Exceptions to Competitive Requirements	598
c.	Appointment Through Reinstatement	603
d.	Merit Promotion With Internal Candidates Only; Reassignment; Reinstatement	603
e.	Merit Promotion, Open to External Candidates; Canceled Announcement; “Right to Compete” Claim	606
f.	Position Announced Under Both Open Competition and Merit Promotion Procedures.....	616
g.	Impact of Collective Bargaining Agreement	620
h.	Background Investigation	621
i.	Veterans Readjustment Authority Appointment	622
j.	Federal Career Intern Program	623
k.	Outstanding Scholar Program	632
l.	Pathways, Recent Graduates Program	638
m.	Foreign Service.....	644
n.	Failure to Provide Proper Veterans Preference.....	645
14.	Remedial Structure; Reconstruction of Selection Process; Removal of Selectee.....	646
a.	Use of Improper Appointment Authority.....	659
b.	Manipulation of Appointments; Cancellation of Vacancy	660
c.	Rule of Three.....	669
d.	Passover Process	670
e.	Mootness; Review of Agency-Initiated Reconstruction Effort	674
15.	Damages, Performance Award.....	676
VI.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATION.....	680
A.	APPELLATE PROCEDURES.....	686
B.	APPLICATION TO COMPETITIVE SERVICE APPOINTEES.....	686
1.	Employees Serving in Probationary or Trial Periods.....	687
C.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS BY AGENCIES OPERATING UNDER AUTHORITY DELEGATED BY OPM	687
1.	Constructive Suitability Determination	690
2.	Evidence of Material, Intentional False Statement, or Deception or Fraud.....	690
3.	Nonselection for Position; Constructive Suitability Determination Under Delegated Authority	692
a.	Cases Decided Under OPM Regulations Predating 2008.....	698
4.	Impact of 2008 OPM Suitability Regulations.....	704
D.	ADJUDICATION STANDARDS	705
1.	Mitigation; EEO Defenses	708
2.	Disparate Treatment	709
3.	Rehabilitation	709
E.	EVIDENCE	709
1.	Collateral Estoppel; <i>Res Judicata</i>	711
F.	BASES FOR SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS.....	712
1.	Falsification of Employment Document	712
2.	Drug Involvement	713
3.	Post-Appointment Conduct.....	714
4.	Criminal or Dishonest Conduct.....	717
5.	Other Problems	718
G.	REMEDIES	718
1.	Mootness.....	720
H.	RELATION OF SUITABILITY AND PASSOVER DETERMINATIONS	720
I.	RELATION OF OPM-DIRECTED SUITABILITY REMOVAL AND ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL RIGHTS, MITIGATION ANALYSIS; <i>AGUZIE</i>	722
VII.	OPM REGULATION REVIEW; CHALLENGES TO AGENCY IMPLEMENTATION OF OPM REGULATIONS; CHALLENGES TO OPM EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES	731
A.	REGULATION AND REGULATION IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW PROCEDURES	732
1.	General Criteria for Regulation Review and Regulation Implementation Review	732
a.	Distinction Between Regulation Review, Implementation Review.....	736
2.	Pleading Requirements; Scope of Review.....	737
a.	Discretionary Review; Likelihood of Success.....	738
b.	Likelihood of Harm	738
c.	Likelihood Issues Will Be Addressed in a Different MSPB Appeal or a Different Forum.....	739
d.	Standing; “Interested Person”	740
e.	Covered Personnel Action.....	741
3.	Examples of Regulation Review	741
a.	Administrative Law Judge Examination Authority	741

b.	SES Reassignment, Work Schedule	741
c.	Administration of Leave	743
d.	OPM Qualification Standards	743
e.	Scope of Administrative Grievance Procedure	744
f.	Other Issues	744
4.	Examples of Regulation Implementation Review	746
a.	SES Performance Appraisal Dispute	747
B.	EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE CHALLENGES	748
1.	Time and Place for Filing Appeal	753
2.	Agency Misapplication of Valid OPM Requirement; Agency Employment Practices; Nonselections	754
3.	Standing to Raise Challenge	758
4.	General Characteristics of Tests Rather Than Individual Examination Results at Issue	760
5.	Failure to Hire	761
6.	Scope of Competition	762
7.	Position Qualification Standard; Educational Requirement	762
8.	Medical and Physical Qualification Requirements	768
9.	OPM Involvement in Agency Selection	769
10.	Selection and Examination Practices for Administrative Law Judges	772
a.	Rule of Three	778
11.	Passover Determination	780
12.	Time-In-Grade Restriction	782
13.	Eligibility Rating and Suitability Determination	783
14.	Failure to Promote	783
15.	Remedy	784
VIII.	CHALLENGES TO ADVERSE PERSONNEL RECORDS NOTATIONS	784

CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY 785

I.	INITIATING AN APPEAL	785
A.	RULES AND PRACTICES OF GENERAL APPLICATION GOVERNING APPEALS	785
1.	Dates of Filing	785
2.	Service of Pleadings	785
3.	Electronic Filing Regulation, Dates of Electronic Filing; Technical Difficulties	786
4.	MSPB Processing of Appeal	791
B.	TIME FOR FILING APPEAL	792
1.	Treatment of Timeliness Issues	792
2.	Jurisdiction or Timeliness as Alternate Bases for Dismissal of Appeal	793
3.	Time to Appeal; Regulatory Provisions; Computation of Time	796
a.	Allegations of Discrimination—Mixed Case	796
b.	Effect of Labor Contract Grievance Procedure	797
c.	Computation of Time	797
d.	Technical Constructions	797
e.	Request for Extension of Time to Appeal	799
4.	Suspension Appeals	799
a.	Indefinite Suspension; Enforced Leave	799
5.	Individual Right of Action Appeals	803
6.	USERRA Appeal	803
7.	Negative OPM Reconsideration Decision Appeal	804
a.	Failure to Seek Timely Reconsideration; Requests to Extend Time to Request Reconsideration	806
b.	Board Appeal With Belated Receipt of Reconsideration Request	812
c.	Relation Between Scope of Reconsideration Request and Appeal	812
d.	Failure of OPM to Act on Reconsideration Request; Failure of OPM to Advise of Reconsideration Right	812
e.	Overpayment Determinations	817
8.	Law Enforcement Officer Retirement Credit Appeal	818
C.	METHOD AND PLACE OF FILING	820
1.	Method of Filing	820
a.	Mail	820
b.	Significance of Postmark: Presumptive Filing Date	820
c.	Significance of Actual Mailing Date; Mailstream Rule: Actual Filing Date	821
d.	Commercial Delivery	821
e.	Facsimile	821
f.	Personal Delivery	822

g. Electronic Filing.....	822
2. Irregular and Misdirected Filings.....	822
a. Appeal To or From Congressional Office.....	822
b. Misfiled Mixed Case Appeal	823
c. Non-Mixed Appeal Filed With Employing Agency	825
d. Appeal Misdirected Within MSPB, to OPM, or to OSC	826
e. Incomplete Appeal	827
D. PREMATURE APPEALS.....	827
1. Abeyance Arrangement.....	827
2. Premature Appeal That Ripens Into Appealable Action During Regional Adjudication or During PFR	828
3. Retirement Appeal.....	830
4. Mixed and Whistleblowing Cases; Actions Initiated in Court	831
E. TIMELINESS OF APPEALS.....	832
1. Judge’s Responsibility to Provide Notice Concerning a Timeliness Issue	833
a. Mental or Physical Illness; <i>Lacy</i> Notice.....	835
b. Duty of Appellant to Produce Evidence Concerning Timeliness	837
c. Duty of Agency and Judge to Produce and Develop Evidence Concerning Timeliness	838
2. Waiver; <i>Alonzo</i>	840
a. Prejudice to Respondent; <i>Laches</i>	842
b. Current Law on Waiver; Multifactor Analysis.....	842
c. Historical Position on Waiver.....	847
d. Retirement Appeals	849
3. Application for Waiver	850
a. Hearing Entitlement on a Timeliness Issue	851
b. Due Diligence	854
4. Labor Contract Stay Provision; Postal Service Employee; Agency-Initiated Stay.....	854
F. JUSTIFICATION FOR LATE FILING	856
1. Sickness or Hospitalization.....	856
a. Supporting Evidence.....	857
b. Mental Impairment.....	858
c. Effect of Continuing Mental Disorder on Filing Deadline.....	859
2. Substitute Employment, Travel, or Other Activities.....	861
3. Military Service.....	861
4. Incarceration; Criminal Proceeding	864
5. Need to Obtain Documentation.....	864
6. Unfamiliarity With MSPB Procedures and Law; Ambiguous Agency Communications	865
a. Inability to Obtain Counsel	866
b. Language Difficulties	866
c. Miscalculation of Time for Appeal.....	867
7. Lack of, Interference With, or Incorrect Notice	868
a. Obligation to Provide Notice; Appeal Form.....	868
b. Belated Receipt of Adverse Action Decision.....	873
c. Constructive Receipt of Decision Notice.....	875
d. Proof Concerning Delivery of Notice of Appeal Right	877
e. Notice of Appeal Right to Appellant’s Representative.....	877
f. Appellant’s Responsibility When Decision Notice or Information About Appeal Rights Is Not Received	877
g. Constructive Adverse Action; Notice if Agency Learns of Employee’s Protest.....	878
h. Constructive Adverse Action Without Notice of Employee’s Protest to Agency	881
(i) <i>Jones, Krizman</i> and Beyond.....	888
i. Adverse Action or Performance-Based Appeal Arising From Last Chance or Other Settlement Agreement	892
j. Lack of Notice Concerning Restoration and Reemployment Appeal Rights	894
k. Enforced Leave	897
l. Agency on Notice but Fails to Provide Appeal Rights; Secondary Information Concerning Appeal Rights	898
m. Prior or Subsequent Notice of Filing Deadline	899
n. Agency Misrepresentation.....	900
o. Threats by Agency Personnel.....	902
p. Mixed Case Notice Problems.....	902
q. Problem With or Delayed Receipt of Domestic, Certified, or International Mail, or Commercial Delivery; Address Change	903
8. Appeal Lost in the Mail.....	910
9. Facsimile Problems	912

10. Electronic Filing Problem	912
11. Problem Caused by Adjudicators; Misdirected Appeal.....	913
a. MSPB.....	913
b. EEOC.....	913
c. OPM.....	913
12. Uncertainty as to Outcome of a Related Case; Pending Settlement Negotiations or Investigation; Case Taken to Court.....	915
a. Grievances.....	915
13. Inadequate Representation.....	916
a. Delay Not Excused	916
b. Delay Excused; Counsel's Delay Balanced Against Appellant's Best Efforts; Retirement Cases	917
c. Delay Excused; Obstruction or Misrepresentation by Counsel.....	919
d. Delay Excused; Inconsequential Delay by Representative	924
14. Other Problems	924
G. TIME FOR RAISING NEW APPELLATE ISSUES AND CLAIMS.....	925
1. Issues and Defenses	925
a. Liberal Construction of Pleadings; Issues Raised at Hearing	925
b. EEO Affirmative Defenses	925
2. Claims	925
H. MOOT, WITHDRAWN, AND WAIVED APPEALS.....	926
1. Mootness of Appeal	926
a. Cancellation of Action Appealed.....	927
b. Restoration of <i>Status Quo Ante</i>	929
c. Initiation of New Action Based on Events Leading to Canceled Action	936
d. Procedure Followed if Action Not Completely Rescinded.....	936
e. Procedure Following Remand to Judge.....	937
f. Settlement Independent of MSPB Appeal	938
g. Complete Relief Through Other Means; Stay of Pending Litigation.....	947
h. Collateral Issues Following Rescission of Action; Claims for Counsel Fees or General Damages; Interest.....	948
i. EEO Allegation; Claim for Compensatory Damages	949
j. Whistleblower Protection Act: Claims for Damages, Other Relief	951
k. Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act	957
l. Resignation or Retirement Before Termination	959
m. Criminal Conviction	959
n. Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	959
o. OPM Rescinds Reconsideration or Final Decision; Overpayment Recovery; Withdrawal of or Additional Retirement Application.....	960
p. Administrative Law Judge Complaint.....	966
q. Other Problems	966
2. Effect of Retirement on Appealable Action.....	966
a. Effect of Cleansing Personnel File When Removal Is Accompanied by Retirement; Effect of Claim for Damages	973
b. Reduction in Force Appeal.....	976
c. Prior Law; Disability Retirement.....	977
3. Withdrawal of Appeal.....	978
a. Withdrawal to Pursue EEO Complaint; Withdrawal of EEO Claim	981
b. Withdrawal to Pursue a Labor Contract Grievance Procedure.....	983
c. Confusion Between Necessity for Withdrawal of Appeal, Continuance, and Withdrawal of Appeal Without Prejudice to Refile	984
d. Unauthorized Act of Representative	985
e. Duress; Misrepresentation; Incompetence	988
f. Mistake	991
g. Misleading or Incomplete Information From Judge.....	991
h. Attempts to Refile, Reinstate, or Reopen Withdrawn Appeals.....	994
4. Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile ("DWOP").....	998
a. Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1003
b. Procedures for Obtaining Dismissal; Refiling	1004
c. Refiling Date	1005
d. Effect of PFR	1007
e. Agency-Initiated Request; Prior Practice.....	1008
f. Dismissal Initiated by Judge or MSPB.....	1008
g. Delay in Refiling; Retirement Case	1010

h.	Late Refiling; Independent Right of Appeal	1015
i.	Imperfect Attempt to Refile; Confusion Caused by Judge	1015
5.	Waiver of Appeal Through Last Chance or Other Preappeal Agreement	1016
a.	Jurisdictional Analysis.....	1018
b.	Public Policy Considerations; Complete Preclusion of Appeal; Conflict With Agency Regulation; Valid Consideration; Scope of Agreement.....	1026
c.	Ambiguous Term; Failure to Waive Future Appeal Right.....	1029
d.	Due Process Considerations; Notice	1032
e.	Last Chance Agreement Superseded by Independent Adverse Action	1034
f.	Lack of Authority of Representative to Enter Agreement.....	1035
g.	Agreement to Accept Demotion	1035
h.	Bad Faith, Coercion, or Lack of Mental Capacity	1036
i.	Agency Breach of Agreement or Appellant's Compliance With Agreement as a Jurisdictional Condition	1042
j.	Burden of Proof on Breach of Agreement	1043
k.	Hearing Entitlement	1045
l.	Illegal or Punitive Term	1049
m.	Condition Unrelated to Underlying Action; Vague or Ambiguous Condition; Condition Described in Notice of Violation of LCA	1050
n.	Discrimination, Reprisal	1055
o.	Claim Collateral to Breach of Agreement.....	1056
p.	Duration of Agreement	1056
6.	Personnel Action Resulting From Settlement Not Constituting Last Chance Agreement	1057
7.	Settlement Reached During Board Appeal	1059
II.	FORMAT AND PRELIMINARY PROCESSING OF APPEAL	1059
A.	ESSENTIAL INFORMATION.....	1059
B.	FORMAT.....	1060
1.	Interpretation of Appeal.....	1061
2.	Signature	1062
3.	Appeal Filed Through Representative	1062
4.	"John Doe" Appeal: Protecting Appellant's Privacy.....	1063
5.	Agency-Initiated Retirement Appeal	1065
6.	Class Action, Consolidated Appeals, and Joinder; Bifurcated Appeals.....	1065
a.	Consolidation	1066
b.	Joinder; Compulsory Joinder	1068
c.	Class Action	1070
d.	Bifurcated Appeals.....	1071
7.	Substitution; Survival of Claim	1072
a.	IRA Case.....	1073
C.	INTERVENTION	1074
1.	Intervention of Right: OPM, OSC	1074
a.	OPM	1075
b.	OSC	1076
2.	Permissive Intervention	1076
3.	Rights of Intervenor.....	1079
4.	<i>Amicus Curiae</i>	1079
D.	STEPS TAKEN AFTER APPEAL IS FILED	1079
1.	Acknowledgment of Appeal.....	1081
a.	Philippines Retirement Appeal	1082
2.	Amendment of Appeal.....	1082
3.	Service of Pleadings	1082
4.	Deficient Appeal.....	1083
E.	AGENCY RESPONSE TO APPEAL.....	1084
1.	Narrative Response to Appeal	1085
2.	Motion to Dismiss Appeal.....	1086
3.	Delay in Appeal Response.....	1086
4.	Designation of Agency Representative.....	1086
F.	APPEALS INVOLVING JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	1087
1.	Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegation	1090
2.	Judge Must Ensure Jurisdictional Issues Are Identified; <i>Burgess</i> Notice	1091
3.	Agency Representative's Responsibilities	1094
4.	Hearing on Jurisdictional Issue	1095

G.	REPRESENTATIVES.....	1096
1.	Right to Representation.....	1096
a.	Inadequate Representation.....	1098
b.	Service on Representative.....	1099
2.	Disqualification of Representative; Application of State Disciplinary Rules.....	1100
3.	Conflicts.....	1100
a.	Representative as Witness.....	1103
4.	Disciplinary Rules and Proceedings.....	1104
H.	PRO SE AND INADEQUATELY REPRESENTED PARTIES.....	1104
1.	Pro Se Appellant.....	1104
2.	Assistance to Mentally Incompetent Appellant; French Procedure.....	1105
I.	EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS.....	1109
1.	What They Are.....	1110
2.	How Ex Parte Communications Are Treated.....	1112
III.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS.....	1112
A.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL PROCEDURE.....	1113
1.	Regulation.....	1113
2.	Application of Regulation.....	1115
a.	Rulings on Bias and Intervention.....	1116
b.	Direct Appeal to MSPB.....	1117
3.	Stay of Proceeding.....	1117
IV.	DISCOVERY.....	1118
A.	AN OVERVIEW OF DISCOVERY PROCEDURES.....	1118
1.	Regulatory Structure.....	1119
2.	Initial Disclosures.....	1122
3.	Preliminary Steps in Discovery.....	1122
4.	Discovery Limitations.....	1123
a.	Jurisdictional or Timeliness Issue.....	1123
5.	Discovery Dispute; Motion to Compel.....	1124
6.	Federal Rules.....	1127
a.	Federal Rules of General Application.....	1127
7.	Interrogatories.....	1129
a.	Use of Interrogatories.....	1129
8.	Deposition.....	1130
9.	Other Discovery Devices.....	1132
a.	Document Request.....	1132
b.	Request for Admission.....	1133
c.	Medical, Psychiatric Examinations.....	1134
d.	Motion for More Definite Statement of Appeal.....	1136
10.	Discovery From Nonparties.....	1136
B.	STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS IN DISCOVERY.....	1137
1.	Burdensome Discovery.....	1137
a.	Effect of EEO, Reprisal Allegations.....	1138
b.	Discovery During Pendency of Criminal Proceedings.....	1138
2.	Privileged Information.....	1138
a.	In Camera Inspection.....	1139
b.	Law Enforcement Privilege.....	1140
c.	OSC File; Executive and Investigative Privileges.....	1141
d.	OPM Suitability File.....	1142
e.	Agency Investigative File.....	1142
f.	Attorney-Client Privilege.....	1143
g.	Attorney Work Product Privilege.....	1147
h.	Agency Deliberative Process Privilege.....	1150
i.	Statutory Confidentiality Limitations.....	1151
3.	Privacy Act.....	1152
4.	Failure to Use Discovery.....	1154
5.	Informal Discovery; Control By Agencies Of Employees' Time.....	1155
6.	Protective Order.....	1156
C.	ENTRY OF DISCOVERY MATERIAL INTO RECORD.....	1156
D.	SUBPOENAS.....	1158
1.	When a Subpoena Is Used.....	1158

2.	Obtaining, Serving Subpoena	1158
a.	Witnesses Outside the United States	1160
3.	Challenge; Enforcement	1160
4.	Witness Fees; Travel Allowances	1161
E.	REVIEW OF DISCOVERY RULINGS	1162
1.	Effect of Denial of Discovery	1162
a.	Preservation of Issue	1164
2.	Rulings on Discovery Disputes	1165
a.	Synopsis of Testimony	1165
b.	Relevance, Overbroad Request	1165
c.	Mitigation; Disparate Treatment	1167
d.	Deposition of Agency Head	1167
e.	Electronic Records	1167
f.	Inspection Rather Than Production of Documents	1168
3.	Discovery in OSC Case	1169
V.	SANCTIONS	1169
A.	MONETARY SANCTIONS; ATTORNEY FEES	1171
B.	FAILURE TO RESPOND TO APPEAL	1171
1.	Default Judgment	1172
C.	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE APPEAL	1172
1.	Dismissal Warranted	1173
a.	Failure to Provide Basis for Appeal	1174
b.	Failure to Designate Representative	1175
c.	Failure to Comply With Judge's Order	1175
2.	Dismissal Unwarranted	1177
a.	Failure to Attend Hearing	1178
b.	Inadvertent or Isolated Failure to Obey Order	1178
c.	Late Appeal	1181
D.	FAILURE TO COOPERATE IN DISCOVERY	1181
1.	Discovery Procedures	1181
a.	Sanction Against Agency	1182
b.	Material in Control of Third Party	1184
c.	Sanction Against Appellant	1185
E.	FAILURE TO FOLLOW PREHEARING OR HEARING PROCEDURES	1187
1.	Sanction Against Appellant; Prejudice to Agency	1187
2.	Sanction Against Agency	1189

CHAPTER 3: HEARING..... 1191

I.	HEARING.....	1191
A.	RIGHT TO HEARING	1191
1.	<i>De Novo</i> Hearing	1192
2.	Jurisdictional Hearing; Documentary Evidence	1192
a.	Timeliness Issue	1196
b.	Issue of Law; No Material Disputed Facts; Summary Judgment	1196
3.	Counsel	1198
4.	Control by Judge	1198
a.	Role of Intervenor	1201
5.	Official Time; Resources Available to Appellant	1201
B.	WAIVER OF HEARING	1201
1.	Inability to Travel to Hearing Site	1204
2.	Failure to Request Hearing	1205
a.	New Decisional Standard; Remanded Case	1206
3.	Untimely Hearing Request	1207
a.	Effect of Amendment of Appeal	1207
4.	Withdrawal of Hearing Request	1207
a.	Failure to Receive Hearing Notice	1208
b.	Postponement Denied	1209
c.	Events Beyond Appellant's Control	1210
5.	Strategic Considerations—Intentional Waiver	1210
6.	Adjudication After Waiver, Failure to Attend Hearing	1210
7.	Case Adjudicated Without a Hearing; Right to Respond to Evidentiary Submission	1211

C.	POSTPONEMENT OF HEARING	1215
1.	Timing of Hearing	1215
2.	MSPB Policy on Postponement	1216
a.	Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile	1217
b.	Case Suspension	1217
3.	Postponement or Continuance Procedure	1217
a.	Request; Form of Sworn Statement	1218
b.	Failure to Make Request.....	1219
c.	Status of Pending Motion.....	1219
d.	Proceeding After Denial of Motion	1219
4.	Good Cause Requirement.....	1219
a.	Need to Prepare	1219
b.	Awaiting Outcome of Another Case.....	1220
c.	Unavailability of Representative; New Representative	1220
(i)	Case Proceeds to Hearing	1223
d.	Medical Condition of Appellant.....	1223
e.	Effect of Criminal Proceeding on Appeal; Indefinite Suspension	1224
f.	Appellant Incarcerated	1226
g.	Military Service	1228
h.	Change in Hearing Location.....	1228
i.	Missing or Unavailable Witness	1228
5.	Postponement or Continuance Denial—Review Standard	1228
D.	VENUE OF HEARING.....	1229
1.	Change of Venue	1230
a.	Cost to Appellant	1231
2.	Requesting a Change of Venue.....	1231
3.	Venue Determination Review Standard	1231
E.	HEARING FUNDAMENTALS	1232
1.	Change, Resignation, or Death of Judge	1232
2.	Interaction With Judge.....	1232
3.	Prehearing Submission	1233
4.	Prehearing Conference	1233
a.	Stipulations.....	1236
b.	Waiver or Withdrawal of Affirmative Defense	1237
c.	Dismissal of Charge	1237
5.	Memorandum or Order Summarizing Conference.....	1237
a.	Preservation of Objection; Incomplete Summary.....	1238
b.	Treatment of EEO and Other Affirmative Defenses; Summary Judgment.....	1240
F.	CONDUCT OF HEARING; RESPONSIBILITIES OF JUDGE	1242
1.	Hearing Error: Measure of Damage	1243
a.	Timing of Submission of Pleadings	1244
b.	Timing of Initial Decision	1244
2.	Control and Exclusion of Representative or Participant.....	1244
3.	Maintaining Order.....	1246
a.	Exclusion From Hearing Room of an Individual Whose Presence May Intimidate a Witness	1246
b.	Security Arrangement	1246
4.	Witness Control; Sequestration.....	1247
5.	Conduct of Questioning	1249
a.	Multiple Representatives.....	1250
6.	Permitting Record Development	1250
a.	Videoconference, Telephone Hearing.....	1251
b.	Bifurcated Hearing	1255
c.	Hearing Subpoena	1257
7.	Ensuring Record Development; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; EEO File	1257
a.	Annuity Appeal	1260
b.	Duty of Judge to Inform an Appellant of Governing Law; Assistance to <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; Liberal Construction of Pleadings	1261
8.	Raising Issue <i>Sua Sponte</i> ; Addressing Legal Issues	1263
9.	Preserving Review Right Through Objection.....	1264
10.	Media Coverage.....	1264
11.	Public Hearing; Closing the Hearing	1266

12. Timing of Hearing	1266
13. Hearing Accommodation for Disabled Appellant; Interpreter	1266
14. Allocation of Burden of Proof	1268
15. Opening Statement.....	1268
a. Advice to All Representatives	1268
b. Advice to Appellant’s Counsel	1268
16. Brief; Oral Argument	1268
a. Closing Argument	1269
G. PREVENTION OF INTERFERENCE WITH MSPB PROCEEDINGS	1269
1. Protective Order.....	1269
2. Protective Order for Appellant	1270
3. Interference With and Protection of Witness, Representative; Sanctions.....	1271
a. Agency Regulatory Restriction on Appearance of Employee as Witness	1275
H. POSTHEARING ACTIVITIES	1276
1. Closing Record	1276
a. Ensuring Notice of Record Closing	1277
b. Clarifying Scope of Record; Off-The-Record Discussions	1278
c. Timing of Evidentiary Submissions, Responses.....	1278
d. Effect of Closing Record	1280
2. Regional Authority After Initial Decision	1280
a. Judge’s Request to Reopen Record to Correct Error	1280
II. MOTION PRACTICE	1280
A. USE OF MOTIONS.....	1281
1. Dispositive Motion	1283
a. Motion to Dismiss Filed Prior to Hearing	1283
b. Motion to Dismiss Filed During Hearing.....	1284
c. Summary Judgment.....	1285
d. Affirmative Defense Order; Requirement of Specific Factual Allegations	1289
B. FORM AND TIMING OF MOTIONS.....	1291
III. WITNESSES	1292
A. WITNESS REQUEST	1292
1. Obligation to Permit Relevant Testimony	1292
a. Competence to Testify	1292
b. Appellant	1293
c. Decisionmaker.....	1293
d. Agency Head	1293
2. Obligation to Request Witness	1293
a. Witness List	1294
b. Rebuttal Witness	1296
3. Repetitious Testimony	1296
4. Offer of Proof	1296
5. Compelling Witness Attendance	1297
a. Appellant.....	1297
b. Others; Former Employee; Subpoena	1297
c. Duty Status of Federal Employee Witness; Entitlement to Pay, Travel Expense, Per Diem.....	1298
d. Official Time for Federal Employee	1298
6. Protecting Record; Missing Witness	1299
a. Preservation of Objection.....	1300
7. Judge May Call Witness.....	1300
8. Obtaining Testimony by Alternate Means.....	1300
9. Right of Witness to Representation	1301
a. Self-Incrimination	1301
10. Witness Denial—Review Standard	1301
B. EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES	1302
1. Production of Witness Statement, Document Relied on During Testimony	1303
2. Taking Witness Out of Order	1304
3. Leading Questions.....	1304
4. Control of Questioning by Judge	1305
5. Examination by Judge	1305
IV. DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGE	1306
A. PRESUMPTION OF HONESTY AND IMPARTIALITY	1306

1. Competence of Judge	1308
B. TREATMENT OF BIAS ALLEGATIONS.....	1308
1. Procedure; Documenting Record.....	1310
2. Significance of Extrajudicial Source of Bias.....	1312
3. Treatment of Bias Allegation by Judge, Board.....	1313
4. Specific Bias Allegations	1313
a. Relation With Party or Witness.....	1313
b. Relation With Counsel.....	1313
c. Improper Communication	1314
d. Examination of Witness.....	1314
e. Criticism of Counsel, Party, or Position; Settlement Effort; <i>Ex Parte</i> Communication.....	1315
f. Prior Ruling Against Party.....	1319
g. Erroneous Ruling	1319
h. Incorrect Factual Conclusion.....	1319
i. Hasty or Late Decision	1320
j. Change in Judge Without Finding of Bias	1320

CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE..... 1323

I. FUNDAMENTALS	1323
A. RELEVANCE, MATERIALITY, AND FAIRNESS	1323
1. Informal Adjudication	1323
2. Relevance and Materiality	1323
a. <i>De Novo</i> Review	1324
b. Conditional Admission of Evidence.....	1324
3. Record.....	1324
a. Offer of Proof.....	1324
4. Fairness in Development of Evidence.....	1324
a. Erroneous Exclusion of Evidence	1324
b. Erroneous Admission of Evidence.....	1325
c. Manipulation or Redaction of Evidence.....	1325
B. NATURE OF CHARGES	1326
1. Evidentiary Value of Charge	1326
a. Response to Charge	1327
C. HEARSAY	1328
1. <i>Borninkhof</i>	1329
2. Judicial Interpretations	1331
3. 5 USC 2302(b)(2): Investigative Statement	1332
II. EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE	1332
A. DOCUMENTS	1332
1. Response to Appeal	1333
2. Medical Report, Records.....	1333
3. Notes of Witness; Memorandum of Conversation	1334
4. Time and Attendance Record; Recollection Recorded	1334
5. Production Record, Report; Business Record.....	1334
6. Regulation; Law	1335
7. Evidence From Other MSPB Hearing; Other Judicial Proceeding.....	1335
8. Procedure for Introducing Document; Demonstrative Evidence	1335
9. Authentication Requirement	1337
a. Handwriting	1337
b. Significance of Signature	1337
c. Copy; Photograph	1337
B. PHYSICAL EVIDENCE.....	1337
1. Custody and Control	1337
2. Use at Hearing	1338
C. ADMISSIONS	1338
1. Probative Value	1338
a. Repudiated or Recanted Admission	1339
2. Settlement Offer.....	1340
D. CIRCUMSTANTIAL AND SECONDARY EVIDENCE	1341
1. Common Possession/Multiple Causation.....	1343
2. Contemporaneous Statement.....	1343

3.	Flight or Evasion	1343
4.	Statistics.....	1344
E.	OPINION AND IMPEACHMENT EVIDENCE	1344
1.	Physical Condition	1344
2.	Character.....	1344
a.	Past Misconduct	1346
b.	Arrest, Conviction.....	1347
c.	Reputation	1347
d.	Habit	1347
3.	Department or Demeanor During Hearing	1348
4.	Evidence in Disability Annuity Appeal; <i>Chavez</i> ; Post-Separation Evidence	1348
F.	RECURRENT EVIDENTIARY PROBLEMS.....	1355
1.	Polygraph.....	1355
2.	Sworn, Unsworn Statements.....	1356
a.	No Hearing.....	1357
b.	Hearing Held	1357
c.	Affidavit; Sworn Statement; Declaration; Form of Attestation	1358
d.	Deposition	1360
3.	Investigation Reports.....	1361
4.	Recordings.....	1363
a.	Video	1363
b.	Audio	1363
5.	Transcript of Prior Testimony	1363
6.	Expert Witness; Medical Evidence	1363
a.	Medical Expert Opinion	1365
b.	Other Experts.....	1368
7.	Statements of Representative, Party.....	1368
8.	Testimony of Child	1369
9.	Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Agreement.....	1369
10.	Newspaper Article	1369
11.	Drug Test	1369
III.	SUBSTITUTES FOR DIRECT EVIDENCE	1373
A.	OFFICIAL NOTICE	1373
1.	Regulations.....	1374
a.	Federal Personnel Manual; Agency Handbook, Publication	1374
2.	Related Board Case Records.....	1375
B.	ADVERSE INFERENCES AND PRESUMPTIONS	1375
1.	Silence	1375
2.	Failure to Produce Evidence; Loss of Evidence or Spoliation; Negative or Adverse Inferences.....	1376
a.	Negative Evidence	1380
3.	Presumption.....	1381
a.	Delivery of Mail, Other Documents	1381
C.	STIPULATIONS	1385
1.	Issues of Fact and Law	1386
2.	Stipulations Directed by Judge	1387
D.	<i>RES JUDICATA</i> , COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL, AND LAW OF THE CASE—THE DOCTRINES.....	1387
1.	Elements of <i>Res Judicata</i>	1388
a.	Identity of Prior Cause of Action and Issues	1392
b.	Identity of Parties; Privity	1393
c.	Complete Relief Available	1394
d.	<i>Res Judicata</i> Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB; Waiver of Defense	1395
e.	Jurisdictional Issue	1396
f.	Settlement	1398
g.	Withdrawal of Appeal	1400
2.	Collateral Estoppel.....	1400
a.	Error in Law; Change in Law	1402
b.	Proof of a Prior Adjudication	1403
c.	Privity; Appellant as a Party to Prior Case	1404
d.	Privity of Agencies	1404
e.	Identity of Prior Issue	1405
f.	Jurisdictional, Timeliness Issues.....	1406

g.	Decision of Another Tribunal	1408
h.	Collateral Estoppel Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB	1410
3.	Judicial Estoppel	1410
4.	Law of the Case; Mandate Rule	1412
5.	<i>Stare Decisis</i>	1416
E.	RES JUDICATA AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL—THE DOCTRINES APPLIED	1417
1.	Criminal Conviction.....	1417
2.	Pleas to Criminal Charges.....	1420
a.	Guilty Plea	1420
b.	<i>Nolo Contendere</i> and <i>Alford</i> Pleas	1421
c.	Pretrial Diversion	1425
d.	Conviction, Misconduct Distinguished	1425
3.	Acquittal; Reversal of Criminal Conviction.....	1425
4.	Successive MSPB Cases	1426
a.	Dismissal for Adjudicatory Efficiency.....	1427
b.	WIGI/Removal	1427
c.	Successive RIFs	1428
d.	Whistleblowing Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaint or Appeal.....	1428
e.	USERRA Claims	1435
f.	Suitability Determination	1435
g.	Regulation Review	1436
h.	Prior Action Reversed for Lack of Due Process.....	1436
5.	Other Judicial and Administrative Proceedings.....	1436
a.	Agency Credentialing Committee.....	1436
b.	Union Trial Board	1437
c.	Labor Contract, Administrative Grievances; Arbitrations; Postal Service Employees.....	1438
d.	OPM Annuity Determination	1440
e.	Unemployment Compensation Award	1442
f.	OWCP Finding; Social Security Determination	1444
g.	EEOC Decision.....	1445
h.	Comptroller General or GAO Decision	1446
i.	Judicial Determination	1447
6.	Exceptions to Application of Collateral Estoppel, <i>Res Judicata</i>	1448
a.	Pendency of an Appeal	1448
b.	Fairness of Adjudication; New Evidence	1449
c.	Fraud; Misrepresentation	1449
d.	Change in Law	1450
IV.	EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE	1450
A.	PROCEDURES	1451
1.	Objection, Motion to Strike, Motion <i>in Limine</i>	1451
2.	Witness Exclusion	1451
a.	Disapproval of Proposing Official.....	1451
B.	CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY CHALLENGES	1452
1.	Search.....	1452
a.	Wiretap.....	1457
b.	Recording	1457
c.	Drug Testing	1457
2.	Interrogation.....	1460
a.	Misconduct of Investigator	1460
b.	Compelled Testimony; <i>Kalkines</i> Warning	1460
c.	Right to Silence, Counsel	1463
3.	Denial of Union Representation	1464
C.	OTHER BASES FOR EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE	1465
1.	Claims of Privilege.....	1465
a.	Alcoholism Treatment Records.....	1465
b.	Other Medical Records	1466
c.	Privacy; Attorney-Client Communication	1466
2.	Failure to Follow MSPB Procedure	1466
V.	HEARING RECORD	1466
A.	RIGHT TO AND NECESSITY FOR A RECORD OR TRANSCRIPT	1466
1.	Current MSPB Practice.....	1467

2. Past Treatment of Transcript.....	1468
3. Past Internal MSPB Guidance on Transcript.....	1468
4. Federal Circuit Commentary on Transcript.....	1469
a. Arbitration Case	1469
5. Use of Recording	1469
B. PROBLEMS CONCERNING TRANSCRIPT AND RECORD	1470
1. Off-The-Record Discussion	1470
2. Hearing Recording or Computer Recording Omission; Transcript Error	1470
3. Correction of Transcript	1472
4. Unofficial Transcript.....	1472

CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW..... 1473

I. INITIAL DECISION.....	1473
A. INITIAL DECISION FORMAT	1473
1. Minimum Requirements.....	1473
a. Bench Decision	1475
b. Notice of Right to Review	1476
2. Case Dismissed by Consent; Mootness of Initial Decision	1477
B. REQUIRED ANALYSIS	1477
1. Analytical Structure	1477
a. Analysis of Appeal Presenting Both Timeliness and Jurisdictional Issues	1478
b. Analysis Required; Omitted Factual or Legal Findings.....	1479
c. Incorrect Adjudication Standard.....	1480
2. Issue of Law	1481
a. Adverse Action	1481
b. Annuity Appeal	1481
3. EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue	1482
a. Nondispositive EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue.....	1483
4. Consolidated Cases	1485
5. Counsel Fee Determination	1485
6. Issue Not Raised in Appeal	1485
C. CREDIBILITY FINDINGS	1485
1. Necessary Findings	1485
a. Weight of Evidence Equally Balanced	1486
2. Factors Considered; <i>Hillen</i>	1487
a. Some Testimony Discredited	1489
b. Alibi Defense	1489
c. Inconsistencies; Denials; Memory Lapse; Failure to Provide Statement	1489
d. Contemporaneous Notation, Statement; <i>Post Hoc</i> Explanation.....	1491
e. Self-Serving Testimony; Bias; Criminal Conviction; Past Misconduct	1491
f. Uncontradicted Testimony.....	1492
g. Implausible, Inherently Improbable, Imprecise Testimony	1492
h. Telephonic Hearing.....	1492
i. Determination Made Without Hearing.....	1493
3. Authenticity Issue.....	1493
II. PETITION FOR REVIEW; RECONSIDERATION	1493
A. PFR PROCESS	1493
1. Statutory and Regulatory Structure	1494
a. Scope of Reply to PFR Response.....	1496
2. Cross-PFR.....	1496
a. Conditional Cross-PFR	1497
3. Internal Board Guidance.....	1498
4. Board Treatment of PFR, Reopening Request.....	1499
a. Enforcement Issue.....	1500
5. Effect of Judicial Review on PFR	1500
6. Effect of EEOC Review on PFR	1501
7. Who May Obtain Review	1501
a. OPM	1502
b. OSC	1502
c. Others; Intervention at PFR Stage	1502
8. Grounds for PFR	1502

a.	Evidentiary Disputes	1503
b.	Other Bases for Review; Ineffective Counsel	1503
c.	Fivolous PFR; Sanction	1505
d.	Challenges to Settlement	1505
9.	Time for Filing.....	1505
10.	Service	1506
11.	MSPB Processing	1506
a.	Tied Vote; Lack of Quorum	1508
b.	Decision Effective Upon Issuance by Clerk	1509
c.	Joinder	1509
12.	Failure to Prosecute; Withdrawal of PFR; Failure to Respond	1509
a.	Dismissal Without Prejudice	1509
13.	PFR Settlement Program	1510
14.	MSPB Final Decision	1511
a.	Short Form Order.....	1511
15.	Authority to Reopen and Reconsider	1512
a.	Jurisdictional Issue.....	1515
b.	Due Diligence	1516
c.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1520
d.	Change in Law	1520
e.	Fraud	1522
f.	Retirement Case	1523
g.	Effect of Judicial Review on Petition to Reopen.....	1525
h.	Reopening in Lieu of Excusing Untimely or Defective PFR; Manifest Injustice	1526
i.	Discovery of Additional Legal Argument.....	1526
j.	Correction of Case Processing Error	1527
k.	Manifest Injustice	1527
16.	Entry of Settlement Agreement Into Record.....	1527
B.	INTERIM RELIEF	1528
1.	Effective Date of Interim Relief.....	1531
2.	Effect of Remand or Supplemental Initial Decision on Interim Relief.....	1531
3.	Obligation to Return Employee to Work and Pay; Undue Disruption Determination	1532
a.	Necessity for Undue Disruption Determination.....	1534
b.	Form of Undue Disruption Notice	1535
c.	Implicit Undue Disruption Determination; Strong Overriding Interest.....	1537
d.	Restoration Followed by Removal From Workplace or Adverse Action During Interim Relief Period; Return to Work With Changed Duties	1541
e.	Restoration Followed by Appellant's Inability to Work.....	1542
f.	Pay Entitlement; Overtime; Allowances	1542
g.	Deductibility of Interim Earnings or Severance Pay	1545
h.	Prior "Bad Faith" Implementation Standard	1545
4.	Dismissal of PFR for Failure to Provide Interim Relief	1546
a.	Appellant's Remedy for Inadequate Agency Compliance With Interim Relief Order	1547
b.	Time and Format for Filing Motion to Dismiss PFR for Lack of Proper Interim Relief; Enforcement Procedures	1548
c.	PFR Not Mooted by Overbroad Interim Relief	1549
d.	Effect of Jurisdictional Issue	1550
5.	Certification and Proof of Interim Relief	1550
a.	Evidence of Interim Relief	1551
b.	Substantial Compliance but Technical Error; Supplemental Evidence of Interim Relief	1553
c.	Delay in Payment Following Certification or <i>Prima Facie</i> Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1555
d.	Withdrawal of Interim Relief	1555
6.	Factors Limiting or Warranting Denial of Interim Relief	1556
a.	Receipt of OWCP Compensation	1556
b.	Effect of Retirement.....	1557
c.	Restriction on Extension of Appointment	1558
d.	Waiver or Settlement of Interim Relief; Change in Duties or Employment Status	1558
7.	Special Situations	1560
a.	Retirement Appeals	1560
b.	Suitability Appeal	1561
c.	Mitigation of Removal to Demotion	1561
d.	Mitigation of Removal to Suspension	1562

e.	Demotion Mitigated to Suspension	1562
f.	Mitigation or Cancellation of Suspension	1562
g.	Enforced Leave Concluded by the Date of the Initial Decision.....	1562
h.	Unified Penalty Involving Reassignment	1563
i.	Appeal of Within-Grade Increase Denial	1563
j.	Discriminatory Application of Interim Relief	1563
k.	VEOA Appeals	1563
C.	FACTUAL AND CREDIBILITY FINDINGS	1563
1.	Review of Factual Findings; “Special Deference”	1564
a.	Case Decided on Affidavits or Documents	1569
b.	Telephonic or Videoconference Hearing	1569
2.	Objection Based on Omitted Finding	1569
3.	Unnecessary Finding	1570
4.	Issue of Mental Competence During Appeal Adjudication	1571
D.	NEW EVIDENCE	1571
1.	What Constitutes Evidence	1574
2.	What Evidence Is New	1574
a.	Evidence Previously Available	1575
b.	Timeliness of Appeal, Pleading, or Other Submission	1576
c.	Jurisdictional Issue; Exhaustion of Remedies in IRA, VEOA Cases	1577
d.	Claim of Surprise	1580
e.	Test of Due Diligence	1580
f.	Evidence Concerning Issue First Raised by Judge	1583
g.	Evidence From Another MSPB Case	1583
3.	Materiality of New Evidence	1583
a.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1584
b.	Impeachment Evidence; Rebuttal to Hearing Evidence; Minor Inconsistencies	1584
c.	Subsequent Corroborative Evidence	1588
d.	Evidence of Disparate Treatment	1588
e.	Subsequent OPM, SSA, OWCP, VA Determination; Evidence of Mental Incapacity	1589
f.	Subsequent Adjudication of Past Discipline.....	1590
E.	NEW LAW	1590
F.	NEW ISSUES; ISSUES NOT RAISED WITH THE JUDGE	1592
1.	General Rule.....	1592
a.	Jurisdictional Issue	1593
b.	Order Directing Payment in Violation of Federal Statute.....	1594
2.	Determining if an Issue or Argument Was Raised Below	1594
a.	Annuity Issue	1594
b.	Penalty Determination	1594
c.	Statutory or Constitutional Interpretation Issue	1594
d.	Timeliness of Appeal	1595
e.	Issue of Discrimination	1595
f.	EEOC Treatment Distinguished	1595
g.	Waiver of Issue	1595
G.	TIMELINESS OF PFR	1596
1.	Date and Place of Filing	1596
a.	Deficient but Timely PFR.....	1596
2.	Filing by Facsimile	1597
a.	Misguided Facsimile	1598
3.	Filing by Commercial Delivery.....	1598
4.	Filing by Hand.....	1598
5.	Filing by Mail.....	1599
a.	Proof of Mailing; Rebuttal of Postmark; Letterbox Rule; Sworn Statement Concerning Mailing	1600
b.	PFR Lost in the Mail.....	1603
6.	Electronic Filing.....	1604
7.	Request for Extension of Time	1606
8.	Procedure on Late Submission.....	1607
a.	Affidavit or Sworn Statement Required	1608
b.	Strict Application	1609
c.	Retirement Appeal.....	1610
9.	Justification for Late Filing	1611

a.	Merits of Case.....	1611
b.	Physical or Mental Illness of Appellant, Counsel	1611
c.	Ignorance of Law; Late Discovery of a Legal Defense; Subsequent MSPB Decision in Another Case	1618
d.	Problem With Settlement	1620
e.	Misinterpretation of or Unfamiliarity With MSPB Regulation or Instruction.....	1622
f.	Incorrect Information From MSPB, Others	1623
g.	Incomplete Notice of Right to File PFR.....	1624
h.	Delayed Receipt or Misrouting of Initial Decision or PFR; Constructive Receipt of Initial Decision	1625
i.	Failure to Receive Initial Decision; E-Filer; Change of Address; Incomplete Initial Decision	1627
(i)	Responsibility to Notify Board of Physical or Email Address Change	1630
j.	Electronic Filing Problem.....	1632
k.	Effect of Judge’s Remand to Agency for Redetermination of Segment of Case	1634
l.	Mailroom Delay in Posting PFR	1635
m.	Foreign Mail Problem	1635
n.	Withdrawal, Absence of Representative	1635
o.	Inability to Obtain Representation	1636
p.	Unexcused Delay or Neglect of Representative.....	1637
q.	Excused Neglect of Representative; Diligence of Appellant	1640
r.	Attempt to Obtain Congressional Assistance	1642
s.	Pending Review by Another Adjudicator	1642
t.	Awaiting Transcript, Other Document.....	1643
u.	Delay in Internal Decisionmaking	1644
v.	Military Service.....	1644
w.	Fear of Prosecution; Agency Misrepresentation	1645
x.	Language Difficulties	1645
y.	Office Equipment, Technology, E-Filing Mishap, Related Problems.....	1645
z.	Other Problems.....	1646
10.	Filing PFR With Wrong Agency or MSPB Office	1649
a.	Mixed Case Appeals.....	1649
b.	Other Misdirected Filings	1650
11.	Case or PFR Misfiled in Court	1651
H.	FORMAT AND SUBSTANCE OF PFR; REPLY.....	1652
1.	Regulatory Standards: Submissions; Length; Format	1652
a.	Erroneous Designation of Pleading	1654
b.	Error in Formal Requirements	1654
c.	<i>Pro Se</i> Form PFR.....	1654
2.	Signature, Designation of Representative Required	1655
3.	Specific and Supported Objection	1656
a.	Factual Error	1657
b.	Adjudicatory Error	1657
4.	Lack of Transcript	1657
5.	Response to PFR	1657
6.	Reply Brief.....	1658
7.	Supplemental Authority.....	1658
I.	MOOTNESS OF PFR	1658
1.	Cancelation of Adverse Action; Agency Compliance With Initial Decision	1659
a.	Effect of Appellant’s PFR if No Agency PFR Filed	1659
2.	Settlement; Vacatur of Initial Decision	1659
3.	Regulation Review Proceeding	1660
4.	Retirement Appeal.....	1660
5.	Disqualification of Representative	1660
J.	PROCEDURE ON REMAND.....	1660
1.	Determining Whether a Remand Is Necessary.....	1660
a.	Board Obtains Evidence During PFR	1661
2.	Evidence, Findings From First Hearing.....	1661
a.	Effect of MSPB Order Vacating Initial Decision	1663
3.	Remand for Further Discovery	1663
4.	Remand for More Evidence	1663
a.	Subsequent PFR.....	1664
b.	Entry of Interlocutory or Interim Relief on Remand	1664
5.	Remand for Compliance	1664

K.	OPM RECONSIDERATION REQUESTS	1664
1.	Governing Statute and Regulation	1664
2.	Substantial Impact on Law; Collective Bargaining Agreement Issue, Mixed Case	1667
a.	Decisions Prior to 1990.....	1668
3.	Limited to Facts and Issues of Record	1669
4.	Timing of Request; Arbitration Award	1669
5.	Mootness of Reconsideration Request	1669
6.	EEO Discrimination Decision	1670
L.	STAY REQUESTS	1670
1.	Requested by OPM	1671
a.	Pending Reconsideration Request Is Not a Stay	1673
b.	Pending Request for Supreme Court Review	1674
2.	Requested by Agency	1674
a.	Stay of Enforcement Proceeding	1676
3.	Requested by or for Individual.....	1676
a.	Special Counsel Disciplinary Case	1678
b.	Other OSC Litigation	1679
M.	REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS	1680
1.	Award Subject to Review	1685
a.	Governing Statute and Regulation; Time for Review	1686
b.	EEO Allegation—Ordinarily to Be First Raised With the Arbitrator	1687
c.	Compensatory Damages Claim; Inadequate Analysis by Arbitrator; Remand	1692
d.	Other Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue; Remand	1693
e.	Counsel Fee Claim	1693
2.	Proper Appellant Before MSPB; Labor Union; VA Medical Professional	1693
3.	Method and Scope of MSPB Review	1694
a.	Issue Preclusion	1697
b.	Labor Contract Exclusivity Clause.....	1697
c.	Allegation of Bias, Unfair Hearing	1698
d.	Enforcement of Award Reviewed by MSPB.....	1698
4.	Standard of Review	1699
a.	Penalty, Remedial Determination; Time-Served Suspension	1702
b.	Procedural Issue; Timeliness of Grievance	1709
c.	Discrimination Issue	1712
5.	MSPB Review Procedure.....	1713
a.	Time to Seek Review.....	1715
6.	Postal Service Employees.....	1717
a.	Effect of Arbitration Award on Board Appeal.....	1720

CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS 1725

I.	ADVERSE ACTIONS DEFINED	1725
A.	CANCELATION OF APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION	1725
1.	Appointment.....	1726
a.	Entry on Duty; Action by Appointing Authority; Reliance	1729
b.	Citizenship Issue	1729
c.	Nepotism.....	1731
d.	Selective Service Registration.....	1731
2.	Cancellation of Promotion, Pay Increase	1733
a.	Withdrawal of Offer to Extend Term Appointment.....	1746
3.	Termination by Adverse Action of Appointment Secured by Fraud; Disqualification by OPM or OSC Proceeding; OPM Suitability Disqualification Action	1746
B.	CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTION	1747
1.	Jurisdictional Showing	1749
a.	Specific Allegations Control	1758
b.	Analysis of Totality of Circumstances	1761
c.	Obligation of Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements	1763
d.	Avoidance of Jurisdictional Analysis in Untimely Appeal	1763
e.	Collateral Attack on Settlement Agreement and Waiver of Appeal Right.....	1764
f.	Allegation of Discrimination	1765
2.	General Approach to Analysis of Constructive Adverse Action Appeals	1769
a.	Timing of Operative Events.....	1769

3.	Involuntary Downgrading	1771
a.	Hearing.....	1771
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation	1772
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause	1779
d.	Time Pressure	1781
e.	Improper Reassignment	1781
f.	Withdrawal of Request for Downgrading	1782
g.	Unauthentic Request for Downgrading	1782
h.	Discrimination; Intolerable Working Conditions	1782
i.	External Problems	1786
j.	Correction of Administrative Error	1787
4.	Involuntary Resignation.....	1787
a.	Hearing.....	1791
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation	1792
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause	1797
d.	Time Pressure	1800
e.	Improper Reassignment	1803
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Resign.....	1804
g.	Irrevocable Resignation; VSIP.....	1806
h.	Unauthentic, Ambiguous or Conditional Resignation	1807
i.	Ineffective Resignation	1808
j.	Mental Disability.....	1809
k.	Intolerable Working Conditions	1810
l.	Whistleblowing Reprisal	1818
m.	Discriminatory Working Conditions	1819
n.	Failure to Accommodate Disability	1822
o.	Denial of Leave	1825
p.	External Problems	1826
q.	Probationer	1826
r.	Technical Error	1826
5.	Involuntary Retirement.....	1826
a.	Hearing	1828
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation	1829
(i)	Correction of Retirement Benefit; Placement in the Wrong Retirement System	1841
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause	1842
d.	Time Pressure	1844
e.	Involuntary Reassignment	1845
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Retire	1848
g.	Irrevocable Retirement; VSIP	1849
h.	Intolerable Working Conditions	1853
i.	Whistleblowing Reprisal	1860
j.	Discriminatory Working Conditions	1865
k.	Failure to Accommodate Disability	1869
l.	Discriminatory Conduct Causes the Disability Leading to Retirement.....	1880
m.	Denial of Leave	1881
n.	Mental Disability.....	1882
o.	Agency-Initiated Retirement	1882
p.	Discontinued Service Retirement	1883
q.	Mandatory Retirement	1885
r.	Employing Agency as Party to a Retirement Appeal Against OPM.....	1885
6.	Constructive Demotion Through Reassignment; <i>Russell</i> Appeal	1885
a.	Planned Management Action	1889
b.	Position Must Be Upgraded	1891
c.	Identity of Duties.....	1894
d.	Qualification for Higher-Graded Position	1894
e.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Hearing	1895
f.	Evidence of Classification Error	1895
g.	EEO Allegation	1895
h.	Timeliness of Appeal.....	1895
7.	Involuntary Transfer	1896
C.	ENFORCED LEAVE; CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION	1897

1.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Burden of Proof	1900
a.	Hearing.....	1902
b.	EEO Allegation	1904
c.	Effect of Receipt of OWCP Benefit on Enforced Leave or Constructive Suspension Claim.....	1904
d.	Dispute Over Reemployment Right.....	1905
2.	Requirement for Adverse Action Procedure.....	1906
a.	Leave Status Voluntarily Assumed; Failure to Provide Medical Documentation or to Accept Assigned Duties ...	1909
b.	Process Due to Employee	1913
c.	Substantive Evaluation of Leave Enforced Following Notice to Employee	1913
d.	Disability Accommodation	1913
3.	Employee AWOL	1917
4.	Employee Blocked From Working Because of Employer's Concern About Fitness.....	1919
a.	Employee on LWOP	1925
5.	Light and Limited Duty; Medical Restriction.....	1925
a.	Historical Development of Light Duty Analysis.....	1929
b.	Collective Bargaining Agreement	1934
c.	Disability Accommodation	1938
d.	EEO Settlement	1943
e.	Termination of Light Duty.....	1943
f.	Postal Service National Collective Bargaining Agreements; Other Labor Agreements.....	1945
g.	Furlough	1947
6.	Work Release.....	1947
7.	Bar Order Preventing Entry to Workplace	1947
8.	Temporary Absence Resulting From Intolerable Working Conditions	1949
D.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSION.....	1952
1.	Use	1952
2.	Procedure; Duration	1956
a.	Due Process	1962
b.	Regulatory Error.....	1964
3.	Criminal Activity	1966
a.	Indictment; Filing of Information; Referral for Prosecution	1967
b.	Investigation Accompanied by Other Circumstances.....	1968
c.	Arrest	1970
4.	Security Clearance or Other Investigation.....	1977
a.	Due Process: Separation of Officials Denying Access and Deciding Suspension; Change in Basis for Clearance Suspension.....	1983
b.	Indefinite Prolongation of Suspension.....	1997
5.	Inquiry Into Other Issues	1999
6.	Nexus.....	2004
a.	Alternatives for Clearance Suspension	2007
b.	Discrimination; Accommodation for Disability; Whistleblowing	2013
c.	Medical Conditions.....	2013
7.	Remedy	2014
a.	Action Following Termination of Criminal Proceeding.....	2018
II.	SERVICE EFFICIENCY	2019
A.	BURDEN OF PROOF	2021
1.	Agency Burden of Proof	2021
a.	Suspicion; Belief	2022
b.	Intent	2022
2.	Preponderance of Evidence	2023
a.	Uniformity of Standard	2024
b.	Charge of Violation of Criminal Statute	2024
3.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case	2024
4.	Presumption.....	2024
5.	Employee's Burden: Affirmative Defense.....	2025
B.	PERSONAL FAULT	2025
1.	Adverse Action to Assist Another Employee	2025
a.	Discrimination	2025
b.	Merit Promotion Grievance	2026
c.	Action Directed by Arbitrator.....	2026
2.	Correction of Administrative Error	2026

3. <i>Respondeat Superior</i>	2026
C. ADVERSE ACTION RELATED TO DISABILITY	2029
1. Medical Standard	2029
2. Medical Impairment	2031
a. Agency-Initiated Retirement	2031
b. Assistance in Securing Counsel.....	2035
c. Prior Law: Reasonable Cause to Believe	2035
d. Permissible Action; Mitigation.....	2037
3. Evaluation of Physical Impairment	2037
a. Evidence of Recovery Between Date of Removal and MSPB Decision.....	2040
4. Effect of Removal for Inability to Work on OPM Disability Annuity Determination	2041
a. Rebuttable Presumption of Annuity Entitlement.....	2042
5. Effect of Grant of Disability Retirement Application on Action Based on Inability to Perform Duties	2050
6. Allegation of Disability Discrimination; Lack of Reasonable Accommodation	2052
III. SPECIAL CLASSES OF EMPLOYEES.....	2053
A. SENIOR EXECUTIVE SERVICE	2053
1. Mitigation of Disciplinary Action	2058
2. Performance Case	2059
3. Department of Veterans Affairs.....	2059
a. 2014 Legislation.....	2060
B. ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES.....	2065
1. Scope of MSPB Review	2069
a. Good Cause	2069
b. Penalty Determination	2073
c. Affirmative Defenses	2074
2. Cause for Discipline	2075
a. Insubordination	2077
b. Poor Performance	2078
c. Failure to Follow Performance-Related Directive	2082
d. Remarks to Litigant; Comments in Decision; Conduct of Hearing.....	2084
e. Prolonged Absence; Attendance	2085
f. Other Misconduct	2086
3. Constructive Action Against Judge: <i>Tunik</i>	2089
a. Forced Retirement.....	2096
b. Enforced Leave	2097
c. Pre- <i>Tunik</i> Decisions; Judicial Independence.....	2098
4. Furlough; RIF	2106
5. Settlement of Complaint	2108
6. Voluntary Dismissal of Complaint	2109

CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND MITIGATION2111

I. CONCEPT OF NEXUS	2111
A. <i>MERRITT</i> AND PRESUMPTIONS OF NEXUS; OFF-DUTY CONDUCT.....	2111
1. General Approach Toward Proof.....	2113
a. Actual or Potential Publicity, Notoriety	2114
b. Potential for Future Harm.....	2115
c. Investigative Exertion	2115
B. SPECIFIC NEXUS DETERMINATIONS.....	2115
1. Arrest	2116
2. Violent Off-Duty Misconduct	2116
a. Shooting; Killing	2116
b. Assault; Threat.....	2118
3. Violent Conduct on Agency Premises	2119
4. Off-Duty Drug Offense	2119
a. Drug Activity Involving Agency Time or Facilities	2123
5. Off-Duty Alcohol-Related Offense	2123
a. Off-Duty Action Involving Agency Premises	2124
6. Sexual Misconduct.....	2124
7. Fraud and Theft	2136
a. Off-Duty Offense	2136
b. Preemployment Offense.....	2138

c.	On-Duty or Job-Related Offense	2138
d.	Gambling.....	2139
8.	Failure to Pay Debt	2139
9.	Grievance Meeting	2142
10.	Conduct Contrary to Agency Mission	2142
a.	Real Estate Activity—DHUD	2142
b.	Employee’s Tax Problem—IRS, Other Agencies	2142
c.	Law Enforcement Officer; <i>Giglio</i> Impairment.....	2147
d.	Driver.....	2152
e.	Strike-Related Conduct	2152
11.	AWOL Removal After Criminal Conviction.....	2152
II.	MITIGATION OR AGGRAVATION OF PENALTIES	2152
A.	GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS	2153
1.	<i>Douglas</i> Standards; Decision to Reflect Consideration of Mitigating Factors or MSPB Imposes Maximum Reasonable Penalty.....	2155
a.	Consideration of Mitigating Factors	2156
b.	Proposal to List Aggravating Factors; Treatment of Warnings; Due Process Considerations	2157
c.	Exemplary Penalty.....	2159
d.	Exaggeration of Charge	2159
2.	Articulation of Relevant Factors.....	2160
a.	By Agency; Decision Notice	2160
b.	By MSPB	2161
3.	Not All Charges Sustained; Maximum Reasonable Penalty	2162
a.	Remand to Agency for Redetermination of Penalty	2167
4.	All Charges but Not All Specifications Sustained; Part of a Specification Sustained.....	2168
5.	Charge Sustained That Was Not Brought	2170
6.	Factors Not Considered Mitigating.....	2170
a.	Disability Discrimination; Mental Impairment.....	2170
b.	Discriminatory Environment	2171
c.	Prohibited Personnel Practice.....	2171
d.	Offer of Settlement	2171
7.	When Mitigation Must Be Raised	2171
8.	Special Counsel Disciplinary Case.....	2172
9.	Impact of Mitigation Through Demotion on Collective Bargaining Agreement Requirement	2172
B.	SPECIFIC MITIGATING OR AGGRAVATING FACTORS	2172
1.	Potential for Rehabilitation	2172
a.	Deference to Higher Level Management Assessment.....	2172
b.	Forward-Looking Analysis.....	2173
c.	Performance Action	2173
d.	Prior Notice of Rule or Policy	2174
e.	Temporary Condition; Stress; Alcoholism	2175
f.	Prior Long Service	2176
g.	Weight of Prior Performance Evaluation	2176
h.	Intervening Good Performance; Misconduct Subsequent to Charge Leading to Adverse Action	2177
i.	Post-Removal Conduct or Evidence of Rehabilitation	2178
j.	Display of Contrition or Remorse; Admission of Misconduct	2179
k.	Denial of Misconduct; Vigorous Defense	2180
l.	Position of Trust; Fiduciary Duty; Loss of Trust	2181
m.	Notoriety.....	2183
n.	Repeated Misconduct; Last Chance Agreement.....	2183
2.	Psychological Problem; Medical Condition, Illness or Treatment; Medication; Stress, Job Tension	2184
3.	Intent	2189
4.	Progressive Discipline	2189
a.	Table of Penalties; Classification of Offense	2190
5.	Disparate; Comparable Penalties	2193
a.	Degree of Consistency Required	2197
b.	Substantial Similarity of Offenses; Totality of the Circumstances	2198
c.	Proximity in Time	2203
d.	Same Work Unit; Evolving Case Law: <i>Woebcke</i> ; <i>Lewis</i>	2203
e.	Positions of Similar Levels of Trust and Responsibility	2211
f.	Selective Prosecution.....	2213

g.	Settlement	2213
h.	Comparable Arbitration Awards; Other MSPB Decisions	2216
i.	Effect of Criminal Sentence	2217
j.	Assertion of Discrimination	2217
k.	Duty of Agency to Inquire into Comparable Offenses and Penalties.....	2217
l.	Post-Removal Comparability Analysis	2218
6.	Mandatory Penalty	2219
7.	Staleness of Charge	2222
8.	Agency Bad Faith, Provocation, Manipulation; Improper Pressure on Appellant; Entrapment	2222
9.	Condonation	2223
10.	Favorable Attitude of Coworker; Supervisor	2223
11.	Severity of Misconduct	2224
a.	Sequential Disciplinary Proposals	2224
b.	Multiplicity and Merger of Charges	2224
c.	Zero Tolerance Policy	2224
12.	Employee Job Level.....	2226
a.	Ineffectiveness as Supervisor; Demotion to Nonsupervisory Position; Other Demotion	2227
b.	Reassignment to Different Position	2228
c.	Position of Trust; Loss of Confidence in Employee	2228
C.	AGENCY CONSIDERATION OF PAST DISCIPLINE	2229
1.	Notice Requirement; Exceptions	2231
a.	Failure to Include Past Discipline in Proposal: Due Process and Harmful Error.....	2232
2.	Proof, Rebuttal of Past Discipline	2233
a.	Availability of Challenge to Past Discipline.....	2234
b.	Clearly Erroneous	2234
c.	Reprisal	2234
d.	Pending Challenge to Past Discipline	2235
e.	Past Discipline Reversed Following Initial Decision	2237
f.	Discipline Imposed After the Appealed Adverse Action.....	2237
g.	Past Discipline Time-Barred	2238
h.	Dissimilar Offense.....	2238
i.	Nondisciplinary Sanction	2240
D.	STANDARDS FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW, ADMINISTRATIVE RECONSIDERATION	2240
1.	General Rule.....	2240
2.	Agency Table of Penalties	2241
3.	Application of Relevant <i>Douglas</i> Factors	2241
4.	Effect of OPM Reconsideration Request	2241

CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....2243

I.	STATUS	2243
A.	ABSENCE	2243
1.	Impact on Service Efficiency	2243
a.	Assigned Post of Duty; Travel Requirement.....	2245
2.	Approved and Disapproved Absence.....	2245
a.	Abuse of Leave	2247
b.	Loafing; Wasting Time.....	2247
c.	Excessive Leave, LWOP, Absences Beyond Employee's Control; Failure to Maintain a Regular Work Schedule; OWCP Coverage	2247
(i)	Historical Application of <i>Cook</i> and Related Decisions.....	2251
d.	Unscheduled but Approved Absence Following Failure to Follow Procedure to Request Leave	2258
3.	Tardiness.....	2261
4.	Leave-Requesting, Leave-Reporting Requirement	2261
a.	Leave Restriction Notice	2265
b.	Medical Certification Requirement	2265
c.	Other Certification or Documentation Requirement	2267
d.	Accommodation Issue	2267
5.	Proof of AWOL; Leave Entitlement.....	2267
6.	Agency Abuse of Discretion.....	2268
a.	Ambiguous Leave Policy or Directive	2269
b.	Condonation of AWOL	2270
c.	Jury Duty.....	2270

7.	Evidence of Illness First Submitted to MSPB	2270
a.	FMLA	2272
8.	LWOP; Other Leave Arrangement; Compensable Injury.....	2272
a.	Executive Order 5396; Disabled Veteran	2276
b.	Advanced Sick Leave.....	2276
c.	Donated Leave.....	2276
9.	Family Leave.....	2277
a.	Burden of Proof Under FMLA; FMLA Request; Medical Documentation	2282
b.	Constructive FMLA Request	2290
c.	Belated Submission of FMLA Request, Documentation.....	2293
d.	Abuse of Family Leave	2295
10.	Worker's Compensation Issue.....	2295
a.	Determining Whether Removal Is Based on Reason Unrelated to OWCP Entitlement.....	2296
b.	Leave-Reporting Requirement	2298
c.	No Foreseeable End to Absence; Absence When Compensation Ends	2298
11.	Disability Discrimination	2301
12.	Leave Status Pending Disability Retirement	2302
13.	Incarceration; Work-Release Program.....	2302
14.	Cancelation or Conversion of Approved Leave	2304
15.	Absence Caused by Fear for Safety	2304
16.	Military Leave.....	2304
17.	Religious Leave	2305
18.	Problem Following Reinstatement Through MSPB Order	2305
19.	Aggravating Factors	2305
a.	Prolonged AWOL	2305
b.	Frequent AWOL	2306
c.	Unreliable Attendance.....	2306
20.	Mitigating Factors.....	2306
a.	Short, Infrequent AWOL.....	2307
b.	Longer AWOL; Other Mitigating Factors	2308
c.	Leave Status Caused by Agency's Wrongful Action.....	2309
B.	REFUSAL TO ACCEPT REASSIGNMENT	2310
1.	General Rule.....	2311
a.	SES Employee	2316
2.	Inconvenience to Employee; Health Problem	2318
a.	Failure to Accept Return From Overseas Assignment.....	2318
3.	Agency Burden of Proof; Legitimate Reason for Reassignment	2319
a.	Mobility Agreement; Condition of Employment	2322
b.	Misconduct Following Improper Reassignment	2323
4.	Application of RIF Procedures; Procedural Errors	2323
C.	FAILURE TO MAINTAIN OR OBTAIN CONDITION OF POSITION	2323
1.	Lack of License, Certification	2323
a.	Lawyer	2323
b.	Driver.....	2324
c.	Others.....	2325
d.	Medical Certification or Standard.....	2325
e.	Certification by Military Authority.....	2325
2.	Loss of Credential.....	2325
3.	Failure to Complete Training Course; Validity of Examination	2326
a.	Air Traffic Controller	2326
b.	Other Positions.....	2329
4.	Lack of or Loss of Minimum Qualification.....	2331
a.	Indian Child Protection and Family Violence Prevention Act	2332
b.	Lautenberg Amendment	2334
c.	Loss of Access to Agency Computer, Network	2336
5.	Security Clearance Revocation; Sensitive Position	2337
a.	Clearance Process	2338
b.	Agency Security Clearance Proceeding	2338
c.	Review of Agency Determination; <i>Egan</i> ; Constitutional Due Process	2342
d.	Decision to Require a Clearance; Whether Clearance Required as Employment Condition	2349
e.	Reassignment to Nonsensitive Position; Mitigation	2353

f.	EEO Issue; Whistleblower Reprisal; Disparate Treatment; USERRA	2355
g.	Regulatory Infraction During Revocation Process.....	2358
h.	Suspension, Removal Under 5 USC 7532.....	2364
i.	Suitability Determination, Security Clearance Distinguished.....	2365
j.	Sensitive Duties Not Requiring a Clearance: <i>Conyers</i>	2365
k.	Decisions Postdating <i>Conyers</i>	2386
l.	Requirement Similar to Security Clearance; Public Trust Position.....	2389
m.	TSA Sensitive Security Information.....	2391
n.	Retirement Issue Related to Removal for Loss of Clearance.....	2392
6.	Removal From Reserve Status	2392
7.	Lack of Suitability for Continued Employment	2397
D.	CONFLICTS OF INTEREST; APPARENT CONFLICTS.....	2398
1.	Conflicts; Improper Business Dealings	2399
2.	Apparent Conflicts; Use of Government Office for Private Gain	2401
3.	Agency Internal Information.....	2402
a.	Nondisclosure Agreements	2402
4.	Transaction With Another; Gift; Bribe; <i>Honorarium</i> ; Loan	2402
a.	Transaction With Patron, Vendor, Inmate	2403
b.	Transaction With Supervisor	2404
c.	Compensation for Government Service From Another Source.....	2404
5.	Acting as Agent or Attorney Against Government.....	2405
E.	OUTSIDE EMPLOYMENT	2405
1.	Personal Work on Government Time	2405
a.	Reporting, Approval Requirements.....	2405
b.	Employment in Violation of Agency Restriction; Outside Practice of Law	2406
F.	SPECIAL CATEGORIES OF EMPLOYEES	2406
1.	Guard, Correctional Officer, Police, Investigator, Security Official.....	2406
2.	Immigration Officer	2407
3.	Ship Employee.....	2407
4.	Supervisor	2407
G.	STRIKES.....	2407
1.	Charge of Striking	2408
2.	Basis for Removal	2408
3.	Proof of Participation	2408
4.	Refuting Participation.....	2409
5.	Fear for Personal Safety	2409
a.	Insufficient Threat.....	2409
b.	Duress, Coercion Established.....	2409
6.	Association With Strikers	2410
7.	Settlement Agreement	2410
8.	Influence of Political Leader	2410
9.	Penalty.....	2410
10.	Other Issues.....	2410
II.	RELATIONSHIPS.....	2410
A.	INSUBORDINATION	2410
1.	Refusal or Failure to Perform Work	2411
a.	Proof of Intent.....	2412
b.	Failure to Follow Instruction	2413
c.	Failure to Follow Policy, Regulation	2414
d.	Disruptiveness; Lack of Cooperation.....	2415
e.	Prohibited Recording of Conversation	2416
2.	Cumulative Insubordination	2416
3.	Dispute Over Position Responsibilities	2417
a.	Difficulty Following Reinstatement	2417
b.	Breach of Settlement Agreement.....	2418
4.	Insolence, Abusive Language.....	2418
a.	Abuse of Coworker, Subordinate	2419
b.	Abuse of Supervisor; Disrespectful or Coarse Language.....	2419
c.	Disagreement Over Instruction, Program	2421
5.	Misuse of Dispute Resolution Procedure	2422
a.	EEO Process.....	2422

b.	Congressional Communication.....	2422
c.	Grievance Proceeding.....	2422
d.	Supervisor.....	2424
e.	Interference With Employee Grievance.....	2424
6.	Refusal to Take Fitness Examination.....	2424
a.	Properly Ordered.....	2425
b.	Improperly Ordered.....	2426
7.	Failure to Provide Medical Information; Position Requirement.....	2429
8.	Refusal to Submit to Search or Drug Test.....	2431
9.	Problems During Investigations: Lack of Cooperation; Interference; Self-Incrimination.....	2434
10.	Administrative Law Judge.....	2443
11.	Defenses.....	2444
a.	Inability to Comply.....	2444
b.	Unclear Order; Unknown Policy.....	2444
c.	Constitutional, Similar Challenge.....	2444
d.	Improper Directive; Command Influence.....	2445
e.	Federal Labor Law Policy; Labor Contract.....	2449
f.	Fear for Safety or Other Harm.....	2450
12.	Mitigating Factors.....	2452
B.	SEXUAL MISCONDUCT.....	2454
1.	Sexual Harassment; Inappropriate Behavior.....	2455
a.	Past Significance of Psychological Harm.....	2461
b.	Charge Based on Agency Regulation or Standard of Conduct Not Specifically Tied to Title VII.....	2467
c.	Physical Contact.....	2472
d.	Offensive Remarks; Photos.....	2475
e.	Consensual Conduct Affecting Workplace.....	2479
f.	Homosexual Conduct.....	2480
2.	Misconduct Toward Agency Client, Affiliate.....	2481
3.	Misconduct Toward Child.....	2481
4.	Penalties for Sexual Misconduct.....	2481
a.	Demotion, Suspension.....	2481
b.	Removal.....	2482
5.	Defenses.....	2483
C.	CONDUCT HARMING OTHERS; CRIMINAL VIOLATIONS.....	2484
1.	Threat; Inappropriate Conduct.....	2484
a.	<i>Metz</i> Test.....	2485
b.	Statement Made to Therapist; EAP Counselor.....	2488
c.	Statement to Union Representative.....	2491
d.	Reaction of Others to Threat.....	2492
e.	Threat Through Another; Rumor.....	2494
f.	Conditional Threat.....	2495
g.	Threat Against a Coworker.....	2497
h.	Threat Against a Supervisor.....	2498
i.	Threat Against Others.....	2499
j.	Thought of Violence.....	2499
k.	Inappropriate or Disruptive Statement Not Charged as Threat.....	2499
l.	Mitigation.....	2502
2.	Assault.....	2503
a.	Assault on a Coworker.....	2503
b.	Assault on a Supervisor.....	2503
c.	Assault on a Subordinate.....	2503
d.	Assault on Others.....	2504
e.	Defenses.....	2504
f.	Mitigation; Aggravation.....	2505
3.	Fighting; Self Defense.....	2507
4.	Gambling.....	2508
5.	Threat of Legal Action, Whistleblowing, or Publicity.....	2508
6.	Lawsuit.....	2509
7.	Discourtesy; Related Problems.....	2510
a.	Profanity.....	2511
8.	Improper Conduct Toward Patient, Ward, Others.....	2511

9.	Invidious Discrimination; Offensive Remark; Preferential Treatment; Reprisal	2514
a.	Action Against Supervisor for Whistleblowing Reprisal, Other Prohibited Personnel Practices	2520
b.	Nepotism; Hiring of Friend	2521
D.	CRITICAL STATEMENTS	2523
1.	Constitutional Framework Applied in Federal Sector	2530
a.	Private Speech	2533
2.	Criticism of Agency or Its Personnel	2534
a.	Constitutional Analysis	2534
b.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Analysis	2536
c.	Defamation.....	2538
d.	Congressional Communication.....	2539
e.	Political Activity and Speech	2540
f.	Concept of Loyalty	2542
3.	Internal Criticism	2542
a.	Constitutional Analysis.....	2543
b.	Managerial Disagreement	2543
c.	Administrative Law Judge.....	2544
d.	Criticism, False Statement About Coworker, Subordinate, or Supervisor	2544
III.	INTEGRITY.....	2547
A.	FALSIFICATION AND MISREPRESENTATION	2547
1.	Proof of Fraud; Falsification	2550
a.	Neglect or Mistake	2554
b.	Perjury.....	2556
c.	Failure to Correct Report of Another	2557
d.	Reliance on Advice of Counsel or Other Individual	2557
e.	Cumulative False Statements.....	2558
2.	Employment Application; Security Questionnaire; Lack of Candor	2558
a.	Criminal Record.....	2562
b.	Education; Experience	2563
c.	Pre-Employment Medical Inquiry.....	2565
3.	Compensation Claim; Voucher	2566
a.	Overtime	2566
b.	Travel Voucher, Related Documentation.....	2568
c.	OWCP Claim.....	2569
d.	Unemployment Compensation	2571
e.	Disability or Leave Claim	2571
f.	Pay and Allowances Claim.....	2571
4.	Records of Time, Attendance, Work, and Pay; Negligence	2572
5.	Medical Certificate	2574
6.	Alteration, Failure to Preserve Documentation and Evidence	2575
7.	Investigative Misrepresentation; "Exculpatory No"	2575
8.	Lack of Candor.....	2577
9.	Failure to Report Misconduct	2581
10.	Disclosure Statement.....	2581
11.	Mitigating Factors	2581
a.	Time, Attendance, Travel Record.....	2583
b.	Medical Certificate	2584
c.	Employment Application	2584
B.	REMOVAL, MISUSE OF PROPERTY	2585
1.	Service Efficiency	2585
2.	Burden of Proof	2586
a.	Conversion	2586
b.	Unauthorized Possession or Removal of Property; Theft	2587
c.	Unauthorized Use.....	2588
d.	Common Possession Cases	2589
e.	Evidence of Intent: Theft and Unauthorized Possession.....	2589
3.	Petty Theft.....	2590
a.	Shoplifting	2592
b.	Significance of Custody and Control of Property	2592
4.	Government Vehicle.....	2594
a.	Deviation From Assigned Route; Minor Personal Use; Public Service Exception	2599

b.	Nonstatutory Vehicle Misuse Charge; Impaired Driver.....	2599
5.	Unauthorized Use, Theft, or Destruction of Specific Property	2600
a.	Computer; Internet.....	2600
b.	Photocopier; Facsimile.....	2602
c.	Telephone.....	2602
d.	Misuse of Government Credit Card.....	2602
e.	Misuse or Misdirection of Government Services or Funds.....	2603
f.	Government Records; Official Information; Privacy Act.....	2604
g.	Black Marketing; Diversion of Property	2618
h.	Obstruction, Theft, or Mistreatment of Mail	2619
i.	Misuse of Official Mail, Delivery Service.....	2620
j.	Concealment of Theft	2620
k.	Mitigating Factors	2620
6.	Use of Public Office for Private Gain.....	2622
IV.	MEDICAL.....	2622
A.	DRUG AND ALCOHOL OFFENSES	2622
1.	Drug Possession, Use, Distribution	2623
a.	Possession or Use	2623
b.	Sale or Distribution	2625
c.	Safe Harbor Provision	2626
d.	Mitigation.....	2627
2.	Alcohol.....	2631
V.	PERFORMANCE.....	2631
A.	POOR PERFORMANCE REQUIRES CORRECTION	2632
1.	Significance of Performance Evaluations	2632
2.	Significance of Performance Standard.....	2632
a.	<i>Ad Hoc</i> Measure.....	2632
b.	Assigned Standard.....	2635
c.	Measurement of Work Error.....	2636
3.	Responsibility for Work Error.....	2636
4.	Medical Inability to Perform.....	2636
a.	Specific Medical or Physical Standard.....	2645
b.	Penalty Analysis.....	2645
c.	Disability Accommodation Analysis	2645
d.	Recovery From Disability	2646
5.	Mitigating Factors; Choice of Penalty	2648
a.	Comparative Performance	2649
b.	New Duties	2649
c.	Detail, Special Assignment	2651
d.	Progressive Discipline	2651
e.	Lack of Training	2651
f.	Lack of Improvement Period.....	2652
g.	Demotion or Reassignment.....	2652
h.	Suspension	2654
B.	NEGLIGENCE	2654
1.	Endangerment of Employee	2654
2.	Public Safety Risk.....	2655
3.	Destruction or Loss of Property	2655
4.	Medical Error	2655
5.	Mishandling or Improper Possession of Weapon	2656
6.	Inattention to Duty; Sleeping on Job	2656
7.	Failure to Follow Procedure	2656
8.	Excessive Expenditure; Waste	2657

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES2659

I.	UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE CASES	2659
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS: EMPLOYEE AND AGENCY COVERAGE	2660
B.	AN OVERVIEW OF PERFORMANCE ACTIONS	2662
1.	Merit Pay Employee	2663

C.	OPM APPROVAL OF APPRAISAL SYSTEM.....	2664
1.	Change in Appraisal System.....	2665
2.	Flexibility Permitted by Appraisal System.....	2669
3.	Extent of OPM Review; Subordinate Organization Within Agency.....	2669
4.	Change Directed by OPM.....	2670
D.	PERFORMANCE STANDARD CRITERIA	2671
1.	Substantive Right	2672
2.	Scope of Review	2672
a.	Deference to Agency Management	2673
3.	Objectivity	2674
a.	Timeliness of Work	2677
b.	Draft; Intermediate Work Product	2678
c.	Personal Characteristic: Initiative, Reliability.....	2678
4.	<i>Wilson and Jackson</i> ; Negative or “Backwards” Standard.....	2678
5.	Communication of Standard.....	2681
6.	Augmentation of Standard.....	2682
7.	Use of PIP to Establish, Refine Standard	2684
8.	Specific Occupations	2686
a.	Clerical Employee, Secretary	2686
b.	Voucher Examiner	2688
c.	Inspector.....	2688
d.	Social Security Claims Employee	2688
e.	Employee Relations, Human Relations Specialist	2688
f.	Trade Analyst.....	2689
g.	Medical Technologist; Nurse.....	2689
h.	Scientist	2689
i.	Trades Employee	2690
j.	IT Specialist	2690
k.	Supervisory Supply Technician	2690
l.	Engineer	2690
m.	Lawyer	2691
n.	Paralegal	2691
o.	Management Analyst	2691
p.	Realty Specialist	2691
q.	Others	2692
9.	Numeric Standard	2692
10.	Multiple Components.....	2693
11.	Classification, Significance of Error	2696
12.	Relation of Standards Within Element	2696
13.	Absolute Standard; <i>Guillebeau</i>	2697
a.	Law Before <i>Guillebeau</i>	2701
b.	Standard to Be Viewed as a Whole.....	2702
c.	Modification of Absolute Standard	2702
d.	Standard That Enumerates Tasks	2702
e.	Level of Performance That May Be Exceeded	2703
14.	Unreasonable Standard	2704
15.	Levels of Performance	2705
a.	Five-Tier Appraisal System; Marginal, Minimally Successful, or “Needs Improvement” Level of Performance	2705
b.	Multiple Appraisal Levels Derived From Ratings for Critical Elements	2709
c.	Two-Level; Pass/Fail Appraisal System	2711
16.	Standards Development; Employee Involvement	2712
17.	Change in Standard.....	2713
a.	Change Through PIP.....	2714
E.	OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE	2714
1.	Prerequisite of Unacceptable Performance	2715
a.	Agency Need Not Prove Pre-PIP Unacceptable Performance	2716
2.	Opportunity Period Requirements	2717
a.	Order, Burden of Proof	2717
b.	Control Over Work	2718
c.	Assistance to Employee.....	2718
d.	Necessity for Specific Warning	2719

e.	Statement of Expectations; Job Responsibilities Not Described in PIP	2720
f.	Impossibility of Improvement; Unreasonable Expectations.....	2720
g.	Harmful Error Rule.....	2722
3.	Time Allowed for Improvement.....	2722
a.	One-Year Maximum for Evaluation; Pre-PIP Performance	2724
b.	Post-PIP Performance; Roller Coaster Employees	2726
c.	PIP Extension.....	2729
d.	Performance During Detail	2729
F.	PROCEDURE	2730
1.	Chapter 43 and 75 Actions Distinguished.....	2730
2.	Failure to Use Chapter 43	2731
a.	<i>Lovshin</i>	2731
b.	Conversion of Action	2732
c.	Limitations on Use of Chapter 43	2736
3.	Proposal, Decision Letter	2737
a.	Requirement of Concurrence.....	2737
b.	Unstated Charge	2737
c.	Necessity for Specific Instances.....	2737
d.	Notice Period	2739
G.	NECESSARY PROOF: SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE	2739
1.	Test Defined; Scope of Review	2739
2.	Weight, Quality of Substantial Evidence	2740
a.	Charges, Work Papers.....	2741
b.	Effect of Prior Performance Evaluation; Rating Issued in Error	2742
c.	Statistics; Sampling Method.....	2743
d.	Other Documentation; Testimony.....	2744
H.	DEFENSES	2744
1.	Propriety and Comparison of Performance Standards	2745
2.	Comparison of Employees' Performance.....	2745
3.	Adequacy of PIP; Lack of Control of Work; Agency Bad Faith	2746
4.	Training	2747
5.	Discrimination; Disparate Treatment	2748
6.	Reprisal.....	2752
7.	Collective Bargaining Agreement	2753
I.	PRECLUSION OF MITIGATION	2753
II.	APPEALS FROM WITHIN-GRADE INCREASE DENIALS.....	2754
A.	BASIS FOR MSPB REVIEW.....	2756
B.	WHEN MSPB JURISDICTION ATTACHES.....	2756
1.	Jurisdictional Effect of Collective Bargaining Agreement	2760
C.	BURDEN OF PROOF	2760
1.	Proof of Poor Performance	2760
a.	Role of Performance Standards.....	2761
2.	Substantial Evidence Controls.....	2761
a.	What Constitutes Evidence.....	2762
D.	DEFENSES	2762
1.	Error in ALOC Procedure	2762
a.	Linkage of ALOC and Appraisal System	2762
b.	Waiting Period	2763
c.	Lack of ALOC Determination.....	2764
d.	Vague ALOC Determination	2764
2.	Reconsideration Errors.....	2764
a.	Employee Denied Information	2764
b.	Reconsideration Summary Lacking	2764
c.	Reconsideration Decision Level	2765
d.	Late Reconsideration Decision	2765
3.	Circumstances of Employee	2765
a.	Unfair Work Burden	2765
b.	Illness or Disability	2765
c.	Comparative Work Production	2765
d.	Lack of Training	2765

CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....2767

I. RIF PROCESS	2767
A. NATURE OF RIF	2767
1. Statutory Provisions	2767
2. OPM Regulations, Guidance.....	2768
a. Other RIF Descriptions.....	2770
3. Validity of RIF Statute, Regulations	2771
4. Furlough	2771
a. Exemptions	2783
b. Emergency Furlough	2785
c. Part-Time or Light Duty Status; Intermittent Appointment; Adjustment in Work Schedule	2785
d. Discovery in Furlough Appeal.....	2787
B. ACTIONS APPEALABLE AS RIF; MSPB JURISDICTION	2789
1. Regulatory Structure.....	2789
2. Types of Appointees.....	2790
a. Temporary	2790
b. Probationer.....	2790
c. Demonstration Project	2790
d. Postal Service Non-Preference Eligible	2793
e. Part-Time.....	2794
f. Senior Executive Service	2794
g. Agencies With Independent Statutory Personnel Authority	2797
3. Possible RIF.....	2798
4. Action to Avoid RIF	2798
a. Transfer to Another Agency	2798
b. Resignation	2799
c. Retirement	2799
d. Detail.....	2799
e. Reassignment Without Regard to RIF	2799
(i) Representative Rate	2801
f. Reassignment During or Following RIF	2802
g. Reassignment With Pay Reduction in Anticipation of RIF	2802
(i) Postal Reorganizations: 1990s.....	2803
(ii) Postal Reorganizations: 2000 Onward.....	2810
(iii) Other Agencies	2816
5. Grade and Pay Retention; Pay Rate Change; Demotion	2818
6. Classification Issue	2819
a. Erosion of Duties.....	2821
b. Intentional Changes in Duties	2823
7. Transfer of Function.....	2823
a. Identification of Positions for Transfer	2825
b. Employee Who Declines to Move	2828
C. COMPETITIVE AREA.....	2828
1. Definition	2828
2. Criteria	2828
3. Assignment Across Competitive Area	2829
4. Challenge to Competitive Area	2829
a. Burden of Proof.....	2829
b. Organizational Structure; One-Person RIF.....	2829
c. Geographical Structure; Local Commuting Area	2832
D. COMPETITIVE LEVEL	2832
1. Defined	2833
2. Challenge to Competitive Level	2835
a. Primacy of Position Description	2835
b. Testimony Concerning Duties	2838
c. Loss of Productivity; Undue Interruption	2839
d. Collective Bargaining Agreement	2840
e. Challenge to Performance Appraisal	2841
3. Particular Groups of Employees	2842
a. Developmental/Trainee	2842
b. Temporary.....	2842

c.	Part-Time	2843
d.	VA Health Care Professional.....	2843
e.	Bureau of Indian Affairs; Indian Health Service	2846
4.	Scope of MSPB Review	2846
a.	Impact of Error.....	2846
b.	Right to Hearing	2847
c.	Substantive Review.....	2847
II.	ASSIGNMENT AND RELATED RIGHTS	2847
A.	REGULATORY AND OPERATIONAL BASIS	2847
1.	Veteran, Other Preferences.....	2850
2.	Appointment Qualifying for Assignment Right	2851
a.	Excepted Service.....	2851
b.	Detail.....	2852
c.	Intergovernmental Personnel Act	2852
d.	Part-Time/Full-Time	2852
3.	Position Subject to Displacement.....	2852
a.	Supervisory	2852
b.	Temporary.....	2852
4.	Filling of Vacancies.....	2852
5.	Assessment of Qualifications	2855
a.	Updating Qualifications	2858
b.	Qualifications of Displacing Employee	2858
c.	Merit Promotion Issue.....	2858
d.	Undue Interruption	2858
6.	Representative Rate	2860
7.	Amendment of RIF Notice; Change in Position Offer.....	2861
B.	BUMPING.....	2861
C.	RETREAT	2864
1.	Prior Rule	2864
2.	Method of Analysis	2865
3.	Burden of Proof	2867
D.	REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS	2867
1.	Reemployment Priority List Right Before RIF Effective Date	2879
2.	Remedy in Reemployment Priority List Appeal	2881
3.	Transitional Assistance	2881
III.	RIF CHALLENGES.....	2882
A.	BURDEN OF PROOF.....	2882
1.	Agency Responsibility	2882
2.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	2882
3.	Qualifications; Assignment Right	2883
4.	Classification Dispute	2883
B.	<i>BONA FIDE</i> RIF: <i>LOSURE</i>	2884
1.	Substantive Rights, Harmful Error.....	2884
2.	RIF as Adverse Action.....	2887
3.	Challenge to Reorganization	2890
a.	Reorganization Defined; Single Position RIF	2891
b.	Managerial Discretion.....	2891
c.	Funding Decision	2892
d.	Redistribution of Duties	2893
e.	Planning for Future Events	2894
f.	Comparative Qualifications as a Factor in Selection of Positions for RIF	2895
g.	Contribution to Agency Mission; Funding of Individual Position	2895
h.	Contracting Out Challenge	2896
i.	Sham, Paperwork Reorganization: Old, New Position Identical; Delayed Reorganization	2896
j.	Merit Promotion, Hiring, Placement During RIF.....	2899
k.	Events Preceding, Subsequent to RIF	2899
C.	DISCRIMINATION DEFENSES	2900
1.	Age	2905
2.	Religion.....	2906
D.	PROCEDURAL ISSUES	2906
1.	Internal Procedures	2906

2. Timing of Job Offer; Timing of Release of Employees	2906
3. Correction of Retention Standing Error	2906
a. Inspection of Records	2907
4. Adequacy of RIF Notice	2907

CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....2909

I. STATUTORY STANDARD	2909
A. HARMFUL ERROR DEFINED.....	2909
1. <i>Parker</i>	2910
2. Might Have/Would Have Analysis	2911
B. HARMFUL ERROR APPLIED	2912
1. Mixing Harmful Error and Other Doctrines.....	2912
a. Mitigation of Penalty	2912
b. Prohibited Personnel Practice	2912
c. RIF.....	2912
2. Statutory, Regulatory Violation; Action Not in Accordance With Law	2912
a. Unfair Labor Practice	2914
b. Privacy Act; Disclosure of Confidential Information	2916
c. Constitution.....	2917
d. Invalid Regulation	2917
3. Labor Contract Violation.....	2918
a. Disputed Coverage	2920
b. Impact of Arbitration Award	2920
c. Employment Contract	2921
4. Problem With Representation	2921
a. Cautionary Notes to Counsel	2921
5. Treatment of Affirmative Defense if Action Is Set Aside as Erroneous.....	2922
II. ERROR IN PRELIMINARY PROCEDURES.....	2922
A. AGENCY INVESTIGATION	2922
1. Due Process	2923
2. Right to Counsel; Union Representative.....	2923
3. Entrapment	2925
4. Agency Predecisional Hearing	2926
5. Security Clearance Investigation	2926
B. STALE CHARGES; LACHES	2927
1. General Rule	2927
2. Agency Regulation; Collective Bargaining Agreement	2929
3. Performance Case	2929
C. ESTOPPEL; DOUBLE JEOPARDY	2929
1. Estoppel	2929
2. Double Jeopardy	2930
a. Reinitiation of a Proposal After an Adverse Action Is Canceled.....	2937
b. Action Initiated After Earlier Action Invalidated for Procedural Reason.....	2938
c. Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	2939
d. Action Following Acquittal	2939
III. ERRORS IN PROPOSAL NOTICE AND REPLY PROCESS	2939
A. BASIC RIGHTS	2939
1. Pre-Decision Proposal Not Mandated in Some Cases When Due Process Is Provided Following Decision	2942
2. Right to Counsel	2944
B. PROPOSAL NOTICE.....	2944
1. Purpose, Sufficiency of Notice; Due Process	2945
a. Supporting Evidence.....	2946
b. Technical Deficiencies	2947
c. Failure to Provide Notice of Appeal or Statutory Right	2947
d. Error in Date	2947
e. Other Minor Error	2948
f. Assessing Sufficiency of Charge.....	2949
2. Specific Charge; Only Conduct Described	2953
a. Conduct After Date of Proposal Notice	2955
b. Amendment of Charge.....	2956
3. Framing of Charge	2956

a.	General Charge; Charge Label; Detailed Narrative; <i>Otero and Cross</i>	2956
b.	Variation Between Stated Charge and Supporting Narrative or Specification; <i>Nazelrod and Lachance</i>	2959
c.	Splitting of Charge	2965
d.	Independent Elements of Single Charge	2968
e.	Multiple Specifications Supporting a Single Charge	2971
f.	Lesser Included Offense	2974
g.	Past Discipline; Performance Record; Aggravating Factors	2974
4.	Citation of Standards of Conduct	2974
5.	Charge Tied to Penalty Table Classification	2975
6.	Criminal Charge	2976
7.	Mixing Chapters 43 and 75	2976
8.	Cumulative Charges; Merger of Charges	2976
9.	Charge of Unbecoming or Improper Conduct	2978
10.	Service of Notice	2980
C.	INADEQUATE REPLY AND NOTICE PERIOD	2982
1.	Calculation	2983
2.	Not Less Than Seven Days for Reply	2983
3.	30-Day Advance Notice of Action	2986
D.	SHORTENED NOTICE PERIOD	2987
1.	Procedure to Invoke Shortened Notice	2987
2.	Reasonable Belief of Crime	2988
a.	Arrest, Warrant	2990
b.	Conduct Caused by Mental Impairment	2990
3.	Emergency Suspension for Reason Other Than Reasonable Belief of Crime	2990
4.	Indefinite Suspension	2991
E.	FAILURE TO PROVIDE EVIDENCE FILE, OTHER INFORMATION	2992
1.	Loss or Destruction of Evidence	2994
F.	ORAL AND WRITTEN REPLIES	2994
1.	Proof of Harm; Failure to Consider a Reply; Due Process	2996
a.	Investigation of Information Provided by the Employee	3001
b.	Criminal Proceeding Pending	3002
2.	Waiver of Reply Right	3002
a.	Extension Request	3002
3.	Decisionmaker, Reply Officer	3006
4.	Right to Confrontation	3006
5.	Right to Information	3006
6.	Inadequate Representation	3007
G.	AGENCY DECISIONAL PROCEDURES; <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS	3007
1.	Early Law From Courts	3007
2.	<i>Sullivan</i> ; Regulatory Prohibitions; Adverse External Influences	3010
3.	<i>Stone</i> ; Current, Broadened Due Process Test	3012
a.	Reinitiation of Action Following Due Process Reversal	3019
4.	Early Law From MSPB	3019
5.	Deciding Official Consults Witness, Advisor; Information Not Disclosed to Employee	3021
a.	Information From Witness	3022
b.	Impact of 5 USC 2302(b)(2)	3023
c.	Report, Investigation	3023
d.	Advisor	3023
e.	Past Discipline as Rebuttal to Mitigation	3024
6.	Proposing and Deciding Official Confer	3024
7.	Information Pertaining to Aggravation or Mitigation of Penalty; <i>Ward</i>	3025
a.	Potential Publicity, Notoriety, Other Harm	3043
b.	Information or Documents in the Evidence File Not Referenced in the Proposal	3045
c.	Information Provided to the Deciding Official Before the Reply Process Begins	3046
d.	Evaluation Of Information Presented During The Reply	3047
e.	Penalty Table, Standard of Conduct Reference	3048
f.	Performance Cases	3051
g.	Harmful Error Analysis Prior to <i>Ward</i>	3053
8.	Predisposition to Take Adverse Action; Offer to Permit Resignation; Uninformed Deciding Official	3053
a.	Biased Proposing Official	3058
b.	Malicious Initiation of Action	3058

9. Deciding Official Who Is Biased or Whose Decision Is Directed	3058
10. Involvement of OSC.....	3059
11. Changes in Proposing, Deciding Official	3059
12. Lack of Authority	3064
a. Deciding Official	3064
b. Proposing Official.....	3064
13. Lack of Discretion.....	3065
14. Pending Retirement Application	3065
15. Specificity of Decision Letter.....	3065
a. No Decision Letter.....	3065
b. Retroactive Decision Letter.....	3066

CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION3067

I. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES	3067
A. PROCEDURES IN MIXED CASES.....	3067
1. Multiple Agency Review Processes.....	3069
a. Constructive Adverse Action	3070
2. Multiple Filing Options; Pleading Requirements; Timing of MSPB Appeal	3071
a. Withdrawal or Abandonment of EEO Allegation	3071
b. Authority of Judge to Strike Frivolous EEO Allegation; Summary Judgment	3072
3. Jurisdictional Problems With EEO Complaints	3075
a. Filing Dates	3075
b. Timeliness of EEO Complaint	3077
c. EEO Class Action	3080
d. EEO Complaint Withdrawn.....	3081
e. What Constitutes a Complaint	3082
f. Coextensive Issues; Scope of Complaint.....	3083
g. Premature Appeal	3083
4. Duty to Resolve Issues and Inform Appellant of Elements of Proof	3084
5. Jurisdiction Over Appealable Action; Constructive Adverse Action	3085
a. Probationer.....	3086
b. Restoration Appeal Involving Employee Partially Recovered From Compensable Injury	3086
6. Election of Remedies	3087
a. Grievance Under Negotiated Agreement.....	3087
b. Informed Election; Treatment of EEO Complaint	3087
c. Effect of Subject Matter of Preexisting Complaint on Subsequent Appeal; EEO Complaint Involving Proposed Action	3089
7. MSPB Remand; EEOC Remand	3090
8. Strategic Considerations	3093
B. BURDEN OF PROOF	3093
1. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	3093
2. Analysis Following the <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	3097
a. Analysis of Motivation, Pretext	3099
b. Mixed Motives; Proof That Action Would Have Been Taken Without Discriminatory Motive	3101
c. Element of Intent; Employer Error	3108
d. Significance of Agency's Proof of Charges	3109
e. Significance of Agency's Failure to Prove Charge	3110
f. Comparable Employees; Disparate Treatment	3111
C. EVIDENCE	3117
1. Direct Evidence; Comparators; Taint of Agency Official; Cat's Paw	3118
2. Circumstantial Evidence; Pretext; Presumption	3121
3. Disparate Impact	3123
4. Statistics	3125
5. Supervisory Practices; Remarks.....	3126
D. FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION	3127
1. Race	3127
2. Age	3128
3. Religion	3133
4. Marital Status.....	3134
5. Pregnancy	3134
6. Sex; Sexual Orientation; Equal Pay Act.....	3135

7. Retirement Cases: Application by OPM of Statutory Requirements	3135
E. REPRISAL.....	3136
1. The Convincing Mosaic; Evidence Considered as a Whole	3147
2. Collateral Personnel Action of Evidentiary Weight in an EEO Affirmative Defense.....	3150
3. Taint of Reprisal by Lower Level Official; Cat's Paw	3151
II. REHABILITATION ACT: DISABLING CONDITIONS	3153
A. REGULATORY STRUCTURE.....	3154
B. <i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE; ACCOMMODATION REQUIREMENTS	3158
1. Individual Regarded or Perceived as Disabled	3160
2. Individual Associated With Disabled Person	3167
3. Substantial Limitation of Major Life Activity	3167
a. Life Activity of Working	3169
4. Order and Burden of Proof.....	3173
a. Disparate Treatment	3182
b. Mixed Motive Analysis.....	3183
5. Causal Connection.....	3185
6. Transitory or Temporary Disability.....	3188
a. Corrected or Mitigated Condition	3189
7. Limitation on General Employability	3190
a. Allergy.....	3192
b. Stress Disorder	3194
c. Other Mental Disability; Proof of Disability.....	3199
8. Conditions Not Protected by Rehabilitation Act	3200
a. Gambling Compulsion	3200
b. Sexual Disorder	3200
c. Pregnancy	3201
9. Qualified Disabled Employee	3201
a. Dangerousness; Risk Assessment; Direct Threat	3203
b. Lack of Medical Release	3208
10. Knowledge of Disability.....	3208
a. When Disability Claim or Defense Must Be Raised	3209
11. Suggesting Nonapparent Accommodation; Duty of Reasonable Inquiry	3211
a. Interactive Process	3213
C. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH JOB RESTRUCTURING, ASSISTANCE	3216
1. Light Duty and Job Modification.....	3216
a. Lifting Requirements.....	3220
b. Postal Service Collective Bargaining Agreements.....	3222
c. Inappropriate Job Modification; Increased Job Burden	3223
2. Provision of, Modification to, Job Equipment	3223
3. Alteration of Work Schedule, Worksite; Telework	3226
4. Alteration of Training Requirement.....	3236
D. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH REASSIGNMENT	3237
1. <i>Ignacio</i>	3239
2. Evaluation of Reassignment Effort	3241
a. Reassignments Across Organizational Lines	3247
E. ALTERNATIVE ACCOMMODATIVE REQUIREMENTS	3253
1. Collective Bargaining Agreement	3253
2. Agency Regulation	3253
3. Restoration From Compensable Injury	3254
4. Demotion; Promotion.....	3254
5. Modification of Agency Policy, Facility.....	3256
6. Job Training; Change in Supervision	3256
7. Referral for Counseling.....	3259
F. AGENCY DEFENSES	3260
1. Disqualifying Misconduct	3260
2. Undue Hardship.....	3260
a. Unreasonable Accommodation.....	3263
b. Restrictions in Collective Bargaining Agreement	3265
3. Lack of Qualification for Position.....	3267
a. Failure to Provide Evidence of Fitness for Position With Medical Standard	3267
4. Receipt of Disability Annuity.....	3268

5. Rebuttal	3269
6. Restriction on Remedy	3269
G. ALCOHOLISM AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE.....	3269
1. Necessity for Accommodation: <i>Ruzek</i>	3271
a. Suitability.....	3272
b. Postal Service Employee	3273
2. Notice of Disability.....	3273
a. Agency Request for Information.....	3274
3. Proof of Disease	3274
4. Causal Connection: Misconduct Caused by Disease	3275
a. Alcohol or Drug Use on the Job	3279
b. Revocation of Driver's License	3279
c. Possession of Drugs.....	3280
d. Misappropriation or Theft of Drugs.....	3280
e. Misappropriation of Funds	3280
5. Qualified Disabled Employee; <i>Hougens</i> and Disqualifying Conduct	3281
a. Current Substance Abuser	3284
b. Disqualifying Misconduct: Removal Appropriate.....	3286
c. Less Serious Conduct: Concurrent Rehabilitation, Discipline.....	3291
6. Firm Choice, Last Chance Agreement.....	3293
a. Requirement of Collective Bargaining Agreement, Agency Regulation	3296
b. Failed Rehabilitation Attempt.....	3297
7. Undue Hardship	3300
III. AVENUES OF FURTHER REVIEW OF EEO DEFENSES	3301
A. EEOC REVIEW	3301
B. SPECIAL PANEL REVIEW.....	3302
C. JUDICIAL REVIEW	3309
1. Scope of District Court Review.....	3312
a. Effect of District Court Review	3313
b. Time for District Court Review; Tolling or Estoppel; Exhaustion of Remedies	3316
2. Effect of Waiver of EEO Claim	3319

CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....3321

I. OVERVIEW.....	3321
A. SIGNIFICANCE OF DISCOVERY.....	3323
II. TYPES OF PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES	3324
A. WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL.....	3325
1. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012; Retroactivity	3326
2. Statutory Definitions Control	3328
a. "Gross" Waste or Mismanagement	3329
b. Violation of Law, Rule, or Regulation	3336
c. Abuse of Authority	3344
d. Threat to Public Health and Safety.....	3349
e. Disclosure of Censorship Related to Research, Analysis, or Technical Information.....	3375
3. Dispute Over Form of Whistleblowing	3375
a. Disclosure of Potential Harm or Wrongdoing	3375
b. Complaint to Wrongdoer.....	3376
c. Disclosure to Someone Who Cannot Directly Remedy the Problem.....	3378
d. Minor Personal Grievance	3381
e. Internal, Policy Disagreement.....	3381
f. Disclosure Made During Normal Course of Duties.....	3385
g. Required Report Under Office of Government Ethics Rules, E.O. 12675	3397
h. Communication Indirectly Involving the Government; Private Wrongdoing	3398
i. Communication to News Media; Congress.....	3401
j. Disclosure in Court.....	3401
k. Complaint to the Inspector General	3402
l. Disclosure of Information Already Known or Public.....	3403
m. Sequential Allegations	3405
4. Whistleblowing No Shield Against Misconduct.....	3405
a. Abusive Whistleblower; Robust Language; Chain of Command.....	3406
b. Threatened Disclosure.....	3409

5.	Personnel Treated as Whistleblowers	3410
a.	Individual Perceived as Whistleblower	3410
b.	Whistleblower's Aide, Associate	3414
c.	Individual Serving as Conduit of Information; Internal Disclosure	3415
d.	Former Employee	3416
e.	Contractor Employee	3416
6.	Protected Disclosure: Reasonableness	3417
a.	"Reasonably Believes"; False Statement	3417
b.	Motivation of Whistleblower	3423
c.	Information Developed After Disclosure	3423
d.	Belief Shared by Other Employees; Disinterested Observer	3423
e.	Response of Agency to Disclosure	3424
f.	Expertise of Whistleblower	3425
g.	Specificity of Disclosure	3426
h.	Presumed Agency Good Faith; "Irrefragable Proof" Standard	3428
7.	Unprotected Disclosure; Dispute Concerning Coverage of Disclosure Under 2302(b)(8) or 2302(b)(9)	3431
a.	Disclosure Prohibited by Law; Regulation Incorporating Statutory Provision	3434
b.	EEO Complaint	3444
c.	Other Appeals, Charges, FECA Claims, Grievances, and Complaints	3448
8.	Disclosures in Multiple Forums	3452
B.	PROHIBITED PRACTICES OTHER THAN WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL	3454
1.	Discrimination Proscribed by Civil Rights Laws; 5 USC 2302(b)(1)(A)	3454
a.	Sexual Harassment	3455
2.	Improper Personnel Recommendation; 5 USC 2302(b)(2)	3455
3.	Obstruction of Competition; 5 USC 2302(b)(4)	3455
4.	Influencing Employment Decision; 5 USC 2302(b)(5)	3456
5.	Improper Preference, Promotion; 5 USC 2302(b)(6)	3456
6.	5 USC 2302(b)(9); Appeal Right; Grievance, Complaint; OSC and IG Involvement; Refusal to Obey Unlawful Order	3459
a.	WPEA: Exercise of, Testimony or Assistance in, Appeal, Complaint, or Grievance	3465
7.	Discrimination Unrelated to Job Performance; 5 USC 2302(b)(10)	3467
8.	Discrimination Against Veteran; 5 USC 2302(b)(11)	3469
9.	Violation of Merit System Principle; 5 USC 2302(b)(12)	3469
a.	Failure to Provide Effective Training; 5 USC 2301(b)(7); 5 USC 2307	3472
10.	Nondisclosure Agreement; 5 USC 2302(b)(13)	3473
11.	Refusal to Violate Law, Regulation, or Rule	3473
III.	INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION	3475
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS AND LIMITATIONS	3477
1.	Time for Initiating IRA Appeal With OSC and MSPB	3484
a.	Case That May Be Either Initiated With OSC or Appealed Directly to MSPB	3485
b.	Jurisdiction Limitations of an IRA Rather Than an Adverse Action Appeal	3485
c.	Premature Appeal Following Resort to OSC	3486
d.	Belated Receipt of OSC Closeout Notice	3487
e.	Calculation of Appeal Period; Late IRA Appeal; Waiver	3488
f.	OSC Reopening	3489
g.	Equitable Tolling	3492
h.	Laches in Filing OSC Complaint	3496
B.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUE	3497
1.	<i>Rusin</i> Model: Nonfrivolous Allegations Establish Jurisdiction	3497
a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations Based on the Written Record	3502
b.	Hearing	3504
2.	Jurisdictional Analysis Prior to <i>Rusin</i>	3504
3.	Variations in Order of Proof; Bifurcation; Necessity to Consider Entire Record	3506
4.	Exhaustion of Remedies; Amendment of Appeal	3515
5.	Election and Preclusion of Remedies	3518
a.	Grievance or MSPB Appeal	3519
b.	Exhaustion of OSC Process; Direct Appeal of Otherwise Appealable Action	3523
c.	EEO Complaint	3526
6.	Collateral Jurisdiction Over EEO Claim Presented in IRA Appeal Not Involving Otherwise Appealable Action	3527
7.	Jurisdiction Over Merits Determination, Collateral Prohibited Personnel Practice, Constitutional, Discrimination, and Harmful Error Claim in Otherwise Appealable Action Initiated Through OSC	3527
8.	Status of Particular Agencies and Employees	3529

a.	Postal Service	3530
b.	Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee	3531
c.	National Guard Technician	3535
d.	Federal Bureau of Investigation	3539
e.	Judicial Branch Employee.....	3542
f.	Federal Reserve Board	3542
g.	NAF Employee	3542
h.	Independent Counsel	3543
i.	Federal Aviation Administration	3543
j.	Transportation Security Agency	3543
k.	Intelligence, Counterintelligence Agencies; Foreign National.....	3546
l.	Government Corporation	3549
m.	Other Entities	3549
n.	Experts and Consultants; Personnel Appointed Outside Title 5.....	3550
o.	Lawyer	3552
p.	Former Employee	3552
q.	Inspector General Office	3553
r.	Employee of Agency Other Than the Agency Charged With Reprisal	3553
s.	Employee in the Private Sector; Applicant for Employment	3554
t.	Uniformed Service	3555
u.	Administrator of Federal Benefits.....	3557
9.	Retroactivity of 1989 Whistleblower Amendments; Continuing Violation	3557
C.	PLEADING REQUIREMENTS.....	3558
1.	Duty of Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	3558
2.	Specificity of Underlying Whistleblower Disclosure; Labeling of Disclosure Not Required.....	3560
3.	Pleading to OSC.....	3563
a.	Classification or Labeling of Disclosure Not Required	3572
b.	Curative Filing With OSC	3574
c.	Proof of Scope of Complaint Made to OSC; Post-Complaint Submission.....	3574
d.	Information First Submitted With PFR	3578
e.	Serial Complaints to OSC.....	3578
f.	OSC Closeout Letter.....	3578
4.	Pleading to MSPB	3579
D.	COVERED AND EXCLUDED PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	3581
1.	Threatened Personnel Action	3581
a.	Proposed Action; Dispute Arising During Compliance.....	3584
2.	Failure to Take Personnel Action.....	3585
3.	Performance Appraisal; Evaluation of Qualifications or Abilities.....	3587
4.	Awards and Acts Preliminary to Awards.....	3588
5.	Denial of Salary Step Increase	3589
6.	Promotion, Appointment.....	3589
7.	Decision Concerning Leave; Change in Duties; Idling; Overtime; Harassment	3590
a.	Degree of Significance of Change of Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions.....	3591
b.	Hostile Environment.....	3592
8.	Reprimand; Admonition; Counseling; Performance Warning; Performance Improvement Period	3592
9.	Suspension	3596
10.	Probationary Termination	3596
11.	Failure to Renew Appointment; Failure to Reinstate	3596
12.	Reassignment, Transfer, and Detail	3597
13.	Fitness Examination; Investigation	3598
14.	Security Clearance Suspension, Revocation; Other Certification	3599
15.	Training	3604
16.	Defamatory Statement; Tort; Arrest; False Allegation; Blacklisting	3605
17.	Reduction in Force.....	3606
18.	Classification Issue	3607
19.	Constructive Adverse Action	3607
20.	Action Affecting Private Sector Employment Opportunity	3611
21.	Other Action.....	3611
E.	REMEDIES.....	3613
1.	Transfer	3614

IV. CASES BROUGHT BY OSC	3614
A. STATUTORY BASES.....	3615
1. Corrective Action Petition; Stay	3615
2. Disciplinary Complaint.....	3617
3. Board Authority in Disciplinary, Corrective Action Case.....	3617
4. Hatch Act; FOIA Violation	3617
B. ORGANIZATION OF OSC.....	3621
1. Organizational Structure	3621
2. Disclosure Unit.....	3621
3. MSPB Referral to OSC.....	3622
4. Judicial or Administrative Finding of Discrimination by Federal Employee; 5 USC 1216(a)(5)	3622
C. OSC DISCIPLINARY COMPLAINT	3622
1. Limits on Prosecutorial Authority.....	3623
a. Employee Who Takes or Recommends Personnel Action.....	3624
b. Prior Resort to Agency-Employer for Disciplinary Action	3624
2. OSC Complaint.....	3625
3. Rights of Employee, Respondent	3626
4. OSC Subpoena; Discovery Procedures	3626
5. Hearing by Administrative Law Judge; MSPB Review.....	3627
6. Disciplinary Penalty.....	3627
D. OSC CORRECTIVE ACTION PETITION	3632
1. Regulatory Provisions	3634
2. Filing a Complaint With OSC	3635
a. OSC Deferral Policy on EEO Charge	3636
b. Proceeding to Compel OSC Action.....	3636
c. Right to Counsel in OSC Investigation.....	3639
E. LITIGATION WITH OSC.....	3640
1. Purpose of MSPB Hearing	3641
a. Obtaining Records	3641
b. Evidence From Other Investigation	3641
c. Dismissal of OSC Action	3641
2. Settlement of OSC Litigation	3641
3. Judicial Review of OSC and IRA Cases	3642
a. Stay Pending Judicial Review.....	3642
V. BURDEN OF PROOF IN REPRISAL CASE	3642
A. ANALYSIS UNDER WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT	3643
1. Analysis Required by Judge.....	3643
2. Statutory, Regulatory Provisions	3643
3. Contributing Factor Analysis	3644
a. Order of Proof	3645
b. <i>Per Se</i> Timing/Knowledge Test	3646
c. Evidence Other Than Timing.....	3649
d. Knowledge by Agency Manager of Appellant’s Whistleblowing; Constructive Knowledge; Cat’s Paw.....	3655
e. Disclosure Follows the Personnel Action.....	3661
f. Settlement Offer	3663
g. Reprisal Without Unlawful Motivation: Reprisal by Investigation—the Atypical Case; <i>Marano, Carr</i>	3663
h. Charge Arising Out of Conduct During Retaliatory Investigation.....	3671
i. OSC Corrective Action Case	3674
4. Otherwise Appealable Action	3674
5. Agency’s Clear and Convincing Evidence; <i>Carr</i> Factors.....	3675
a. Constructive Adverse Action.....	3692
6. Evidence of Reprisal	3693
a. Strength of Agency’s Case; Probationer; Term Employee.....	3695
b. Strength of Motive to Retaliate	3699
c. Comparison Employees	3699
d. Preliminary Reprisal Leading to Personnel Action	3701
e. Shifting or Belated Explanations for Agency Action.....	3701
B. ANALYSIS FOR PROHIBITED PRACTICES NOT COVERED BY WPA, WPEA.....	3702
1. <i>Mt. Healthy</i>	3705
2. Importance of Untainted Deciding Official	3707
3. Timing of Action.....	3710

4.	Severity of Charged Misconduct	3710
5.	Discipline Related to Refusal of Reassignment	3711
6.	Reprisal Against Individual Involved in Union Activity	3711
7.	Performance Case	3715
8.	Disciplinary Case Against Individual Charged With Reprisal.....	3715
	a. Analysis by Agency Deciding Official.....	3722
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	3722
VI.	STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS	3723
A.	STAY THROUGH INDIVIDUAL APPEAL.....	3723
	1. Basis for Stay	3725
	a. Intervention by OPM.....	3727
	b. Effect of Prior Settlement Agreement.....	3727
	2. Scope of Stay	3727
	3. MSPB Review of Judge's Stay Decision	3727
B.	STAY THROUGH OSC PROCEEDING	3728
	1. Statutory, Regulatory Provisions	3729
	2. Initial Stay.....	3731
	a. Potential for Disruption by Employee's Return to Workplace	3733
	b. Obtaining Clarification of Stay Order	3733
	3. Extension of Stay.....	3734
	a. Indefinite Stay.....	3737
	4. Proof Supporting Stay Application	3738
	5. Nature of Relief.....	3738
	a. Hostile Environment; Protective Order.....	3739
	b. Restraint On Employee Communication With OSC, Congress.....	3742
	6. Termination of Stay.....	3744
	7. Relation of Stay and Appeal Proceedings	3744
	8. Use of Stay to Protect Other Proceeding.....	3745
	a. EEO Case	3745
	b. Union Rights Under Statute.....	3745
	9. Employees Covered by Stay	3745
	a. SES	3745
	b. Presidential Appointee; Policymaker	3745
	c. At Will Employee	3745
	d. Former Agency Employee.....	3745
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	3745

CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS3747

I.	RETIREMENT.....	3747
A.	OVERVIEW OF THE PRINCIPAL RETIREMENT SYSTEMS.....	3748
	1. Conversions.....	3749
B.	FEDERAL EMPLOYMENT.....	3750
	1. Effect of Reemployment	3752
C.	COVERED AND CREDITABLE SERVICE.....	3752
	1. Service Requirements for CSRS.....	3753
	2. When-Actually-Employed; Seasonal Employee; Leave Without Pay; Part-Time	3755
	3. Indefinite Appointment.....	3757
	4. Temporary Employment.....	3757
	5. Personal Service Contract	3758
	6. Nonappropriated Fund	3763
	7. Others.....	3764
	8. Effect of Military Service; Deposit for Military Service.....	3764
	a. National Guard, Other Uniformed Service	3777
	(i) Abandonment of Civilian Career for Military Service	3779
	9. Period of Receipt of OWCP Benefits	3783
	10. Sick Leave Credit.....	3785
D.	DISABILITY RETIREMENT.....	3785
	1. Statutory, Regulatory Standards.....	3785
	a. Concept of Disability	3787
	b. Cause of Disability	3789
	c. Medical Condition Postdating Disability Retirement.....	3789

2.	Disability Incurred While in the Federal Service.....	3789
a.	Preexisting Condition	3790
3.	Position Last Occupied.....	3790
a.	Qualifying Position.....	3790
4.	Disability Must Continue at Least One Year	3790
a.	Possible Future Disability.....	3792
5.	Situational or Transitory Condition; Hostile Environment.....	3793
a.	Workplace Stressor May Be Sufficient.....	3794
b.	Workplace Stressor May Be Insufficient	3794
c.	Alcoholism or Drug Addiction; Inability to Control Condition.....	3795
6.	Partial Disability Does Not Qualify	3796
7.	Reassignment in Lieu of Disability Retirement	3796
a.	Adequacy of Position Offered Through Reassignment	3797
b.	Permanent Light Duty Position	3798
c.	Postal Service: Different Craft.....	3802
d.	Failure to Accept a Suitable Position	3804
8.	Effect of Disability Accommodation on Annuity Entitlement.....	3805
a.	Conflicting Agency Evidence Concerning Accommodation	3807
9.	Necessity for Cessation of Pay or Separation From the Federal Service.....	3807
10.	One Year for Disability Retirement Application.....	3807
a.	New Condition Raised With Judge or in PFR; Condition That Should Have Been Considered by OPM.....	3810
b.	Evidence of Progression of Disease Presented in PFR.....	3811
c.	Technical Constructions Concerning Filing Date: Method of Filing; Filing With Former Agency.....	3811
d.	Waiver; Separation for Medical Reason: Notice Required.....	3814
e.	Mental Incompetence; Related Delay Excused.....	3815
11.	Agency-Initiated Disability Retirement Application.....	3819
a.	Service Credit Requirement.....	3822
12.	Application Cannot Be Filed After the Employee's Death	3822
13.	Bar to Concurrent Receipt of Disability Retirement and Workers Compensation Benefit.....	3822
14.	Withdrawal of Disability Annuity Application	3822
15.	Rescission of Disability Retirement Grant	3824
16.	Evidence of Disability.....	3824
a.	Significance of Position Description, Qualification Requirements	3825
b.	Scope of Board Review; <i>Chavez</i>	3825
c.	Objective Medical Evidence	3829
d.	Content of Medical Report.....	3830
e.	Lack of Evidence of Precise Medical Causation Not Determinative	3830
f.	<i>Mullins-Howard</i> : Disability Established Without Unduly Detailed Medical Causation Analysis	3833
g.	Subjective Evidence.....	3838
h.	Testimony of Supervisor; Performance Appraisal.....	3839
i.	Hearsay.....	3839
j.	Absence; Use of Leave	3839
k.	Post-Separation Medical Evidence.....	3839
l.	Medical Condition Not Presented to OPM	3841
m.	Removal for Physical Inability to Perform; <i>Bruner; Settlement</i>	3842
n.	Loss of Military Status	3847
o.	OWCP Determination	3848
p.	Social Security Administration Determination	3848
q.	VA Disability Rating.....	3850
r.	Security Clearance Determination	3851
s.	Agency Medical Disqualification	3852
t.	Removal for Misconduct.....	3852
17.	Refusal to Undergo Diagnostic or Other Procedure.....	3853
a.	Possible Improvement Through Future Surgery	3854
18.	Specific Conditions	3854
19.	Earnings Recovery	3855
a.	Current Rate of Pay	3856
b.	Basic Pay; Cost of Living Adjustment	3857
c.	Bonus	3858
d.	Miscellaneous Income	3858
e.	Business Expense.....	3859

f. Pension Contribution	3859
20. Decline of Recovered Earnings.....	3859
21. Discontinued Service Annuity Upon Recovery of Earning Capacity	3859
22. Conversion From Disability to Optional Retirement	3860
23. Conversion From Optional to Disability Retirement	3860
24. Recovery From Disability: Burden of Proof	3860
25. Restoration of Annuity	3861
26. Calculation of Annuity.....	3862
27. Loss of Annuity for Certain Offenses.....	3863
E. LUMP SUM DEATH BENEFITS.....	3865
1. Submission of Designation.....	3871
2. Child Who Qualifies to Receive Lump Sum Payment	3874
3. Other Distributions.....	3875
a. Slayer Statute	3875
4. Time for Application.....	3876
F. SURVIVOR ANNUITIES	3876
1. Eligibility of Employee for Retirement as Condition to Survivor Annuity	3878
2. Application for Survivor Annuity.....	3879
3. Time, Method of Election	3879
a. Notice to Annuitant of Necessity to Notify OPM of Remarriage to Secure Survivor Annuity.....	3880
b. Delay in Notice to OPM of Survivor Annuity Election	3881
c. Lack of Proper Notice From OPM Concerning Survivor Annuity Election	3883
d. Incorrect Information From Employing Agency Concerning Survivor Annuity Election	3893
e. Survivor Annuity Election Form; Signature.....	3896
f. Effect of Mental Incompetence on Timeliness of Election	3897
g. Authority to Act on Behalf of Incompetent Employee to Create Survivor Annuity	3898
h. Employee Mentally Incompetent to Make Adverse Election	3899
i. Community Property Interests	3900
4. State Law Defines Marital Status; Common Law Marriage; Qualifying Widow.....	3901
a. Current Spouse; Duration of Marriage; Widow: Issue of Marriage.....	3903
b. Accidental Death	3904
c. Putative Spouse	3904
5. Effect of Remarriage After Retirement	3905
6. Calculation.....	3906
a. Survivor Annuity Based on Disability Annuity.....	3906
b. Health Benefits	3908
c. Social Security Benefit Offset—CSRS	3908
d. Social Security Benefit—FERS.....	3909
7. Consent of Spouse to Waiver of Survivor Annuity	3910
a. Consent by Current Spouse to Discontinue Survivor Annuity.....	3917
b. Consent by Current Spouse for Former Spouse Annuity	3918
8. Marriage of at Least Nine Months; Parent of Issue by Marriage; Exceptions	3918
9. Attempt to Modify Amount of Spousal Survivor Annuity.....	3919
10. Survivor Annuity for Child Incapable of Self-Support	3920
a. Children in School.....	3926
G. DISCONTINUED SERVICE ANNUITY	3927
H. LAW ENFORCEMENT RETIREMENT	3936
1. Process of Determining and Appealing LEO Status.....	3936
2. Agency Head Determination; Timeliness of Request for LEO Status.....	3938
3. Substantive Criteria for LEO Determination	3947
a. Customs and Border Patrol Officers.....	3958
b. Cases Prior to 2000.....	3960
4. Evidence Considered	3964
5. Supervisory Credit	3968
6. Effect of Disability Retirement.....	3970
I. FIREFIGHTER RETIREMENT	3971
J. AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLER RETIREMENT.....	3980
K. OTHER ANNUITY INTERESTS	3980
1. Deferred Annuity.....	3980
2. FERS Minimum Retirement Age Annuity.....	3981
3. Supplemental, Redetermined Annuity	3981

4.	Alternative Form of Annuity.....	3984
5.	Voluntary Early Retirement Authority.....	3987
L.	APPORTIONMENT OF ANNUITY BY COURT ORDER.....	3988
1.	Lifetime Annuity.....	3989
2.	Former Spouse Survivor Annuity.....	3989
a.	Intent to Create Former Spouse Survivor Annuity or Other Benefit.....	3990
b.	Reduction in Lifetime Annuity.....	3992
c.	Wording of the Decree.....	3993
d.	Ambiguous Provision in Divorce Decree; Extrinsic Evidence; Rules of Construction.....	3995
3.	Challenge to Court Order Affecting Annuity Interest.....	3999
a.	Qualifying Court Order.....	4001
b.	Amendment to Court Order Affecting Former Spouse Annuity; Construction of Annuity Interest Following Ineffective Amendment.....	4011
c.	Bifurcated Decree.....	4022
d.	Spouse Equity Act of 1984 as Amended.....	4025
M.	ANNUITY CALCULATION ISSUES.....	4027
1.	Estoppel as Basis to Create, Continue, or Adjust Benefit or Overpayment.....	4027
2.	Refund.....	4029
3.	Redeposit.....	4036
a.	Personal Service Agreement.....	4037
4.	High Three Salary Calculation: Basic Pay; Lump Sum Back Pay Settlement.....	4038
5.	Onset of Disability Annuity Payment.....	4041
6.	VA Medical Professional; VA Benefit Reduction.....	4044
7.	Annuity Reduction for VA Employees Removed for Certain Performance or Misconduct.....	4044
8.	Law Enforcement Enhanced Annuity Rate.....	4045
9.	Minimum, Maximum Annuity.....	4045
10.	Annuity Allotment.....	4045
11.	Impact of Receipt of Medicare Benefits, Social Security on CSRS, FERS.....	4045
12.	Deposit for Post-1956 Military Service.....	4048
13.	Deposit for Creditable Service; Annuity Supplement.....	4048
14.	Interest.....	4049
15.	Taxes.....	4049
16.	Cost of Living Adjustment for Reinstated Annuity.....	4049
17.	Diversion of Annuity Payment.....	4050
18.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4050
19.	Individual Retirement Record.....	4051
20.	Reconstructing Employment Record.....	4053
N.	OVERPAYMENTS.....	4053
1.	Proving the Debt; Evidence Supporting Waiver; OPM Records.....	4054
2.	Basis for Waiver.....	4055
a.	Annuitant Without Fault and Recovery Against Equity and Good Conscience.....	4057
b.	Knowledge of Overpayment; Set-Aside Rule.....	4059
c.	OPM Fault in Creating Overpayment.....	4060
d.	Unconscionability of Recovery; Recovery Delay.....	4062
e.	Financial Hardship.....	4066
f.	Adjustment of Repayment Schedule; Length of Recovery.....	4067
g.	Ordinary and Necessary Living Expenses; Future Events.....	4067
h.	Assets Available to Satisfy Overpayment; Income/Expense Margin.....	4069
i.	Detrimental Reliance.....	4070
j.	Age of Debt.....	4073
k.	Calculation of Overpayment; Interest.....	4074
l.	Recovery Schedule Adjustment When There Is No Annuity Entitlement.....	4074
m.	Collection From Survivor for Debt of Original Annuitant.....	4074
n.	Insurance Issue Related to Overpayment.....	4078
O.	OFFSETS; DEBT COLLECTION FROM ANNUITY.....	4079
II.	RESTORATION RIGHTS UPON RECOVERY FROM OCCUPATIONAL INJURY OR ILLNESS.....	4084
A.	SEPARATION OR FURLOUGH MUST RESULT FROM COMPENSABLE INJURY.....	4087
1.	Separation for Reason Other Than Result of Injury or Illness.....	4090
a.	Factual Determination on Cause of Separation.....	4096
b.	Termination When OWCP Determination Supports Employee's Refusal to Return to Work.....	4098
c.	AWOL Covered by Period of Compensation.....	4100

d. Effect of Resignation	4101
e. Separation by Settlement Agreement.....	4101
B. SIGNIFICANCE OF OWCP DETERMINATION; RECEIPT OF COMPENSATION.....	4102
1. Requirement of Medical Examination	4105
C. MEANING OF "RECOVERY"	4106
1. Fully Recovered Within a Year	4107
2. Fully Recovered After a Year	4110
a. Priority Consideration: Necessity for Position to Be Filled by Another Person.....	4112
b. Geographic Extent of Consideration	4114
c. Method, Duration of Priority Consideration	4115
3. Partially Recovered	4115
a. Geographic Extent of Consideration: Local Commuting Area.....	4120
b. Arbitrary or Capricious Restoration Effort	4123
c. Accommodation Requirement.....	4125
d. Postal Service National Reassessment Process; Realignment of Employees; <i>Latham</i>	4127
e. Other Postal Service Limited Duty Restoration Decisions.....	4138
f. Discontinuation of Modified Assignment	4140
4. Physically Disqualified Employee	4140
a. Geographic Extent of Consideration	4141
D. PARTICULAR GROUPS OF EMPLOYEES	4142
1. Probationer.....	4142
2. Reemployed Annuitant.....	4142
3. Postal Service.....	4143
4. Nonappropriated Fund	4146
E. WHEN RESTORATION IS TO OCCUR	4147
1. Light Duty	4148
2. Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4148
F. TIME TO APPLY FOR RESTORATION	4150
1. Form of Restoration Request	4151
G. REMEDY.....	4152
1. Same or Equivalent Position	4153
a. Return to <i>Status Quo</i>	4153
b. Interim Promotion.....	4154
2. Regraded Position.....	4155
3. Seniority Inapplicable.....	4155
4. Priority Placement Program	4155
5. Benefits Upon Restoration.....	4156
H. MSPB APPEAL RIGHTS.....	4162
1. Time for Appeal.....	4162
a. Lack of Notice of Appeal Right	4163
b. Settlement	4164
2. Burden of Proof; Jurisdictional Allegations	4164

CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....4167

I. ENTITLEMENT STANDARDS	4167
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS FOR FEES	4167
1. Use of Counsel; Licensure.....	4168
2. Governing Statutes and Regulation	4170
a. Civil Rights Statutes	4172
b. Whistleblower Protection Act	4172
3. Jurisdiction Over Action Under Appeal	4172
4. Miscellaneous Appeals	4173
a. Regulation Review Proceeding	4173
b. Retirement Case.....	4173
c. OSC Case: Prohibited Personnel Practice and Hatch Act Litigation	4173
d. Sanction	4182
B. PREVAILING PARTY STATUS	4182
1. Mitigation.....	4184
2. Other Relief.....	4185
3. Must Prevail Through MSPB Procedures.....	4186
a. Mixed-Motive Determination	4187

4.	Cancelation of Action Appealed.....	4188
a.	Enforcement Proceeding Mooted by Agency Action	4193
5.	Settlement	4197
a.	Prevailing Party Status Through Settlement	4197
b.	Relief Through Settlement Must Be Related to MSPB Appeal.....	4199
c.	Interest of Justice Criteria	4199
d.	MSPB Jurisdiction to Accept and Enforce Settlement Providing for Fees or Supporting Fee Motion	4199
C.	INTEREST OF JUSTICE: AN OVERVIEW	4204
1.	<i>Allen</i> Criteria	4204
a.	Financial Hardship.....	4205
2.	Preservation of Claims Supporting Entitlement; Significance of Final Merits Decision	4205
a.	Overlapping Fee Entitlement Standards	4205
3.	Statutory Examples Not Exclusive	4206
D.	BAD FAITH	4206
1.	Malicious Action; Inadequate Inquiry	4206
a.	Disparate Treatment	4207
2.	Action Reversed but Some Charges Sustained.....	4207
3.	Unreasonable Litigation Tactics; Failure to Settle.....	4207
a.	Frivolous PFR	4207
4.	Compliance	4207
E.	CLEARLY WITHOUT MERIT OR WHOLLY UNFOUNDED	4208
1.	Failure to Adhere to Legal Precedent.....	4208
2.	Inadequate Initial Inquiry Into Facts	4209
3.	Lack of Legitimate Basis for Agency Action	4209
a.	Development of Dispositive Information During MSPB Appeal.....	4209
4.	Mitigation	4210
5.	Factual Dispute	4210
6.	Performance Case	4211
7.	Retirement Case.....	4212
a.	Legal Error by OPM	4215
b.	Incorrect Advice From OPM	4216
c.	Issue of Mental Incompetence	4216
F.	KNEW OR SHOULD HAVE KNOWN	4218
1.	Lack of Reasonable Inquiry	4218
2.	Disregard of Legal Precedent	4220
3.	Regulatory Error.....	4220
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4220
5.	Performance Case	4220
6.	Mitigation	4220
a.	Not All Charges Sustained	4224
7.	Negligent Presentation of Case	4225
8.	Decision of Another Tribunal	4225
9.	Retirement Case	4225
a.	Failure of OPM to Evaluate Evidence Available During Reconsideration Process	4225
b.	Legal Error by OPM	4228
10.	Settlement	4228
G.	GROSS PROCEDURAL ERROR.....	4228
1.	Denial of Advance Notice or Appeal Right	4230
a.	Involuntary or Constructive Adverse Action	4232
b.	Enforced Leave	4232
c.	Indefinite or Emergency Suspension	4233
2.	Mitigation.....	4233
3.	Performance Case	4233
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4234
H.	SUBSTANTIALLY INNOCENT.....	4234
1.	<i>Yorkshire</i>	4236
2.	MSPB Treatment of <i>Yorkshire</i>	4237
3.	Appellant Who Ensnares the Agency	4239
4.	Mitigation: <i>Boese, VanFossen</i>	4239
a.	Factually Close Case.....	4242
b.	Prior Law	4243

5.	Performance Case	4243
6.	Other Legal Error	4244
I.	OTHER AUTHORITY FOR FEE AWARDS	4244
1.	Back Pay Act	4244
a.	Postal Service Employee	4244
2.	Equal Access to Justice Act	4246
a.	Administrative Law Judge Case	4248
b.	Basis for Compensating Court Time	4250
c.	Prevailing Party	4250
d.	Substantial Justification	4253
e.	Basis for Awarding MSPB Time	4255
f.	Rate Under EAJA; <i>Pro Bono</i> or Contingent Representation; COLA; Expenses	4256
g.	Procedure Under EAJA; Time for Filing; Application	4258
h.	Effect of EAJA on MSPB Litigation	4259
3.	Civil Rights Case	4260
a.	Result Achieved	4262
4.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Case	4263
5.	USERRA; VEOA	4264
6.	Miscellaneous Claims; Equitable Assessment of Fee.....	4266
II.	PROCEDURES FOR OBTAINING FEES	4266
A.	HOW FEES ARE INCURRED	4266
1.	Attorney-Client Relationship; Fee Payment	4266
a.	Law Clerk, Paraprofessional; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant.....	4266
2.	Union Counsel	4267
a.	Demise of the Cost-Plus Formula.....	4267
b.	History of the Cost-Plus Rule	4270
c.	Repayment of Fees to Union Required	4271
3.	Federally Employed Attorney	4271
4.	Public Interest Organization	4271
B.	COMPENSABLE SERVICES	4271
1.	Service Prior to Final Adverse Action or Other Decision	4272
2.	Research	4274
3.	Discovery	4274
4.	Settlement, Mediation.....	4274
5.	PFR	4274
a.	OPM Reconsideration Petition	4275
6.	Time in Court	4276
a.	Appropriate Charge for Court Time	4279
b.	Practice Notes	4279
7.	Preparation of Fee Motion	4280
8.	Defense of Fee Motion	4280
9.	Enforcement Proceeding.....	4280
10.	Related Proceeding	4286
a.	MSPB	4287
b.	Grievance	4287
c.	Privacy Act	4288
d.	Unemployment Compensation	4288
e.	Criminal Case	4288
f.	EEO Complaint.....	4289
g.	Media Contact; Congressional Activity.....	4290
11.	Anticipated Time; Supplemental Petition	4290
12.	Unsuccessful Claim, Issue, or Defense	4290
a.	<i>Hensley</i>	4291
b.	Mitigation.....	4297
c.	Tangentially Related Issue	4298
d.	Clearly Separate Claim	4299
e.	Unsuccessful EEO Claim	4299
f.	Unsuccessful Whistleblower Claim	4301
C.	REASONABLENESS OF FEES.....	4301
1.	Hourly Rate.....	4302
a.	Evidence of Reasonableness; Fee Agreement; Result Achieved	4303

b.	Initial Decision in Another Appeal; Decision of Another Tribunal	4310
c.	Settlement	4310
d.	Out-Of-Town Counsel	4310
e.	Travel Time	4311
2.	Contingency Arrangement, Enhancement; <i>City of Burlington</i>	4311
a.	Early Treatment by MSPB of Contingent Fee	4314
b.	Enhancement for Payment Delay; Interest	4314
c.	Enhancement for Quality Work	4316
d.	Enhancement for Wear and Tear	4318
e.	Traditional Contingency Agreement; Fee Cap	4318
3.	<i>Laffey Matrix</i>	4319
4.	Below Market Rate	4324
5.	Reasonableness of Time Invested	4328
a.	Responsibility of Judge	4328
b.	Articulated Analysis Required	4330
c.	Notice to Counsel of Defect in Fee Motion	4332
d.	Expertise and Diligence of Counsel; Likely Outcome	4332
e.	Time at Hearing	4333
f.	PFR	4333
g.	<i>Amicus</i> Brief	4333
h.	Time Preparing Counsel Fee Motion	4334
i.	Consolidated Cases	4334
j.	Multiple Counsel; Duplicative Work.....	4334
k.	Clerical, Secretarial Work	4336
6.	Examples of Fee Awards	4337
a.	Rates	4337
b.	Amounts	4338
D.	COSTS AND EXPENSES.....	4339
1.	Transcript.....	4340
2.	Photocopy; Electronic Production	4340
3.	Travel	4340
4.	Secretarial Expense.....	4340
5.	Postage; Courier	4340
6.	Fee for Expert, Consultant	4340
7.	Investigator	4341
8.	Accounting Expense	4341
9.	Telephone or Facsimile	4341
10.	Electronic Research	4342
11.	Taxes	4342
12.	EEO, Whistleblower Protection Act, USERRA, and VEOA Cases; Broader Coverage.....	4342
13.	Direct Recovery of Costs by Appellants	4343
E.	FEE MOTION	4345
1.	Who May File	4346
2.	Time and Place of Filing	4346
a.	Premature Fee Motion.....	4347
b.	Timing of Agency Response	4348
c.	Late Fee Motion	4348
3.	Fee Motion Must Be Complete When Filed	4352
a.	Incomplete Fee Motion	4352
4.	Developing Evidence to Support Fee Motion	4352
a.	Hearing Concerning Fee Entitlement in Settled Appeal	4352
b.	Hearing and Discovery Concerning Reasonableness	4353
5.	Format of Motion	4354
a.	What to Include.....	4355
b.	Fee Agreement	4355
c.	Itemization of Time	4356
d.	Retrospective Reconstruction of Time	4357
6.	Supplemental or Corrected Fee Motion	4357
7.	Unopposed, Moot, or Settled Fee Motion.....	4358
8.	Service of Fee Motion	4358
9.	Opposition to Fee Motion	4358

10. Initial Decision on Fee Motion	4358
a. Obligation of Judge to Ensure Due Process	4359
b. Requirements of Addendum Initial Decision	4359
c. Initial Decision Controls Basis for Fee Determination	4359
d. Change in Judge	4361
e. Hourly Rate Analysis.....	4361
11. Waiver of Fee Through Settlement Agreement	4361
a. Effect of Settlement on Claims of Multiple Counsel	4362
12. Settlement of Fee Motion	4363
13. Payment of Fee to Counsel and Client	4364
a. Payment to Counsel	4364
b. Repayment of Fee by Counsel to Client	4365
14. PFR of Fee Decision	4365
a. Interim Fee	4366
b. Time Spent on PFR	4366

CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT4367

I. SETTLEMENT.....	4367
A. ELEMENTS OF SETTLEMENTS	4367
1. Settlement Resources; Mediation Appeals Program.....	4369
2. Minimum Requirements	4369
a. Hatch Act Case.....	4370
3. Settlement After Issuance of Initial Decision	4370
4. Regulatory Process	4370
5. Filing, Acceptance of Settlement for Enforcement	4371
a. Intent That Agreement Be Subject to MSPB Enforcement Authority	4372
b. Unfiled Settlement	4374
c. Oral Advice of Settlement	4375
d. Specific Oral Settlement Agreement Entered Into the Record	4377
e. Distinguishing Oral Agreement and Ongoing or Incomplete Negotiation	4381
f. Oral Agreement to Be Followed by Written Agreement	4385
g. Appellant's Understanding of Agreement	4386
6. Jurisdiction to Accept Settlement: <i>Delorme</i>	4387
a. Prior Law	4388
b. Settlement Arising From Disputed Last Chance Agreement.....	4392
7. Flexibility, Scope of Settlement	4393
a. Incomplete Settlement; Omitted Terms	4393
8. Conditional Settlement; Lapsed Offer; Implied Term	4395
9. Settlement Requiring Specific Action by Judge	4397
10. Integration or "Zipper" Clause	4398
11. Modification or Amendment of Agreement	4402
12. Waiver of Statutory Right; Release	4402
a. Unemployment Compensation	4403
b. Workers' Compensation	4404
c. Older Workers' Benefit Protection Act	4404
d. RIF Entitlement	4413
e. Limitation on the Right to Seek Future Federal Employment	4413
13. Retirement Benefit.....	4414
14. Settlement Provision Affecting Other Agencies	4414
15. OSC Case	4415
B. SETTING ASIDE A SETTLEMENT	4416
1. Agreement Challenged as Invalid; Use of PFR	4416
2. Timing of PFR.....	4418
3. Bases for Setting Aside a Settlement	4420
a. Threat of Unwarranted Action; Duress	4421
b. Hardship.....	4423
c. Disappointment; Confusion	4423
d. Lack of Understanding	4424
e. Mental Incapacity; Stress	4425
f. Time Pressure.....	4428
g. Coercion or Bias by Judge	4428

h.	Coercion by Counsel or Union Representative; Lack of Signature by Counsel	4432
i.	Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative—Agreement Sustained	4435
j.	Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative— <i>Bona Fide</i> Challenge to Agreement	4438
k.	Error or Lack of Authority of Government Counsel.....	4442
l.	Fraud; Misrepresentation; Bad Faith; Merit of the Underlying Action	4443
m.	Mutual, Unilateral Mistake	4448
n.	Lack of Mutual Assent.....	4455
o.	Lack of Consideration	4458
p.	Incorrect Information From the Agency Concerning Retirement Eligibility.....	4458
q.	Provision Unlawful or Contrary to Public Policy or Labor Contract	4459
r.	Change in Law	4464
4.	Unfiled Settlement Agreement; Preappeal Settlement	4464
5.	Collateral Attack on Settlement Through New Appeal	4467
6.	Breach of Settlement: Election Between Rescission or Enforcement.....	4468
a.	Agency May Rescind	4469
b.	Restoration of Consideration Received; “Tender Back”.....	4469
c.	Use of Enforcement Petition to Rescind Settlement	4471
II.	APPELLATE REMEDIES	4472
A.	REMEDIAL ORDERS AND RIGHTS	4472
1.	Impact of OPM Regulation	4472
2.	Statutory Basis for Remedial Authority	4473
3.	Collateral Result of Restoration Order; Action Related to Case Under Appeal	4473
a.	Effect on Remedial Order of Decision of Another Tribunal	4478
b.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	4478
4.	Back Pay Remedies	4479
a.	Necessary Findings	4479
b.	Pay Entitlement: Ready, Willing, and Able to Work	4479
c.	Maximum Recovery Period	4485
d.	Liability for Event Preceding Adverse Action	4485
e.	Method of Payment	4486
f.	Method of Calculation	4486
g.	Reinstatement With No or Limited Pay; Time-Served or Other Suspension; After-Acquired Evidence; Shortened Notice Period	4486
h.	Loss of Security Clearance.....	4488
i.	Bonus and Award; Differential; Relocation Expense	4489
j.	Premium, Overtime, Holiday Pay	4490
k.	Overtime for Postal Service Employee	4495
l.	Interest—Back Pay Act	4496
m.	Interest—Postal Service Employee	4499
n.	Insurance Benefit.....	4500
o.	Retirement, TSP Contribution or Loan	4501
p.	Leave Account; FMLA; Military Leave	4506
q.	Restoration of Leave for Participation in MSPB or Related Proceedings; Compensatory Time; Official Time	4509
r.	Interim Promotion; WIGI; Pay Increase.....	4511
s.	Applicant for Employment	4515
t.	Federal Aviation Administration Employee	4515
5.	Duty to Mitigate Damages Through Interim Employment	4515
a.	Employee Other Than Postal Service.....	4515
b.	Postal Service Employee	4515
6.	Deductions From Back Pay	4517
a.	Retirement, TSP Contribution	4518
b.	Debt to Retirement Fund.....	4519
c.	Annuity Entitlement or Adjustment	4520
d.	Union Dues; Insurance; Medicare	4520
e.	Taxes; Increased Taxes.....	4525
f.	Unemployment, OWCP, Workers’ Compensation.....	4527
g.	Interim Earnings; Job Search, Relocation Cost; Replacement Earnings; Retirement Income; Fraudulent Earnings Information	4530
h.	Other Deductions	4533
7.	Retraining	4533

8.	Reemployment Right.....	4533
9.	Purging of Records; Modification of Documentation, Performance Appraisal	4534
	a. Coding of Personnel Document.....	4537
	b. Adjustment to AWOL Charge	4537
10.	Damages; Regulation Governing Recovery.....	4539
	a. Availability of Compensatory Damages	4541
	b. Awards of Compensatory Damages—Civil Rights Acts	4546
	c. Effect of Receipt of FECA and Insurance Benefits on Recovery of Compensatory Damages	4555
	d. Consequential Damages and Costs—Whistleblower Case	4556
	e. Compensatory Damages—Whistleblower Case.....	4566
	f. Damages Under Veterans Employment Opportunities Act of 1998; USERRA	4569
	g. Monetary Relief for Prohibited Personnel Practices Not Covered by the WPA or EEO Law	4570
	h. Punitive Damages	4572
	i. Taxation of Damages, Attorney Fees.....	4572
11.	Nontraditional Remedies	4573
	a. Waiver of Debt.....	4573
	b. Apology; Evidence Destruction	4573
	c. Protection Against Intervening Event	4573
	d. Protection Against Future Event.....	4574
	e. Front Pay	4574
	f. Equitable Relief; Other Remedies	4574
III.	ENFORCEMENT.....	4576
A.	ENFORCEMENT OF MSPB DECISION	4576
1.	Authority to Order Compliance; Sanctions.....	4577
2.	Limitation on Enforcement Authority to Award Back Pay or Monetary Remedy	4578
	a. Mootness	4580
	b. Burden of Proof; Proof of Compliance	4580
3.	Enforcement Procedure	4582
	a. Enforcement Petition Regulation, Guidance	4583
	b. Duty to Supply Information; Accounting.....	4585
	c. Evidence Supplied After Decision of Judge	4587
	d. Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	4587
	e. Agency Request for Extension of Time.....	4591
	f. Unclear or Impossible Compliance	4591
	g. Evidence of Compliance; Statement of Intent; Representative’s Statement; Hearing.....	4591
	h. Discovery	4593
	i. Referral to Comptroller General	4594
	j. Sanction Against Agency	4595
	k. Multiple Enforcement Petitions; <i>Res Judicata</i>	4595
	l. Analysis by Judge	4597
	m. MSPB Review of Compliance Initial Decision	4597
4.	Allegation of Reprisal, Bad Faith, Discrimination, or Harassment	4599
	a. Discipline Related to Agency Noncompliance	4600
	b. Performance Appraisal Dispute	4600
5.	Back Pay Dispute	4601
	a. Delay in Payment.....	4603
	b. Damages.....	4603
6.	Reinstatement to the Same Position; <i>Status Quo Ante</i> Remedy	4603
	a. Compelling Reason for Reassignment; Detail; Different Duties.....	4607
	b. Medical Limitation	4614
	c. Administrative Leave	4615
	d. Effect of Retirement.....	4616
	e. Reason Related to Original Action	4616
	f. Obligation Under Collective Bargaining Agreement	4618
	g. Other Post-Reinstatement Action; Medical Certification Requirement.....	4618
	h. Postal Service Reorganization.....	4619
	i. Security Clearance Problem.....	4621
	j. Demotion	4623
	k. Term or Temporary Appointment.....	4630
	l. Seniority Adjustment	4631
	m. Pay System Change	4632

n. Insurance	4632
o. Other Working Conditions	4632
7. Reinstatement With Accommodation for Disability	4633
8. Lack of Authority to Enforce Compliance.....	4637
9. Sovereign Immunity Issue.....	4637
B. ENFORCEMENT AND INTERPRETATION OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	4638
1. Scope of Enforcement Authority	4640
a. Only Filed Settlement May Be Enforced	4640
b. Allegation of Discrimination; Whistleblowing Reprisal	4641
c. Damages.....	4643
2. Agency Enforcement Initiative	4643
a. Appellant’s Agreement to Resign or to Take Other Action; Agency Self Help	4644
b. Agreement Not to Reapply for Employment With Agency	4645
c. Agreement to Withdraw EEOC Case or Other Litigation	4646
3. Agreement That Appellant First Notify Agency of Noncompliance Allegation	4647
a. Agreement That the Parties Attempt to Adjust Disputes Under the Settlement.....	4647
4. Election Between Enforcement and Rescission; Pleading in the Alternative	4648
a. Modification of Settlement Provision	4649
5. Role of MSPB Regional or Field Office	4650
a. Treatment of Enforcement Issue, Evidence on PFR	4650
6. Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	4650
a. Reasonableness of Timing of Enforcement; Laches Defense	4655
7. Burden of Proof	4658
a. Evidence Required	4661
b. Mutual Breach; “Clean Hands”	4662
8. Interpretation and Application of Settlement: Legal Principles	4663
a. Materiality of Breach	4664
b. Good Faith Required; Harassment; Bad Faith.....	4669
c. Foreclosure of Future Discipline or Other Agency Action for Past Conduct.....	4673
d. Time for Compliance if No Time Set in Settlement Agreement	4676
9. Interpretation of Agreement: External Law; Extrinsic or Parol Evidence; Ambiguous Term; History of Performance; Hearing	4678
a. Back Pay Obligation; Omitted Term	4683
b. Amendment to Agreement; Counterproposal	4685
10. Specific Settlement Provisions	4686
a. Term of Art	4686
b. Obligation to Reinstatement or Restore to Duty; Precondition to Restoration.....	4686
c. Agreement to Reassign, Demote, Suspend; Work Schedule Change; Light Duty Position	4687
d. Agreement That Employee May Be Terminated or Will Resign or Retire Upon Specified Condition; Agreement Not to Reapply	4689
e. Promotion, Placement Consideration; Priority Consideration	4691
f. Agreement to Provide Affirmative, Neutral, or Controlled Reference	4695
g. “Clean Record” or “Clean Paper”; Expungement or Withdrawal of Record; Implied Requirement	4703
h. Nondisclosure or Confidentiality Clause.....	4718
i. “Need to Know” Exception to Confidentiality Clause.....	4725
j. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act Provision.....	4730
k. Waiver of Protection of Confidentiality or Affirmative Reference Provision	4730
l. Damages Unavailable for Breach of Clause Requiring Affirmative Reference, Other Violations	4731
m. Adjustment of Performance Appraisal, Documentation.....	4732
n. Agreement to Provide Assistance to Employee	4734
o. Agreement to “Cancel” Action; Back Pay, Interest, Damages, or Other Entitlement; Bonus or Award; Lump Sum Provision	4734
p. Retirement Entitlement	4739
q. Unemployment Compensation	4744
11. Debt Recoupment	4745
12. Allegation of Reprisal or Harassment.....	4745
13. Settlement Reached in Another Tribunal	4748
14. Settlement Involving Action of Third Party	4748
15. Privacy Act Issue	4748
16. Provision That Violates Collective Bargaining Agreement	4749
17. Unlawful Provision	4749

CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....4755

- I. OVERVIEW OF THE APPELLATE PROCESS4755
 - A. NATURE OF THE DECISION UNDER REVIEW4755
 - 1. Final Decision.....4755
 - a. Denial of Request for Reopening.....4757
 - 2. Statutory Basis for Review; CSRA and Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 20124760
 - a. Collateral MSPB Order.....4761
 - b. Decision Remanding Case to Judge; Final Order Rule4761
 - c. Counsel Fee Award, Application4763
 - 3. Proper Parties in Court; Standing; Mootness4764
 - a. Proper Respondent in Court4764
 - b. OSC Disciplinary Case4769
 - c. Arbitration Award4770
 - 4. Authorization to Appeal4770
 - 5. *Amicus* Submission4770
 - 6. Counsel Authorized to Appear in Appeal; Federal Circuit Admission.....4770
 - 7. Government Appellate Review Request; Cross-Appeal.....4770
 - a. Review Request by OPM4770
 - b. Discrimination Issue4772
 - 8. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit.....4773
 - a. Nonprecedential Decision.....4774
 - b. Summary Affirmation4775
 - c. Court Practice4776
 - d. *Pro Se* Appeal4779
 - e. Stay Pending Court Review.....4779
 - 9. Record Below4779
 - a. Appendix4781
 - b. New and Material Evidence4781
 - B. SCOPE OF REVIEW4782
 - 1. Arbitrary and Capricious.....4783
 - 2. Issues of Law, Jurisdiction; Contract Interpretation; Constitutional Issues4783
 - a. Decisional Rationale Omitted by MSPB; Departure From Precedent4784
 - 3. Procedural Error by MSPB.....4786
 - a. Ruling on Witnesses and Evidence4786
 - b. Ruling on Discovery4787
 - c. Timeliness of MSPB Filing4788
 - 4. Substantial Evidence; Factual Dispute.....4789
 - a. Credibility4792
 - b. Nexus4796
 - 5. Agency Rule of Conduct4797
 - 6. Penalty Determination4797
 - a. Performance Action.....4801
 - 7. Reduction in Force4801
 - 8. Whistleblower Reprisal: Circuits Other Than the Federal Circuit4801
 - C. DEFERENCE; INTERPRETATION OF STATUTES, REGULATIONS, LABOR AND OTHER CONTRACTS4802
 - 1. Agency Statutory Interpretation4802
 - a. Regulation Applying Statute; Agency Interpretation of Regulation4805
 - 2. Agency Handbook, Instruction4809
 - 3. MSPB Decision4810
 - 4. Principles of Statutory and Regulatory Interpretation4810
 - a. Language Controls.....4812
 - b. Consideration of the Statutory Scheme4814
 - c. Avoidance of Absurd Consequences4814
 - d. Statements of Legislators4814
 - e. Amendment; Failure to Amend.....4815
 - f. Retroactivity4815
 - g. Change in Law4819
 - 5. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Agreement.....4819
 - 6. Settlement; Last Chance Agreement4820

D.	RETIREMENT AND ANNUITY APPEALS	4822
1.	Disability Retirement	4823
2.	Optional Retirement	4827
E.	DISCRIMINATION ISSUES	4827
1.	Reprisal.....	4830
2.	Procedural Problem.....	4831
3.	Jurisdictional Matter; Constructive Adverse Action	4832
4.	Timeliness Issue	4839
5.	Review of Board Cases That Include EEO Defenses or Both EEO and Whistleblower Reprisal Defenses.....	4844
6.	Transfer To and From District Courts.....	4846
7.	District Court Review	4848
a.	Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies	4848
b.	Summary Adjudication of EEO Issues; Disposition of Civil Service Issues	4849
c.	Scope of Review	4850
d.	Compliance With District Court Decision	4850
8.	Discharge of Probationer	4850
F.	REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS.....	4852
1.	Exclusivity of Review	4854
a.	Mixed Case.....	4855
2.	Time for Seeking Review	4860
3.	Decisional Standards for Arbitrator	4861
a.	Arbitrability	4864
b.	Bargaining History	4865
c.	Past Practice.....	4865
4.	Review Sought by OPM	4866
5.	Award Involving Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee	4866
6.	Award Involving Nonappropriated Fund Instrumentality Employee.....	4868
7.	Award Reviewed by Federal Labor Relations Authority.....	4868
G.	VEOA, USERRA CLAIMS.....	4869
II.	PREREQUISITES FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW	4870
A.	TIME FOR INITIATING JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	4870
1.	Equitable Tolling	4874
B.	EXHAUSTION OF MSPB ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES	4878
1.	Issue Must Be Raised With the MSPB	4878
a.	Exception to Exhaustion Requirement	4879
b.	Mandamus.....	4880
2.	Necessity for PFR to MSPB.....	4881
a.	Challenge to Settlement.....	4883
3.	Ripeness for Judicial Review	4883
III.	JUDICIAL REMEDIAL AUTHORITY	4884
A.	AUTHORITY TO REMAND	4884
1.	Remand to Effect Settlement	4886
2.	Judicial Control of MSPB Procedures	4886
B.	AUTHORITY TO TRANSFER	4886
C.	SANCTIONS	4887
1.	Examples of Sanctionable Conduct	4889
IV.	JUDICIAL RELIEF OUTSIDE THE REFORM ACT	4891
A.	PARTIES TO THE SUIT	4892
1.	Sovereign Immunity.....	4892
2.	Absolute Immunity.....	4893
3.	Qualified Immunity.....	4893
a.	Action Against Union	4893
B.	SUITS BASED ON STATUTE AND CONSTITUTION	4893
1.	Administrative Procedure Act	4893
a.	Use of the APA	4894
b.	Scope of Review; Preclusive Effect of the Reform Act	4894
c.	Scope of Relief	4898
2.	Privacy Act; FOIA	4898
a.	Scope of the Act	4899
b.	Enforcement of the Act	4899
c.	Use of the Privacy Act	4899

d. Position Classification	4900
3. Mandamus Act	4901
a. Position Classification	4901
4. Tucker Act	4904
a. Position Classification	4909
b. Overtime Pay Claim	4910
c. Environmental Differential, Hazard Pay, Travel Pay	4911
d. Claims Concerning Tenure, Contract Employment, Promotion, and Bonuses	4913
e. Whistleblower Reprisal Claim	4917
f. Claims Based on Constitution	4918
g. EEO Settlement	4919
h. MSPB Settlement	4921
5. Back Pay Act	4923
a. Implied Preclusion Under the CSRA	4926
b. Promotion Claim	4927
6. Family Medical Leave Act	4928
7. Overtime, Pay Statutes	4928
8. Unfair Labor Practice	4930
9. Constitution	4930
a. Property Interest	4931
b. Liberty Interest; Name Clearing Hearing	4933
(i) Termination of Probationer, Others	4934
c. First Amendment	4935
10. Injunction Action	4937
C. ACTIONS FOR DAMAGES AGAINST INDIVIDUALS AND GOVERNMENT; <i>BIVENS</i>	4944
1. Preclusion in the Circuits	4948
a. D.C. Circuit	4948
b. First Circuit	4951
c. Second Circuit	4951
d. Third Circuit	4951
e. Fourth Circuit	4952
f. Fifth Circuit	4952
g. Sixth Circuit	4953
h. Seventh Circuit	4953
i. Eighth Circuit	4954
j. Ninth Circuit	4954
k. Tenth Circuit	4955
l. Eleventh Circuit	4956
2. Claims Based on State Law; Westfall Act; Federal Tort Claims Act; Defamation; Tort Action Arising From Assault	4956

CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....4965

I. RESEARCH AND REFERENCES	4965
II. FORMS	4966

BIBLIOGRAPHY4987

TABLE OF CASES4995

INDEX5145