

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
GLOSSARY	iii
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY	795
CHAPTER 3: HEARING.....	1209
CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE.....	1341
CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW.....	1493
CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS	1747
CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND MITIGATION	2135
CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....	2269

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES	2689
CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....	2799
CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....	2941
CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION	3107
CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES	3361
CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS.....	3799
CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....	4223
CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT	4427
CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	4821
CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....	5045
BIBLIOGRAPHY	5067
TABLE OF CASES	5075
INDEX	5229

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
GLOSSARY	iii
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
I. REFORM ACT.....	1
A. CAPSULE HISTORY	1
B. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL	3
II. MSPB ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATION.....	5
A. IMPARTIAL ADJUDICATION	6
1. <i>De Novo</i> Review of Agency Actions	7
a. Deference to OPM Regulations	8
b. Consideration of Agency Regulations	8
2. Prohibition Against Advisory Opinion; Internal Guidance; Request for Advisory Opinion	9
B. ORGANIZATION	10
1. Clerk	11
2. Office of Appeals Counsel	11
C. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGES	14
1. Delegations of Authority	15
a. Administrative Law Judges Adjudicating Specialized Cases	16
2. <i>Judges' Handbook</i> ; Internal Guidance	16
3. Qualifications, Performance Standards for Administrative Judge.....	16
a. Judges' Position Description, Performance Standards	16
b. Regional Director (Chief Administrative Judge) Position Description and SES Performance Plan.....	17
4. Regulatory Responsibilities of Judge.....	18
a. Waiver of Procedural Regulations	19
5. Quality Review	20
D. BOARD DECISIONS; PRECEDENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE	20
1. Nonprecedential Final Orders.....	21
2. Arbitration Award.....	22
3. Sensitive, Public Interest Appeal	22
4. Referral to OPM, OSC	22
E. MSPB RECORDS	22
1. Gaining Access; Review Procedure	26
2. Precluding Access	26
a. Sealing of Record or Files	26
b. Attempt to Preclude Publication of Decision.....	29
c. Expungement of Record	29
d. Redaction of Initial Decision	29
e. Classified Information	30
F. RULEMAKING PETITIONS.....	30
G. RESPONSIBILITY OF PARTIES IN MSPB CASES	31
III. JURISDICTIONAL OVERVIEW	31
A. SOURCES OF JURISDICTION	33
1. Original Jurisdiction Cases.....	33
2. Appealable Actions	34
a. Adverse Action	35
b. Performance-Based Action.....	35
c. Demonstration Project	35
3. Jurisdiction Through Agency Regulation	36
B. PRELIMINARY APPELLATE JURISDICTIONAL ANALYSIS	37
1. Lack of Jurisdiction; Failure to State a Claim	38
IV. EMPLOYEES WHO MAY APPEAL; APPEALABLE ISSUES	39
A. NATURE OF CIVIL SERVICE APPOINTMENTS	40

B.	CONCEPTS COMMON TO DEFINITION OF “EMPLOYEE” FOR COMPETITIVE AND EXCEPTED SERVICE	41
1.	Current Continuous Service	41
a.	Break in Service	42
b.	Service During Detail or in Acting Position.....	46
2.	Not Serving a Probationary or Trial Period Under an Initial Appointment.....	46
3.	Counting Service Time in a Prior Position or Appointment; <i>McCormick</i>	47
a.	Time in Nonpermanent Appointment as a Component of Current Continuous Service.....	53
C.	COMPETITIVE SERVICE EMPLOYEES	59
1.	Other Than a Temporary Appointment Limited to One Year or Less.....	61
D.	EXCEPTED SERVICE EMPLOYEES.....	63
1.	1990 Civil Service Due Process Amendments; Nonpreference Eligible Employees.....	63
a.	Excepted Service Employees Excluded From Due Process Amendments.....	64
2.	Preference Eligible Status.....	70
a.	Documentation.....	75
b.	Disabled Veteran.....	76
c.	Derivative Preference Eligible Status.....	76
3.	Effect of Grievance Settlement; Collective Bargaining Contract	78
4.	Period of Non-Pay Status.....	78
5.	Same or Similar Position	79
a.	Factual Dispute Concerning Similarity of Positions	86
b.	In an Executive Agency	88
6.	Appointment Pending Conversion to Competitive Service	91
E.	DETERMINATION OF PROBATION	95
1.	Probationary Classification Issues.....	95
a.	Appointment From Register	95
b.	Transfer	97
c.	Temporary Appointment Pending Establishment of a Register (TAPER).....	98
d.	Career Reinstatement	98
2.	Calculating Year of Service.....	100
a.	Incorrect Determination of Duration of Probation	102
b.	Effective Time and Date of Inexplicit Termination Notice	106
c.	Significance of SF-50; Unclear Appointment Date	106
d.	WAE Appointment	107
e.	Military Service.....	107
3.	Tacking of Prior Service: Competitive Service Probation.....	109
a.	Same Agency	115
b.	Same Line of Work.....	115
4.	Agreement to Serve Probationary Period; Waiver of Preexisting Appeal Right	118
5.	Imposition of Probation Following Break in Service	121
6.	Representation by Agency That Probation Is Not Required; Equitable Estoppel	121
a.	Lack of Notice of Probationary Period	122
b.	Creation of Probationary Period Not Required by Statute or Regulation	122
F.	APPEAL RIGHTS OF PROBATIONER.....	124
1.	Appeal of Probationary Termination.....	125
a.	Actions Other Than Termination.....	126
2.	Classification of Probationers and Their Appeals	127
a.	Competitive Service Term Appointee; Trial Period.....	127
b.	Probationary Supervisor	128
3.	Jurisdictional Issue; Right to Hearing.....	132
a.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract; Agency Regulation	134
b.	Other Contract.....	134
c.	Harmful Error Analysis; <i>Stephen</i>	134
d.	Relation to Suitability Determination	136
4.	Preappointment Conditions	140
a.	Harmful Error Analysis: Lack of Proper Advance Notice, Other Procedural Error	140
b.	Entitlement to Hearing.....	145
c.	Measure of Substantive Review	146
5.	Postappointment Reasons.....	146
a.	Pre- and Postappointment Distinctions.....	146
6.	Defective or Untimely Termination Notice	152
a.	Termination by Unauthorized Official.....	153

7.	Discrimination and Partisan Politics	154
a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations	155
b.	Partisan Political Reason	156
c.	Marital Status	158
d.	Other Discrimination	165
8.	Constitutional Claim	165
9.	Involuntary Resignation.....	167
G.	LOSS OF APPEAL RIGHTS BY CHANGE IN POSITION.....	167
1.	Movement Between Positions in Same Agency; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation.....	167
a.	Movement to Position Through Settlement Agreement	175
2.	Movement From One Agency to Another; Transfer; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation	175
H.	TEMPORARY AND TERM APPOINTMENTS	178
1.	Competitive Service Temporary, Term Appointees	181
2.	Excepted Service Preference Eligible Temporary Appointees	187
3.	Excepted Service Nonpreference Eligible Temporary Appointees.....	187
4.	Particular Temporary or Irregular Schedule Appointments.....	187
a.	TAPER	187
b.	Seasonal; On-Call	188
c.	Intermittent	191
d.	Full-Time/Part-Time.....	193
e.	Postal Service Light Duty.....	193
f.	Indefinite Appointment	193
5.	Jurisdictional Effect of Lapse of Term or Temporary Appointment	193
6.	Appeal Right if Termination Occurs Before End of Expiration of Limited Appointment.....	195
I.	PARTICULAR APPOINTMENTS.....	196
1.	Nonappropriated Fund	196
2.	Veterans Readjustment Act.....	197
3.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	202
a.	Exceptions.....	204
4.	Senior Executive Service.....	206
5.	Administrative Law Judge.....	206
6.	Disabled Employee.....	206
7.	Employees in Confidential, Policy-Making, Policy-Determining Positions; Presidential Appointee.....	209
a.	White House, Executive Office of the President Employees	213
8.	Alien; Noncitizen	213
9.	Students.....	213
a.	Federal Career Intern Program	215
b.	Student Temporary Employment Program; Student Career Experience Program	221
10.	Judicial Branch	222
11.	Government Corporation.....	223
12.	Postal Service	224
a.	One Year of Qualifying Service; Current Continuous Service in Same or Similar Position	228
b.	Postal Supervisors, Managers	233
c.	Postal Personnel Officials, Confidential Employees	239
d.	Postal Service Employees Who Lack Preference Eligibility, Have No Negotiated Grievance Procedures, and Who Are Neither Managers Nor Personnelists	243
13.	Contractors.....	245
14.	Others.....	246
J.	AGENCIES WITH SPECIALIZED PERSONNEL SYSTEMS: MSPB JURISDICTIONAL EXCLUSIONS AND MODIFICATIONS	247
1.	Department of Homeland Security	247
a.	Human Resources Management System's Rise and Demise	247
b.	Transportation Security Agency: Screeners; Other Employees	247
(i)	Probationer	250
(ii)	Other TSA Employees.....	251
c.	RIF.....	255
2.	Federal Aviation Administration.....	255
a.	2012 Legislation Restoring Back Pay Authority as a Component of MSPB Jurisdiction	257
b.	2000 Legislation Restoring MSPB Jurisdiction; Back Pay Issues	258
c.	1996 Legislation Removing MSPB Jurisdiction.....	265
3.	Department of Defense National Security Personnel System	266
4.	District of Columbia	266

5.	Central Intelligence Agency; Defense Department Intelligence; Other Intelligence or Security Agencies.....	267
6.	Federal Bureau of Investigation	268
7.	Canal Zone.....	268
8.	National Archives	268
9.	National Guard Technicians.....	268
10.	Tennessee Valley Authority Employees.....	270
11.	Library of Congress; GAO; Congressional Employees.....	270
a.	Ramspeck Act	271
12.	Smithsonian Institution	271
13.	Bureau of Indian Affairs.....	271
14.	MSPB Employees	271
15.	Department of Veterans Affairs.....	271
a.	USERRA Coverage.....	277
b.	Actions Against Healthcare Professionals Not Involving Professional Conduct or Competence.....	277
(i)	Involuntary Retirement, Resignation.....	278
c.	Veterans Canteen Service.....	281
16.	Agriculture: Stabilization and Conservation Service; Cooperative Extension Services	283
17.	Department of Defense Education Activity.....	283
18.	Office of Independent Counsel.....	284
19.	Foreign Service.....	284
20.	World Bank	285
K.	NATURE OF PERSONNEL ACTION APPEALED.....	285
1.	Possible Adverse Action; Proposal	286
2.	Suspension	286
a.	Paper Suspension	286
b.	Consolidation of Short Suspensions.....	287
c.	Calculating Duration of Suspension	288
d.	Erroneous Imposition of Suspension Exceeding 14 Days	289
e.	Indefinite Suspension	290
3.	Position Change; Nonselection.....	290
a.	Rank Reduction	291
b.	Nonselection.....	291
c.	Loss of Promotion or Earnings Opportunities; Change in Work Schedule	293
d.	Disciplinary Reassignment; Unified Penalties	295
4.	Pay and Benefits; Classification; Debt; Leave	296
a.	Classification	297
b.	Pay System Conversion; Grade Reduction	299
c.	Correction of Pay, Grade	303
d.	Reduction in Pay; Locality Pay Issue; Failure to Obtain Pay Increase	309
e.	Misrepresentation Concerning Pay Rates	313
f.	Termination of Premium Pay; Bonus; LEAPA; Seniority, Overtime Adjustments.....	314
g.	Retirement Credit, Contributions, and Incentives; Individual Retirement Record.....	319
h.	Debt Collection, Recoupment: Agency, OPM Involvement	321
i.	Leave Dispute; Administrative Leave; Notice, Investigation Leave	324
j.	Pay and Compensation Claims: Role of OPM	328
5.	Severance Pay.....	328
6.	Promotion Claim	328
a.	Termination of Temporary Promotion	329
b.	Lower Graded Position Through Return Right—Overseas Employee	330
7.	Back Pay Dispute	331
a.	Retirement Payment	331
8.	Resignation.....	331
a.	Abandonment of Position.....	331
9.	Mandatory Retirement	333
10.	OWCP Benefits	333
11.	Insurance Programs.....	335
12.	Requests for Reinstatement: Non-Military Personnel.....	341
a.	Failure to Rehire	341
b.	Reinstatement Rights—Occupational Illness or Injury; Others.....	341
13.	Performance Standard; Rating; PIP.....	342
14.	Prohibited Personnel Practices; Allegations of Discrimination	342

15. Merit System Principles Violations	345
16. Constitutional Violation	346
17. Miscellaneous Issues	350
L. EFFECT OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING CONTRACT GRIEVANCE OR RELATED PROCEDURES; 5 USC 7121	351
1. Postal Service Employees	354
a. Effect of EEO Allegation or EEO Complaint	356
2. Administrative Grievance System	356
3. Statutory Grievance System; Foreign Service Grievance Board	356
4. Employee Choice: Adverse Action; Performance Case	357
5. Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity	357
a. Appeal Right With EEO Allegation	358
b. USERRA Claim	361
c. RIF	365
d. Acceptable Level of Competence Determination; Within-Grade Increase	367
6. Problems Arising From Choice of Collective Bargaining Contract Procedure	367
a. Incorrect or Inadequate Advice From Agency	367
b. Dispute Over Bargaining Unit Status or Arbitrability; Ineffective Elections; Cross-Filing; Withdrawal of Grievance	368
c. Defunct Union	371
d. Union Action on Behalf of Employee	373
e. What Constitutes Filing of Grievance	375
f. Premature Elections	376
g. Belated Grievance	377
h. Failure to Obtain Arbitration Hearing	377
7. Indefinite Suspension	380
8. Appeal Right With Arbitration Award; Employees of Agencies Other Than Postal Service	381
9. Unfair Labor Practice Charge	382
M. GRADE AND PAY RETENTION	383
1. <i>Atwell</i>	386
a. Restoration Action	388
2. Absence of Retention; Benefits Declined	388
3. Appeal of RIF; Classification	389
4. Termination of Pay Retention	390
V. APPEAL RIGHTS BASED ON MILITARY SERVICE AND VETERANS PREFERENCE	391
A. REGULATIONS GOVERNING USERRA, VEOA CLAIMS	396
B. JUDGE'S RESPONSIBILITY	398
C. HEARING ENTITLEMENT; BOARD DISPOSITION	399
D. EXCLUSIVITY OF VEOA OR USERRA APPEAL; JOINDER OF CLAIMS	402
E. UNIFORMED SERVICE EMPLOYMENT AND REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT	403
1. USERRA Statutory Structure	408
a. Related EEO Violation; Prohibited Personnel Practice Allegation	413
b. Affirmative Defense	415
2. Time for USERRA Appeal	416
a. Laches	418
b. Waiver of Right to Appeal	418
3. Permissive Exhaustion of Labor Department Remedy	420
4. Liberal Pleading Standard	423
a. Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegations	428
b. Summary Disposition of Claim	429
5. Burden of Proof	429
a. Analysis of Alleged Discrimination or Reprisal Based on Military Service	433
b. Reprisal Against the Exercise of USERRA Rights	438
c. Circumstantial Evidence; Statistics	439
d. Discrimination Motivated by Lower-Level Supervisor; Cat's Paw	442
e. Disability Incurred While in Military Service	444
f. Disparate Impact Theory Inapplicable	445
6. Recovery Period	447
a. Nonretroactive Substantive Application	449
b. Vietnam Era Veterans' Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974	452
7. Covered Personnel; Agencies	453
a. Contractor Employee	458

b.	Relatives of Service Members	460
8.	Military Restoration Rights	460
a.	National Guard Return Rights; 38 USC 2024(d)	464
b.	Length of Service Before Loss of Restoration Right	468
c.	Conditions of Discharge From Military Service	469
d.	Effect of Release From Service for Disability	469
e.	Delay in Requesting Restoration Following Military Service	473
f.	Elimination of Position Through RIF	473
9.	Other Personnel Action, Benefits	475
a.	Dismissal From Employment; Demotion; Abandonment of Civilian Career	475
b.	Constructive Adverse Action	481
c.	Suspension	482
d.	Failure to Appoint	482
e.	Failure to Consider Employee for Vacant Positions; Nonpromotion; Manipulation or Abolition of Positions	487
f.	Denial of Priority Consideration	491
g.	Performance Appraisal	491
h.	Noncompetitive Promotion; Bid Assignment; Escalator Principle; Interim Promotion	492
i.	Reassignment	499
j.	Retirement Benefits	499
k.	Education Benefits	500
l.	Military Leave; <i>Butterbaugh</i>	501
m.	Charge to Leave	509
n.	Harassment; Hostile Working Environment	509
o.	Change in Employment Status; Reemployment; Benefits Following Restoration to Duty	513
p.	Ready Reserve Status	521
F.	VETERANS EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES ACT	521
1.	Statutory Structure	524
a.	Definition of Agency	525
b.	Burden of Proof	527
c.	Related EEO Violation, Prohibited Personnel Practice, Other Challenges	528
2.	Covered Personnel	529
a.	Training Status	531
b.	Disabled Veteran	533
3.	Student, Intern Recruitment Programs	533
a.	Federal Career Intern Program	533
b.	Outstanding Scholar Program	541
c.	Pathways, Recent Graduates Program	548
4.	Particular Agencies; Positions	553
a.	Postal Service	553
b.	Foreign Service	555
c.	Nonappropriated Fund	557
d.	Public Health Service	558
e.	Statutory Exclusions	558
f.	VA Medical Professionals	558
g.	FAA, TSA Employees	559
h.	National Guard Technicians	561
i.	Title 10 Intelligence Position	561
5.	Time for VEOA Appeal	562
6.	Mandatory Exhaustion of DOL Remedy; Time for Complaint	563
a.	Specificity Required for DOL Complaint	567
b.	Equitable Tolling of DOL Time Limit; Waiver of Administrative Exhaustion Requirement	568
c.	Effect of Settlement Reached by DOL	579
d.	Termination of Proceedings to Pursue Case in Court	579
7.	Liberal Pleading Standard	579
8.	Basis for Veterans Preference	582
a.	Excepted Service Position; "Positive Factor"; Attorneys	583
9.	Application of Veterans Preference to Appointment Process	598
a.	Necessity for Application	599
b.	Appointment Through Reinstatement	600
c.	Impact of Collective Bargaining Contract	600
d.	Background Investigation	602

e.	Failure to Provide Proper Veterans Preference.....	602
f.	Use of Improper Appointment Authority.....	604
g.	Manipulation of Appointments; Cancellation of Vacancy.....	605
h.	Geographic Extent of Competition.....	614
i.	Category Rating System.....	614
j.	Rule of Three.....	617
10.	Qualifications for Position; Exclusion From Consideration; Consideration of Experience.....	618
a.	Education.....	629
b.	Time-In-Grade.....	630
c.	Medical Fitness.....	631
d.	Age Limit on Appointment.....	632
e.	Consideration for Position but Nonselection; Limitation on Consideration Imposed by the Applicant.....	637
f.	Improper Assessment of Qualifications.....	639
11.	Appointment and Promotion Processes Challenges.....	641
a.	Competitive Appointment Procedures; Exceptions to Competitive Requirements.....	641
b.	Merit Promotion With Internal Candidates Only; Reassignment; Reinstatement.....	646
c.	Merit Promotion, Open to External Candidates; Canceled Announcement; "Right to Compete" Claim.....	648
d.	Position Announced Under Both Open Competition and Merit Promotion Procedures.....	657
e.	Veterans Readjustment Authority Appointment.....	662
12.	Remedial Structure; Reconstruction of Selection Process; Removal of Selectee.....	663
a.	Passover.....	676
b.	Mootness; Review of Agency-Initiated Reconstruction Effort.....	681
13.	Damages, Performance Award.....	682
14.	Disciplinary Case.....	687
15.	Reassignment; Transfer.....	687
16.	Retirement Benefit.....	688
17.	Other Benefits.....	688
VI.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATION.....	688
A.	APPELLATE PROCEDURES.....	694
B.	APPLICATION TO COMPETITIVE SERVICE APPOINTEES.....	695
1.	Employees Serving in Probationary or Trial Periods.....	695
C.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS BY AGENCIES OPERATING UNDER AUTHORITY DELEGATED BY OPM.....	695
1.	Evidence of Material, Intentional False Statement, or Deception or Fraud.....	698
2.	Constructive Suitability Determination.....	700
3.	Nonselection for Position; Constructive Suitability Determination Under Delegated Authority.....	701
a.	Decisions Under OPM Regulations Predating 2008.....	707
4.	Impact of 2008 OPM Suitability Regulations.....	714
D.	ADJUDICATION STANDARDS.....	715
1.	Mitigation; EEO Defenses.....	718
2.	Disparate Treatment.....	718
3.	Rehabilitation.....	718
E.	EVIDENCE.....	719
1.	Collateral Estoppel; <i>Res Judicata</i>	720
F.	BASES FOR SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS.....	721
1.	Falsification of Employment Document.....	721
2.	Drug Involvement.....	722
3.	Post-Appointment Conduct.....	723
4.	Criminal or Dishonest Conduct.....	726
5.	Other Problems.....	727
G.	REMEDIES.....	727
1.	Mootness.....	729
H.	RELATION OF SUITABILITY AND PASSOVER DETERMINATIONS.....	729
I.	RELATION OF OPM-DIRECTED SUITABILITY REMOVAL AND ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL RIGHTS, MITIGATION ANALYSIS; <i>AGUZIE</i>	731
VII.	OPM REGULATION REVIEW; CHALLENGES TO AGENCY IMPLEMENTATION OF OPM REGULATIONS; CHALLENGES TO OPM EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES.....	741
A.	REGULATION AND REGULATION IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW PROCEDURES.....	741
1.	General Criteria for Regulation Review and Regulation Implementation Review.....	741
a.	Distinction Between Regulation Review, Implementation Review.....	745
2.	Pleading Requirements; Scope of Review.....	746
a.	Discretionary Review; Likelihood of Success.....	747

b.	Likelihood of Harm	747
c.	Likelihood Issues Will Be Addressed in a Different MSPB Appeal or a Different Forum.....	748
d.	Standing; “Interested Person”	749
e.	Covered Personnel Action.....	750
3.	Examples of Regulation Review	750
a.	Administrative Law Judge Examination Authority	750
b.	SES Reassignment, Work Schedule	750
c.	Administration of Leave	752
d.	OPM Qualification Standards.....	752
e.	Scope of Administrative Grievance Procedure	753
f.	Other Issues	753
4.	Examples of Regulation Implementation Review.....	755
a.	SES Performance Appraisal Dispute	756
B.	EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE CHALLENGES	757
1.	Time and Place for Filing Appeal.....	763
2.	Agency Misapplication of Valid OPM Requirement; Agency Employment Practices; Nonselections	763
3.	Standing to Raise Challenge	768
4.	General Characteristics of Tests Rather Than Individual Examination Results.....	769
5.	Failure to Hire.....	770
6.	Scope of Competition.....	771
7.	Position Qualification Standard; Educational Requirement	772
8.	Medical and Physical Qualification Requirements.....	777
9.	OPM Involvement in Agency Selection	779
10.	Selection and Examination Practices for Administrative Law Judges.....	781
a.	Rule of Three.....	787
11.	Passover Determination	789
12.	Time-In-Grade Restriction.....	791
13.	Eligibility Rating and Suitability Determination	792
14.	Failure to Promote	793
15.	Remedy	793
VIII.	CHALLENGES TO ADVERSE PERSONNEL RECORDS NOTATIONS.....	793

CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY 795

I.	INITIATING AN APPEAL.....	795
A.	RULES AND PRACTICES OF GENERAL APPLICATION GOVERNING APPEALS	795
1.	Dates of Filing	795
2.	Service of Pleadings	795
3.	Filing Regulation; Electronic Filing; Technical Difficulties.....	796
4.	MSPB Processing of Appeal	801
B.	TIME FOR FILING APPEAL	802
1.	Treatment of Timeliness Issues	803
2.	Jurisdiction or Timeliness as Alternate Bases for Dismissal of Appeal	804
3.	Time to Appeal; Regulatory Provisions; Computation of Time.....	806
a.	Allegations of Discrimination—Mixed Case.....	807
b.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure	807
c.	Computation of Time	808
d.	Technical Constructions.....	808
e.	Request for Extension of Time to Appeal	809
4.	Suspension Appeal.....	809
a.	Indefinite Suspension; Enforced Leave.....	810
5.	Individual Right of Action Appeal.....	813
6.	USERRA Appeal.....	814
7.	Negative OPM Reconsideration Decision Appeal	814
a.	Failure to Seek Timely Reconsideration; Requests to Extend Time to Request Reconsideration	817
b.	Belated Receipt of Reconsideration Request	823
c.	Relation Between Scope of Reconsideration Request and Appeal.....	823
d.	Failure of OPM to Act on Reconsideration Request; Failure of OPM to Advise of Reconsideration Right	823
e.	Overpayment Determinations	828
8.	Law Enforcement Officer Retirement Credit Appeal.....	829
C.	METHOD AND PLACE OF FILING	831
1.	Method of Filing	831

a.	Mail	831
b.	Significance of Postmark: Presumptive Filing Date.....	831
c.	Significance of Actual Mailing Date; Mailstream Rule: Actual Filing Date	832
d.	Commercial Delivery	832
e.	Facsimile	832
f.	Personal Delivery	833
g.	Electronic Filing.....	833
2.	Irregular and Misdirected Filings.....	833
a.	Appeal To or From Congressional Office.....	834
b.	Misfiled Mixed Case Appeal	834
c.	Non-Mixed Appeal Filed With Employing Agency	836
d.	Appeal Misdirected Within MSPB, to OPM, or to OSC	837
e.	Incomplete Appeal	838
D.	PREMATURE APPEALS	838
1.	Abeyance Arrangement.....	838
2.	Premature Appeal That Ripens Into Appealable Action During Regional Adjudication or During PFR	839
3.	Retirement Appeal.....	841
4.	Mixed and Whistleblowing Cases; Actions Initiated in Court	843
E.	TIMELINESS OF APPEALS	843
1.	Judge’s Responsibility to Provide Notice Concerning a Timeliness Issue	844
a.	Mental or Physical Illness; <i>Lacy</i> Notice	847
b.	Duty of Appellant to Produce Evidence Concerning Timeliness	848
c.	Duty of Agency and Judge to Produce and Develop Evidence Concerning Timeliness	849
2.	Waiver; <i>Alonzo</i>	852
a.	Prejudice to Respondent; <i>Laches</i>	853
b.	Current Law on Waiver; Multifactor Analysis.....	853
c.	Historical Position on Waiver.....	859
d.	Retirement Appeals	860
3.	Application for Waiver	861
a.	Hearing Entitlement on a Timeliness Issue	862
b.	Due Diligence	865
4.	Collective Bargaining Contract Stay Provision; Postal Service Employee; Agency-Initiated Stay.....	865
F.	JUSTIFICATION FOR LATE FILING	867
1.	Sickness or Hospitalization.....	867
a.	Supporting Evidence.....	868
b.	Mental Impairment.....	869
c.	Effect of Continuing Mental Disorder on Filing Deadline.....	871
2.	Substitute Employment, Travel, or Other Activities.....	873
3.	Military Service.....	873
4.	Incarceration; Criminal Proceeding	875
5.	Need to Obtain Documentation.....	876
6.	Need to Obtain Counsel	877
7.	Unfamiliarity With MSPB Procedures and Law; Ambiguous Agency Communications	877
a.	Language Difficulties	878
b.	Miscalculation of Time for Appeal.....	879
8.	Obligation to Provide Notice of Appeal Rights	879
a.	Failure to Provide Notice.....	880
b.	Belated Receipt of Adverse Action Decision.....	885
c.	Constructive Receipt of Decision Notice.....	887
d.	Proof Concerning Delivery of Notice of Appeal Right	888
e.	Notice of Appeal Right to Appellant’s Representative.....	889
f.	Appellant’s Responsibility When Decision Notice or Information About Appeal Rights Is Not Received	889
g.	Constructive Adverse Action; Notice if Agency Learns of Employee’s Protest.....	890
h.	Constructive Adverse Action Without Notice of Employee’s Protest to Agency	893
(i)	<i>Jones, Krizman</i> and Beyond.....	900
i.	Agency on Notice but Fails to Provide Appeal Rights; Secondary Information Concerning Appeal Rights	904
j.	Adverse Action or Performance-Based Appeal Arising From Last Chance or Other Settlement Agreement	905
k.	Lack of Notice Concerning Restoration and Reemployment Appeal Rights	907
l.	Enforced Leave	910
m.	Prior or Subsequent Notice of Filing Deadline	911
n.	Agency Misrepresentation.....	912

o.	Threats by Agency Personnel.....	914
p.	Mixed Case Notice Problems.....	914
q.	Problem With or Delayed Receipt of Domestic, Certified, or International Mail, or Commercial Delivery; Address Change.....	915
9.	Appeal Lost in the Mail.....	922
10.	Facsimile Problems.....	924
11.	Electronic Filing Problem.....	924
12.	Problem Caused by Adjudicators; Misdirected Appeal.....	924
a.	MSPB.....	924
b.	EEOC.....	925
c.	OPM.....	925
13.	Uncertainty as to Outcome of a Related Case; Pending Settlement Negotiations or Investigation; Case Taken to Court.....	926
a.	Grievances.....	927
14.	Inadequate Representation.....	927
a.	Delay Not Excused.....	928
b.	Delay Excused; Counsel's Delay Balanced Against Appellant's Best Efforts; Retirement Cases.....	929
c.	Delay Excused; Obstruction or Misrepresentation by Counsel.....	931
d.	Delay Excused; Inconsequential Delay by Representative.....	936
15.	Other Problems.....	936
G.	TIME FOR RAISING NEW APPELLATE ISSUES AND CLAIMS.....	937
1.	Issues and Defenses.....	937
a.	Liberal Construction of Pleadings; Issues Raised at Hearing.....	937
b.	EEO Affirmative Defenses.....	937
2.	Additional Appealable Action.....	938
H.	MOOT, WITHDRAWN, AND WAIVED APPEALS.....	938
1.	Mootness of Appeal.....	938
a.	Cancellation of Action Appealed.....	939
b.	Restoration of <i>Status Quo Ante</i>	941
c.	Initiation of New Action Based on Events Leading to Canceled Action.....	948
d.	Procedure Followed if Action Not Completely Rescinded.....	948
e.	Procedure Following Remand to Judge.....	950
f.	Settlement Independent of MSPB Appeal.....	950
g.	Complete Relief Through Other Means; Stay of Pending Litigation.....	960
h.	Collateral Issues Following Rescission of Action; Claims for Attorney Fees or General Damages; Interest.....	960
i.	EEO Allegation; Claim for Compensatory Damages.....	961
j.	Whistleblower Protection Act: Claims for Damages, Other Relief.....	964
k.	Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act.....	969
l.	Resignation or Retirement Before Termination.....	971
m.	Criminal Conviction.....	971
n.	Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	971
o.	OPM Rescinds Reconsideration or Final Decision; Overpayment Recovery; Withdrawal of or Additional Retirement Application.....	972
p.	Administrative Law Judge Complaint.....	978
q.	Other Problems.....	978
2.	Effect of Retirement on Appealable Action.....	979
a.	Effect of Cleansing Personnel File When Removal Is Accompanied by Retirement; Effect of Claim for Damages... 986	986
b.	Reduction in Force Appeal.....	990
c.	Prior Law; Disability Retirement.....	991
3.	Withdrawal of Appeal.....	992
a.	Withdrawal to Pursue EEO Complaint; Withdrawal of EEO Claim.....	995
b.	Withdrawal to Pursue a Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure.....	997
c.	Confusion Between Necessity for Withdrawal of Appeal, Continuance, and Withdrawal of Appeal Without Prejudice to Refile.....	997
d.	Unauthorized Act of Representative.....	998
e.	Duress; Misrepresentation; Incompetence.....	1002
f.	Mistake.....	1004
g.	Misleading or Incomplete Information From Judge.....	1005
h.	Attempts to Refile, Reinstate, or Reopen Withdrawn Appeals.....	1007
4.	Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile ("DWOP").....	1011
a.	Reasons for DWOP.....	1016

b.	Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1016
c.	Procedures for Obtaining Dismissal; Refiling	1018
d.	Refiling Date.....	1018
e.	Effect of PFR	1021
f.	Agency-Initiated Request; Prior Practice.....	1022
g.	Dismissal Initiated by Judge or MSPB.....	1022
5.	Delay in Refiling After DWOP.....	1023
a.	Retirement Appeals.....	1028
b.	Imperfect Attempt to Refile; Confusion Caused by Judge.....	1028
c.	Late Refiling; Independent Right of Appeal	1029
6.	Waiver of Appeal Through Last Chance or Other Preappeal Agreement.....	1029
a.	Jurisdictional Analysis.....	1032
b.	Public Policy; Appeal Preclusion; Consideration; Conflict With Regulation	1040
c.	Ambiguous Term; Failure to Waive Future Appeal Right.....	1042
d.	Due Process Considerations; Notice.....	1046
e.	Last Chance Agreement Superseded by Independent Adverse Action.....	1048
f.	Lack of Authority of Representative to Enter Agreement.....	1049
g.	Agreement to Accept Demotion, Suspension	1049
h.	Bad Faith, Coercion, Lack of Mental Capacity.....	1050
i.	Illegal or Punitive Term	1056
j.	Jurisdictional Prerequisite: LCA Compliance or Breach	1056
k.	Burden of Proof.....	1058
l.	Hearing Entitlement.....	1060
m.	Condition Unrelated to Underlying Action; Ambiguous Condition; Condition Described in Notice of LCA Violation	1063
n.	Discrimination, Reprisal	1069
o.	Claim Collateral to Breach of Agreement.....	1070
p.	Duration of Agreement	1070
7.	Personnel Action Resulting From Settlement Not Constituting Last Chance Agreement	1071
8.	Settlement Reached During Board Appeal	1072
II.	FORMAT AND PRELIMINARY PROCESSING OF APPEAL.....	1073
A.	ESSENTIAL INFORMATION.....	1073
B.	FORMAT.....	1074
1.	Interpretation of Appeal.....	1074
2.	Signature	1076
3.	Appeal Filed Through Representative	1076
4.	“John Doe” Appeal: Protecting Appellant’s Privacy.....	1076
5.	Agency-Initiated Retirement Appeal	1079
6.	Class Action, Consolidated Appeals, and Joinder; Bifurcated Appeals.....	1079
a.	Consolidation	1080
b.	Joinder; Compulsory Joinder	1082
c.	Class Action	1084
d.	Bifurcated Appeals.....	1085
7.	Substitution; Survival of Claim	1086
a.	IRA Case.....	1087
C.	INTERVENTION.....	1088
1.	Intervention of Right: OPM, OSC	1088
a.	OPM	1089
b.	OSC	1090
2.	Permissive Intervention	1090
3.	Rights of Intervenor.....	1093
4.	<i>Amicus Curiae</i>	1093
D.	STEPS TAKEN AFTER APPEAL IS FILED	1093
1.	Acknowledgment of Appeal.....	1095
a.	Philippines Retirement Appeal	1096
2.	Amendment of Appeal.....	1096
3.	Service of Pleadings	1097
4.	Deficient Appeal.....	1097
5.	Affirmative Defense Order; Requirement of Specific Allegations.....	1098
E.	AGENCY RESPONSE TO APPEAL.....	1100
1.	Narrative Response to Appeal	1101

2.	Motion to Dismiss Appeal.....	1101
3.	Delay in Appeal Response.....	1101
4.	Designation of Agency Representative.....	1102
F.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	1102
1.	Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegation	1105
2.	Judge Must Ensure Jurisdictional Issues Are Identified; <i>Burgess</i> Notice	1107
3.	Agency Representative’s Responsibilities	1110
4.	Hearing on Jurisdictional Issue	1111
G.	REPRESENTATIVES.....	1112
1.	Right to Representation.....	1112
a.	Inadequate Representation	1114
b.	Service on Representative.....	1115
2.	Disqualification of Representative; State Disciplinary Rules	1115
a.	Conflicts	1116
b.	Representative as Witness.....	1119
c.	Disciplinary Rules, Proceedings.....	1120
H.	<i>PRO SE</i> AND INADEQUATELY REPRESENTED PARTIES	1120
1.	<i>Pro Se</i> Appellant	1120
2.	Assistance to Mentally Incompetent Appellant; <i>French</i> Procedure	1121
I.	<i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS	1125
1.	What They Are	1126
2.	How <i>Ex Parte</i> Communications Are Treated	1128
III.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS	1129
A.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL PROCEDURE.....	1129
1.	Regulation.....	1129
2.	Application of Regulation	1131
a.	Rulings on Bias and Intervention.....	1133
b.	Direct Appeal to MSPB.....	1133
3.	Stay of Proceeding.....	1133
IV.	DISCOVERY	1134
A.	OVERVIEW	1135
1.	Regulatory Structure.....	1135
2.	Preliminary Steps.....	1138
a.	Initial Disclosures.....	1139
3.	Limitations	1140
a.	Jurisdictional or Timeliness Issue	1140
4.	Motion to Compel.....	1141
5.	Federal Rules	1143
a.	Federal Rules of General Application	1143
6.	Interrogatories.....	1145
7.	Deposition	1146
8.	Other Discovery Devices	1149
a.	Document Request	1149
b.	Request for Admission.....	1150
c.	Medical, Psychiatric Examinations	1150
d.	Motion for More Definite Statement of Appeal	1152
9.	Discovery From Nonparties	1152
B.	STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS	1153
1.	Burden	1153
a.	Effect of EEO, Reprisal Allegations.....	1154
b.	Discovery During Pendency of Criminal Proceedings	1154
2.	Privileged Information	1155
a.	<i>In Camera</i> Inspection	1155
b.	Law Enforcement Privilege	1156
c.	OSC File; Executive and Investigative Privileges	1157
d.	OPM Suitability File.....	1158
e.	Agency Investigative File	1158
f.	Attorney-Client Privilege	1159
g.	Attorney Work Product Privilege	1164
h.	Agency Deliberative Process Privilege.....	1167
i.	Statutory Confidentiality Limitations.....	1168

3. Privacy Act	1169
4. Failure to Use Discovery.....	1171
5. Informal Discovery; Control by Agencies of Employees' Time	1172
6. Protective Order	1173
C. ENTRY OF DISCOVERY MATERIAL INTO RECORD	1174
D. SUBPOENAS	1175
1. When a Subpoena Is Used	1175
2. Obtaining, Serving Subpoena	1175
a. Witnesses Outside the United States	1177
3. Challenge; Enforcement	1177
4. Witness Fees; Travel Allowances	1178
E. REVIEW OF DISCOVERY RULINGS	1179
1. Rulings on Disputes.....	1179
a. Synopsis of Testimony	1179
b. Relevance, Overbroad Request	1179
c. Mitigation; Disparate Treatment	1180
d. Deposition of Agency Head.....	1181
e. Electronic Records.....	1181
f. Inspection Rather Than Production of Documents.....	1182
g. OSC Case.....	1183
2. Effect of Denial of Discovery	1183
a. Preservation of Issue	1185
V. SANCTIONS	1186
A. FAILURE TO RESPOND TO APPEAL	1188
1. Default Judgment.....	1189
B. FAILURE TO PROSECUTE APPEAL	1189
1. Dismissal Warranted	1190
a. Failure to Provide Basis for Appeal	1192
b. Failure to Designate Representative.....	1192
c. Failure to Comply With Judge's Order.....	1192
2. Dismissal Unwarranted	1194
a. Failure to Attend Hearing	1195
b. Inadvertent or Isolated Failure to Obey Judge's Orders	1195
c. Late Appeal.....	1198
C. FAILURE TO COOPERATE IN DISCOVERY	1198
1. Sanction Against Agency	1199
a. Material in Control of Third Party.....	1201
2. Sanction Against Appellant.....	1202
D. FAILURE TO FOLLOW PREHEARING OR HEARING PROCEDURES	1204
1. Sanction Against Appellant; Prejudice to Agency.....	1204
2. Sanction Against Agency	1206

CHAPTER 3: HEARING..... 1209

I. HEARING.....	1209
A. RIGHT TO HEARING	1209
1. <i>De Novo</i> Hearing.....	1210
a. Role of Intervenor	1210
2. Jurisdictional Hearing; Documentary Evidence.....	1210
a. Timeliness Issue	1214
b. No Material Disputed Facts	1214
3. Counsel	1216
4. Control by Judge	1216
5. Official Time; Resources Available to Appellant	1219
B. WAIVER OF HEARING	1219
1. Inability to Travel to Hearing Site	1222
2. Failure to Request Hearing	1223
a. Remands; New Law.....	1224
3. Untimely Hearing Request.....	1224
a. Effect of Amendment of Appeal	1225
4. Withdrawal of Hearing Request.....	1225
a. Failure to Receive Hearing Notice.....	1226

b.	Postponement Denied	1227
c.	Events Beyond Appellant’s Control.....	1228
5.	Strategic Considerations—Intentional Waiver	1228
6.	Adjudication After Waiver, Failure to Attend Hearing.....	1228
7.	Adjudication Without Hearing; Responses to Evidentiary Submissions	1229
C.	POSTPONEMENT OF HEARING	1233
1.	Timing of Hearing	1233
2.	Policy on Continuances	1234
a.	Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile	1235
b.	Case Suspension	1235
3.	Continuance Procedure	1235
a.	Request; Form of Sworn Statement	1236
b.	Failure to Make Request.....	1237
c.	Status of Pending Motion.....	1237
d.	Proceeding After Denial of Motion	1237
4.	Good Cause Requirement.....	1237
a.	Need to Prepare	1237
b.	Awaiting Outcome of Another Case.....	1238
c.	Unavailability of Representative; New Representative	1238
(i)	Case Proceeds to Hearing	1241
d.	Medical Condition of Appellant.....	1241
e.	Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1242
f.	Incarceration	1244
g.	Military Service	1246
h.	Missing or Unavailable Witness	1246
i.	Change in Hearing Location.....	1246
5.	Continuance Denial—Review Standard	1246
D.	VENUE OF HEARING.....	1247
1.	Change of Venue	1248
a.	Cost to Appellant	1249
2.	Requesting a Change of Venue.....	1249
3.	Venue Determination Review Standard	1250
E.	HEARING FUNDAMENTALS	1250
1.	Change, Resignation, or Death of Judge	1250
2.	Interaction With Judge.....	1250
3.	Prehearing Submission	1251
4.	Prehearing Conference	1252
a.	Stipulations.....	1255
b.	Waiver or Withdrawal of Affirmative Defense	1255
c.	Dismissal of Charge	1255
5.	Memorandum or Order Summarizing Conference.....	1255
a.	Preservation of Objection; Incomplete Summary.....	1256
b.	Treatment of EEO and Other Affirmative Defenses; Summary Judgment.....	1259
F.	CONDUCT OF HEARING; RESPONSIBILITIES OF JUDGE	1260
1.	Hearing Error: Measure of Damage	1261
a.	Timing of Submission of Pleadings	1262
b.	Timing of Initial Decision	1262
2.	Control and Exclusion of Representative or Participant.....	1262
3.	Maintaining Order.....	1264
a.	Exclusion From Hearing Room of an Individual Whose Presence May Intimidate a Witness	1264
b.	Security Arrangement	1265
4.	Witness Control; Sequestration.....	1265
5.	Conduct of Questioning	1268
a.	Multiple Representatives.....	1268
6.	Permitting Record Development	1268
a.	Videoconference, Telephone Hearing.....	1269
b.	Bifurcated Hearing	1273
c.	Hearing Subpoena.....	1275
7.	Ensuring Record Development; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; EEO File	1275
a.	Annuity Appeal	1278
b.	Duty of Judge to Inform an Appellant of Governing Law; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; Liberal Construction of Pleadings....	1279

c.	Raising Issue <i>Sua Sponte</i>	1281
d.	Preserving Review Right Through Objection	1282
8.	Media Coverage.....	1282
9.	Public Hearing; Closing the Hearing	1284
10.	Timing of Hearing	1284
11.	Hearing Accommodation for Disabled Appellant; Interpreter	1284
12.	Allocation of Burden of Proof	1286
13.	Opening Statement.....	1286
14.	Closing Argument, Brief.....	1286
G.	PREVENTION OF INTERFERENCE WITH MSPB PROCEEDINGS	1287
1.	Protective Order.....	1287
2.	Protective Order for Appellant	1288
3.	Interference With Witness, Representative, Appellant	1289
a.	Agency Restriction on Appearance of Employee as Witness	1293
H.	POSTHEARING ACTIVITIES	1294
1.	Closing Record	1294
a.	Ensuring Notice of Record Closing	1295
b.	Clarifying Scope of Record; Off-The-Record Discussions	1296
c.	Timing of Evidentiary Submissions, Responses.....	1296
d.	Effect of Closing Record	1298
2.	Regional Authority After Initial Decision	1298
a.	Judge’s Request to Reopen Record to Correct Error	1298
II.	MOTION PRACTICE	1298
A.	USE OF MOTIONS.....	1299
1.	Dispositive Motion	1301
a.	Motion to Dismiss Filed Before Hearing.....	1301
b.	Motion to Dismiss Filed During Hearing.....	1302
c.	Summary Judgment.....	1303
B.	FORM AND TIMING OF MOTIONS.....	1307
III.	WITNESSES	1308
A.	WITNESS REQUEST	1308
1.	Obligation to Permit Relevant Testimony	1309
a.	Competence to Testify	1309
b.	Appellant	1309
c.	Decisionmaker.....	1309
d.	Agency Head	1310
2.	Obligation to Request Witness	1310
a.	Witness List	1311
b.	Rebuttal Witness.....	1312
3.	Repetitious Testimony	1313
4.	Offer of Proof	1313
5.	Compelling Witness Attendance	1313
a.	Appellant.....	1314
b.	Others; Former Employee; Subpoena.....	1314
6.	Duty Status of Federal Employee Witness; Pay, Travel, Per Diem	1314
a.	Official Time	1315
7.	Protecting Record; Missing Witness	1316
a.	Preservation of Objection.....	1316
8.	Judge May Call Witness.....	1317
9.	Obtaining Testimony by Alternate Means.....	1317
10.	Right of Witness to Representation	1317
a.	Self-Incrimination	1317
11.	Witness Denial—Review Standard	1317
B.	EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES	1319
1.	Control of Questioning	1320
a.	Questioning by Judge.....	1320
b.	Leading Questions	1321
c.	Production of Witness Statement, Document Relied on During Testimony	1322
d.	Taking Witness Out of Order	1322
IV.	DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGE	1323
A.	PRESUMPTION OF HONESTY AND IMPARTIALITY	1323

1. Competence of Judge	1325
B. TREATMENT OF BIAS ALLEGATIONS.....	1325
1. Procedure; Documenting Record.....	1327
2. Extrajudicial Source of Bias.....	1329
3. Treatment of Bias Allegation by Judge, Board.....	1330
4. Specific Bias Allegations	1330
a. Relationship With Party or Witness	1330
b. Relationship With Counsel	1330
c. Improper Communication	1331
d. Examination of Witness.....	1331
e. Remarks About Counsel, Party, Merits, Settlement; <i>Ex Parte</i> Communication.....	1332
f. Prior Ruling Against Party.....	1336
g. Erroneous Ruling	1336
h. Incorrect Factual Conclusion.....	1337
i. Hasty or Late Decision	1337
j. Change in Judge Without Finding of Bias	1337

CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE..... 1341

I. FUNDAMENTALS	1341
A. RELEVANCE, MATERIALITY, AND FAIRNESS	1341
1. Informal Adjudication	1341
2. Relevance and Materiality	1341
a. <i>De Novo</i> Review	1342
b. Conditional Admission of Evidence.....	1342
3. Record.....	1342
a. Offer of Proof.....	1342
4. Fairness in Development of Evidence.....	1342
a. Erroneous Exclusion of Evidence	1342
b. Erroneous Admission of Evidence.....	1343
c. Manipulation or Redaction of Evidence.....	1343
B. NATURE OF CHARGES	1344
1. Evidentiary Value of Charge	1344
a. Response to Charge	1345
C. HEARSAY	1346
1. <i>Borninkhof</i>	1347
2. Judicial Interpretations	1349
3. 5 USC 2302(b)(2): Investigative Statement	1350
II. EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE	1350
A. DOCUMENTS	1350
1. Response to Appeal	1351
2. Medical Report, Records.....	1351
3. Notes of Witness; Memorandum of Conversation	1352
4. Time and Attendance Record	1352
5. Business Record	1352
6. Regulation; Law	1353
7. Evidence From Other MSPB Hearing; Other Judicial Proceeding.....	1353
8. Procedure for Introducing Document; Demonstrative Evidence	1353
9. Authentication Requirement	1355
a. Handwriting	1355
b. Significance of Signature	1355
c. Copy; Photograph	1355
B. PHYSICAL EVIDENCE.....	1355
1. Custody and Control	1355
2. Use at Hearing	1356
C. ADMISSIONS	1356
1. Probative Value	1356
a. Repudiated or Recanted Admission	1357
2. Settlement Offer.....	1358
D. CIRCUMSTANTIAL AND SECONDARY EVIDENCE	1359
1. Common Possession/Multiple Causation.....	1361
2. Contemporaneous Statement.....	1361

3.	Flight or Evasion	1361
4.	Statistics.....	1362
E.	OPINION AND IMPEACHMENT EVIDENCE	1362
1.	Physical Condition	1362
2.	Character.....	1362
a.	Past Misconduct	1363
b.	Arrest, Conviction.....	1365
c.	Reputation	1365
d.	Habit	1365
3.	Hearing Deportment or Demeanor	1366
4.	Evidence in Disability Annuity Appeal; <i>Chavez</i> ; Post-Separation Evidence	1366
F.	RECURRENT EVIDENTIARY PROBLEMS.....	1372
1.	Polygraph.....	1373
2.	Unsworn Written Statements.....	1374
a.	No Hearing.....	1375
b.	Hearing Held	1375
c.	Sworn Written Statement; Form of Attestation	1376
d.	Deposition	1378
3.	Investigation Reports.....	1379
4.	Recordings.....	1381
a.	Video	1381
b.	Audio	1381
5.	Transcript of Prior Testimony	1381
6.	Expert Witness; Medical Evidence	1382
a.	Medical Expert Opinion	1384
b.	Other Experts.....	1386
7.	Statements of Representative, Party.....	1386
8.	Testimony of Child	1387
9.	Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract	1387
10.	Newspaper Article	1387
11.	Drug Test	1387
III.	SUBSTITUTES FOR DIRECT EVIDENCE	1392
A.	OFFICIAL NOTICE	1392
1.	Regulations.....	1392
a.	Federal Personnel Manual; Agency Handbook, Publication	1393
2.	Related Board Case Records.....	1393
B.	ADVERSE INFERENCES AND PRESUMPTIONS	1393
1.	Silence	1393
2.	Negative Inferences.....	1395
a.	Destruction or Loss of Evidence.....	1396
b.	Negative Evidence	1399
3.	Presumption.....	1399
a.	Delivery of Mail, Other Documents	1399
C.	STIPULATIONS	1403
1.	Issues of Fact and Law	1404
2.	Stipulations Directed by Judge	1405
D.	<i>RES JUDICATA</i> , COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL, AND LAW OF THE CASE—THE DOCTRINES.....	1405
1.	<i>Res Judicata</i>	1406
a.	Identity of Prior Cause of Action and Issues	1410
b.	Identity of Parties; Privity	1411
c.	Complete Relief Available	1412
d.	Jurisdictional Issue	1413
e.	Settlement	1415
f.	Withdrawal of Appeal	1416
g.	<i>Res Judicata</i> Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB; Waiver of Defense	1417
2.	Collateral Estoppel.....	1418
a.	Error in Law; Change in Law	1421
b.	Proof of a Prior Adjudication	1422
c.	Privity; Appellant as a Party to Prior Case	1422
d.	Privity of Agencies	1422
e.	Identity of Prior Issue	1423

f.	Jurisdictional, Timeliness Issues	1424
g.	Decision of Another Tribunal	1427
h.	Collateral Estoppel Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB	1428
3.	Judicial Estoppel	1429
4.	Law of the Case; Mandate Rule	1431
5.	<i>Stare Decisis</i>	1434
E.	RES JUDICATA AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL—THE DOCTRINES APPLIED	1435
1.	Criminal Conviction	1435
2.	Pleas to Criminal Charges.....	1438
a.	Guilty Plea	1438
b.	<i>Nolo Contendere</i> and <i>Alford</i> Pleas	1440
c.	Pretrial Diversion	1443
d.	Conviction, Misconduct Distinguished	1444
3.	Acquittal; Reversal of Criminal Conviction.....	1444
4.	Successive MSPB Cases	1444
a.	Dismissal for Adjudicatory Efficiency	1446
b.	WIGI/Removal	1446
c.	Successive RIFs	1446
d.	Whistleblowing Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaint or Appeal.....	1446
e.	USERRA Claims	1453
f.	Suitability Determination	1454
g.	Regulation Review	1454
h.	Prior Action Reversed for Lack of Due Process.....	1455
5.	Other Proceedings.....	1455
a.	Credentialing Committee	1455
b.	Union Trial Board	1456
c.	Labor Arbitration Awards	1456
d.	OPM Annuity Determination	1459
e.	Unemployment Compensation Award	1461
f.	OWCP Finding; Social Security Determination	1463
g.	EEOC Decision.....	1463
h.	Comptroller General or GAO Decision	1464
i.	Judicial Determination	1466
6.	Potential Exceptions to Application of Collateral Estoppel, <i>Res Judicata</i>	1467
a.	Pendency of an Appeal	1467
b.	Fairness of Adjudication; New Evidence	1467
c.	Fraud; Misrepresentation	1467
d.	Change in Law	1469
IV.	EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE	1469
A.	PROCEDURES	1469
1.	Objection, Motions to Strike or <i>in Limine</i>	1469
2.	Witness Exclusion	1470
a.	Proposing Official.....	1470
B.	CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY CHALLENGES	1471
1.	Search.....	1471
a.	Wiretap.....	1475
b.	Recording	1475
c.	Drug Testing	1476
2.	Interrogation.....	1480
a.	Misconduct of Investigator	1480
b.	Compelled Testimony; <i>Kalkines</i> Warning	1481
c.	Right to Silence, Counsel	1483
d.	Denial of Union Representation.....	1484
C.	OTHER BASES FOR EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE	1485
1.	Claims of Privilege.....	1485
a.	Alcoholism Treatment Records.....	1485
b.	Other Medical Records	1486
c.	Privacy; Attorney-Client Communication	1486
2.	Failure to Follow MSPB Procedure	1486
V.	HEARING RECORD	1486
A.	RIGHT TO AND NECESSITY FOR A RECORD OR TRANSCRIPT	1486

1. Current MSPB Practice.....	1487
2. Past Treatment of Transcript.....	1488
3. Past Internal MSPB Guidance on Transcript.....	1488
4. Federal Circuit Commentary on Transcript.....	1489
a. Arbitration Hearing	1489
5. Use of Recording	1489
B. PROBLEMS CONCERNING TRANSCRIPT AND RECORD.....	1490
1. Off-The-Record Discussion	1490
2. Hearing Recording Omission; Transcript Error.....	1491
3. Correction of Transcript	1492
4. Unofficial Transcript.....	1492

CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW..... 1493

I. INITIAL DECISION.....	1493
A. INITIAL DECISION FORMAT	1493
1. Minimum Requirements.....	1493
a. Bench Decision	1495
b. Notice of Right to Review	1496
2. Appeal Dismissed by Consent; Mootness of Initial Decision.....	1497
B. REQUIRED ANALYSIS	1497
1. Incomplete Analysis	1498
a. Incorrect Adjudication Standard.....	1500
b. Issue Not Raised in Appeal.....	1500
2. Timeliness and Jurisdictional Issues	1500
3. Adverse Action, Performance Case	1501
4. Annuity Appeal	1501
5. EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue	1502
a. Nondispositive EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue.....	1503
6. Consolidated Appeals	1505
7. Attorney Fees Decision	1505
C. CREDIBILITY FINDINGS	1505
1. Necessary Findings	1505
a. Weight of Evidence Equally Balanced	1506
2. Factors Considered; <i>Hillen</i>	1506
a. Some Testimony Discredited	1509
b. Alibi Defense	1509
c. Inconsistencies; Denials; Memory Lapse; Failure to Provide Statement	1509
d. Contemporaneous Notation, Statement; <i>Post Hoc</i> Explanation.....	1510
e. Self-Serving Testimony; Bias; Criminal Conviction; Past Misconduct	1511
f. Uncontradicted Testimony.....	1512
g. Implausible, Inherently Improbable, Imprecise Testimony	1512
h. Telephonic Hearing.....	1512
i. Determination Made Without Hearing.....	1512
II. PETITION FOR REVIEW; RECONSIDERATION	1513
A. PFR PROCESS	1513
1. Statutory and Regulatory Structure	1514
a. Internal Board Guidance	1516
2. Board Treatment of PFR, Reopening Request.....	1517
a. Enforcement Issue.....	1519
3. Reply to PFR Response	1519
4. Cross-PFR.....	1519
a. Conditional Cross-PFR	1520
5. Effect of Judicial Review on PFR	1520
6. Effect of EEOC Review on PFR	1521
7. Who May Obtain Review	1521
a. OPM	1521
b. OSC	1522
c. Others; Intervenors	1522
8. Grounds for PFR	1522
a. Evidentiary Disputes	1523
b. Ineffective Counsel	1524

c.	Fivolous PFR; Sanction	1525
d.	Challenges to Settlement	1525
9.	Time for Filing.....	1525
10.	Service	1526
11.	MSPB Processing	1527
a.	Tied Vote; Lack of Quorum	1529
b.	Decision Effective Upon Issuance by Clerk	1529
c.	Joinder	1529
12.	Failure to Prosecute; Failure to Respond.....	1529
a.	Withdrawal of PFR.....	1530
b.	Dismissal Without Prejudice	1530
13.	PFR Settlement Program	1530
14.	MSPB Final Decision	1531
a.	Short Form Order.....	1531
15.	Authority to Reopen and Reconsider	1532
a.	Jurisdictional Issue.....	1535
b.	Due Diligence	1536
c.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1540
d.	Change in Law	1541
e.	Fraud	1543
f.	Retirement Appeal	1544
g.	Effect of Judicial Review on Petition to Reopen.....	1545
h.	Reopening in Lieu of Excusing Untimely or Defective PFR	1547
i.	Clear Legal Error; Manifest Injustice.....	1547
j.	Discovery of Additional Legal Argument.....	1547
k.	Correction of Case Processing Error	1547
16.	Entry of Settlement Agreement Into Record.....	1548
B.	INTERIM RELIEF	1548
1.	Effective Date of Interim Relief.....	1551
2.	Effect of Remand or Supplemental Initial Decision on Interim Relief.....	1552
3.	Obligation to Return Employee to Work and Pay; Undue Disruption.....	1552
a.	Undue Disruption Determination	1555
b.	Undue Disruption Notice	1556
c.	Implicit Disruption Determination; Strong Overriding Interest	1558
d.	Removal From Workplace or Adverse Action During Interim Relief Period	1562
e.	Return to Work With Changed Duties.....	1563
f.	Restoration Followed by Appellant’s Inability to Work.....	1563
g.	Pay Entitlement; Overtime; Allowances	1563
h.	Deductibility of Interim Earnings or Severance Pay	1566
i.	Prior “Bad Faith” Implementation Standard	1566
4.	Dismissal of PFR for Failure to Provide Interim Relief	1566
a.	Remedy for Inadequate Interim Relief	1568
b.	Motion to Dismiss PFR for Lack of Proper Interim Relief	1568
c.	Discriminatory Application of Interim Relief	1569
d.	PFR Not Mooted by Overbroad Interim Relief	1570
e.	Effect of Jurisdictional Issue	1571
5.	Certification and Proof of Interim Relief	1571
a.	Evidence of Interim Relief	1572
b.	Technical Error; Supplemental Evidence of Interim Relief	1575
c.	Delay in Payment Following Certification or <i>Prima Facie</i> Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1576
d.	Withdrawal of Interim Relief	1576
6.	Factors Limiting or Warranting Denial of Interim Relief	1577
a.	OWCP Benefits	1577
b.	Retirement	1578
c.	Restriction on Extension of Appointment	1579
d.	Waiver, Settlement of Interim Relief; Employment Status Change	1579
7.	Special Situations	1581
a.	Retirement Appeals	1581
b.	Within-Grade Increase Appeal	1582
c.	Suitability Appeal	1582
d.	VEOA Appeal.....	1582

e.	Mitigation of Removal to Demotion	1582
f.	Mitigation of Removal to Suspension	1583
g.	Mitigation of Demotion to Suspension	1583
h.	Mitigation or Cancellation of Suspension	1583
i.	Enforced Leave Concluded by the Date of the Initial Decision.....	1584
j.	Unified Penalty Involving Reassignment	1584
C.	REVIEW OF FACTUAL AND CREDIBILITY FINDINGS	1584
1.	Factual Findings; "Special Deference"	1585
a.	Decision Based on Affidavits, Documents	1589
b.	Telephonic, Videoconference Hearing	1589
2.	Omitted Findings	1590
3.	Unnecessary Findings	1591
4.	Issue of Mental Competence During Appeal Adjudication	1592
D.	REVIEW OF NEW EVIDENCE	1592
1.	What Constitutes Evidence	1595
2.	What Evidence Is New	1595
a.	Previously Available	1595
b.	Issue First Raised by Judge	1596
c.	Claim of Surprise	1597
d.	Due Diligence	1597
e.	Issue of Timeliness of Appeal or Other Submission.....	1600
f.	Issue of Jurisdiction; Exhaustion of Remedies	1601
g.	Evidence From Another MSPB Case	1604
3.	Materiality of New Evidence	1604
a.	Impeachment, Rebuttal Evidence	1604
b.	Corroborative Evidence	1608
c.	Disparate Treatment	1609
d.	OPM, SSA, OWCP, VA Determination; Evidence of Medical, Mental Condition	1609
e.	Adjudication of Past Discipline.....	1610
f.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1611
E.	REVIEW OF NEW LAW	1611
F.	REVIEW OF NEW ISSUES OR ISSUES NOT RAISED WITH JUDGE	1612
1.	General Rule.....	1613
a.	Jurisdictional Issue	1613
b.	Order Directing Payment in Violation of Federal Statute.....	1614
2.	Determining if Issue or Argument Was Raised Below	1614
a.	Annuity	1615
b.	Penalty	1615
c.	Statutory, Constitutional Interpretation	1615
d.	Timeliness of Appeal	1615
e.	Discrimination	1615
f.	Waiver of Issue	1616
G.	TIMELINESS OF PFR	1616
1.	Request for Extension of Time	1617
2.	Date and Place of Filing	1618
a.	Deficient but Timely PFR.....	1618
3.	Filing by Facsimile	1618
a.	Misguided Facsimile	1619
4.	Filing by Commercial Delivery.....	1620
5.	Filing by Hand.....	1620
6.	Filing by Mail.....	1620
a.	Proof of Mailing; Postmark; Letterbox Rule.....	1622
b.	PFR Lost in the Mail.....	1624
7.	Electronic Filing.....	1626
8.	Procedure on Late Submission.....	1627
a.	Affidavit or Sworn Statement Required	1628
b.	Strict Application	1629
c.	Retirement Appeal.....	1631
9.	Justification for Late Filing	1631
a.	Electronic Filing Problem.....	1632
b.	Mailroom Delay in Posting PFR	1635

c.	Foreign Mail Problem.....	1635
d.	Office Equipment, Technology, E-Filing Mishap, Related Problems.....	1635
e.	Merits.....	1636
f.	Physical or Mental Condition of Appellant or Counsel.....	1636
g.	Ignorance of Law; Late Discovery of Legal Defense; Subsequent MSPB Decision in Another Case.....	1643
h.	Problem With Settlement.....	1645
i.	Misinterpretation, Ignorance of MSPB Regulation, Instruction.....	1646
j.	Incorrect Information From MSPB, Others.....	1648
k.	Incomplete Notice of Right to File PFR.....	1649
l.	Delayed Receipt, Misrouting of Initial Decision, PFR; Constructive Receipt.....	1650
m.	Failure to Receive Initial Decision; E-Filer.....	1652
(i)	Responsibility to Notify Board of Physical or Email Address Change.....	1655
n.	Effect of Judge's Remand to Agency for Redetermination.....	1657
o.	Withdrawal, Absence of Representative.....	1657
p.	Inability to Obtain Representation.....	1658
q.	Unexcused Delay or Neglect of Representative.....	1658
r.	Excused Neglect of Representative; Diligence of Appellant.....	1661
s.	Attempt to Obtain Congressional Assistance.....	1664
t.	Pending Review by Another Adjudicator.....	1664
u.	Awaiting Transcript, Other Document.....	1665
v.	Delay in Internal Decisionmaking.....	1666
w.	Military Service.....	1666
x.	Fear of Prosecution; Agency Misrepresentation.....	1667
y.	Language Difficulties.....	1667
z.	Other Problems.....	1667
10.	Filing PFR With Wrong Agency or MSPB Office.....	1670
a.	Mixed Case Appeals.....	1670
b.	Other Misdirected Filings.....	1670
11.	Case or PFR Misfiled in Court.....	1672
H.	FORMAT AND SUBSTANCE OF PFR; REPLY; RESPONSE TO REPLY.....	1673
1.	Allowable Submissions; Length, Format.....	1673
a.	Erroneous Designation of Pleading.....	1674
b.	Error in Formal Requirements.....	1675
c.	<i>Pro Se</i> Form PFR.....	1675
2.	Signature, Designation of Representative Required.....	1676
3.	Specific and Supported Objection.....	1677
a.	Factual Error.....	1677
b.	Adjudicatory Error.....	1678
4.	Response to PFR.....	1678
5.	Reply to Response.....	1678
6.	Supplemental Authority.....	1679
7.	Lack of Transcript.....	1679
I.	MOOTNESS OF PFR.....	1679
1.	Cancellation of Adverse Action; Agency Compliance With Initial Decision.....	1679
a.	Effect of Appellant's PFR; No Agency PFR Filed.....	1680
2.	Settlement; Vacatur of Initial Decision.....	1680
3.	Regulation Review Proceeding.....	1681
4.	Retirement Appeal.....	1681
5.	Disqualification of Representative.....	1681
J.	PROCEDURE ON REMAND.....	1681
1.	Determining Whether a Remand Is Necessary.....	1681
a.	Board Obtains Evidence During PFR.....	1682
2.	Evidence, Findings From First Hearing.....	1682
a.	Effect of MSPB Order Vacating Initial Decision.....	1683
3.	Remand for Further Discovery.....	1683
4.	Remand for More Evidence.....	1683
a.	Subsequent PFR.....	1683
b.	Entry of Interlocutory or Interim Relief on Remand.....	1684
5.	Remand for Compliance.....	1684
K.	OPM RECONSIDERATION REQUESTS.....	1684
1.	Governing Statute and Regulation.....	1684

2.	Substantial Impact on Law	1686
a.	Decisions Before 1990.....	1688
3.	Limited to Facts, Issues of Record	1689
4.	Timing of Request; Arbitration Award	1689
5.	Mootness	1689
6.	EEO Discrimination Decision	1689
L.	STAY REQUESTS	1689
1.	Requested by OPM	1690
a.	Request for Supreme Court Review	1693
2.	Requested by Agency	1694
a.	Stay of Enforcement Proceeding	1696
3.	Requested by or for Individual.....	1696
a.	Special Counsel Disciplinary Case	1698
b.	Other OSC Litigation	1699
M.	REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS	1699
1.	Award Subject to Review	1705
a.	Governing Statute and Regulation; Time for Review	1706
b.	EEO Allegation.....	1707
c.	Remand for Resolution of EEO Issue.....	1712
d.	Attorney Fees Claim	1713
2.	MSPB Review Procedure.....	1713
a.	Time to Seek Review.....	1715
3.	Proper Appellant Before MSPB	1717
4.	Method, Scope of MSPB Review	1717
a.	Issue Preclusion	1720
b.	Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity.....	1721
c.	Allegation of Bias, Unfair Hearing	1721
d.	Enforcement of Award Reviewed by MSPB.....	1722
5.	Standard of Review	1722
a.	Penalty, Time-Served Suspension; Remedy	1726
b.	Procedures; Timeliness of Grievance	1734
c.	EEO Issue	1737
6.	Postal Service Employees.....	1738
a.	Effect of Arbitration Award on Board Appeal.....	1740

CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS 1747

I.	ADVERSE ACTIONS DEFINED	1747
A.	CANCELATION OF APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION	1747
1.	Appointment.....	1748
a.	Entry on Duty; Action by Appointing Authority; Reliance	1751
b.	Citizenship.....	1751
c.	Nepotism.....	1753
d.	Selective Service Registration.....	1753
e.	Withdrawal of Offer to Extend Term Appointment.....	1755
2.	Promotion, Pay Increase	1756
B.	TERMINATION BY ADVERSE ACTION OF APPOINTMENT SECURED BY FRAUD; OPM SUITABILITY ACTION.....	1768
C.	CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTION	1769
1.	Jurisdictional Showing	1771
a.	Specific Allegations Control	1780
b.	Totality of Circumstances	1783
c.	Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	1785
d.	Jurisdictional Analysis in Untimely Appeal	1786
e.	Collateral Attack on Settlement Agreement, Waiver of Appeal Right.....	1786
f.	Allegation of Discrimination	1788
2.	Overview of Constructive Adverse Action Appeals	1791
a.	Timing of Events	1792
3.	Involuntary Downgrading	1793
a.	Hearing.....	1794
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation	1794
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause	1802
d.	Time Pressure	1803

e.	Improper Reassignment	1804
f.	Withdrawal of Request for Downgrading	1804
g.	Unauthentic Request for Downgrading	1804
h.	Discrimination; Intolerable Working Conditions	1804
i.	External Problems	1808
j.	Correction of Administrative Error	1809
4.	Involuntary Resignation.....	1810
a.	Hearing.....	1814
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation	1815
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause	1820
d.	Time Pressure	1822
e.	Improper Reassignment	1826
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Resign.....	1826
g.	Irrevocable Resignation; VSIP.....	1829
h.	Unauthentic, Ambiguous or Conditional Resignation	1829
i.	Ineffective Resignation	1830
j.	Mental Disability.....	1831
k.	Intolerable Working Conditions	1832
l.	Whistleblowing Reprisal	1840
m.	Discriminatory Working Conditions	1841
n.	Failure to Accommodate Disability	1845
o.	Denial of Leave	1847
p.	External Problems	1848
q.	Probationer	1849
r.	Technical Error	1849
5.	Involuntary Retirement.....	1849
a.	Hearing	1850
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation	1852
(i)	Correction of Benefit; Placement in Wrong Retirement System	1864
c.	Action Threatened Without Good Cause	1865
d.	Time Pressure	1867
e.	Involuntary Reassignment	1868
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Retire	1871
g.	Irrevocable Retirement; VSIP	1872
h.	Intolerable Working Conditions	1875
i.	Whistleblowing Reprisal	1883
j.	Discriminatory Working Conditions	1887
k.	Failure to Accommodate Disability	1891
l.	Discriminatory Conduct Causes Disability	1903
m.	Denial of Leave	1904
n.	Mental Disability.....	1905
o.	Agency-Initiated Retirement	1905
p.	Discontinued Service Retirement	1905
q.	Mandatory Retirement	1907
r.	Employing Agency as Party to Appeal Against OPM.....	1907
6.	Constructive Demotion Through Reassignment; <i>Russell</i>	1908
a.	Planned Management Action	1912
b.	Position Must Be Upgraded	1914
c.	Identity of Duties.....	1916
d.	Qualification for Higher-Graded Position	1917
e.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Hearing	1917
f.	Evidence of Classification Error	1918
g.	EEO Allegation	1918
h.	Timeliness of Appeal.....	1918
7.	Involuntary Transfer	1919
D.	ENFORCED LEAVE; CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION	1920
1.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Burden of Proof	1923
a.	Hearing.....	1925
b.	EEO Allegation	1926
c.	Effect of Receipt of OWCP Benefit.....	1927
d.	Disputed Restoration Right	1928

2.	Requirement for Adverse Action Procedure.....	1929
a.	Leave Status Voluntarily Assumed; Failure to Provide Medical Documentation, Perform Available Work.....	1932
b.	Process Due to Employee	1935
c.	Evaluation of Leave Enforced Following Notice to Employee	1936
d.	Disability Accommodation	1936
3.	Employee AWOL	1940
4.	Employee Blocked From Working Because of Employer's Concern About Fitness.....	1941
a.	Employee on LWOP	1948
5.	Light and Limited Duty; Medical Restriction.....	1948
a.	Historical Development of Light Duty Analysis.....	1952
b.	Collective Bargaining Contract.....	1957
c.	Disability Accommodation	1961
d.	EEO Settlement	1965
e.	Termination of Light Duty	1966
f.	Postal Service National and Other Collective Bargaining Contracts.....	1968
g.	Furlough	1969
6.	Work Release.....	1969
7.	Bar Order Preventing Entry to Workplace	1969
8.	Temporary Absence Resulting From Intolerable Working Conditions	1971
E.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSION.....	1974
1.	Use	1975
2.	Procedure; Duration	1978
a.	Due Process	1984
b.	Regulatory Error.....	1987
3.	Criminal Activity	1988
a.	Indictment; Filing of Information; Referral for Prosecution	1989
b.	Investigation Accompanied by Other Circumstances.....	1991
c.	Arrest	1993
4.	Nexus.....	2000
5.	Security Clearance or Other Investigation	2003
a.	Due Process: Separation of Officials Denying Access and Deciding Suspension; Change in Basis for Clearance Suspension.....	2008
b.	Indefinite Prolongation of Suspension.....	2023
c.	Alternatives to Suspension	2025
d.	Discrimination; Accommodation for Disability; Medical Issues; Whistleblowing	2031
6.	Inquiry Into Other Issues	2032
7.	Remedy	2037
a.	Action Following Termination of Criminal Proceeding.....	2042
II.	SERVICE EFFICIENCY	2042
A.	BURDEN OF PROOF	2044
1.	Charges.....	2045
2.	Affirmative Defenses.....	2045
3.	Preponderance of Evidence	2046
a.	Uniformity of Standard	2047
b.	Violation of Criminal Statute	2047
c.	Intent	2047
d.	Suspicion; Belief	2048
4.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case	2048
5.	Presumption.....	2048
B.	PERSONAL FAULT	2048
1.	Adverse Action to Address Action Involving Another Employee	2049
a.	EEO Complaint	2049
b.	Merit Promotion Grievance	2049
2.	Action Directed by Arbitrator	2049
3.	Correction of Administrative Error	2049
4.	<i>Respondeat Superior</i>	2050
C.	ADVERSE ACTION RELATED TO DISABILITY	2052
1.	Medical Standard	2053
2.	Medical Impairment	2054
3.	Agency-Initiated Retirement.....	2055
a.	Assistance in Securing Counsel.....	2058

b. Prior Law: Reasonable Cause to Believe	2059
4. Evaluation of Physical Impairment	2060
a. Evidence of Recovery Between Date of Removal and MSPB Decision.....	2063
5. Effect of Removal for Inability to Work on OPM Disability Annuity Determination	2065
a. Rebuttable Presumption of Annuity Entitlement.....	2065
6. Effect of Grant of Disability Retirement Application on Action Based on Inability to Perform Duties	2073
7. Allegation of Disability Discrimination; Lack of Reasonable Accommodation	2075
III. SPECIAL CLASSES OF EMPLOYEES.....	2076
A. SENIOR EXECUTIVE SERVICE	2076
1. Mitigation of Disciplinary Action	2082
2. Performance Case	2082
3. Department of Veterans Affairs.....	2083
a. 2014 Legislation.....	2085
B. ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES.....	2090
1. Scope of MSPB Review	2093
a. Good Cause	2094
b. Penalty Determination	2098
c. Affirmative Defenses	2099
2. Cause for Discipline	2100
a. Insubordination	2102
b. Performance	2103
c. Failure to Follow Performance-Related Directive	2107
d. Remarks to Litigant; Comments in Decision; Conduct of Hearing.....	2109
e. Prolonged Absence; Irregular Attendance	2111
f. Other Misconduct	2111
3. Constructive Action Against Judge: <i>Tunik</i>	2114
a. Forced Retirement.....	2122
b. Enforced Leave	2122
c. Pre- <i>Tunik</i> Decisions; Judicial Independence.....	2123
4. Furlough; RIF	2131
5. Settlement of Complaint	2134
6. Voluntary Dismissal of Complaint	2134

CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND MITIGATION2135

I. CONCEPT OF NEXUS	2135
A. <i>MERRITT</i> AND PRESUMPTIONS OF NEXUS; OFF-DUTY CONDUCT.....	2135
1. General Approach Toward Proof.....	2137
a. Actual or Potential Publicity, Notoriety	2138
b. Potential for Future Harm.....	2139
c. Investigative Exertion	2139
B. SPECIFIC NEXUS DETERMINATIONS.....	2139
1. Arrest	2140
2. Violent Off-Duty Misconduct	2140
a. Shooting; Killing	2140
b. Assault; Threat.....	2142
3. Violent Conduct on Agency Premises	2143
4. Off-Duty Drug Offense	2143
a. Drug Activity Involving Agency Time or Facilities	2147
5. Off-Duty Alcohol-Related Offense	2147
a. Off-Duty Activity Involving Agency Premises	2148
6. Sexual Misconduct.....	2148
7. Fraud and Theft	2160
a. Off-Duty Offense	2160
b. Preemployment Offense.....	2162
c. On-Duty or Job-Related Offense	2162
8. Gambling.....	2163
9. Failure to Pay Debt	2163
10. Grievance Meeting	2166
11. Conduct Contrary to Agency Mission	2166
a. Real Estate Activity—DHUD	2166
b. Employee's Tax Problem—IRS, Other Agencies; Responsibility for Errors of Others	2166

c.	Law Enforcement Officer; <i>Giglio</i> Impairment	2171
d.	Driver.....	2176
e.	Strike-Related Conduct	2176
12.	AWOL Removal After Criminal Conviction.....	2176
II.	MITIGATION OR AGGRAVATION OF PENALTIES	2176
A.	GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS	2177
1.	<i>Douglas</i> Standards; Decision to Reflect Mitigating Factors or MSPB Imposes Maximum Reasonable Penalty	2179
a.	Consideration of Mitigating Factors	2180
b.	Proposal to List Aggravating Factors; Treatment of Warnings; Due Process Considerations	2181
c.	Exemplary Penalty.....	2183
d.	Exaggeration of Charge	2183
2.	Articulation of Relevant Factors.....	2184
a.	By Agency; Decision Notice	2184
b.	By MSPB	2185
3.	Not All Charges Sustained; Maximum Reasonable Penalty	2186
a.	Remand to Agency for Redetermination of Penalty	2191
4.	All Charges but Not All Specifications Sustained; Partial Specification Sustained.....	2193
5.	Charge Sustained That Was Not Brought	2194
6.	Factors Not Considered Mitigating.....	2194
a.	Disability Discrimination; Impairment.....	2194
b.	Discriminatory Environment	2195
c.	Prohibited Personnel Practice.....	2195
d.	Offer of Settlement	2195
7.	When Mitigation Must Be Raised	2195
8.	Special Counsel Disciplinary Case.....	2196
9.	Impact of Mitigation by Demotion on Labor Agreement Requirement	2196
B.	SPECIFIC MITIGATING OR AGGRAVATING FACTORS	2196
1.	Potential for Rehabilitation	2196
a.	Deference to Higher Level Management Assessment.....	2197
b.	Forward-Looking Analysis.....	2197
c.	Performance Action	2198
d.	Notice of Rule or Policy	2198
e.	Temporary Condition; Stress; Alcoholism	2200
f.	Long Service	2200
g.	Intervening Good Performance; Misconduct Subsequent to Charge Leading to Adverse Action	2201
h.	Post-Removal Conduct or Evidence of Rehabilitation	2202
i.	Contrition or Remorse; Admission of Misconduct	2203
j.	Denial of Misconduct; Vigorous Defense	2204
k.	Repeated Misconduct; Last Chance Agreement.....	2205
2.	Psychological Problem; Illness or Treatment; Stress	2206
3.	Performance, Evaluations.....	2211
4.	Intent	2212
5.	Notoriety	2212
6.	Position of Trust; Fiduciary Duty; Loss of Trust	2212
7.	Progressive Discipline	2215
8.	Table of Penalties; Classification of Offense.....	2217
9.	Disparate; Comparable Penalties	2220
a.	Duty of Agency to Inquire Into Comparable Offenses and Penalties.....	2224
b.	Degree of Consistency Required	2224
c.	Substantial Similarity of Offenses; Totality of Circumstances	2225
d.	Proximity in Time	2230
e.	Same Work Unit; Evolving Case Law: <i>Woebcke</i> ; <i>Lewis</i>	2230
f.	Positions of Similar Levels of Trust and Responsibility	2239
g.	Selective Prosecution.....	2240
h.	Settlement	2241
i.	Comparable Arbitration Awards; Other MSPB Decisions	2244
j.	Effect of Criminal Sentence	2244
k.	Assertion of Discrimination	2245
l.	Post-Removal Comparability Analysis	2245
10.	Mandatory Penalty	2246
11.	Staleness of Charge.....	2248

12. Agency Bad Faith, Provocation, Manipulation; Improper Pressure on Appellant; Entrapment	2249
13. Condonation	2250
14. Favorable Attitude of Coworker; Supervisor	2250
15. Severity of Misconduct	2250
a. Sequential Disciplinary Proposals	2251
b. Multiplicity and Merger of Charges	2251
c. Zero Tolerance Policy	2251
16. Employee Job Level.....	2253
a. Ineffectiveness as Supervisor; Demotion	2253
b. Reassignment	2255
C. AGENCY CONSIDERATION OF PAST DISCIPLINE	2255
1. Notice Requirement	2257
a. Failure to Include Past Discipline in Proposal: Due Process	2258
2. Proof, Rebuttal of Past Discipline	2259
a. Availability of Challenge to Past Discipline.....	2260
b. Clearly Erroneous	2260
c. Reprisal	2260
d. Pending Challenge to Past Discipline	2261
e. Past Discipline Reversed After Initial Decision	2263
f. Discipline Imposed After the Appealed Adverse Action.....	2264
g. Past Discipline Time-Barred	2264
h. Dissimilar Offense.....	2265
i. Nondisciplinary Sanction	2266
D. JUDICIAL REVIEW OF PENALTY, ADMINISTRATIVE RECONSIDERATION	2266
1. General Rule.....	2266
2. Agency Table of Penalties	2267
3. Application of Relevant <i>Douglas</i> Factors	2267
4. Effect of OPM Reconsideration Request	2267

CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....2269

I. STATUS	2269
A. ABSENCE	2269
1. Impact on Service Efficiency	2269
a. Assigned Post of Duty; Travel Requirement.....	2271
2. Approved and Disapproved Absence.....	2271
a. Abuse of Leave	2273
b. Loafing; Wasting Time.....	2273
c. Excessive Leave, LWOP, Absences Beyond Employee's Control; Failure to Maintain a Regular Work Schedule; OWCP Coverage	2273
(i) Historical Application of <i>Cook</i> and Related Decisions.....	2277
d. Unscheduled but Approved Absence Following Failure to Follow Procedure to Request Leave	2284
e. Disability	2286
3. Tardiness.....	2288
4. Leave-Requesting, Leave-Reporting Requirement	2288
a. Leave Restriction Notice	2292
b. Medical Certification Requirement	2293
c. Other Certification or Documentation Requirement	2294
d. Disability Accommodation	2294
5. Proof of AWOL; Telework Status; Leave Request.....	2294
6. Agency Abuse of Discretion.....	2296
a. Ambiguous Leave Policy or Directive	2297
b. Condonation of AWOL	2297
c. Jury Duty.....	2297
7. Evidence of Illness First Submitted to MSPB	2297
a. FMLA	2299
8. LWOP; Other Leave Arrangement; Compensable Injury; Disability Accommodation	2299
a. Executive Order 5396; Disabled Veteran	2303
b. Advanced Sick Leave	2303
c. Donated Leave.....	2304
9. Family Leave.....	2304
a. FMLA Request, Agency Compliance; Medical Documentation	2309

b.	Constructive Request.....	2318
c.	Belated Submission of Request, Documentation	2321
d.	Abuse of Family Leave	2322
10.	Worker's Compensation Issue.....	2322
a.	Determining Whether Removal Is Based on Reason Unrelated to OWCP Entitlement.....	2324
b.	Leave-Reporting Requirement	2325
c.	No Foreseeable End to Absence; Absence When Compensation Ends	2326
11.	Leave Status Pending Disability Retirement	2328
12.	Incarceration; Work-Release Program.....	2328
13.	Cancellation or Conversion of Approved Leave	2330
14.	Absence Caused by Fear for Safety	2330
15.	Military Leave.....	2330
16.	Religious Leave	2331
17.	Problem Following Reinstatement Through MSPB Order	2331
18.	Aggravating Factors	2331
a.	Prolonged AWOL	2331
b.	Frequent AWOL	2332
c.	Unreliable Attendance.....	2332
19.	Mitigating Factors	2332
a.	Short, Infrequent AWOL	2333
b.	Longer AWOL	2334
c.	Leave Status Caused by Agency's Wrongful Action	2335
B.	REFUSAL TO ACCEPT REASSIGNMENT	2336
1.	General Rule.....	2337
a.	SES Employee	2342
2.	Inconvenience or Health Problem	2344
3.	Agency Burden of Proof; Legitimate Reason for Reassignment	2344
a.	Mobility Agreement; Condition of Employment	2348
b.	Return From Overseas Assignment	2349
4.	Misconduct Following Improper Reassignment.....	2349
5.	Application of RIF Procedures; Procedural Errors	2349
C.	FAILURE TO MAINTAIN OR OBTAIN CONDITION OF POSITION	2349
1.	License, Certification	2349
a.	Lawyer	2349
b.	Driver.....	2350
c.	Others	2351
d.	Medical Certification or Standard.....	2351
e.	Certification by Military Authority.....	2351
2.	Loss of Credential.....	2351
3.	Failure to Complete Training Course; Validity of Examination	2352
a.	Air Traffic Controller	2352
b.	Other Positions.....	2355
4.	Lack of or Loss of Minimum Qualification; Position Requirement	2357
a.	Indian Child Protection and Family Violence Prevention Act	2358
b.	Lautenberg Amendment	2360
c.	Removal From Reserve Status.....	2362
d.	Access to Agency Computer, Network	2367
5.	Security Clearance Revocation; Sensitive Position	2368
a.	Clearance Process	2368
b.	Agency Clearance Proceeding.....	2369
c.	Review of Agency Determination; <i>Egan</i> ; Constitutional Due Process	2373
d.	Decision to Require a Clearance; Whether Clearance Required as Employment Condition	2380
e.	Reassignment to Nonsensitive Position; Mitigation	2384
f.	EEO Issue; Whistleblower Reprisal; Disparate Treatment; USERRA	2386
g.	Regulatory Infraction During Revocation Process.....	2388
h.	Suspension, Removal Under 5 USC 7532.....	2395
i.	Suitability Determination, Security Clearance Distinguished	2396
j.	Sensitive Duties Not Requiring a Clearance: <i>Conyers</i>	2396
k.	Decisions Postdating <i>Conyers</i>	2416
l.	Requirement Similar to Security Clearance; Public Trust Position	2419
m.	TSA Sensitive Security Information.....	2421

n. Retirement Issue Related to Removal for Loss of Clearance	2423
6. Lack of Suitability for Continued Employment	2423
D. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST; APPARENT CONFLICTS.....	2424
1. Conflicts; Improper Business Dealings	2425
2. Apparent Conflicts.....	2427
3. Use of Government Office for Private Gain.....	2427
4. Agency Internal Information.....	2429
a. Nondisclosure Agreements	2429
5. Transaction With Another; Gift; Bribe; Honorarium; Loan	2430
a. Transaction With Patron, Vendor, Inmate	2430
b. Transaction With Supervisor	2432
c. Compensation for Government Service From Another Source.....	2432
6. Acting as Agent or Attorney Against Government.....	2432
E. OUTSIDE EMPLOYMENT	2432
1. Personal Work on Government Time	2432
a. Reporting, Approval Requirements.....	2432
b. Employment in Violation of Agency Restriction; Outside Practice of Law	2433
F. SPECIAL CATEGORIES OF EMPLOYEES	2433
1. Guard, Correctional Officer, Police, Investigator, Security Official.....	2433
2. Immigration Officer	2434
3. Ship Employee.....	2434
4. Supervisor	2434
G. STRIKES.....	2435
1. Charge of Striking	2435
2. Basis for Removal	2435
3. Proof of Participation	2435
4. Refuting Participation.....	2436
5. Fear for Personal Safety	2436
a. Insufficient Threat.....	2437
b. Duress, Coercion Established	2437
6. Association With Strikers	2437
7. Influence of Political Leader	2437
8. Penalty.....	2437
9. Other Issues.....	2437
II. RELATIONSHIPS	2437
A. INSUBORDINATION	2437
1. Refusal or Failure to Perform Work	2438
a. Proof of Intent.....	2439
2. Failure to Follow Instruction	2440
3. Failure to Follow Policy, Regulation	2442
4. Disruptiveness; Lack of Cooperation.....	2443
5. Recording of Conversation	2443
6. Cumulative Insubordination	2443
7. Dispute Over Position Responsibilities	2444
a. Difficulty Following Reinstatement	2445
b. Breach of Settlement Agreement.....	2445
8. Insolence, Abusive Language.....	2445
a. Abuse of Coworker, Subordinate	2446
b. Abuse of Supervisor; Disrespectful or Coarse Language.....	2446
c. Disagreement Over Instruction, Program	2449
9. Misuse of Dispute Resolution Procedure	2449
a. EEO Process.....	2449
b. Congressional Communication.....	2450
c. Grievance Proceeding.....	2450
d. Supervisor	2451
e. Interference With Employee Grievance.....	2451
10. Refusal to Take Fitness Examination.....	2451
a. Properly Ordered	2453
b. Improperly Ordered.....	2453
11. Failure to Provide Medical Information; Position Requirement	2457
12. Refusal to Submit to Search or Drug Test	2459

13. Problems During Investigations: Lack of Cooperation; Interference; Self-Incrimination	2462
14. Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence	2471
15. Defenses	2471
a. Inability to Comply	2471
b. Unclear Order; Unknown Policy	2471
c. Constitutional, Similar Challenge	2472
d. Improper Directive; Command Influence	2472
e. Federal Labor Law Policy; Collective Bargaining Contract	2476
f. Fear for Safety or Other Harm	2478
16. Mitigating Factors	2479
B. SEXUAL MISCONDUCT.....	2481
1. Sexual Harassment; Inappropriate Behavior	2482
a. Past Significance of Psychological Harm	2488
b. Charge Based on Agency Regulation or Standard of Conduct Not Tied to Title VII	2494
c. Physical Contact	2499
d. Offensive Remarks; Photos.....	2502
e. Consensual Conduct Affecting Workplace	2507
f. Homosexual Conduct	2508
2. Misconduct Toward Agency Client, Affiliate.....	2508
3. Misconduct Toward Child.....	2508
4. Penalties for Sexual Misconduct	2509
a. Demotion, Suspension	2509
b. Removal	2509
5. Defenses	2510
C. CONDUCT HARMING OTHERS; CRIMINAL VIOLATIONS	2511
1. Threat; Inappropriate Conduct.....	2511
a. Metz Test	2513
b. Reaction of Others to Threat	2515
c. Threat Through Another; Rumor	2517
d. Conditional Threat	2518
e. Statement to Therapist; EAP Counselor.....	2521
f. Statement to Union Representative	2523
g. Threat Against a Coworker	2525
h. Threat Against a Supervisor	2525
i. Threat Against Others	2526
j. Thought of Violence	2526
k. Inappropriate or Disruptive Statement Not Charged as Threat	2527
l. Mitigation.....	2529
2. Assault	2530
a. Against Coworker	2530
b. Against Supervisor	2530
c. Against Subordinate	2531
d. Against Others	2531
e. Defenses	2531
f. Mitigation; Aggravation	2532
3. Fighting; Self Defense.....	2534
4. Gambling.....	2535
5. Threat of Legal Action, Whistleblowing, or Publicity	2535
6. Lawsuit	2536
7. Discourtesy; Related Problems.....	2537
a. Profanity.....	2538
8. Improper Conduct Toward Patient, Ward, Others	2538
9. Invidious Discrimination; Offensive Remark; Preferential Treatment; Reprisal	2541
a. Action Against Supervisor for Whistleblowing Reprisal, Other Prohibited Personnel Practices	2545
b. Nepotism; Hiring of Friend	2548
D. CRITICAL STATEMENTS	2550
1. Constitutional Framework Applied in Federal Sector	2557
a. Private Speech	2560
2. Criticism of Agency or Its Personnel	2561
a. Constitutional Analysis	2561
b. Prohibited Personnel Practice Analysis	2563

c.	Defamation; Related Conduct	2565
d.	Congressional Communication.....	2566
e.	Political Activity and Speech	2567
f.	Concept of Loyalty	2569
3.	Internal Criticism	2570
a.	Constitutional Analysis.....	2570
b.	Managerial Disagreement	2570
c.	Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence.....	2571
d.	Criticism, False Statement About Coworker, Subordinate, Supervisor	2571
III.	INTEGRITY.....	2574
A.	FALSIFICATION AND MISREPRESENTATION	2574
1.	Proof of Fraud; Falsification	2577
a.	Neglect or Mistake	2581
b.	Perjury.....	2584
c.	Failure to Correct Report of Another	2584
d.	Reliance on Advice of Counsel or Other Individual	2584
e.	Cumulative False Statements.....	2585
2.	Employment Application; Security Questionnaire; Lack of Candor	2585
a.	Criminal Record.....	2589
b.	Education; Experience	2590
c.	Pre-Employment Medical Inquiry.....	2592
3.	Compensation Claim; Voucher	2594
a.	Overtime	2594
b.	Travel Voucher, Related Documentation.....	2595
c.	OWCP Claim.....	2597
d.	Unemployment Compensation	2598
e.	Disability or Leave Claim	2598
f.	Pay and Allowances Claim.....	2599
4.	Records of Time, Attendance, Work, and Pay; Negligence	2599
5.	Medical Certificate	2602
6.	Alteration, Failure to Preserve Documentation and Evidence	2602
7.	Investigative Misrepresentation; "Exculpatory No"	2602
8.	Lack of Candor.....	2604
9.	Failure to Report Misconduct	2608
10.	Disclosure Statement.....	2608
11.	Mitigating Factors	2608
a.	Time, Attendance, Travel Record.....	2611
b.	Medical Certificate	2611
c.	Employment Application	2612
B.	REMOVAL, MISUSE OF PROPERTY	2613
1.	Service Efficiency	2613
2.	Burden of Proof	2613
a.	Conversion	2614
b.	Unauthorized Possession or Removal of Property; Theft	2614
c.	Unauthorized Use.....	2616
d.	Common Possession	2616
e.	Evidence of Intent: Theft and Unauthorized Possession.....	2616
3.	Petty Theft.....	2617
a.	Shoplifting	2619
b.	Significance of Custody and Control of Property	2619
4.	Government Vehicle.....	2622
a.	Deviation From Assigned Route; Minor Personal Use; Public Service Exception	2627
b.	Nonstatutory Vehicle Misuse Charge; Impaired Driver.....	2627
5.	Unauthorized Use, Theft, or Destruction of Specific Property	2627
a.	Computer; Internet.....	2628
b.	Photocopier; Facsimile.....	2630
c.	Telephone.....	2630
d.	Government Credit Card.....	2630
e.	Government Services or Funds	2631
f.	Government Records; Official Information; Privacy Act.....	2632
g.	Black Marketing; Diversion of Property	2646

h.	Obstruction, Theft, or Mistreatment of Mail	2647
i.	Misuse of Official Mail, Delivery Service	2648
j.	Concealment of Theft	2648
k.	Mitigating Factors	2648
IV.	DRUGS AND ALCOHOL	2650
A.	DRUG AND ALCOHOL OFFENSES	2650
1.	Drug Possession, Use, Distribution	2651
a.	Possession or Use	2651
b.	Sale or Distribution	2654
c.	Safe Harbor Provision	2654
2.	Alcohol	2656
3.	Mitigation	2657
V.	PERFORMANCE	2660
A.	POOR PERFORMANCE REQUIRES CORRECTION	2660
1.	Performance Evaluations	2660
2.	Performance Standards	2661
a.	<i>Ad Hoc</i> Measure	2661
b.	Assigned Standard	2663
c.	Measurement of Work Error	2664
3.	Responsibility for Work Error	2664
4.	Medical Inability to Perform	2665
a.	Specific Medical or Physical Standard	2674
b.	Penalty Analysis	2674
c.	Disability Accommodation Analysis	2674
d.	Recovery From Disability	2675
5.	Mitigating Factors; Choice of Penalty	2677
a.	Comparative Performance	2678
b.	New Duties	2678
c.	Detail, Special Assignment	2680
d.	Progressive Discipline	2680
e.	Lack of Training	2680
f.	Lack of Improvement Period	2681
g.	Demotion or Reassignment	2681
h.	Suspension	2682
B.	NEGLIGENCE	2683
1.	Endangerment of Employee	2684
2.	Public Safety Risk	2685
3.	Destruction or Loss of Property	2685
4.	Medical Error	2685
5.	Mishandling or Improper Possession of Weapon	2686
6.	Inattention to Duty; Sleeping on Job	2686
7.	Failure to Follow Procedure	2686
8.	Excessive Expenditure; Waste	2687

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES2689

I.	UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE CASES	2689
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS: EMPLOYEE AND AGENCY COVERAGE	2690
1.	OPM Regulations	2692
B.	OVERVIEW OF PERFORMANCE ACTIONS	2693
1.	Merit Pay Employee	2694
C.	OPM APPROVAL OF APPRAISAL SYSTEM	2694
1.	Change in Appraisal System	2695
2.	Flexibility Permitted by Appraisal System; Skeletal Plans	2699
3.	Extent of OPM Review; Subordinate Organization Within Agency	2699
4.	Change Directed by OPM	2701
D.	PERFORMANCE STANDARD CRITERIA	2701
1.	Substantive Right	2702
2.	Scope of Review	2703

a.	Deference to Agency Management	2703
3.	Objectivity	2705
a.	Timeliness of Work	2707
b.	Draft; Intermediate Work Product	2708
c.	Personal Characteristic: Initiative, Reliability	2708
4.	Standards Development; Employee Involvement	2708
5.	<i>Wilson and Jackson</i> ; Negative or “Backwards” Standard.....	2709
6.	Communication of Standard.....	2713
7.	Change in Standard.....	2713
8.	Augmentation of Standard.....	2714
9.	PIP to Establish, Refine Standard	2716
10.	Specific Occupations	2719
a.	Clerical Employee, Secretary	2719
b.	Voucher Examiner	2721
c.	Inspector.....	2721
d.	Social Security Claims Representative	2721
e.	Employee Relations, Human Relations Specialist	2721
f.	Trade Analyst.....	2722
g.	Medical Technologist; Nurse.....	2722
h.	Scientist	2722
i.	Tradesperson	2723
j.	IT Specialist	2723
k.	Supervisory Supply Technician	2723
l.	Engineer	2723
m.	Lawyer	2724
n.	Paralegal	2724
o.	Management Analyst	2724
p.	Realty Specialist	2724
q.	Others	2724
11.	Numeric Standard	2725
12.	Multiple Components.....	2726
13.	Classification, Significance of Error	2729
14.	Relation of Standards in Element	2729
15.	Absolute Standard; <i>Guillebeau</i>	2730
a.	Law Before <i>Guillebeau</i>	2733
b.	Standard to Be Viewed as a Whole.....	2735
c.	Modification of Absolute Standard	2735
d.	Standard That Enumerates Tasks	2735
e.	Level of Performance That May Be Exceeded	2736
16.	Unreasonable Standard	2736
17.	Levels of Performance	2738
a.	Five-Tier Appraisal System; Marginal, Minimally Successful, or “Needs Improvement” Level of Performance	2738
b.	Multiple Appraisal Levels Derived From Ratings for Critical Elements	2742
c.	Two-Level; Pass/Fail Appraisal System	2744
E.	OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE	2745
1.	Prerequisite of Unacceptable Performance	2745
a.	Agency Need Not Prove Pre-PIP Unacceptable Performance	2746
2.	Opportunity Period Requirements	2747
a.	Order, Burden of Proof	2748
b.	Control Over Work	2748
c.	Assistance to Employee.....	2748
d.	Necessity for Specific Warning	2750
e.	Statement of Expectations; Job Responsibilities Not Described in PIP	2750
f.	Impossibility of Improvement; Unreasonable Expectations.....	2750
g.	Harmful Error Rule.....	2752
3.	Time Allowed for Improvement.....	2752
a.	One-Year Maximum for Evaluation; Pre-PIP Performance	2754
b.	Post-PIP Performance; Roller Coaster Employees	2756
c.	PIP Extension.....	2759
d.	Performance During Detail	2760
F.	PROCEDURE	2760

1.	Chapter 43 and 75 Actions Distinguished.....	2761
a.	Executive Order 13,839.....	2761
2.	Failure to Use Chapter 43	2762
a.	<i>Lovshin</i>	2762
b.	Conversion of Action	2763
3.	Limitations on Use of Chapter 43.....	2767
4.	Proposal, Decision Letter	2767
a.	Requirement of Concurrence.....	2768
b.	Unstated Charge	2768
c.	Necessity for Specific Instances.....	2768
d.	Notice Period	2770
G.	NECESSARY PROOF: SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE	2770
1.	Test Defined; Scope of Review	2770
2.	Weight, Quality of Substantial Evidence	2771
a.	Charges, Work Papers.....	2772
b.	Effect of Prior Performance Evaluation; Rating Issued in Error	2773
c.	Statistics; Sampling Method.....	2773
d.	Other Documentation; Testimony.....	2775
H.	DEFENSES	2775
1.	Propriety and Comparison of Performance Standards	2776
2.	Comparison of Employees' Performance.....	2776
3.	Adequacy of PIP; Lack of Control of Work; Agency Bad Faith	2776
4.	Training	2778
5.	Discrimination; Disparate Treatment	2779
6.	Reprisal.....	2783
7.	Collective Bargaining Contract	2783
I.	PRECLUSION OF MITIGATION	2784
II.	WITHIN-GRADE INCREASE DENIALS	2785
A.	BASIS FOR APPEAL	2786
B.	WHEN JURISDICTION ATTACHES.....	2787
1.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract	2792
C.	BURDEN OF PROOF	2793
1.	Proof of Poor Performance	2793
a.	Role of Performance Standards.....	2794
2.	Substantial Evidence Controls.....	2794
a.	What Constitutes Evidence.....	2795
D.	DEFENSES	2795
1.	Error in ALOC Procedure	2795
a.	Linkage of ALOC and Appraisal System	2795
b.	Waiting Period	2796
c.	Lack of ALOC Determination.....	2797
d.	Vague ALOC Determination	2797
2.	Reconsideration Errors.....	2797
a.	Employee Denied Information	2797
b.	Reconsideration Summary Lacking	2797
c.	Reconsideration Decision Level	2797
d.	Late Reconsideration Decision	2798
3.	Circumstances of Employee	2798
a.	Unfair Work Burden	2798
b.	Illness or Disability	2798
c.	Comparative Work Production	2798
d.	Lack of Training	2798

CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....2799

I.	RIF PROCESS	2799
A.	NATURE OF RIF	2799
1.	Statutory Provisions	2800
2.	OPM Regulations, Guidance.....	2801
a.	Validity of RIF Statute, Regulations	2803
3.	Furlough	2803
a.	Exemptions.....	2815

b. Emergency Furlough	2817
c. Part-Time, Light Duty Status; Intermittent Appointment; Work Schedule Adjustment.....	2817
d. Discovery in Furlough Appeal.....	2818
B. ACTIONS APPEALABLE AS RIF; MSPB JURISDICTION	2820
1. Regulatory Structure.....	2820
2. Jurisdictional Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract	2821
3. Types of Appointees.....	2821
a. Temporary	2821
b. Probationer.....	2822
c. Demonstration Project	2822
d. Postal Service Non-Preference Eligible	2825
e. Part-Time.....	2826
f. Senior Executive Service	2826
g. Agencies With Independent Statutory Personnel Authority.....	2829
4. Possible RIF.....	2830
5. Action to Avoid RIF	2830
a. Transfer to Another Agency	2831
b. Resignation	2831
c. Retirement	2831
d. Detail.....	2831
e. Reassignment Without Regard to RIF	2832
(i) Representative Rate.....	2833
f. Reassignment During or Following RIF	2834
g. Reassignment With Pay Reduction in Anticipation of RIF	2835
(i) Postal Reorganizations: 1990s.....	2835
(ii) Postal Reorganizations: 2000 Onward.....	2843
(iii) Other Agencies.....	2848
6. Grade and Pay Retention; Pay Rate Change; Demotion	2851
7. Classification Issue	2851
a. Erosion of Duties.....	2853
b. Intentional Changes in Duties	2855
8. Transfer of Function.....	2855
a. Identification of Positions for Transfer	2857
b. Employee Who Declines to Move.....	2860
C. COMPETITIVE AREA.....	2860
1. Defined	2860
2. Criteria	2861
3. Assignment Across Competitive Area	2861
4. Challenge to Competitive Area	2861
a. Burden of Proof	2861
b. Organizational Structure; One-Person RIF.....	2861
c. Geographical Structure; Local Commuting Area	2864
D. COMPETITIVE LEVEL	2865
1. Defined	2865
2. Challenge to Competitive Level	2867
a. Primacy of Position Description	2868
b. Testimony Concerning Duties	2870
c. Loss of Productivity; Undue Interruption	2871
d. Collective Bargaining Contract.....	2872
e. Challenge to Performance Appraisal	2873
3. Particular Groups of Employees	2874
a. Developmental/Trainee	2874
b. Temporary.....	2875
c. Part-Time	2875
d. VA Health Care Professional.....	2875
e. Bureau of Indian Affairs; Indian Health Service	2878
4. Scope of MSPB Review	2878
a. Impact of Error.....	2878
b. Right to Hearing	2879
c. Substantive Review.....	2879

II. ASSIGNMENT AND RELATED RIGHTS	2879
A. REGULATORY AND OPERATIONAL BASIS	2880
1. Veteran, Other Preferences.....	2882
2. Appointment Qualifying for Assignment Right	2884
a. Excepted Service.....	2884
b. Detail.....	2884
c. Intergovernmental Personnel Act	2884
d. Part-Time/Full-Time	2884
3. Position Subject to Displacement.....	2884
a. Supervisory	2884
b. Temporary.....	2884
4. Filling of Vacancies.....	2884
5. Assessment of Qualifications	2887
a. Updating Qualifications.....	2890
b. Qualifications of Displacing Employee	2890
c. Merit Promotion Issue.....	2890
d. Undue Interruption	2890
6. Representative Rate	2892
7. Amendment of RIF Notice; Change in Position Offer.....	2893
B. BUMPING.....	2893
C. RETREAT	2896
1. Prior Rule	2897
2. Method of Analysis	2897
3. Burden of Proof	2899
D. REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS	2899
1. Reemployment Priority List Right Before RIF Effective Date	2911
2. Remedy in Reemployment Priority List Appeal	2913
3. Transitional Assistance	2913
III. RIF CHALLENGES.....	2914
A. BURDEN OF PROOF.....	2914
1. Agency Responsibility	2914
2. Agency's <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	2914
3. Qualifications; Assignment Right	2915
4. Classification Dispute	2915
B. <i>BONA FIDE</i> RIF: <i>LOSURE</i>	2916
1. Substantive Rights, Harmful Error.....	2916
2. RIF as Adverse Action.....	2919
3. Challenge to Reorganization	2922
a. Reorganization Defined; Single Position RIF	2923
b. Managerial Discretion.....	2923
c. Funding Decision	2924
d. Redistribution of Duties	2925
e. Planning for Future Events	2926
f. Comparative Qualifications as a Factor in Selection of Positions for RIF	2927
g. Contribution to Agency Mission; Funding of Individual Position	2927
h. Contracting Out Challenge	2928
i. Sham, Paperwork Reorganization: Old, New Position Identical; Delayed Reorganization	2928
j. Merit Promotion, Hiring, Placement During RIF.....	2931
k. Events Preceding, Subsequent to RIF	2931
C. DISCRIMINATION DEFENSES	2932
1. Age	2937
2. Religion.....	2938
D. PROCEDURAL ISSUES	2938
1. Internal Procedures	2938
2. Timing of Job Offer; Timing of Release of Employees	2938
3. Correction of Retention Standing Error	2938
4. Adequacy of RIF Notice	2939

CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....2941

I. STATUTORY STANDARD	2941
A. HARMFUL ERROR DEFINED.....	2941

1. <i>Parker</i>	2942
2. Might Have/Would Have Analysis	2943
B. HARMFUL ERROR APPLIED	2944
1. Mixing Harmful Error and Other Doctrines.....	2944
a. Mitigation of Penalty.....	2944
b. Prohibited Personnel Practice	2944
2. Statutory, Regulatory Violation; Action Not in Accordance With Law	2944
a. Unfair Labor Practice	2946
b. Privacy Act; Disclosure of Confidential Information	2948
c. Constitution.....	2949
d. Invalid Regulation	2949
3. Collective Bargaining Contract Violation.....	2950
a. Disputed Coverage	2952
b. Impact of Arbitration Award	2952
c. Employment Contract	2953
4. Problem With Representation	2953
a. Cautionary Notes to Counsel	2953
5. Treatment of Affirmative Defense if Action Is Set Aside as Erroneous.....	2954
II. ERROR IN PRELIMINARY PROCEDURES.....	2954
A. AGENCY INVESTIGATION	2954
1. Due Process.....	2955
2. Right to Counsel; Union Representative.....	2955
3. Entrapment	2957
4. Agency Predecisional Hearing	2958
5. Security Clearance Investigation	2958
B. STALE CHARGES; LACHES	2959
1. General Rule.....	2959
2. Agency Regulation; Collective Bargaining Contract	2961
3. Performance Case	2961
C. ESTOPPEL; DOUBLE JEOPARDY	2961
1. Estoppel	2961
2. Double Jeopardy.....	2961
a. Reinitiation of a Proposal After an Adverse Action Is Canceled.....	2969
b. Action Initiated After Earlier Action Invalidated for Procedural Reason.....	2970
c. Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	2971
d. Action Following Acquittal	2971
III. ERRORS IN PROPOSAL NOTICE AND REPLY PROCESS	2971
A. BASIC RIGHTS	2971
1. Predecision Proposal Not Mandated in Some Cases When Due Process Is Provided Following Decision	2974
2. Right to Counsel	2976
B. PROPOSAL NOTICE.....	2976
1. Purpose, Sufficiency of Notice; Due Process	2977
a. Supporting Evidence.....	2978
b. Technical Deficiencies	2979
c. Failure to Provide Notice of Appeal or Statutory Right	2979
d. Error in Date	2979
e. Other Minor Error	2980
f. Assessing Sufficiency of Charge.....	2981
2. Specific Charge; Only Conduct Described	2985
a. Conduct Postdating Proposal	2990
b. Amendment	2990
3. Framing of Charge	2990
a. General Charge; Charge Label; Detailed Narrative; <i>Otero</i> and <i>Cross</i>	2990
b. Variation Between Stated Charge and Supporting Narrative or Specification; <i>Nazelrod</i> and <i>Lachance</i>	2993
c. Splitting of Charge.....	2999
d. Independent Elements of Single Charge	3002
e. Multiple Specifications Supporting a Single Charge	3006
f. Lesser Included Offense.....	3009
4. Past Discipline; Performance Record; Aggravating Factors	3009
5. Citation of Standards of Conduct.....	3009
6. Charge Tied to Penalty Table Classification	3009

7.	Criminal Charge	3010
8.	Mixing Chapters 43 and 75	3010
9.	Cumulative Charges; Merger of Charges	3011
10.	Charge of Unbecoming or Improper Conduct	3013
11.	Service of Notice.....	3015
C.	INADEQUATE REPLY AND NOTICE PERIOD	3017
1.	Calculation	3017
2.	Not Less Than Seven Days for Reply	3017
3.	30-Day Advance Notice of Action	3020
D.	SHORTENED NOTICE PERIOD; CRIME PROVISION	3021
1.	Procedure to Invoke Shortened Notice	3022
2.	Reasonable Belief of Crime.....	3023
a.	Arrest, Warrant	3025
b.	Conduct Caused by Mental Impairment.....	3025
3.	Emergency Suspension for Reason Other Than Reasonable Belief of Crime	3025
4.	Indefinite Suspension.....	3026
E.	FAILURE TO PROVIDE EVIDENCE FILE, OTHER INFORMATION.....	3026
1.	Loss or Destruction of Evidence	3029
F.	ORAL AND WRITTEN REPLIES.....	3029
1.	Proof of Harm; Failure to Consider a Reply; Due Process.....	3031
a.	Investigation of Information Provided by the Employee.....	3036
b.	Criminal Proceeding Pending	3037
2.	Waiver of Reply Right	3037
a.	Extension Request	3037
3.	Decisionmaker, Reply Officer	3041
4.	Right to Confrontation.....	3041
5.	Right to Information.....	3041
6.	Inadequate Representation.....	3042
G.	AGENCY DECISIONAL PROCEDURES; <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS.....	3042
1.	Early Law From Courts.....	3042
2.	<i>Sullivan</i> ; Regulatory Prohibitions; Adverse External Influences	3045
3.	<i>Stone</i> ; Current, Broadened Due Process Test.....	3047
a.	Reinitiation of Action Following Due Process Reversal	3054
4.	Early Law From MSPB	3054
5.	Deciding Official Consults Witness, Advisor; Information Not Disclosed to Employee	3056
a.	Information From Witness.....	3057
b.	Impact of 5 USC 2302(b)(2).....	3058
c.	Report, Investigation	3058
d.	Advisor.....	3059
e.	Past Discipline as Rebuttal to Mitigation	3059
f.	Multiple Charges.....	3059
6.	Proposing and Deciding Official Confer; Same Proposing and Deciding Official	3061
7.	Information Pertaining to Aggravation or Mitigation of Penalty; <i>Ward</i>	3062
a.	Potential Publicity, Notoriety, Other Harm.....	3081
b.	Information or Documents in the Evidence File Not Referenced in the Proposal	3083
c.	Information Provided to the Deciding Official Before the Reply Process Begins	3084
d.	Evaluation of Information Presented During Reply	3085
e.	Penalty Table, Standards of Conduct.....	3086
f.	Performance Cases.....	3088
g.	Harmful Error Analysis Before <i>Ward</i>	3090
8.	Predisposition to Take Adverse Action; Offer to Permit Resignation; Uninformed Deciding Official	3091
a.	Biased Proposing Official.....	3096
b.	Malicious Initiation of Action	3096
9.	Deciding Official Who Is Biased or Whose Decision Is Directed	3096
a.	Lack of Discretion	3098
10.	Involvement of OSC.....	3098
11.	Changes in Proposing, Deciding Official	3098
12.	Lack of Authority.....	3103
a.	Deciding Official	3103
b.	Proposing Official.....	3104
13.	Pending Retirement Application	3104

14. Specificity of Decision Letter.....	3104
a. No Decision Letter.....	3104
b. Retroactive Decision Letter.....	3104
c. Notice of Appeal Rights.....	3105
15. Delayed Decision.....	3105

CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION3107

I. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES	3107
A. PROCEDURES IN MIXED CASES.....	3107
1. Multiple Agency Review Processes.....	3109
2. Multiple Filing Options; Pleading Requirements; Timing of MSPB Appeal	3111
a. Withdrawal or Abandonment of EEO Allegation	3112
b. Authority of Judge to Strike Frivolous EEO Allegation; Summary Judgment	3112
3. Jurisdictional Problems With EEO Complaints	3115
a. Filing Dates	3116
b. Timeliness of EEO Complaint	3117
c. EEO Class Action	3120
d. EEO Complaint Withdrawn.....	3122
e. What Constitutes a Complaint	3122
f. Coextensive Issues; Scope of Complaint.....	3123
g. Premature Appeal	3124
4. Duty to Resolve Issues and Inform Appellant of Elements of Proof.....	3124
5. Jurisdiction Over Appealable Action; Constructive Adverse Action	3125
a. Probationer.....	3127
b. Restoration Appeal Involving Employee Partially Recovered From Compensable Injury	3127
6. Election of Remedies	3127
a. Election Through Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance	3127
b. Election Between EEO and Direct MSPB Appeal; Treatment of EEO Complaint	3128
c. Effect of Subject Matter of Preexisting Complaint on Subsequent Appeal; Complaint Involving Proposed Action	3130
7. MSPB Remand; EEOC Remand	3131
8. Strategic Considerations	3134
B. BURDEN OF PROOF	3134
1. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	3134
2. Analysis Following the <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	3138
a. Analysis of Motivation, Pretext	3140
b. Mixed Motives; Proof That Action Would Have Been Taken Without Discriminatory Motive	3142
c. Element of Intent; Employer Error	3149
d. Significance of Agency's Proof of Charges	3150
e. Significance of Agency's Failure to Prove Charge	3151
f. Comparable Employees; Disparate Treatment	3152
C. EVIDENCE	3159
1. Direct Evidence; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators; Taint of Agency Official; Cat's Paw.....	3159
2. Circumstantial Evidence; Pretext; Presumption	3163
3. Disparate Impact	3165
4. Statistics	3166
5. Supervisory Practices; Remarks.....	3167
D. FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION	3168
1. Race	3168
2. Age	3169
3. Religion	3174
4. Marital Status.....	3176
5. Pregnancy	3176
6. Sex; Sexual Orientation; Equal Pay Act.....	3176
7. Retirement Cases: Application by OPM of Statutory Requirements	3176
E. REPRISAL.....	3177
1. Convincing Mosaic; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators.....	3188
2. Collateral Personnel Action of Evidentiary Weight in an EEO Affirmative Defense.....	3191
3. Taint of Reprisal by Lower Level Official; Cat's Paw.....	3192
II. REHABILITATION ACT: DISABLING CONDITIONS	3194
A. REGULATORY STRUCTURE.....	3195

B.	PRIMA FACIE CASE; ACCOMMODATION REQUIREMENTS	3199
1.	Individual Regarded or Perceived as Disabled	3202
2.	Individual Associated With Disabled Person	3208
3.	Substantial Limitation of Major Life Activity	3208
a.	Life Activity of Working	3211
4.	Order and Burden of Proof.....	3215
a.	Disparate Treatment	3223
b.	Mixed Motive Analysis.....	3224
5.	Causal Connection.....	3227
6.	Transitory or Temporary Disability.....	3229
a.	Corrected or Mitigated Condition	3231
7.	Limitation on General Employability	3231
a.	Allergy.....	3233
b.	Stress Disorder	3235
c.	Other Mental Disability; Proof of Disability.....	3240
8.	Conditions Not Protected by Rehabilitation Act	3241
a.	Gambling Compulsion	3241
b.	Sexual Disorder	3241
c.	Pregnancy	3242
9.	Qualified Disabled Employee	3242
a.	Dangerousness; Risk Assessment; Direct Threat	3244
b.	Lack of Medical Release	3249
10.	Knowledge of Disability.....	3249
a.	When Disability Claim or Defense Must Be Raised	3250
11.	Suggesting Nonapparent Accommodation; Duty of Reasonable Inquiry	3252
a.	Interactive Process	3254
C.	ACCOMMODATION THROUGH JOB RESTRUCTURING, ASSISTANCE	3257
1.	Light Duty and Job Modification.....	3257
a.	Lifting Requirements.....	3261
b.	Postal Service Collective Bargaining Contracts.....	3263
c.	Inappropriate Job Modification; Increased Job Burden	3264
2.	Provision of, Modification to, Job Equipment	3264
3.	Alteration of Work Schedule, Worksite; Telework	3267
4.	Alteration of Training Requirement.....	3277
D.	ACCOMMODATION THROUGH REASSIGNMENT	3278
1.	<i>Ignacio</i>	3280
2.	Evaluation of Reassignment Effort	3282
a.	Reassignments Across Organizational Lines	3288
3.	Collective Bargaining Contract	3294
4.	Agency Regulation	3294
5.	Restoration From Compensable Injury	3295
6.	Demotion; Promotion.....	3295
E.	ACCOMMODATION THROUGH MEANS OTHER THAN JOB MODIFICATION OR REASSIGNMENT.....	3297
1.	Modification of Agency Policy, Facility.....	3297
2.	Job Training; Change in Supervision	3297
3.	Referral for Counseling.....	3300
F.	AGENCY DEFENSES	3301
1.	Disqualifying Misconduct	3301
2.	Undue Hardship.....	3301
a.	Unreasonable Accommodation	3304
b.	Restrictions in Collective Bargaining Contract	3306
3.	Lack of Qualification for Position.....	3308
a.	Failure to Provide Evidence of Fitness for Position With Medical Standard	3308
4.	Receipt of Disability Annuity.....	3309
5.	Rebuttal	3310
6.	Restriction on Remedy	3310
G.	ALCOHOLISM AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE.....	3310
1.	Necessity for Accommodation: <i>Ruzek</i>	3312
a.	Suitability.....	3313
b.	Postal Service Employee	3314
2.	Notice of Disability.....	3314

a. Agency Request for Information.....	3315
3. Proof of Disease	3315
4. Causal Connection: Misconduct Caused by Disease	3316
a. Alcohol or Drug Use on the Job	3320
b. Revocation of Driver's License	3320
c. Possession of Drugs.....	3321
d. Misappropriation or Theft of Drugs.....	3321
e. Misappropriation of Funds	3321
5. Qualified Disabled Employee; <i>Hougens</i> and Disqualifying Conduct	3322
a. Current Substance Abuser	3325
b. Disqualifying Misconduct: Removal Appropriate.....	3327
c. Less Serious Conduct: Concurrent Rehabilitation, Discipline.....	3332
6. Firm Choice, Last Chance Agreement.....	3334
a. Requirement of Collective Bargaining Contract, Agency Regulation	3337
b. Failed Rehabilitation Attempt.....	3338
7. Undue Hardship	3341
III. AVENUES OF FURTHER REVIEW OF EEO DEFENSES	3342
A. EEOC.....	3342
B. SPECIAL PANEL.....	3343
C. COURT.....	3350
1. Scope of District Court Review.....	3353
a. Effect of District Court Review	3354
b. Time for District Court Review; Tolling or Estoppel; Exhaustion of Remedies	3357
2. Effect of Waiver of EEO Claim	3360

CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....3361

I. OVERVIEW.....	3361
A. SIGNIFICANCE OF DISCOVERY.....	3363
II. TYPES OF PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES	3364
A. WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL.....	3366
1. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012; Retroactivity	3367
2. Statutory Definitions Control	3369
a. "Gross" Waste or Mismanagement	3370
b. Violation of Law, Rule, or Regulation	3377
c. Abuse of Authority	3385
d. Threat to Public Health and Safety.....	3390
e. Disclosure of Censorship Related to Research, Analysis, or Technical Information.....	3416
3. Dispute Over Form of Whistleblowing	3416
a. Disclosure of Potential Harm or Wrongdoing	3416
b. Complaint to Wrongdoer.....	3417
c. Disclosure to Someone Who Cannot Directly Remedy the Problem.....	3420
d. Minor Personal Grievance	3422
e. Internal, Policy Disagreement.....	3422
f. Disclosure Made During Normal Course of Duties.....	3428
g. Required Report Under Office of Government Ethics Rules, E.O. 12675	3440
h. Communication Indirectly Involving the Government; Private Wrongdoing	3440
i. Communication to News Media; Congress.....	3443
j. Disclosure in Court.....	3444
k. Complaint to the Inspector General	3444
l. Disclosure of Information Already Known or Public.....	3445
m. Sequential Allegations	3447
4. Whistleblowing No Shield Against Misconduct.....	3448
a. Abusive Whistleblower; Robust Language; Chain of Command.....	3449
b. Threatened Disclosure.....	3452
5. Personnel Treated as Whistleblowers	3453
a. Individual Perceived as Whistleblower	3453
b. Whistleblower's Aide, Associate.....	3458
c. Individual Serving as Conduit of Information; Internal Disclosure	3459
d. Former Employee	3459
e. Contractor Employee	3459
6. Protected Disclosure: Reasonableness.....	3460

a.	“Reasonably Believes”; False Statement	3460
b.	Motivation of Whistleblower	3466
c.	Information Developed After Disclosure	3466
d.	Belief Shared by Other Employees; Disinterested Observer	3467
e.	Response of Agency to Disclosure	3468
f.	Expertise of Whistleblower	3468
g.	Specificity of Disclosure	3470
h.	Presumed Agency Good Faith; “Irrefragable Proof” Standard	3471
7.	Unprotected Disclosure; Dispute Concerning Coverage of Disclosure Under 2302(b)(8) or 2302(b)(9)	3474
a.	Disclosure Prohibited by Law; Regulation Incorporating Statutory Provision; E.O. 13,526	3477
b.	EEO Complaint	3488
c.	Other Appeals, Charges, FECA Claims, Grievances, and Complaints	3491
8.	Disclosures in Multiple Forums	3495
B.	PROHIBITED PRACTICES OTHER THAN WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL	3498
1.	Discrimination Proscribed by Civil Rights Laws; 5 USC 2302(b)(1)(A)	3498
a.	Sexual Harassment	3498
2.	Improper Personnel Recommendation; 5 USC 2302(b)(2)	3498
3.	Obstruction of Competition; 5 USC 2302(b)(4)	3499
4.	Influencing Employment Decision; 5 USC 2302(b)(5)	3499
5.	Improper Preference, Promotion; 5 USC 2302(b)(6)	3500
6.	5 USC 2302(b)(9); Appeal Right; Grievance, Complaint; OSC and IG Involvement; Refusal to Obey Unlawful Order	3503
a.	WPEA: Exercise of, Testimony or Assistance in, Appeal, Complaint, or Grievance	3509
7.	Discrimination Unrelated to Job Performance; 5 USC 2302(b)(10)	3511
8.	Discrimination Against Veteran; 5 USC 2302(b)(11)	3512
9.	Violation of Merit System Principle; 5 USC 2302(b)(12)	3513
a.	Failure to Provide Effective Training; 5 USC 2301(b)(7); Training for Government Personnel on Whistleblowing Protections	3516
10.	Nondisclosure Agreement; Gag Order; 5 USC 2302(b)(13)	3516
11.	Refusal to Violate Law, Regulation, or Rule	3517
III.	INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION	3519
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS AND LIMITATIONS	3521
1.	Filing a Complaint With OSC	3528
a.	OSC Deferral Policy on EEO Charge	3529
b.	Proceeding to Compel OSC Action	3529
2.	Time for Initiating IRA Appeal With OSC and MSPB	3532
a.	Laches in Filing OSC Complaint	3533
b.	Case That May Be Either Initiated With OSC or Appealed Directly to MSPB	3534
c.	Jurisdiction Limitations of an IRA Rather Than an Adverse Action Appeal	3535
d.	Premature Appeal Following Resort to OSC	3536
e.	Belated Receipt of OSC Closeout Notice	3536
f.	Calculation of Appeal Period; Late IRA Appeal; Waiver	3538
g.	Equitable Tolling	3539
h.	OSC Reopening	3542
B.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUE	3545
1.	<i>Rusin</i> Model: Nonfrivolous Allegations Establish Jurisdiction	3546
a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations Based on the Written Record	3551
b.	Hearing	3553
2.	Jurisdictional Analysis Before <i>Rusin</i>	3553
3.	Variations in Order of Proof; Bifurcation; Necessity to Consider Entire Record	3554
4.	Exhaustion of Remedies; Amendment of Appeal	3564
5.	Election and Preclusion of Remedies	3567
a.	Grievance or MSPB Appeal	3569
b.	IRA Appeal, Direct Appeal of Otherwise Appealable Action Distinguished; Issue Preclusion	3572
c.	EEO Complaint	3575
6.	Collateral Jurisdiction Over EEO Claim Presented in IRA Appeal Not Involving Otherwise Appealable Action	3576
7.	Limited Jurisdiction Over Merits Determination, Collateral Prohibited Personnel Practice, Constitutional, Discrimination, and Harmful Error Claims in Otherwise Appealable Action Initiated Through OSC as IRA	3577
8.	Status of Particular Agencies and Employees	3579
a.	Postal Service	3579
b.	Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee	3580
c.	National Guard Technician	3584

d.	Federal Bureau of Investigation	3588
e.	Judicial Branch.....	3591
f.	Federal Reserve Board	3591
g.	NAF Employee	3591
h.	Independent Counsel	3592
i.	Office of Special Counsel	3592
j.	Federal Aviation Administration	3592
k.	Transportation Security Agency	3592
l.	Intelligence, Counterintelligence Agencies; Foreign National.....	3595
m.	Government Corporation	3598
n.	Other Entities	3599
o.	Experts and Consultants; Personnel Appointed Outside Title 5.....	3599
p.	Lawyer	3601
q.	Former Employee	3601
r.	Inspector General Office	3602
s.	Employee of Agency Other Than the Agency Charged With Reprisal	3603
t.	Private Sector Employee; Applicant for Employment	3604
u.	Uniformed Service	3605
v.	Administrator of Federal Benefits.....	3607
9.	Retroactivity of 1989 Whistleblower Amendments; Continuing Violation	3607
C.	PLEADING REQUIREMENTS.....	3607
1.	Duty of Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	3607
2.	Specificity of Underlying Disclosure; Labeling of Disclosure Not Required	3610
3.	Pleading to OSC.....	3613
a.	Classification or Labeling of Disclosure Not Required	3621
b.	Curative Filing With OSC	3625
c.	Proof of Scope of Complaint Made to OSC; Post-Complaint Submission.....	3625
d.	Information First Submitted With PFR	3629
e.	Serial Complaints to OSC.....	3629
f.	OSC Closeout Letter.....	3629
4.	Pleading to MSPB	3630
D.	COVERED AND EXCLUDED PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	3632
1.	Threatened Personnel Action	3632
a.	Proposed Action; Dispute Arising During Compliance.....	3635
2.	Failure to Take Personnel Action.....	3636
3.	Performance Appraisal; Evaluation of Qualifications or Abilities.....	3638
4.	Awards and Acts Preliminary to Awards	3639
5.	Denial of Within-Grade Increase	3640
6.	Promotion, Appointment.....	3640
7.	Decision Concerning Leave; Change in Duties; Idling; Overtime; Harassment	3641
a.	Degree of Significance of Change of Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions.....	3642
b.	Hostile Environment.....	3643
8.	Reprimand; Admonition; Counseling; Performance Warning; Performance Improvement Period	3643
9.	Suspension	3647
10.	Probationary Termination	3647
11.	Failure to Renew Appointment; Failure to Reinstate	3648
12.	Reassignment, Transfer, and Detail	3648
13.	Fitness Examination; Investigation	3649
14.	Security Clearance Suspension, Revocation; Other Certification	3651
15.	Training	3655
16.	Defamatory Statement; Tort; Arrest; False Allegation; Blacklisting	3656
17.	Reduction in Force.....	3657
18.	Classification Issue	3658
19.	Constructive Adverse Action	3658
20.	Action Affecting Private Sector Employment Opportunity	3662
21.	Other Action.....	3663
E.	REMEDIES	3664
1.	Transfer	3665
IV.	CASES BROUGHT BY OSC	3666
A.	STATUTORY BASES.....	3666
1.	Corrective Action Petition; Stay	3666

2.	Disciplinary Complaint.....	3668
3.	Board Authority in Disciplinary, Corrective Action Case.....	3669
4.	Judicial or Administrative Finding of Discrimination by Federal Employee; 5 USC 1216(a)(5)	3669
5.	Hatch Act; FOIA Violation	3669
B.	SPECIAL COUNSEL OPERATIONS.....	3673
1.	Organizational Structure	3673
2.	Disclosure Unit	3673
3.	MSPB Referral to OSC.....	3674
C.	RIGHT TO COUNSEL IN OSC INVESTIGATION.....	3674
D.	OSC DISCIPLINARY ACTION	3675
1.	Limits on Prosecutorial Authority.....	3675
a.	Employee Who Takes or Recommends Personnel Action.....	3676
b.	Prior Resort to Agency-Employer for Disciplinary Action	3677
2.	OSC Complaint.....	3678
3.	Rights of Employee, Respondent	3679
4.	OSC Subpoena; Discovery Procedures	3679
5.	Hearing by Administrative Law Judge; MSPB Review.....	3679
6.	Disciplinary Penalty.....	3680
E.	OSC CORRECTIVE ACTION PETITION	3685
1.	Regulatory Provisions	3687
F.	LITIGATION WITH OSC.....	3687
1.	Purpose of MSPB Hearing	3687
a.	Obtaining Records	3687
b.	Evidence From Other Investigation	3688
c.	Dismissal of OSC Action	3688
2.	Settlement	3688
3.	Judicial Review in OSC and IRA Cases.....	3688
a.	Stay Pending Judicial Review.....	3689
V.	BURDEN OF PROOF IN REPRISAL CASE	3689
A.	ANALYSIS UNDER WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT	3689
1.	Analysis Required by Judge.....	3689
2.	Statutory, Regulatory Provisions	3690
3.	Contributing Factor Analysis	3690
a.	Order of Proof	3692
b.	<i>Per Se</i> Timing/Knowledge Test	3693
c.	Evidence Other Than Timing.....	3696
d.	Knowledge by Agency Manager of Appellant’s Whistleblowing; Constructive Knowledge; Cat’s Paw.....	3702
e.	Disclosure After the Personnel Action	3708
f.	Settlement Offer	3710
g.	Reprisal Without Unlawful Motivation: Reprisal by Investigation—the Atypical Case; <i>Marano</i>	3710
h.	Charge Arising Out of Conduct During Retaliatory Investigation.....	3719
i.	OSC Corrective Action Case	3721
j.	Otherwise Appealable Action	3722
4.	Agency’s Clear and Convincing Evidence; <i>Carr</i> Factors.....	3722
a.	Constructive Adverse Action.....	3741
5.	Evidence of Reprisal	3742
a.	Strength of Agency’s Case; Probationer; Term Employee.....	3744
b.	Strength of Motive to Retaliate	3748
c.	Comparison Employees	3749
d.	Preliminary Reprisal Leading to Personnel Action	3751
e.	Shifting or Belated Explanations for Agency Action.....	3752
B.	ANALYSIS FOR PROHIBITED PRACTICES NOT COVERED BY WPA, WPEA; VIOLATIONS OF 5 USC 2302(B)(9)	3752
1.	<i>Mt. Healthy</i>	3755
2.	Importance of Untainted Deciding Official	3757
3.	Timing of Action.....	3760
4.	Severity of Charged Misconduct	3760
5.	Discipline Related to Refusal of Reassignment	3761
6.	Reprisal Against Individual Involved in Union Activity	3761
7.	Performance Case	3767
8.	OSC and Agency Disciplinary Case Against Individual Charged With Reprisal	3767
a.	Analysis by Agency Deciding Official.....	3774

C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS	3774
VI.	STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS	3775
A.	STAY THROUGH INDIVIDUAL APPEAL.....	3775
1.	Basis for Stay Sought by Appellant.....	3777
a.	Intervention by OPM.....	3779
2.	Scope of Stay	3779
3.	MSPB Review of Judge's Stay Decision	3779
B.	STAY THROUGH OSC PROCEEDING	3780
1.	Statutory, Regulatory Provisions	3781
2.	Initial Stay.....	3784
a.	Potential for Disruption by Employee's Return to Workplace	3785
b.	Obtaining Clarification of Stay Order	3786
3.	Extension of Stay	3786
a.	Indefinite Stay.....	3789
4.	Proof Supporting Stay Application	3790
5.	Nature of Relief.....	3790
a.	Hostile Environment; Protective Order.....	3791
b.	Restraint on Employee Communication With OSC, Congress.....	3794
6.	Termination of Stay.....	3796
7.	Relation of Stay and Appeal Proceedings	3797
8.	Use of Stay to Protect Other Proceeding.....	3797
a.	EEO Case	3797
b.	Union Rights Under Statute.....	3797
9.	Effect of Prior Settlement Agreement.....	3797
10.	Employees Covered by Stay	3797
a.	SES	3797
b.	Presidential Appointee; Policymaker	3797
c.	At Will Employee	3798
d.	Former Agency Employee.....	3798
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	3798

CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS3799

I.	RETIREMENT.....	3799
A.	OVERVIEW OF THE PRINCIPAL RETIREMENT SYSTEMS.....	3800
1.	Conversions.....	3801
B.	FEDERAL EMPLOYMENT.....	3802
1.	Effect of Reemployment	3804
C.	COVERED AND CREDITABLE SERVICE.....	3804
1.	Service Requirements for CSRS.....	3806
2.	When-Actually-Employed; Seasonal Employee; Leave Without Pay; Part-Time	3808
3.	Indefinite Appointment.....	3809
4.	Temporary Employment.....	3810
5.	Personal Service Contract	3810
6.	Nonappropriated Fund	3816
7.	Others.....	3817
8.	Effect of Military Service; Deposit for Military Service.....	3817
a.	National Guard, Other Uniformed Service	3831
(i)	Abandonment of Civilian Career for Military Service	3833
9.	Period of Receipt of OWCP Benefits	3837
10.	Sick Leave Credit.....	3839
D.	DISABILITY RETIREMENT.....	3839
1.	Statutory, Regulatory Standards.....	3839
a.	Concept of Disability	3841
b.	Cause of Disability	3843
c.	Medical Condition Postdating Disability Retirement.....	3843
2.	Disability Incurred While in the Federal Service.....	3843
a.	Preexisting Condition	3844
3.	Position Last Occupied.....	3844
a.	Qualifying Position.....	3844
4.	Disability Must Continue at Least One Year.....	3845
a.	Possible Future Disability.....	3846

5.	Situational or Transitory Condition; Hostile Environment.....	3847
a.	Workplace Stressor May Be Sufficient.....	3848
b.	Workplace Stressor May Be Insufficient	3848
c.	Alcoholism or Drug Addiction; Inability to Control Condition.....	3850
6.	Partial Disability Does Not Qualify	3850
7.	New Condition Raised With Judge or in PFR; Condition That Should Have Been Considered by OPM.....	3850
a.	Evidence of Progression of Disease Presented in PFR.....	3851
8.	Reassignment in Lieu of Disability Retirement	3851
a.	Adequacy of Position Offered Through Reassignment	3852
b.	Permanent Light Duty Position	3854
c.	Postal Service: Different Craft.....	3858
d.	OWCP Position Suitability Determination	3860
9.	Effect of Disability Accommodation on Annuity Entitlement.....	3861
a.	Conflicting Agency Evidence Concerning Accommodation	3862
10.	Necessity for Cessation of Pay or Separation From the Federal Service.....	3862
11.	One Year for Disability Retirement Application.....	3862
a.	Waiver; Separation for Medical Reason: Notice Not Provided.....	3864
b.	Waiver; Mental Incompetence.....	3867
c.	Technical Constructions Concerning Filing Date: Method of Filing; Filing With Former Agency.....	3871
12.	Agency-Initiated Disability Retirement Application.....	3874
a.	Service Credit Requirement.....	3876
13.	Application After Employee's Death.....	3876
14.	Bar to Concurrent Receipt of Disability Retirement, OWCP Benefit.....	3876
15.	Withdrawal of Disability Retirement Application	3877
16.	Evidence of Disability.....	3878
a.	Scope of Board Review; <i>Chavez</i>	3879
b.	Significance of Position Description, Qualification Requirements	3883
c.	Objective Medical Evidence	3883
d.	Content of Medical Report.....	3884
e.	Lack of Evidence of Precise Medical Causation Not Determinative	3884
f.	<i>Mullins-Howard</i> : Disability Established Without Unduly Detailed Medical Causation Analysis	3887
g.	Subjective Evidence.....	3892
h.	Testimony of Supervisor; Performance Appraisal.....	3893
i.	Hearsay.....	3893
j.	Absence; Use of Leave	3893
k.	Post-Separation Medical Evidence.....	3893
l.	Medical Condition Not Presented to OPM	3895
m.	Removal for Physical Inability to Perform; <i>Bruner; Settlement</i>	3895
n.	Loss of Military Status	3901
o.	OWCP Determination	3901
p.	Social Security Administration Determination	3902
q.	VA Disability Rating.....	3904
r.	Security Clearance Determination	3905
s.	Agency Medical Disqualification	3905
t.	Removal for Misconduct.....	3906
17.	Refusal to Undergo Diagnostic or Other Procedure.....	3907
a.	Possible Improvement Through Future Surgery	3908
18.	Specific Conditions	3908
19.	Earnings Recovery	3908
a.	Current Rate of Pay	3910
b.	Basic Pay; Cost of Living Adjustment	3911
c.	Bonus	3912
d.	Miscellaneous Income	3912
e.	Business Expense.....	3913
f.	Pension Contribution.....	3913
20.	Decline of Earnings.....	3913
a.	Discontinued Service Annuity Upon Recovery of Earning Capacity	3913
21.	Conversion From Disability to Optional Retirement	3914
22.	Conversion From Optional to Disability Retirement	3914
23.	Rescission of Disability Retirement Grant	3914
24.	Recovery From Disability: Burden of Proof	3915

a.	Restoration of Annuity.....	3916
25.	Calculation of Annuity.....	3917
26.	Loss of Annuity for Certain Offenses.....	3918
E.	LUMP SUM DEATH BENEFITS.....	3919
1.	Submission of Designation.....	3926
2.	Child Who Qualifies to Receive Lump Sum Payment.....	3929
3.	Other Distributions.....	3930
a.	Slayer Statute.....	3930
4.	Time for Application.....	3930
F.	SURVIVOR ANNUITIES.....	3931
1.	Eligibility of Employee for Retirement as Condition to Annuity.....	3933
2.	Application for Annuity.....	3933
3.	Time, Method of Election.....	3934
a.	Effect of Remarriage After Retirement.....	3935
b.	Notice to Annuitant of Necessity to Notify OPM of Remarriage to Secure Annuity.....	3936
c.	Delay in Notice to OPM of Annuity Election.....	3937
d.	Lack of Proper Notice From OPM Concerning Annuity Election.....	3938
e.	Incorrect Information From Employing Agency Concerning Annuity Election.....	3949
f.	Annuity Election Form; Signature; Submission.....	3951
g.	Effect of Mental Incompetence on Timeliness of Election.....	3952
h.	Authority to Act on Behalf of Incompetent Employee to Create Annuity.....	3954
i.	Employee Mentally Incompetent to Make Adverse Election.....	3954
j.	Community Property Interests.....	3955
4.	State Law Defines Marital Status; Common Law Marriage; Qualifying Widow.....	3957
a.	Current Spouse; Duration of Marriage; Widow: Issue of Marriage; Children.....	3958
b.	Accidental Death.....	3959
c.	Putative Spouse.....	3959
5.	Calculation.....	3961
a.	Survivor Annuity Based on Disability Annuity.....	3961
b.	Health Benefits.....	3963
c.	Social Security Benefit Offset—CSRS.....	3963
d.	Social Security Benefit—FERS.....	3964
6.	Consent of Spouse to Waiver of Survivor Annuity.....	3965
a.	Consent by Current Spouse to Discontinue Survivor Annuity.....	3972
b.	Attempt to Modify Amount of Spousal Survivor Annuity.....	3973
c.	Consent by Current Spouse for Former Spouse Annuity.....	3974
7.	Marriage of at Least Nine Months; Parent of Issue by Marriage; Exceptions.....	3974
8.	Survivor Annuity for Child Incapable of Self-Support.....	3975
a.	Children in School.....	3981
G.	DISCONTINUED SERVICE ANNUITY.....	3982
H.	LAW ENFORCEMENT RETIREMENT.....	3991
1.	Process of Determining and Appealing LEO Status.....	3991
2.	Agency Head Determination; Timeliness of Request for LEO Status.....	3993
3.	Substantive Criteria for LEO Determination.....	4003
a.	Customs and Border Patrol Officers.....	4013
b.	Decisions Before 2000.....	4016
4.	Evidence Considered.....	4020
5.	Supervisory Credit.....	4023
6.	Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4026
I.	FIREFIGHTER RETIREMENT.....	4027
J.	AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLER RETIREMENT.....	4035
K.	OTHER ANNUITY INTERESTS.....	4035
1.	Deferred Annuity.....	4035
2.	FERS Minimum Retirement Age Annuity.....	4036
3.	Supplemental, Redetermined Annuity.....	4037
4.	Alternative Form of Annuity.....	4040
5.	Voluntary Early Retirement Authority.....	4043
L.	APPORTIONMENT OF ANNUITY BY COURT ORDER.....	4044
1.	Lifetime Annuity.....	4044
2.	Former Spouse Survivor Annuity.....	4045
a.	Intent to Create Former Spouse Survivor Annuity or Other Benefit.....	4046

b.	Reduction in Lifetime Annuity.....	4048
c.	Wording of Decree	4049
d.	Ambiguous Provision in Divorce Decree; Extrinsic Evidence; Rules of Construction	4051
3.	Challenge to Court Order Affecting Annuity Interest.....	4055
a.	Qualifying Court Order.....	4056
b.	Amendment to Court Order Affecting Former Spouse Annuity; Construction of Annuity Interest Following Ineffective Amendment	4066
c.	Bifurcated Decree.....	4078
d.	Spouse Equity Act of 1984 as Amended	4081
M.	ANNUITY CALCULATION ISSUES.....	4083
1.	Estoppel as Basis to Create, Continue, or Adjust Benefit or Overpayment	4084
2.	Refund.....	4086
3.	Redeposit	4092
a.	Personal Service Agreement	4094
4.	High Three Salary Calculation: Basic Pay; Lump Sum Back Pay Settlement.....	4095
5.	Onset of Disability Annuity Payment.....	4098
6.	VA Medical Professional; VA Benefit Reduction.....	4100
7.	Annuity Reduction for VA Employees Removed for Certain Performance or Misconduct.....	4101
8.	Law Enforcement Enhanced Annuity Rate	4101
9.	Minimum, Maximum Annuity	4101
10.	Annuity Allotment.....	4101
11.	Impact of Receipt of Medicare Benefits, Social Security on CSRS, FERS.....	4102
12.	Deposit for Post-1956 Military Service	4104
13.	Deposit for Creditable Service; Annuity Supplement.....	4105
14.	Interest.....	4105
15.	Taxes.....	4106
16.	Cost of Living Adjustment for Reinstated Annuity	4106
17.	Diversion of Annuity Payment.....	4107
18.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4107
19.	Individual Retirement Record.....	4107
20.	Reconstructing Employment Record.....	4110
N.	OVERPAYMENTS.....	4110
1.	Proving the Debt; Evidence Supporting Waiver; OPM Records	4111
2.	Basis for Waiver	4112
a.	Annuitant Without Fault and Recovery Against Equity and Good Conscience	4114
b.	Knowledge of Overpayment; Set-Aside Rule	4116
c.	OPM Fault in Creating Overpayment	4117
d.	Unconscionability of Recovery; Recovery Delay	4118
e.	Financial Hardship.....	4122
f.	Adjustment of Repayment Schedule; Length of Recovery	4123
g.	Ordinary and Necessary Living Expenses; Future Events.....	4124
h.	Assets Available to Satisfy Overpayment; Income/Expense Margin.....	4125
i.	Detrimental Reliance.....	4126
j.	Age of Debt.....	4130
k.	Calculation of Overpayment; Interest	4130
l.	Recovery Schedule Adjustment When There Is No Annuity Entitlement	4131
m.	Collection From Survivor for Debt of Original Annuitant	4131
n.	Insurance Issue Related to Overpayment.....	4134
O.	OFFSETS; DEBT COLLECTION FROM ANNUITY	4136
II.	RESTORATION RIGHTS UPON RECOVERY FROM OCCUPATIONAL INJURY OR ILLNESS.....	4141
A.	SEPARATION OR FURLOUGH MUST RESULT FROM COMPENSABLE INJURY	4144
1.	Separation for Reason Other Than Result of Injury or Illness.....	4146
a.	Factual Determination on Cause of Separation	4153
b.	Termination When OWCP Determination Supports Employee's Refusal to Return to Work.....	4155
c.	AWOL Covered by Period of Compensation.....	4157
d.	Effect of Resignation	4157
e.	Separation by Settlement Agreement.....	4158
B.	SIGNIFICANCE OF OWCP DETERMINATION; RECEIPT OF COMPENSATION	4158
1.	Requirement of Medical Examination.....	4162
C.	MEANING OF "RECOVERY"	4163
1.	Fully Recovered Within a Year	4164

2.	Fully Recovered After a Year	4166
a.	Priority Consideration: Necessity for Position to Be Filled by Another Person.....	4169
b.	Geographic Extent of Consideration	4171
c.	Method, Duration of Priority Consideration	4171
3.	Partially Recovered	4172
a.	Geographic Extent of Consideration: Local Commuting Area.....	4176
b.	Arbitrary or Capricious Restoration Effort	4180
c.	Accommodation Requirement.....	4182
d.	Postal Service National Reassessment Process; Realignment of Employees; <i>Latham</i>	4183
e.	Other Postal Service Limited Duty Restoration Decisions	4195
f.	Discontinuation of Modified Assignment	4196
4.	Physically Disqualified Employee	4197
a.	Geographic Extent of Consideration	4198
D.	PARTICULAR GROUPS OF EMPLOYEES	4198
1.	Probationer.....	4199
2.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4199
3.	Postal Service.....	4200
4.	Nonappropriated Fund	4203
E.	WHEN RESTORATION IS TO OCCUR	4203
1.	Light Duty	4205
2.	Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4205
F.	TIME TO APPLY FOR RESTORATION	4207
1.	Form of Restoration Request	4208
G.	REMEDY.....	4208
1.	Same or Equivalent Position	4209
a.	Return to <i>Status Quo</i>	4210
b.	Interim Promotion.....	4211
2.	Regraded Position.....	4211
3.	Seniority Inapplicable.....	4211
4.	Priority Placement Program	4212
5.	Benefits Upon Restoration.....	4213
H.	MSPB APPEAL RIGHTS.....	4219
1.	Time for Appeal.....	4219
a.	Lack of Notice of Appeal Right	4219
b.	Settlement	4221
2.	Burden of Proof; Jurisdictional Allegations	4221

CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....4223

I.	ENTITLEMENT STANDARDS	4223
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS FOR FEES	4223
1.	Use of Counsel; Licensure.....	4224
2.	Governing Statutes and Regulation	4227
a.	Civil Rights Statutes	4228
b.	Whistleblower Protection Act	4228
3.	Jurisdiction Over Action Under Appeal	4229
4.	Miscellaneous Appeals	4229
a.	Regulation Review Proceeding	4229
b.	Retirement Appeal.....	4229
c.	OSC Case: Prohibited Personnel Practice and Hatch Act Litigation	4230
d.	Sanction	4238
B.	PREVAILING PARTY STATUS	4238
1.	Mitigation.....	4240
2.	Other Relief.....	4241
3.	Must Prevail Through MSPB Procedures.....	4242
a.	Mixed-Motive Determination	4243
4.	Cancellation of Action Appealed.....	4244
a.	Enforcement Proceeding Mooted by Agency Action	4250
5.	Settlement	4253
a.	Prevailing Party Status Through Settlement	4253
b.	Relief Through Settlement Must Be Related to MSPB Appeal.....	4255
c.	Interest of Justice Criteria	4255

d.	Jurisdiction to Accept and Enforce Settlement Providing for Fees or Supporting Fee Motion	4256
C.	INTEREST OF JUSTICE: AN OVERVIEW	4260
1.	<i>Allen</i> Criteria	4260
a.	Financial Hardship.....	4261
2.	Preservation of Claims Supporting Entitlement; Significance of Final Merits Decision	4261
a.	Overlapping Fee Entitlement Standards	4262
3.	Statutory Examples Not Exclusive	4262
D.	BAD FAITH	4262
1.	Malicious Action; Inadequate Inquiry	4263
2.	Disparate Treatment.....	4263
3.	Action Reversed but Some Charges Sustained.....	4263
4.	Unreasonable Litigation Tactics; Failure to Settle.....	4263
a.	Frivolous PFR	4263
5.	Compliance	4264
E.	CLEARLY WITHOUT MERIT OR WHOLLY UNFOUNDED	4264
1.	Failure to Adhere to Legal Precedent.....	4265
2.	Inadequate Initial Inquiry Into Facts	4265
3.	Lack of Legitimate Basis for Agency Action	4266
a.	Development of Dispositive Information During Appeal.....	4266
4.	Mitigation	4266
5.	Factual Dispute	4266
6.	Performance Appeal	4268
7.	Retirement Appeal.....	4268
a.	Legal Error by OPM	4272
b.	Incorrect Advice From OPM	4272
c.	Issue of Mental Incompetence	4272
F.	KNEW OR SHOULD HAVE KNOWN	4275
1.	Lack of Reasonable Inquiry	4275
2.	Disregard of Legal Precedent	4276
3.	Regulatory Error.....	4276
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4277
5.	Performance-Based Action	4277
6.	Mitigation	4277
a.	Not All Charges Sustained	4280
7.	Negligent Presentation of Case	4281
8.	Decision of Another Tribunal	4281
9.	Retirement Appeal	4281
a.	Failure of OPM to Evaluate Evidence Available During Reconsideration Process	4281
b.	Legal Error by OPM	4284
10.	Settlement	4284
G.	GROSS PROCEDURAL ERROR.....	4285
1.	Denial of Advance Notice or Appeal Right	4287
a.	Involuntary or Constructive Adverse Action	4288
b.	Enforced Leave	4288
c.	Indefinite or Emergency Suspension	4290
2.	Mitigation.....	4290
3.	Performance-Based Action.....	4290
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4290
H.	SUBSTANTIALLY INNOCENT.....	4291
1.	<i>Yorkshire</i>	4293
2.	MSPB Treatment of <i>Yorkshire</i>	4293
3.	Appellant Who Ensnares the Agency	4295
4.	Mitigation: <i>Boese, VanFossen</i>	4295
a.	Factually Close Case.....	4299
b.	Prior Law	4299
5.	Performance-Based Appeal	4300
6.	Other Legal Error	4300
I.	OTHER AUTHORITY FOR FEE AWARDS	4300
1.	Back Pay Act	4300
a.	Postal Service Employee	4301
2.	Equal Access to Justice Act	4302

a.	Administrative Law Judge Case	4305
b.	Basis for Compensating Court Time	4306
c.	Prevailing Party	4306
d.	Substantial Justification	4311
e.	Basis for Awarding MSPB Time	4314
f.	Hourly Rate; <i>Pro Bono</i> or Contingent Representation; COLA; Expenses	4315
g.	Procedure; Time for Filing; Application	4317
h.	Application to MSPB Cases	4318
3.	Civil Rights Case	4318
a.	Result Achieved	4321
4.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Case	4322
5.	USERRA; VEOA	4323
6.	Other Bases for Fee Claims; Equitable Assessment of Fee	4325
II.	PROCEDURES FOR OBTAINING FEES	4325
A.	HOW FEES ARE INCURRED	4325
1.	Attorney-Client Relationship; Fee Payment	4325
a.	Law Clerk, Paraprofessional; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant.....	4325
2.	Union Counsel	4326
a.	Demise of the Cost-Plus Formula.....	4326
b.	History of the Cost-Plus Rule	4329
c.	Repayment of Fees to Union Required	4330
3.	Federally Employed Attorney	4330
4.	Public Interest Organization	4330
B.	COMPENSABLE SERVICES	4330
1.	Work Performed Before Final Adverse Action or Other Decision	4331
2.	Research	4333
3.	Discovery	4333
4.	Settlement, Mediation.....	4333
5.	PFR	4333
6.	OPM Reconsideration Petition	4334
7.	Time in Court	4335
a.	Appropriate Charge for Court Time	4338
b.	Practice Notes	4338
8.	Preparation of Fee Motion	4339
9.	Defense of Fee Motion	4339
10.	Enforcement Proceeding.....	4339
11.	Related Proceeding	4344
a.	MSPB	4346
b.	Grievance	4346
c.	Privacy Act	4346
d.	Unemployment Compensation	4346
e.	Criminal Case	4347
f.	EEO Complaint.....	4348
g.	Media Contact; Congressional Activity.....	4349
12.	Anticipated Time; Supplemental Petition	4349
13.	Unsuccessful Claim, Issue, or Defense	4349
a.	<i>Hensley</i>	4350
b.	Mitigation.....	4356
c.	Tangentially Related Issue	4357
d.	Clearly Separate Claim	4358
e.	Unsuccessful EEO Claim	4358
f.	Unsuccessful Whistleblower Claim	4359
C.	REASONABLENESS OF FEES.....	4360
1.	Hourly Rate.....	4361
a.	Evidence of Reasonableness; Fee Agreement; Result Achieved	4362
b.	Initial Decision in Another Appeal; Decision of Another Tribunal	4369
c.	Settlement	4369
d.	Out-Of-Town Counsel	4369
e.	Travel Time	4370
2.	Contingency Arrangement, Enhancement; <i>City of Burlington</i>	4370
a.	Early Treatment by MSPB of Contingent Adjustments	4373

b.	Enhancement for Payment Delay; Interest	4373
c.	Enhancement for Quality Work	4375
d.	Enhancement for Wear and Tear	4377
e.	Traditional Contingency Agreement; Fee Cap	4377
3.	<i>Laffey</i> Matrix	4378
4.	Below Market Rate	4384
5.	Reasonableness of Time Invested	4387
a.	Responsibility of Judge	4387
b.	Articulated Analysis Required	4390
c.	Notice to Counsel of Defect in Fee Motion	4391
d.	Expertise and Diligence of Counsel; Likely Outcome	4392
e.	Time at Hearing	4392
f.	PFR	4392
g.	<i>Amicus</i> Brief	4393
h.	Time Preparing Attorney Fees Motion	4393
i.	Consolidated Appeals	4393
j.	Multiple Counsel; Duplicative Work.....	4393
k.	Clerical, Secretarial Work	4396
6.	Examples of Fee Awards	4397
a.	Rates	4397
b.	Amounts	4397
D.	COSTS AND EXPENSES.....	4398
1.	Transcript.....	4399
2.	Photocopy; Electronic Production	4399
3.	Travel	4399
4.	Secretarial Expense.....	4400
5.	Postage; Courier	4400
6.	Fee for Expert, Consultant	4400
7.	Investigator	4400
8.	Accounting Expense	4401
9.	Telephone or Facsimile	4401
10.	Electronic Research	4401
11.	Taxes	4401
12.	EEO, Whistleblower Protection Act, USERRA, and VEOA Cases; Broader Coverage.....	4402
13.	Direct Recovery of Costs by Appellants	4402
E.	FEE MOTION	4404
1.	Who May File	4406
2.	Time and Place of Filing	4406
a.	Premature Motion	4407
b.	Timing of Agency Response	4407
c.	Late Motion	4407
3.	Motion Must Be Complete When Filed	4411
a.	Incomplete Motion	4411
4.	Developing Evidence to Support Motion	4412
a.	Hearing Concerning Fee Entitlement in Settled Appeal	4412
b.	Hearing and Discovery Concerning Reasonableness	4413
5.	Format of Motion	4413
a.	What to Include.....	4414
b.	Fee Agreement	4415
c.	Itemization of Time	4415
d.	Retrospective Reconstruction of Time	4416
6.	Supplemental or Corrected Motion	4417
7.	Unopposed, Moot, or Settled Motion.....	4417
8.	Service of Motion	4417
9.	Opposition to Motion	4418
10.	Initial Decision on Motion.....	4418
a.	Obligation of Judge to Ensure Due Process	4418
b.	Requirements of Addendum Initial Decision	4418
c.	Initial Decision Controls Basis for Fee Determination	4419
d.	Change in Judge	4420
e.	Hourly Rate Analysis.....	4420

11. Waiver of Fee Through Settlement Agreement	4420
a. Effect of Settlement on Claims of Multiple Counsel	4422
12. Settlement of Fee Claim	4422
13. Payment of Fee to Counsel and Client	4424
a. Payment to Counsel	4424
b. Repayment of Fee by Counsel to Client	4424
14. PFR of Fee Decision	4425
a. Interim Fee	4425
b. Time Spent on PFR	4425

CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT4427

I. SETTLEMENT.....	4427
A. ELEMENTS OF SETTLEMENTS	4427
1. Settlement Resources; Mediation Appeals Program.....	4429
2. Minimum Requirements	4429
a. Hatch Act Case.....	4430
3. Settlement After Initial Decision	4430
4. Regulatory Process	4430
5. Filing, Acceptance of Settlement for Enforcement	4431
a. Intent That Agreement Be Subject to MSPB Enforcement Authority	4432
b. Unfiled Settlement	4434
c. Oral Advice of Settlement	4435
d. Specific Oral Settlement Agreement Entered Into the Record	4437
e. Distinguishing Oral Agreement and Ongoing or Incomplete Negotiation	4441
f. Oral Agreement to Be Followed by Written Agreement	4445
g. Appellant’s Understanding of Agreement	4446
6. Jurisdiction to Accept Settlement: <i>Delorme</i>	4447
a. Prior Law	4448
b. Settlement Arising From Disputed Last Chance Agreement.....	4452
7. Flexibility, Scope of Settlement	4453
a. Incomplete Settlement; Omitted Terms	4453
8. Conditional Settlement; Lapsed Offer; Implied Term	4455
9. Settlement Requiring Specific Action by Judge	4457
10. Integration or “Zipper” Clause	4458
11. Modification, Amendment of Agreement.....	4462
12. Waiver of Statutory Right; Release	4462
a. Unemployment Compensation	4464
b. Workers’ Compensation	4465
c. Older Workers’ Benefit Protection Act	4465
d. RIF Benefit	4474
e. Limitation on the Right to Seek Future Federal Employment	4474
13. Retirement Benefit.....	4474
14. Settlement Provision Affecting Other Agencies	4475
15. OSC Case	4476
B. SETTING ASIDE A SETTLEMENT	4476
1. Agreement Challenged as Invalid; Use of PFR	4477
2. Timing of PFR.....	4479
3. Bases for Setting Aside a Settlement	4480
a. Threat of Unwarranted Action; Duress	4482
b. Hardship.....	4484
c. Disappointment; Confusion	4484
d. Lack of Understanding	4485
e. Mental Incapacity; Stress	4485
f. Time Pressure.....	4488
g. Coercion or Bias by Judge	4489
h. Coercion by Counsel or Union Representative; Lack of Signature by Counsel	4493
i. Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative—Agreement Sustained	4495
j. Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative— <i>Bona Fide</i> Challenge to Agreement	4499
k. Error or Lack of Authority of Government Counsel.....	4502
l. Fraud; Misrepresentation; Bad Faith; Merit of the Underlying Action	4504

m. Mutual, Unilateral Mistake	4509
n. Lack of Mutual Assent	4516
o. Lack of Consideration	4518
p. Incorrect Information From the Agency Concerning Retirement Eligibility	4519
q. Provision Unlawful or Contrary to Public Policy	4519
r. Change in Law	4524
4. Unfiled Settlement Agreement; Preappeal Settlement	4525
5. Collateral Attack on Settlement Through New Appeal	4527
6. Breach of Settlement: Election Between Rescission or Enforcement.....	4528
a. Agency May Rescind	4529
b. Restoration of Consideration Received; “Tender Back”	4529
c. Enforcement Petition to Rescind Settlement	4532
II. APPELLATE REMEDIES	4532
A. REMEDIAL AUTHORITY	4533
1. Statutory Basis for Remedial Authority	4533
2. OPM Regulation	4533
3. Collateral Result of Restoration Order; Action Related to Case Under Appeal	4533
a. Effect on Remedial Order of Decision of Another Tribunal	4538
b. Reversal of Criminal Conviction	4538
B. BACK PAY AND RELATED REMEDIES.....	4539
1. Necessary Findings.....	4539
2. Pay Entitlement: Ready, Willing, and Able to Work	4540
3. Maximum Recovery Period.....	4545
a. Liability for Event Preceding Adverse Action	4546
4. Method of Payment	4546
5. Method of Calculation.....	4546
6. Reinstatement With No or Limited Pay; Time-Served or Other Suspension; Shortened Notice Period	4547
a. After Acquired Evidence	4548
7. Loss of Security Clearance.....	4548
8. Bonus or Award; Differential; Relocation Expense	4549
9. Premium, Overtime, Holiday Pay.....	4551
a. Overtime for Postal Service Employee	4555
10. Interest—Back Pay Act	4556
a. Interest—Postal Service Employee	4560
11. Insurance Benefit.....	4561
12. Retirement, TSP Contribution or Loan.....	4561
13. Leave Account; FMLA; Military Leave	4566
14. Leave Restoration for MSPB, Related Proceedings; Compensatory Time; Official Time	4569
15. Interim Promotion; WIGI; Pay Increase	4572
16. Applicant for Employment	4575
17. Federal Aviation Administration Employee.....	4576
C. DUTY TO MITIGATE BACK PAY THROUGH INTERIM EMPLOYMENT	4576
1. Employee Other Than Postal Service	4576
2. Postal Service Employee.....	4576
D. DEDUCTIONS FROM BACK PAY	4578
1. Retirement, TSP Contribution	4579
2. Debt to Retirement Fund	4580
3. Annuity Entitlement or Adjustment.....	4581
4. Union Dues; Insurance; Medicare.....	4581
5. Taxes; Increased Taxes	4586
6. Unemployment, OWCP, Workers’ Compensation	4588
7. Interim Earnings; Job Search, Relocation Cost; Replacement Earnings; Retirement Income; Fraudulent Earnings Information	4591
8. Other Deductions	4594
E. RETRAINING	4594
F. REEMPLOYMENT RIGHT.....	4594
G. PURGING OF RECORDS; MODIFICATION OF DOCUMENTATION, PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL.....	4595
1. Coding of Personnel Document	4598
2. Adjustment to AWOL Charge.....	4598
H. DAMAGES; REGULATION GOVERNING RECOVERY	4600
1. Availability of Compensatory Damages	4602

2.	Awards of Compensatory Damages—Civil Rights Acts.....	4607
a.	Effect of Receipt of FECA and Insurance Benefits on Recovery of Compensatory Damages	4616
3.	Consequential Damages and Costs—Whistleblower Case.....	4617
4.	Compensatory Damages—Whistleblower Case.....	4627
5.	Damages Under VEOA, USERRA.....	4631
6.	Monetary Relief for Prohibited Personnel Practices Not Covered by the WPA or EEO Law.....	4632
7.	Punitive Damages	4635
8.	Taxation of Damages, Attorney Fees.....	4636
I.	NONTRADITIONAL REMEDIES	4636
1.	Waiver of Debt.....	4637
2.	Apology; Evidence Destruction	4637
3.	Protection Against Intervening Event	4637
a.	Protection Against Future Event	4637
4.	Front Pay.....	4637
5.	Equitable Relief; Other Remedies.....	4637
III.	ENFORCEMENT.....	4639
A.	ENFORCEMENT OF MSPB DECISION	4639
1.	Authority to Order Compliance; Sanctions.....	4641
a.	Sanction Against Agency	4641
2.	Limitation on Enforcement Authority to Award Back Pay or Monetary Remedy	4642
a.	Mootness	4644
b.	Burden of Proof; Proof of Compliance	4645
3.	Enforcement Procedure	4646
a.	Enforcement Petition Regulation, Guidance	4647
b.	Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	4649
c.	Agency Request for Extension of Time.....	4653
d.	Duty to Supply Information; Accounting.....	4653
e.	Unclear or Impossible Compliance	4655
f.	Evidence of Compliance; Statement of Intent; Representative’s Statement.....	4655
g.	Hearing.....	4656
h.	Discovery	4657
i.	Referral to Comptroller General	4658
j.	Multiple Enforcement Petitions; <i>Res Judicata</i>	4658
k.	Analysis by Judge	4660
l.	Evidence Supplied After Decision of Judge	4660
m.	MSPB Review of Initial Decision on Enforcement Petition	4660
4.	Allegation of Reprisal, Bad Faith, Discrimination, or Harassment	4663
a.	Discipline Related to Agency Noncompliance	4663
b.	Performance Appraisal Dispute	4664
5.	Back Pay Dispute	4664
a.	Delay in Payment.....	4666
b.	Damages.....	4667
6.	Reinstatement to the Same Position; <i>Status Quo Ante</i> Remedy	4667
a.	Medical Limitation	4671
b.	Administrative Leave	4672
c.	Effect of Retirement.....	4673
d.	Obligation Under Collective Bargaining Contract	4673
e.	Other Post-Reinstatement Action; Medical Certification Requirement.....	4673
f.	Postal Service Reorganization.....	4674
g.	Security Clearance Problem.....	4675
h.	Demotion	4677
i.	Term or Temporary Appointment.....	4685
j.	Seniority Adjustment	4686
k.	Pay System Change	4686
l.	Insurance	4686
m.	Other Working Conditions	4687
7.	Compelling Reason for Reassignment; Detail; Different Duties.....	4688
a.	Replacement Employee	4688
b.	Placement on Administrative Leave Pending Subsequent Removal Attempt.....	4689
c.	Detail or Other Variation of Permanent Position.....	4689
d.	Reasons Related to Original Action.....	4690

e. Overriding Interest.....	4690
8. Reinstatement With Accommodation for Disability	4697
9. Lack of Authority to Enforce Compliance.....	4701
10. Sovereign Immunity Issue.....	4701
B. ENFORCEMENT AND INTERPRETATION OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	4701
1. Scope of Enforcement Authority	4704
a. Only Filed Settlement May Be Enforced	4704
b. Allegation of Discrimination; Whistleblowing Reprisal	4705
c. Damages.....	4707
2. Agency Enforcement Initiative	4707
a. Appellant’s Agreement to Resign or to Take Other Action; Agency Self Help	4708
b. Agreement Not to Reapply for Employment With Agency	4709
c. Agreement to Withdraw EEOC Case or Other Litigation	4710
3. Agreement That Appellant First Notify Agency of Noncompliance Allegation	4710
a. Agreement That the Parties Attempt to Adjust Disputes Under the Settlement.....	4711
4. Election Between Enforcement and Rescission; Pleading in the Alternative	4712
a. Modification of Settlement Provision	4713
5. Role of MSPB Regional or Field Office	4714
a. Treatment of Enforcement Issue; Evidence on PFR	4714
6. Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	4714
a. Reasonableness of Timing of Enforcement; Laches Defense	4719
7. Burden of Proof	4721
a. Evidence Required	4725
b. Mutual Breach; “Clean Hands”	4725
8. Interpretation and Application of Settlement: Legal Principles	4727
a. Materiality of Breach	4728
b. Good Faith Required; Bad Faith.....	4733
9. Reprisal or Harassment	4737
a. Foreclosure of Future Discipline or Other Agency Action for Past Conduct.....	4740
b. Time for Compliance if None Set in Settlement Agreement	4743
10. Interpretation of Agreement: External Law; Extrinsic or Parol Evidence; Ambiguous Term; History of Performance; Hearing.....	4745
a. Back Pay, Other Obligation; Omitted Term.....	4750
b. Amendment to Agreement; Counterproposal	4752
11. Specific Settlement Provisions	4753
a. Term of Art	4753
b. Obligation to Reinstatement or Restore to Duty; Precondition to Restoration.....	4753
c. Agreement to Reassign; Work Schedule Change; Light Duty Position; Duration of Agency’s Commitment	4755
d. Employee May Be Terminated or Will Resign or Retire on Specified Condition; Agreement Not to Reapply	4757
e. Promotion, Placement Consideration; Priority Consideration	4759
f. Agreement to Provide Affirmative, Neutral, or Controlled Reference	4763
g. “Clean Record” or “Clean Paper”; Expungement or Withdrawal of Record; Implied Requirement; NDAA; Executive Order 13,839.....	4771
h. Nondisclosure or Confidentiality Clause.....	4787
i. “Need to Know” Exception to Confidentiality Clause.....	4794
j. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act Provision.....	4798
k. Waiver of Protection of Confidentiality or Affirmative Reference Provision	4799
l. Damages Unavailable for Breach of Clause Requiring Affirmative Reference, Other Violations	4800
m. Adjustment of Performance Appraisal, Documentation.....	4801
n. Agreement to Provide Assistance to Employee	4803
o. Agreement to “Cancel” Action; Back Pay, Interest, Damages, or Other Entitlement; Bonus or Award; Lump Sum Provision	4803
p. Annuity Issues	4808
q. Unemployment Compensation	4813
12. Debt Recoupment	4813
13. Settlement Reached in Another Tribunal	4814
14. Settlement Involving Action of Third Party	4814
15. Privacy Act Issue	4815
16. Provision That Violates Collective Bargaining Contract.....	4815
17. Unlawful Provision	4815
C. INTERVENING ABOLITION OF POSITION; SUBSEQUENT ADVERSE ACTION DURING ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDING ...	4817

CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....4821

I. OVERVIEW OF THE APPELLATE PROCESS	4821
A. NATURE OF THE DECISION UNDER REVIEW	4821
1. Final Decision.....	4821
a. Denial of Request for Reopening.....	4823
b. Collateral MSPB Order.....	4826
c. Decision Remanding Case to Judge	4826
2. Statutory Basis for Review; CSRA and Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012	4828
3. Proper Parties in Court; Standing; Mootness	4829
a. Proper Respondent in Court	4830
b. OSC Disciplinary Case	4834
c. Arbitration Award	4835
4. Authorization to Appeal	4835
5. <i>Amicus</i> Submission	4835
6. Counsel Authorized to Appear in Appeal; Federal Circuit Admission.....	4835
7. Government Appellate Review Request; Cross-Appeal.....	4835
a. Review Request by OPM	4836
b. Discrimination Issue	4837
8. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit.....	4838
a. Nonprecedential Decision.....	4839
b. Summary Affirmation	4840
c. Court Practice	4841
d. <i>Pro Se</i> Appeal	4844
e. Stay Pending Court Review.....	4845
9. Record Below	4845
a. Appendix	4846
b. New and Material Evidence	4847
B. SCOPE OF REVIEW	4847
1. Arbitrary and Capricious.....	4848
2. Issues of Law, Jurisdiction; Contract Interpretation; Constitutional Issues	4848
a. Decisional Rationale Omitted by MSPB; Departure From Precedent	4850
3. Procedural Error by MSPB.....	4851
a. Ruling on Witnesses and Evidence	4852
b. Ruling on Discovery	4853
c. Timeliness of MSPB Filing	4854
4. Substantial Evidence; Factual Dispute.....	4855
a. Credibility	4859
b. Nexus	4863
5. Agency Rule of Conduct.....	4863
6. Penalty Determination	4863
a. Performance Action.....	4868
7. Reduction in Force	4868
8. Whistleblower Reprisal: Circuits Other Than the Federal Circuit	4868
C. DEFERENCE; INTERPRETATION OF STATUTES, REGULATIONS, LABOR AND OTHER CONTRACTS	4869
1. Agency Statutory Interpretation	4869
a. Regulation Applying Statute; Agency Interpretation of Regulation	4871
2. Agency Handbook, Instruction	4876
3. MSPB Decision	4877
4. Principles of Statutory and Regulatory Interpretation	4877
a. Language Controls.....	4879
b. Consideration of the Statutory Scheme	4881
c. Avoidance of Absurd Consequences	4882
d. Statements of Legislators	4882
e. Amendment; Failure to Amend.....	4882
f. Retroactivity	4882
g. Change in Law	4886
5. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract	4886
6. Settlement; Last Chance Agreement	4888
D. RETIREMENT AND ANNUITY APPEALS	4889
1. Disability Retirement	4891
2. Optional Retirement	4895

E.	DISCRIMINATION ISSUES	4895
1.	Reprisal.....	4898
2.	Procedural Problem.....	4900
3.	Jurisdictional Issue; Constructive Adverse Action; <i>Perry</i>	4900
4.	Timeliness, Procedural Issue; <i>Kloeckner</i>	4907
5.	Review of Board Decisions That Include EEO Defenses or Both EEO and Whistleblower Reprisal Defenses.....	4913
6.	Counsel Fee Award, Application	4915
7.	Transfer To and From District Courts.....	4916
8.	District Court Review	4917
a.	Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies	4917
b.	Summary Adjudication of EEO Issues; Disposition of Civil Service Issues	4918
c.	Scope of Review	4920
d.	Compliance With District Court Decision	4920
9.	Discharge of Probationer	4920
F.	REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS.....	4922
1.	Mixed Case.....	4924
2.	Time for Seeking Review	4930
3.	Decisional Standards for Arbitrator	4931
a.	Arbitrability	4935
b.	Bargaining History	4936
c.	Past Practice.....	4936
4.	Attorney Fees Award.....	4938
5.	Review Sought by OPM	4939
6.	Award Involving Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee	4940
7.	Award Involving Nonappropriated Fund Instrumentality Employee.....	4941
8.	Award Reviewed by Federal Labor Relations Authority.....	4942
G.	VEOA, USERRA CLAIMS.....	4942
II.	PREREQUISITES FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW	4943
A.	TIME FOR INITIATING JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	4943
1.	Equitable Tolling	4947
B.	EXHAUSTION OF MSPB ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES	4951
1.	Issue Must Be Raised With the MSPB	4951
a.	Exception to Exhaustion Requirement	4953
2.	Necessity for PFR to MSPB.....	4954
a.	Challenge to Settlement.....	4956
3.	Ripeness for Judicial Review	4956
4.	Mandamus.....	4958
III.	JUDICIAL REMEDIAL AUTHORITY	4958
A.	AUTHORITY TO REMAND	4958
1.	Remand to Effect Settlement	4959
2.	Judicial Control of MSPB Procedures	4960
B.	AUTHORITY TO TRANSFER	4960
C.	SANCTIONS	4960
1.	Examples of Sanctionable Conduct	4963
IV.	JUDICIAL RELIEF OUTSIDE THE REFORM ACT	4964
A.	PARTIES TO THE SUIT	4969
1.	Sovereign Immunity.....	4969
2.	Absolute Immunity.....	4969
3.	Qualified Immunity.....	4969
a.	Action Against Union	4969
B.	SUITS BASED ON STATUTE AND CONSTITUTION	4970
1.	Administrative Procedure Act	4970
a.	Use of the APA	4970
b.	Scope of Review; Preclusive Effect of the Reform Act	4971
c.	Scope of Relief	4974
2.	Privacy Act; FOIA	4974
a.	Scope of the Act	4976
b.	Enforcement of the Act	4976
c.	Use of the Privacy Act	4976
d.	Position Classification	4977
3.	Mandamus Act	4977

a.	Position Classification	4978
4.	Tucker Act	4981
a.	Position Classification	4986
b.	Overtime Pay Claim	4987
c.	Environmental Differential, Hazard Pay, Travel Pay	4988
d.	Claims Concerning Tenure, Contract Employment, Promotion, and Bonuses	4990
e.	Whistleblower Reprisal Claim	4994
f.	Claims Based on Constitution	4996
g.	EEO Settlement	4997
h.	MSPB Settlement	4999
5.	Federal Tort Claims Act	5002
6.	Back Pay Act	5003
a.	Implied Preclusion Under the CSRA	5006
b.	Promotion Claim	5007
7.	Family Medical Leave Act	5007
8.	Overtime, Pay Statutes	5008
9.	Unfair Labor Practice	5010
10.	Constitution	5010
a.	Property Interest	5011
b.	Liberty Interest; Name Clearing Hearing	5012
(i)	Termination of Probationer, Others	5014
c.	First Amendment	5015
11.	Injunction Action	5017
C.	ACTIONS FOR DAMAGES AGAINST INDIVIDUALS AND GOVERNMENT; <i>BIVENS</i>	5023
1.	Preclusion in the Circuits	5028
a.	D.C. Circuit	5028
b.	First Circuit	5031
c.	Second Circuit	5031
d.	Third Circuit	5031
e.	Fourth Circuit	5031
f.	Fifth Circuit	5032
g.	Sixth Circuit	5032
h.	Seventh Circuit	5033
i.	Eighth Circuit	5034
j.	Ninth Circuit	5034
k.	Tenth Circuit	5035
l.	Eleventh Circuit	5036
2.	Claims Based on State Law; Westfall Act; Federal Tort Claims Act; Defamation; Tort Action Arising From Assault; No FEAR Act	5036

CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....5045

I.	RESEARCH AND REFERENCES	5045
II.	FORMS	5046

BIBLIOGRAPHY5067

TABLE OF CASES5075

INDEX5229