

SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE	i
GLOSSARY	iii
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY.....	863
CHAPTER 3: HEARING.....	1301
CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE.....	1449
CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW.....	1603

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS	1869
CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND PENALTY DETERMINATION.....	2281
CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....	2425
CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES	2869
CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....	2991
CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....	3133
CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION	3311

VOLUME III

CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....	3575
CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS.....	4071
CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....	4527
CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT	4743
CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	5157
CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....	5415
BIBLIOGRAPHY	5437
TABLE OF CASES	5445
INDEX	5613

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE	i
GLOSSARY	iii
CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION.....	1
I. REFORM ACT.....	1
A. CAPSULE HISTORY	1
B. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL	4
II. MSPB ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATION.....	5
A. IMPARTIAL ADJUDICATION.....	6
1. <i>De Novo</i> Review of Agency Actions	7
a. Deference to OPM Regulations	7
b. Consideration of Agency Regulations	8
2. Prohibition Against Advisory Opinion; Internal Guidance; Request for Advisory Opinion	8
B. ORGANIZATION	9
1. Clerk.....	11
2. Office of Appeals Counsel	11
C. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGES	14
1. Delegations of Authority	16
a. Administrative Law Judges Adjudicating Specialized Cases	17
b. <i>Judges' Handbook</i> ; Internal Guidance	17
2. Qualifications, Performance Standards for Administrative Judge.....	17
a. Judges' Position Description, Performance Standards	17
b. Regional Director (Chief Administrative Judge) Position Description and SES Performance Plan	19
3. Regulatory Responsibilities of Judge.....	20
a. Waiver of Procedural Regulations	20
4. Quality Review	21
D. BOARD DECISIONS; PRECEDENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE.....	21
1. Nonprecedential Decisions, Final Orders	22
2. Arbitration Award.....	23
3. Sensitive, Public Interest Appeal	23
4. Referral to OPM, OSC	23
E. MSPB RECORDS	23
1. Gaining Access; Review Procedure	27
2. Precluding Access	27
a. Sealing of Record or Files.....	27
b. Attempt to Preclude Publication of Decision	30
c. Expungement of Record	31
d. Redaction of Initial Decision.....	31
e. Classified Information	31
F. RULEMAKING PETITIONS	32
G. RESPONSIBILITY OF PARTIES IN MSPB CASES	33
III. JURISDICTIONAL OVERVIEW.....	33
A. SOURCES OF JURISDICTION	35
1. Original Jurisdiction Cases.....	36
2. Appealable Actions	36
a. Adverse Action	37
b. Performance-Based Action	37
c. Demonstration Project	38
3. Jurisdiction Through Agency Regulation	39
B. PRELIMINARY APPELLATE JURISDICTIONAL ANALYSIS	39
1. Lack of Jurisdiction; Failure to State a Claim	40
IV. EMPLOYEES WHO MAY APPEAL; APPEALABLE ISSUES	41
A. NATURE OF CIVIL SERVICE APPOINTMENTS	43
B. CONCEPTS COMMON TO DEFINITION OF "EMPLOYEE" FOR COMPETITIVE AND EXCEPTED SERVICE.....	43
1. Current Continuous Service	44

a.	Break in Service	45
b.	Effect of Grievance or Other Settlement; Collective Bargaining Contract.....	49
c.	Service During Detail or in Acting Position.....	49
d.	Period of Non-Pay Status	50
2.	Not Serving a Probationary or Trial Period Under an Initial Appointment.....	50
3.	Counting Service Time in a Prior Position or Appointment; <i>McCormick</i>	51
a.	Time in Nonpermanent Appointment as a Component of Current Continuous Service.....	57
C.	COMPETITIVE SERVICE EMPLOYEES	63
1.	Other Than a Temporary Appointment Limited to One Year or Less.....	65
D.	EXCEPTED SERVICE EMPLOYEES.....	66
1.	1990 Civil Service Due Process Amendments; Nonpreference Eligible Employees.....	67
a.	Excepted Service Employees Excluded From Due Process Amendments; Statutory Appointment Discretion.....	68
2.	Preference Eligible Status.....	75
a.	Documentation.....	80
b.	Disabled Veteran.....	81
c.	Derivative Preference Eligible Status.....	82
3.	Same or Similar Position	84
a.	Factual Dispute Concerning Similarity of Positions	91
b.	In an Executive Agency	93
4.	Appointment Pending Conversion to Competitive Service	97
E.	PROBATION OR TRIAL PERIOD.....	100
1.	Probationary Classification Issues.....	100
a.	Appointment From Register.....	101
b.	Transfer.....	102
c.	Reassignment; Promotion.....	103
d.	Temporary Appointment Pending Establishment of a Register (TAPER).....	103
e.	Career Reinstatement	103
2.	Department of Defense	107
3.	Calculating Year of Service.....	107
a.	Incorrect Determination of Duration of Probation	108
b.	Effective Time and Date of Inexplicit Termination Notice.....	113
c.	Significance of SF-50; Unclear Appointment Date	113
d.	WAE Appointment	115
e.	Military Service	115
4.	Tacking of Prior Service: Competitive Service Probation.....	116
a.	Same Agency	122
b.	Same Line of Work.....	123
5.	Agreement to Serve Probationary Period; Waiver of Preexisting Appeal Right	126
6.	Imposition of Probation Following Break in Service	128
7.	Creation of Probationary Period Not Required by Statute or Regulation.....	129
8.	Representation by Agency That Probation Is Not Required; Equitable Estoppel	130
9.	Lack of Notice of Probationary Period	132
F.	APPEAL RIGHTS OF PROBATIONER.....	132
1.	Appeal of Probationary Termination.....	134
a.	Actions Other Than Termination.....	135
2.	Classification of Probationers and Their Appeals	135
a.	Competitive Service Term Appointee; Trial Period	135
b.	Probationary Supervisor	136
3.	Jurisdictional Issue; Right to Hearing.....	141
a.	Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract; Agency Regulation	143
b.	Other Contract.....	144
c.	Harmful Error Analysis; <i>Stephen</i>	144
d.	Relation to Suitability Determination	146
4.	Preappointment Conditions	150
a.	Harmful Error Analysis: Lack of Proper Advance Notice, Other Procedural Error	150
b.	Entitlement to Hearing.....	155
c.	Measure of Substantive Review	156
5.	Postappointment Reasons.....	156
a.	Pre- and Postappointment Distinctions.....	156
6.	Defective or Untimely Termination Notice	162
a.	Termination by Unauthorized Official.....	165
7.	Discrimination and Partisan Politics.....	166

a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations	166
b.	Partisan Political Reason	167
c.	Marital Status	169
d.	Other Discrimination.....	176
8.	Constitutional Claim	177
9.	Involuntary Resignation.....	178
G.	LOSS OF APPEAL RIGHTS BY CHANGE IN POSITION.....	179
1.	Movement Between Positions in Same Agency; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation.....	179
a.	Movement to Position Through Settlement Agreement	187
2.	Movement From One Agency to Another; Transfer; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation	187
H.	TEMPORARY AND TERM APPOINTMENTS	190
1.	Competitive Service Temporary, Term Appointees.....	194
2.	Excepted Service Preference Eligible Temporary Appointees	199
3.	Excepted Service Nonpreference Eligible Temporary Appointees.....	199
4.	Particular Temporary or Irregular Schedule Appointments.....	200
a.	TAPER	200
b.	Seasonal; On-Call	200
c.	Intermittent	204
d.	Full-Time/Part-Time.....	205
e.	Postal Service Light Duty.....	205
f.	Indefinite Appointment	205
5.	Jurisdictional Effect of Lapse of Term or Temporary Appointment	206
6.	Appeal Right if Termination Occurs Before End of Expiration of Limited Appointment.....	207
I.	PARTICULAR APPOINTMENTS.....	208
1.	Nonappropriated Fund	208
2.	Veterans Readjustment Act	209
3.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	214
a.	Exceptions.....	217
4.	Senior Executive Service.....	218
5.	Administrative Law Judge.....	218
6.	Disabled Employee.....	218
7.	Employees in Confidential, Policy-Making, Policy-Determining Positions; Presidential Appointee.....	222
a.	White House, Executive Office of the President Employees	225
b.	Schedule F Positions.....	226
8.	Alien; Noncitizen	229
9.	Students.....	229
a.	Federal Career Intern Program	230
b.	Student Temporary Employment Program; Recent Graduates Program; Student Career Experience Program.....	236
10.	Judicial Branch	238
11.	Government Corporation.....	239
12.	Postal Service.....	240
a.	One Year of Qualifying Service; Current Continuous Service in Same or Similar Position	244
b.	Postal Supervisors, Managers	249
c.	Postal Personnel Officials, Confidential Employees	255
d.	Postal Service Employees Who Lack Preference Eligibility, Have No Negotiated Grievance Procedures, and Who Are Neither Managers Nor Personnelists	261
13.	Contractors	263
14.	Stafford Act.....	263
15.	Others.....	265
J.	AGENCIES WITH SPECIALIZED PERSONNEL SYSTEMS: MSPB JURISDICTIONAL EXCLUSIONS AND MODIFICATIONS.....	266
1.	Department of Homeland Security	266
a.	Human Resources Management System's Rise and Demise	266
b.	Transportation Security Agency: Screeners; Other Employees	266
(i)	Probationer	269
(ii)	Other TSA Employees.....	270
c.	RIF.....	274
2.	Federal Aviation Administration.....	274
a.	2012 Legislation Restoring Back Pay Authority as a Component of MSPB Jurisdiction	277
b.	2000 Legislation Restoring MSPB Jurisdiction; Back Pay Issues	278
c.	1996 Legislation Removing MSPB Jurisdiction.....	286
3.	Department of Defense National Security Personnel System	286
4.	District of Columbia	286

5.	Central Intelligence Agency; Defense Department Intelligence; Other Intelligence or Security Agencies.....	287
6.	Federal Bureau of Investigation	288
7.	Canal Zone.....	289
8.	National Archives	289
9.	National Guard Technicians.....	289
10.	Tennessee Valley Authority Employees.....	293
11.	Library of Congress; GAO; Congressional Employees.....	294
	a. Ramspeck Act	294
12.	Smithsonian Institution	294
13.	Bureau of Indian Affairs.....	295
14.	MSPB Employees	295
15.	Department of Veterans Affairs.....	295
	a. USERRA Coverage.....	308
	b. Actions Against Healthcare Professionals Not Involving Professional Conduct or Competence.....	309
	(i) Involuntary Retirement, Resignation.....	310
	c. Veterans Canteen Service.....	313
16.	Agriculture: Stabilization and Conservation Service; Cooperative Extension Services	315
17.	Department of Defense Education Activity.....	315
18.	Office of Independent Counsel.....	316
19.	Foreign Service.....	316
20.	World Bank	317
K.	NATURE OF PERSONNEL ACTION APPEALED.....	317
	1. Possible Adverse Action; Proposal	317
	2. Suspension	318
	a. Paper Suspension	318
	b. Consolidation of Short Suspensions.....	318
	c. Calculating Duration of Suspension.....	320
	d. Erroneous Imposition of Suspension Exceeding 14 Days.....	320
	e. Indefinite Suspension	321
	3. Position Change.....	322
	a. Rank Reduction	323
	b. Nonselection	323
	c. Loss of Earnings Opportunities; Change in Work Schedule.....	325
	d. Disciplinary Reassignment; Unified Penalties; Reassignment Leading to Reduction in Pay.....	326
	4. Pay and Benefits; Classification; Debt; Leave	328
	a. Classification	328
	b. Pay System Conversion; Grade Reduction.....	330
	c. Correction of Pay, Grade	335
	d. Reduction in Pay; Locality Pay Issue; Failure to Obtain Pay Increase	341
	e. Misrepresentation Concerning Pay Rates.....	345
	f. Termination of Premium Pay; Bonus; LEAPA; Seniority, Overtime Adjustments	346
	g. Retirement Credit, Contributions, and Incentives; Individual Retirement Record.....	352
	h. Debt Collection, Recoupment, Retirement Funds: Agency, OPM Involvement.....	353
	i. Leave Dispute; Administrative Leave; Notice, Investigation Leave	357
	j. Pay and Compensation Claims: Role of OPM	361
	5. Severance Pay.....	361
	6. Promotion Claim.....	361
	a. Termination of Temporary Promotion	362
	b. Loss of Promotion Opportunities	365
	c. Lower Graded Position Through Return Right—Overseas Employee.....	366
	7. Back Pay Dispute	367
	a. Retirement Payment.....	367
	8. Resignation.....	367
	a. Abandonment of Position	367
	9. Mandatory Retirement.....	369
	10. OWCP Benefits	369
	11. Insurance Programs.....	371
	12. Requests for Reinstatement: Non-Military Personnel.....	377
	a. Failure to Rehire	377
	b. Reinstatement Rights—Occupational Illness or Injury; Others.....	377
	13. Performance Standard; Rating; PIP	378
	14. Miscellaneous Actions.....	378

L.	NATURE OF STATUTORY VIOLATION ALLEGED	379
1.	Prohibited Personnel Practices; Discrimination	379
2.	Merit System Principles Violations	382
3.	Constitutional Violation	383
M.	EFFECT OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING CONTRACT GRIEVANCE OR RELATED PROCEDURES; 5 USC 7121	388
1.	Postal Service Employees.....	391
a.	Effect of EEO Allegation or EEO Complaint.....	393
2.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714.....	393
3.	Administrative Grievance System	394
4.	Statutory Grievance System; Foreign Service Grievance Board	394
5.	Employee Choice: Adverse Action; Performance Case.....	394
6.	Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity	395
a.	Appeal Right With EEO Allegation.....	396
b.	USERRA Claim	399
c.	RIF.....	403
d.	Acceptable Level of Competence Determination; Within-Grade Increase.....	405
7.	Problems Arising From Choice of Collective Bargaining Contract Procedure	405
a.	Incorrect or Inadequate Notice From Agency.....	405
b.	Dispute Over Bargaining Unit Status or Arbitrability; Ineffective Elections; Cross-Filing; Withdrawal of Grievance.....	407
c.	Defunct Union	410
d.	Union Action on Behalf of Employee	412
e.	What Constitutes Filing of Grievance	414
f.	Premature Elections.....	415
g.	Belated Grievance	416
h.	Failure to Obtain Arbitration Hearing	416
8.	Indefinite Suspension.....	419
9.	Appeal Right With Arbitration Award; Employees of Agencies Other Than Postal Service	420
10.	Unfair Labor Practice Charge	421
N.	GRADE AND PAY RETENTION	422
1.	<i>Atwell</i>	425
a.	Restoration Action	426
2.	Absence of Retention; Benefits Declined	427
3.	Appeal of RIF; Classification.....	428
4.	Termination of Pay Retention	430
V.	APPEAL RIGHTS BASED ON MILITARY SERVICE AND VETERANS PREFERENCE.....	430
A.	REGULATIONS GOVERNING USERRA, VEOA CLAIMS.....	435
B.	JUDGE'S RESPONSIBILITY.....	437
C.	HEARING ENTITLEMENT; BOARD DISPOSITION.....	438
D.	EXCLUSIVITY OF VEOA OR USERRA APPEAL; JOINDER OF CLAIMS.....	442
E.	UNIFORMED SERVICE EMPLOYMENT AND REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT	442
1.	USERRA Statutory Structure	447
a.	Related EEO Violation; Prohibited Personnel Practice Allegation.....	452
b.	Affirmative Defense	455
2.	Time for USERRA Appeal	455
a.	Laches.....	457
b.	Waiver of Right to Appeal.....	458
3.	Permissive Exhaustion of Labor Department Remedy.....	460
a.	Referral to OSC.....	463
4.	Liberal Pleading Standard.....	463
a.	Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegations	469
b.	Summary Disposition of Claim	471
5.	Burden of Proof.....	471
a.	Analysis of Alleged Discrimination or Reprisal Based on Military Service	476
b.	Reprisal Against the Exercise of USERRA Rights.....	481
c.	Circumstantial Evidence; Statistics.....	483
d.	Preselection	486
e.	Discrimination Motivated by Lower-Level Supervisor; Cat's Paw	487
f.	Disability Incurred While in Military Service; Use of Leave for Disability.....	489
g.	Disparate Impact Theory Inapplicable.....	490
h.	Reprisal.....	492
6.	Recovery Period.....	492

a.	Nonretroactive Substantive Application.....	494
b.	Vietnam Era Veterans’ Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974.....	497
7.	Covered Personnel; Agencies	498
a.	Contractor Employee	503
b.	Relatives of Service Members	505
8.	Military Restoration Rights	505
a.	National Guard USERRA Discrimination and Restoration Claims.....	509
b.	Length of Service Before Loss of Restoration Right	514
c.	Conditions of Discharge From Military Service	514
d.	Effect of Release From Service for Disability.....	515
e.	Delay in Requesting Restoration Following Military Service.....	518
f.	Elimination of Position Through RIF	519
9.	Other Personnel Action, Benefits; Damages	520
a.	Dismissal From Employment; Demotion; Abandonment of Civilian Career.....	520
b.	Constructive Adverse Action.....	527
c.	Suspension.....	527
d.	Failure to Appoint.....	528
e.	Failure to Consider Employee for Vacant Positions; Nonpromotion; Manipulation or Abolition of Positions.....	534
f.	Denial of Priority Consideration.....	538
g.	Performance Appraisal; References	538
h.	Noncompetitive Promotion; Bid Assignment; Escalator Principle; Interim Promotion.....	539
i.	Reassignment	546
j.	Retirement Benefits	546
k.	Education Benefits	547
l.	Military Leave; <i>Butterbaugh</i>	547
m.	Charge to Leave	556
n.	Differential Pay	556
o.	Harassment; Hostile Working Environment; Remedy	557
p.	Change in Employment Status; Reemployment; Benefits Following Restoration to Duty.....	562
q.	Ready Reserve Status	570
F.	VETERANS EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES ACT	571
1.	Statutory Structure	574
a.	Definition of Agency	575
b.	Burden of Proof	577
c.	Related EEO Violation, Prohibited Personnel Practice, Other Challenges.....	577
2.	Covered Personnel.....	578
a.	Training Status.....	581
b.	Disabled Veteran.....	583
3.	Student, Intern Recruitment Programs	583
a.	Federal Career Intern Program	583
b.	Outstanding Scholar Program	591
c.	Pathways, Recent Graduates Program	598
4.	Particular Agencies; Positions.....	603
a.	Postal Service	603
b.	Foreign Service	605
c.	Nonappropriated Fund	607
d.	Public Health Service.....	608
e.	Statutory Exclusions	608
f.	VA Medical Professionals	608
g.	FAA, TSA Employees	609
h.	National Guard Technicians	611
i.	Title 10 Intelligence Position	611
5.	Time for VEOA Appeal	613
6.	Mandatory Exhaustion of DOL Remedy; Time for Complaint	613
a.	Specificity Required for DOL Complaint	619
b.	Equitable Tolling of DOL Time Limit; Waiver of Administrative Exhaustion Requirement.....	620
c.	Effect of Settlement Reached by DOL.....	632
d.	Termination of Proceedings to Pursue Case in Court.....	632
7.	Liberal Pleading Standard.....	632
8.	Basis for Veterans Preference	635
a.	Excepted Service Position; “Positive Factor”; Attorneys.....	637

9.	Application of Veterans Preference to Appointment Process.....	651
a.	Necessity for Application.....	652
b.	Appointment Through Reinstatement.....	653
c.	Impact of Collective Bargaining Contract.....	653
d.	Background Investigation.....	655
e.	Failure to Provide Proper Veterans Preference.....	655
f.	Improper Appointment Authority.....	657
g.	Manipulation of Appointments; Cancellation of Vacancy.....	658
h.	Geographic Extent of Competition.....	667
i.	Category Rating System.....	667
j.	Rule of Three.....	671
10.	Qualifications for Position; Exclusion From Consideration; Consideration of Experience; Multiple Referral Certificates.....	672
a.	Education.....	683
b.	Time-In-Grade.....	685
c.	Medical Fitness.....	686
d.	Age Limit on Appointment.....	687
e.	Consideration for Position but Nonselection; Limitation on Consideration Imposed by the Applicant.....	692
f.	Improper Assessment of Qualifications.....	694
11.	Appointment and Promotion Processes Challenges.....	696
a.	Competitive Appointment Procedures; Exceptions to Competitive Requirements; Expedited Hiring for Acquisitions Positions.....	696
b.	Merit Promotion With Internal Candidates Only; Reassignment; Reinstatement.....	702
c.	Merit Promotion, Open to External Candidates; Canceled Announcement; "Right to Compete" Claim.....	705
d.	Position Announced Under Both Open Competition and Merit Promotion Procedures.....	717
e.	Veterans Readjustment Act Appointment.....	722
12.	Remedial Structure; Reconstruction of Selection Process; Removal of Selectee.....	724
a.	Passover.....	738
b.	Mootness; Review of Agency-Initiated Reconstruction Effort.....	742
13.	Damages, Other Benefits.....	744
14.	Disciplinary Case.....	749
15.	Reassignment; Transfer.....	749
16.	Retirement Benefit.....	750
VI.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATION.....	751
A.	APPELLATE PROCEDURES.....	757
B.	APPLICATION TO COMPETITIVE SERVICE APPOINTEES.....	757
1.	Employees Serving in Probationary or Trial Periods.....	758
C.	SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS BY AGENCIES OPERATING UNDER AUTHORITY DELEGATED BY OPM.....	758
1.	Evidence of Material, Intentional False Statement, or Deception or Fraud.....	761
2.	Constructive Suitability Determination.....	763
3.	Nonselection for Position; Constructive Suitability Determination Under Delegated Authority.....	764
a.	Decisions Under OPM Regulations Predating 2008.....	772
4.	Impact of 2008 OPM Suitability Regulations.....	779
D.	ADJUDICATION STANDARDS.....	780
1.	Mitigation; EEO Defenses.....	783
2.	Disparate Treatment.....	783
3.	Rehabilitation.....	783
E.	EVIDENCE.....	784
1.	Collateral Estoppel; <i>Res Judicata</i>	785
F.	BASES FOR SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS.....	786
1.	Falsification of Employment Document.....	787
2.	Drug Involvement.....	788
3.	Criminal or Dishonest Conduct.....	788
4.	Other Problems.....	789
G.	REMEDIES.....	789
1.	Mootness.....	791
H.	RELATION OF SUITABILITY AND PASSOVER DETERMINATIONS.....	791
I.	RELATION OF OPM-DIRECTED SUITABILITY REMOVAL AND ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL RIGHTS, MITIGATION ANALYSIS; <i>AGUZIE</i> ; 2015 LEGISLATIVE MODIFICATION.....	793

VII. OPM REGULATION REVIEW; CHALLENGES TO AGENCY IMPLEMENTATION OF OPM REGULATIONS; CHALLENGES TO OPM EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES.....	806
A. REGULATION AND REGULATION IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW PROCEDURES.....	806
1. General Criteria for Regulation Review and Regulation Implementation Review.....	807
a. Distinction Between Regulation Review, Implementation Review.....	811
2. Pleading Requirements; Scope of Review.....	812
a. Discretionary Review; Likelihood of Success.....	813
b. Likelihood of Harm.....	813
c. Likelihood Issues Will Be Addressed in a Different MSPB Appeal or a Different Forum.....	814
d. Standing; “Interested Person”.....	815
e. Covered Personnel Action.....	816
3. Examples of Regulation Review.....	816
a. Administrative Law Judge Examination Authority.....	816
b. SES Reassignment, Work Schedule.....	816
c. Administration of Leave.....	818
d. OPM Qualification Standards.....	818
e. Scope of Administrative Grievance Procedure.....	819
f. Other Issues.....	819
4. Examples of Regulation Implementation Review.....	821
a. SES Performance Appraisal Dispute.....	822
B. EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE CHALLENGES.....	823
1. Time and Place for Filing Appeal.....	829
2. Agency Misapplication of Valid OPM Requirement; Agency Employment Practices; Nonselections.....	830
3. Standing to Raise Challenge.....	835
4. General Characteristics of Tests Rather Than Individual Examination Results.....	837
5. Failure to Hire.....	838
6. Scope of Competition.....	839
7. Position Qualification Standard; Educational Requirement.....	840
8. Medical and Physical Qualification Requirements.....	845
9. OPM Involvement in Agency Selection.....	847
10. Selection and Examination Practices for Administrative Law Judges.....	849
a. Rule of Three.....	855
11. Passover Determination.....	857
12. Time-In-Grade Restriction.....	859
13. Eligibility Rating and Suitability Determination.....	860
14. Failure to Promote.....	860
15. Remedy.....	861
VIII. CHALLENGES TO ADVERSE PERSONNEL RECORDS NOTATIONS.....	861

CHAPTER 2: APPEAL AND DISCOVERY 863

I. INITIATING AN APPEAL.....	863
A. RULES AND PRACTICES OF GENERAL APPLICATION GOVERNING APPEALS.....	863
1. Dates of Filing.....	863
2. Service of Pleadings.....	863
3. Filing Regulation; Electronic Filing; Technical Difficulties.....	864
4. MSPB Processing of Appeal.....	870
B. TIME FOR FILING APPEAL.....	871
1. Treatment of Timeliness Issues.....	872
2. Jurisdiction or Timeliness as Alternate Bases for Dismissal of Appeal.....	873
3. Time to Appeal; Regulatory Provisions; Computation of Time.....	875
a. Allegations of Discrimination—Mixed Case.....	876
b. Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure.....	876
c. Computation of Time.....	877
d. Technical Constructions.....	877
e. Request for Extension of Time to Appeal.....	878
4. Suspension Appeal.....	879
a. Indefinite Suspension; Enforced Leave.....	879
5. Individual Right of Action Appeal.....	883
6. USERRA Appeal.....	883
7. Negative OPM Reconsideration Decision Appeal.....	884
a. Failure to Seek Timely Reconsideration; Requests to Extend Time to Request Reconsideration.....	888

b.	Belated Receipt of Reconsideration Decision	893
c.	Relation Between Scope of Reconsideration Request and Appeal.....	894
d.	Failure of OPM to Act on Reconsideration Request; Failure of OPM to Advise of Reconsideration Right.....	894
e.	Overpayment Determinations.....	899
8.	Law Enforcement Officer Retirement Credit Appeal.....	900
9.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714; Mixed Cases; Equitable Tolling.....	901
a.	Hybrid Employees	905
C.	METHOD AND PLACE OF FILING	908
1.	Method of Filing	908
a.	Mail	908
b.	Significance of Postmark: Presumptive Filing Date.....	909
c.	Significance of Actual Mailing Date; Mailstream Rule: Actual Filing Date	909
d.	Commercial Delivery.....	909
e.	Facsimile	910
f.	Personal Delivery.....	910
g.	Electronic Filing.....	910
2.	Irregular and Misdirected Filings.....	911
a.	Appeal To or From Congressional Office.....	911
b.	Misfiled Mixed Case Appeal.....	911
c.	Non-Mixed Appeal Filed With Employing Agency	914
d.	Appeal Misdirected Within MSPB, to OPM, or to OSC	915
e.	Incomplete Appeal	915
D.	PREMATURE APPEALS	915
1.	Abeyance Arrangement.....	916
2.	Premature Appeal That Ripens Into Appealable Action During Regional Adjudication or During PFR.....	917
3.	Retirement Appeal.....	919
4.	Mixed and Whistleblowing Cases.....	921
E.	TIMELINESS OF APPEALS	921
1.	Judge's Responsibility to Provide Notice Concerning a Timeliness Issue	922
a.	Mental or Physical Illness; <i>Lacy</i> Notice	925
b.	Duty of Appellant to Produce Evidence Concerning Timeliness.....	926
c.	Duty of Agency and Judge to Produce and Develop Evidence Concerning Timeliness	927
2.	Waiver of Time Limit for Appeal; <i>Alonzo</i>	930
a.	Prejudice to Respondent; <i>Laches</i>	933
b.	Current Law on Waiver; Multifactor Analysis.....	933
c.	Historical Position on Waiver.....	939
d.	Retirement Appeals.....	940
3.	Application for Waiver	941
a.	Due Diligence	942
4.	Collective Bargaining Contract Stay Provision; Postal Service Employee; Agency-Initiated Stay.....	943
5.	Hearing Entitlement On Timeliness Issue.....	944
F.	JUSTIFICATION FOR LATE FILING.....	947
1.	Sickness or Hospitalization	947
a.	Supporting Evidence.....	948
b.	Mental Impairment.....	949
c.	Effect of Continuing Mental Disorder on Filing Deadline.....	951
2.	Substitute Employment, Travel, or Other Activities.....	953
3.	Military Service.....	953
4.	Incarceration; Criminal Proceeding	956
5.	Need to Obtain Documentation.....	956
6.	Need to Obtain Counsel	957
7.	Unfamiliarity With MSPB Procedures and Law; Ambiguous Agency Communications	958
a.	Language Difficulties	958
b.	Miscalculation of Time for Appeal	959
8.	Lack of Notice of Appeal Rights.....	960
a.	Failure to Provide Notice.....	960
b.	Belated Receipt of Adverse Action Decision.....	966
c.	Constructive Receipt of Decision Notice.....	967
d.	Proof Concerning Delivery of Notice of Appeal Right.....	970
e.	Notice of Appeal Right to Appellant's Representative.....	970
f.	Appellant's Responsibility When Decision Notice or Information About Appeal Rights Is Not Received	971

g.	Constructive Adverse Action; Notice if Agency Learns of Employee's Protest	972
h.	Constructive Adverse Action Without Notice of Employee's Protest to Agency	974
	(i) <i>Jones, Krizman and Beyond</i>	981
i.	Agency on Notice but Fails to Provide Appeal Rights; Secondary Information Concerning Appeal Rights	985
j.	Adverse Action or Performance-Based Appeal Arising From Last Chance or Other Settlement Agreement	986
k.	Lack of Notice Concerning Restoration and Reemployment Appeal Rights	988
l.	Enforced Leave	992
m.	Prior or Subsequent Notice of Filing Deadline	992
n.	Agency Misrepresentation	993
o.	Threats by Agency Personnel	995
p.	Mixed Case Notice Problems	995
q.	Problem With or Delayed Receipt of Domestic, Certified, or International Mail, or Commercial Delivery; Address Change	997
9.	Appeal Lost in the Mail	1003
10.	Facsimile Problems	1006
11.	Electronic Filing Problem	1006
12.	Problem Caused by Adjudicators; Misdirected Appeal	1006
	a. MSPB	1006
	b. EEOC; Agency EEO Processes	1007
	c. OPM	1007
13.	Uncertainty as to Outcome of a Related Case; Pending Settlement Negotiations or Investigation; Case Taken to Court	1008
	a. Grievances	1009
	b. Mediation Request	1009
14.	Inadequate Representation	1010
	a. Delay Not Excused	1010
	b. Delay Excused; Counsel's Delay Balanced Against Appellant's Best Efforts; Retirement Cases	1012
	c. Delay Excused; Obstruction or Misrepresentation by Counsel	1015
	d. Delay Excused; Inconsequential Delay by Representative	1018
15.	Other Problems	1019
G.	TIME FOR RAISING NEW APPELLATE ISSUES AND CLAIMS	1020
	1. Issues and Defenses	1020
	a. Liberal Construction of Pleadings; Issues Raised at Hearing	1020
	b. EEO Affirmative Defenses	1020
	2. Additional Appealable Action	1021
H.	MOOT, WITHDRAWN, AND WAIVED APPEALS	1021
	1. Mootness of Appeal	1021
	a. Cancellation of Action Appealed	1022
	b. Restoration of <i>Status Quo Ante</i>	1024
	c. Initiation of New Action Based on Events Leading to Canceled Action	1031
	d. Procedure Followed if Action Not Completely Rescinded	1032
	e. Procedure Following Remand to Judge	1033
	f. Settlement Independent of MSPB Appeal	1033
	g. Complete Relief Through Other Means; Stay of Pending Litigation	1043
	h. Collateral Issues Following Rescission of Action; Claims for Attorney Fees or General Damages; Interest	1044
	i. EEO Allegation; Claim for Compensatory Damages	1044
	j. Whistleblower Protection Act: Claims for Damages, Other Relief	1047
	k. Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act	1053
	l. Criminal Conviction	1055
	m. Consecutive Adverse Actions	1055
	n. OPM Rescinds Reconsideration or Final Decision; Overpayment Recovery; Withdrawal of or Additional Retirement Application; Disputed Retirement Calculations	1055
	o. Administrative Law Judge Complaint	1062
	p. Other Problems	1062
	2. Effect of Retirement on Appealable Action	1063
	a. Effect of Cleansing Personnel File When Removal Is Accompanied by Retirement; Effect of Claim for Damages	1071
	b. Resignation or Retirement Before Termination	1075
	c. Reduction in Force Appeal	1075
	d. Prior Law; Disability Retirement	1076
	3. Withdrawal of Appeal	1077

a.	Withdrawal to Pursue EEO Complaint; Withdrawal of EEO Claim	1080
b.	Withdrawal to Pursue a Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure.....	1082
c.	Confusion Between Necessity for Withdrawal of Appeal, Continuance, and Withdrawal of Appeal Without Prejudice to Refile	1083
d.	Unauthorized Act of Representative	1084
e.	Duress; Misrepresentation; Incompetence	1087
f.	Mistake	1089
g.	Misleading or Incomplete Information From Judge.....	1090
h.	Attempts to Refile, Reinstate, or Reopen Withdrawn Appeals.....	1093
4.	Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile (“DWOP”).....	1096
a.	Reasons for DWOP	1101
b.	Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1102
c.	Procedures for Obtaining Dismissal; Refiling	1103
d.	Refiling Date	1104
e.	Effect of PFR.....	1106
f.	Agency-Initiated Request; Prior Practice.....	1107
g.	Dismissal Initiated by Judge or MSPB	1108
5.	Delay in Refiling After DWOP.....	1109
a.	Retirement Appeals	1113
b.	Imperfect Attempt to Refile; Confusion Caused by Judge	1114
c.	Late Refiling; Independent Right of Appeal	1115
6.	Waiver of Appeal Through Last Chance or Other Preappeal Agreement	1115
a.	Jurisdictional Analysis.....	1118
b.	Public Policy; Appeal Preclusion; Consideration; Conflict With Regulation	1127
c.	Ambiguous Term; Failure to Waive Future Appeal Right.....	1129
d.	Due Process Considerations; Notice	1133
e.	Last Chance Agreement Superseded by Independent Adverse Action	1134
f.	Lack of Authority of Representative to Enter Agreement.....	1135
g.	Agreement to Accept Demotion, Suspension	1136
h.	Bad Faith, Coercion, Lack of Mental Capacity.....	1137
i.	Illegal or Punitive Term	1142
j.	Jurisdictional Prerequisite: LCA Compliance or Breach	1143
k.	Burden of Proof	1144
l.	Hearing Entitlement	1146
m.	Condition Unrelated to Underlying Action; Ambiguous Condition; Condition Described in Notice of LCA Violation	1150
n.	Condition of Good Performance.....	1156
o.	Discrimination, Reprisal	1156
p.	Claim Collateral to Breach of Agreement.....	1156
q.	Duration of Agreement	1157
7.	Personnel Action Resulting From Settlement Not Constituting Last Chance Agreement	1157
8.	Settlement Reached During Board Appeal	1159
II.	FORMAT AND PRELIMINARY PROCESSING OF APPEAL	1160
A.	ESSENTIAL INFORMATION.....	1160
B.	FORMAT.....	1161
1.	Interpretation of Appeal.....	1161
2.	Signature	1162
3.	Appeal Filed Through Representative	1163
4.	“John Doe” Appeal: Protecting Appellant’s Privacy.....	1163
5.	Agency-Initiated Retirement Appeal	1166
6.	Class Action, Consolidated Appeals, and Joinder; Bifurcated Appeals.....	1166
a.	Consolidation.....	1166
b.	Joinder; Compulsory Joinder	1169
c.	Class Action	1171
d.	Bifurcated Appeals.....	1172
7.	Substitution; Survival of Claim	1173
a.	IRA Case.....	1174
C.	INTERVENTION	1175
1.	Intervention of Right: OPM, OSC	1176
a.	OPM	1176
b.	OSC	1177

2.	Permissive Intervention	1177
3.	Rights of Intervenor.....	1180
4.	<i>Amicus Curiae</i>	1180
D.	STEPS TAKEN AFTER APPEAL IS FILED.....	1180
1.	Acknowledgment of Appeal	1182
a.	Philippines Retirement Appeal.....	1183
2.	Amendment of Appeal.....	1183
3.	Service of Pleadings	1184
4.	Deficient Appeal	1184
5.	Affirmative Defense Order; Requirement of Specific Allegations.....	1185
E.	AGENCY RESPONSE TO APPEAL.....	1187
1.	Narrative Response to Appeal	1188
2.	Motion to Dismiss Appeal.....	1188
3.	Delay in Appeal Response.....	1189
4.	Designation of Agency Representative.....	1189
F.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	1189
1.	Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegation	1193
2.	Judge Must Ensure Jurisdictional Issues Are Identified; <i>Burgess</i> Notice	1194
3.	Agency Representative’s Responsibilities	1198
4.	Hearing on Jurisdictional Issue	1198
G.	REPRESENTATIVES.....	1199
1.	Right to Representation.....	1199
a.	Inadequate Representation	1202
b.	Service on Representative.....	1202
2.	Disqualification of Representative; State Disciplinary Rules	1203
a.	Conflicts	1204
b.	Representative as Witness.....	1207
H.	<i>PRO SE</i> AND INADEQUATELY REPRESENTED PARTIES	1208
1.	<i>Pro Se</i> Appellant.....	1208
2.	Assistance to Mentally Incompetent Appellant; <i>French</i> Procedure	1209
I.	<i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS	1213
1.	What They Are	1214
2.	How <i>Ex Parte</i> Communications Are Treated	1216
III.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS.....	1217
A.	INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL PROCEDURE.....	1217
1.	Regulation.....	1217
2.	Application of Regulation	1219
a.	Rulings on Bias and Intervention.....	1221
b.	Direct Appeal to MSPB.....	1221
3.	Stay of Proceeding.....	1221
IV.	DISCOVERY	1222
A.	OVERVIEW	1223
1.	Regulatory Structure.....	1223
2.	Preliminary Steps.....	1226
a.	Initial Disclosures.....	1227
3.	Limitations	1228
a.	Jurisdictional or Timeliness Issue.....	1228
4.	Motion to Compel.....	1229
5.	Federal Rules.....	1231
a.	Federal Rules of General Application	1232
6.	Interrogatories.....	1233
7.	Deposition	1234
8.	Other Discovery Devices	1237
a.	Document Request.....	1237
b.	Request for Admissions.....	1238
c.	Medical, Psychiatric Examinations	1239
d.	Motion for More Definite Statement of Appeal.....	1240
9.	Discovery From Nonparties.....	1241
B.	STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS	1241
1.	Burden.....	1242
a.	Effect of EEO, Reprisal Allegations.....	1242

b.	Discovery During Pendency of Criminal Proceedings	1243
2.	Privileged Information	1243
a.	<i>In Camera</i> Inspection.....	1244
b.	Law Enforcement Privilege	1245
c.	OSC File; Executive and Investigative Privileges	1246
d.	OPM Suitability File.....	1247
e.	Agency Investigative File	1247
f.	Attorney-Client Privilege	1248
g.	Attorney Work Product Privilege	1252
h.	Agency Deliberative Process Privilege.....	1255
i.	Statutory Confidentiality Limitations.....	1257
3.	Privacy Act	1257
4.	Failure to Use Discovery.....	1259
5.	Informal Discovery; Control by Agencies of Employees' Time	1261
6.	Protective Order.....	1262
C.	ENTRY OF DISCOVERY MATERIAL INTO RECORD	1263
D.	SUBPOENAS	1264
1.	When a Subpoena Is Used	1264
2.	Obtaining, Serving Subpoena	1264
a.	Witnesses Outside the United States	1266
3.	Challenge; Enforcement	1266
4.	Witness Fees; Travel Allowances	1267
E.	REVIEW OF DISCOVERY RULINGS.....	1268
1.	Rulings on Disputes.....	1268
a.	Synopsis of Testimony	1268
b.	Relevance, Overbroad Request	1268
c.	Mitigation; Disparate Treatment	1269
d.	Deposition of Agency Head.....	1270
e.	Electronic Records.....	1270
f.	Inspection Rather Than Production of Documents.....	1270
g.	OSC Case.....	1271
2.	Effect of Denial of Discovery	1272
a.	Due Process Considerations	1274
b.	Preservation of Issue	1276
V.	SANCTIONS.....	1277
A.	FAILURE TO RESPOND TO APPEAL	1279
1.	Default Judgment.....	1280
B.	FAILURE TO PROSECUTE APPEAL	1280
1.	Dismissal Warranted.....	1282
a.	Failure to Provide Basis for Appeal	1283
b.	Failure to Designate Representative.....	1283
c.	Failure to Comply With Judge's Order.....	1284
2.	Dismissal Unwarranted	1286
a.	Failure to Attend Hearing	1287
b.	Inadvertent or Isolated Failure to Obey Judge's Orders	1287
c.	Late Appeal.....	1290
C.	FAILURE TO COOPERATE IN DISCOVERY	1290
1.	Sanction Against Agency	1290
a.	Material in Control of Third Party.....	1293
2.	Sanction Against Appellant.....	1294
D.	FAILURE TO FOLLOW PREHEARING OR HEARING PROCEDURES.....	1297
1.	Sanction Against Appellant; Prejudice to Agency.....	1297
2.	Sanction Against Agency	1299

CHAPTER 3: HEARING..... 1301

I.	HEARING.....	1301
A.	RIGHT TO HEARING	1301
1.	<i>De Novo</i> Hearing.....	1302
a.	Role of Intervenor.....	1303
2.	Jurisdictional Hearing; Documentary Evidence.....	1303
a.	Timeliness Issue.....	1307

b. No Material Disputed Facts	1307
3. Counsel	1309
4. Control by Judge	1309
Hearing at Initiative of Judge.....	1311
5. Official Time; Resources Available to Appellant.....	1312
B. WAIVER OF HEARING	1312
1. Inability to Travel to Hearing Site	1315
2. Failure to Request Hearing	1316
a. Remands; New Law.....	1317
3. Untimely Hearing Request.....	1317
a. Effect of Amendment of Appeal	1318
b. Failure to Receive Hearing Notice.....	1318
4. Withdrawal of Hearing Request.....	1319
a. Postponement Denied	1320
b. Events Beyond Appellant’s Control.....	1321
5. Strategic Considerations—Intentional Waiver	1321
6. Adjudication After Waiver, Failure to Attend Hearing.....	1321
7. Adjudication Without Hearing; Responses to Evidentiary Submissions	1322
C. POSTPONEMENT OF HEARING	1326
1. Timing of Hearing	1326
2. Policy on Continuances.....	1327
a. Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile.....	1328
b. Case Suspension	1328
3. Continuance Procedure	1329
a. Request; Form of Sworn Statement	1330
b. Failure to Make Request.....	1330
c. Status of Pending Motion.....	1330
d. Proceeding After Denial of Motion	1330
4. Good Cause Requirement.....	1331
a. Need to Prepare	1331
b. Awaiting Outcome of Another Case.....	1331
c. Unavailability of Representative; New Representative	1331
(i) Case Proceeds to Hearing	1334
d. Medical Condition of Appellant.....	1334
e. Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension.....	1335
f. Incarceration	1338
g. Military Service.....	1339
h. Missing or Unavailable Witness.....	1339
i. Change in Hearing Location.....	1339
5. Continuance Denial—Review Standard	1339
D. VENUE OF HEARING.....	1341
1. Change of Venue	1341
a. Cost to Appellant.....	1343
2. Requesting a Change of Venue	1343
3. Venue Determination Review Standard	1343
E. HEARING PRELIMINARIES	1343
1. Change, Resignation, or Death of Judge	1343
2. Interaction With Judge.....	1344
3. Prehearing Submission	1344
4. Prehearing Conference	1345
a. Stipulations.....	1348
b. Waiver or Withdrawal of Affirmative Defense	1348
c. Dismissal of Charge	1349
5. Memorandum or Order Summarizing Conference.....	1349
a. Preservation of Objection; Incomplete Summary	1350
b. Treatment of EEO and Other Affirmative Defenses; Summary Judgment.....	1352
F. CONDUCT OF HEARING; RESPONSIBILITIES OF JUDGE	1357
1. Hearing Error: Measure of Damage	1358
a. Timing of Submission of Pleadings.....	1359
b. Timing of Initial Decision.....	1359
2. Control and Exclusion of Representative or Participant.....	1359

3.	Maintaining Order.....	1361
a.	Exclusion From Hearing Room of an Individual Whose Presence May Intimidate a Witness	1361
b.	Security Arrangement	1362
4.	Witness Control; Sequestration.....	1363
5.	Conduct of Questioning	1365
a.	Multiple Representatives	1365
6.	Permitting Record Development	1365
a.	Videoconference, Telephone Hearing.....	1366
b.	Bifurcated Hearing	1371
c.	Hearing Subpoena	1372
7.	Ensuring Record Development; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; EEO File	1372
a.	Annuity Appeal	1375
b.	Duty of Judge to Inform an Appellant of Governing Law; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant; Liberal Construction of Pleadings....	1376
c.	Raising Issue <i>Sua Sponte</i>	1378
d.	Preserving Review Right Through Objection	1379
8.	Media Coverage.....	1380
9.	Public Hearing; Closing the Hearing	1381
10.	Timing of Hearing	1381
11.	Hearing Accommodation for Disabled Appellant; Interpreter	1382
12.	Allocation of Burden of Proof	1383
13.	Opening Statement.....	1384
14.	Closing Argument, Brief.....	1384
G.	PREVENTION OF INTERFERENCE WITH MSPB PROCEEDINGS	1385
1.	Protective Order.....	1385
2.	Protective Order for Appellant	1386
3.	Interference With Witness, Representative, Appellant	1387
a.	Agency Restriction on Appearance of Employee as Witness	1391
H.	POSTHEARING ACTIVITIES	1392
1.	Closing Record	1392
a.	Ensuring Notice of Record Closing.....	1393
b.	Clarifying Scope of Record; Off-The-Record Discussions.....	1393
c.	Timing of Evidentiary Submissions, Responses.....	1394
d.	Effect of Closing Record	1395
2.	Regional Authority After Initial Decision	1395
a.	Judge's Request to Reopen Record to Correct Error	1396
II.	HEARING RECORD	1396
A.	RIGHT TO AND NECESSITY FOR A RECORD OR TRANSCRIPT	1396
1.	Current MSPB Practice.....	1397
2.	Past Treatment of Transcript.....	1398
3.	Past Internal MSPB Guidance on Transcript.....	1398
4.	Federal Circuit Commentary on Transcript	1399
a.	Arbitration Hearing.....	1400
5.	Use of Recording	1400
B.	PROBLEMS CONCERNING TRANSCRIPT AND RECORD	1401
1.	Off-The-Record Discussion	1401
2.	Hearing Recording Omission; Transcript Error.....	1401
3.	Correction of Transcript	1402
4.	Unofficial Transcript.....	1403
III.	MOTION PRACTICE.....	1403
A.	USE OF MOTIONS.....	1404
1.	Dispositive Motion.....	1406
a.	Motion to Dismiss Filed Before Hearing.....	1406
b.	Motion to Dismiss Filed During Hearing.....	1406
c.	Summary Judgment.....	1407
B.	FORM AND TIMING OF MOTIONS.....	1412
IV.	WITNESSES	1413
A.	WITNESS REQUEST	1413
1.	Obligation to Permit Relevant Testimony	1414
a.	Competence to Testify.....	1414
b.	Appellant.....	1414
c.	Decisionmaker.....	1414

d. Agency Head.....	1414
2. Obligation to Request Witness.....	1415
a. Witness List.....	1416
b. Rebuttal Witness.....	1417
3. Repetitious Testimony.....	1418
4. Offer of Proof.....	1418
5. Compelling Witness Attendance.....	1418
a. Appellant.....	1419
b. Others; Former Employee; Subpoena.....	1419
6. Duty Status of Federal Employee Witness; Pay, Travel, Per Diem.....	1419
a. Official Time.....	1420
7. Protecting Record; Missing Witness.....	1421
a. Preservation of Objection.....	1421
8. Judge May Call Witness.....	1422
9. Obtaining Testimony by Alternate Means.....	1422
10. Right of Witness to Representation.....	1422
a. Self-Incrimination.....	1422
11. Witness Denial—Review Standard.....	1423
B. EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES.....	1425
1. Control of Questioning.....	1425
a. Questioning by Judge.....	1426
b. Leading Questions.....	1426
c. Production of Witness Statement, Document Relied on During Testimony.....	1427
d. Taking Witness Out of Order.....	1428
V. DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGE.....	1428
A. PRESUMPTION OF HONESTY AND IMPARTIALITY.....	1428
1. Competence of Judge.....	1430
B. TREATMENT OF BIAS ALLEGATIONS.....	1430
1. Procedure; Documenting Record; Sworn Statement.....	1433
2. Extrajudicial Source of Bias.....	1435
3. Treatment of Bias Allegation by Judge, Board.....	1435
4. Specific Bias Allegations.....	1436
a. Relationship With Party or Witness.....	1436
b. Relationship With Counsel.....	1438
c. Improper Communication.....	1439
d. Examination of Witness.....	1440
e. Remarks About Counsel, Party, Merits, Settlement; Remarks During Hearing; <i>Ex Parte</i> Communication.....	1440
f. Prior Ruling Against Party.....	1444
g. Erroneous Ruling.....	1445
h. Incorrect Factual Conclusion.....	1445
i. Hasty or Late Decision.....	1445
j. Change in Judge Without Finding of Bias.....	1446

CHAPTER 4: EVIDENCE..... 1449

I. FUNDAMENTALS.....	1449
A. RELEVANCE, MATERIALITY, AND FAIRNESS.....	1449
1. Informal Adjudication.....	1449
2. Relevance and Materiality.....	1449
a. <i>De Novo</i> Review.....	1450
b. Conditional Admission of Evidence.....	1450
3. Record.....	1450
a. Offer of Proof.....	1450
4. Fairness in Development of Evidence.....	1450
a. Erroneous Exclusion of Evidence.....	1450
b. Erroneous Admission of Evidence.....	1451
c. Manipulation or Redaction of Evidence.....	1451
B. NATURE OF CHARGES.....	1452
1. Evidentiary Value of Charge.....	1452
a. Response to Charge.....	1453
C. HEARSAY.....	1454
1. <i>Borninkhof</i>	1455

2. Judicial Interpretations	1458
3. 5 USC 2302(b)(2): Investigative Statement	1458
II. EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE.....	1459
A. DOCUMENTS.....	1459
1. Response to Appeal	1459
2. Medical Report, Records.....	1459
3. Notes of Witness; Memorandum of Conversation	1460
4. Time and Attendance Record	1461
5. Business Record	1461
6. Regulation; Law	1462
7. Evidence From Other MSPB Hearing; Other Judicial Proceeding.....	1462
8. Procedure for Introducing Document; Demonstrative Evidence	1462
9. Authentication Requirement	1463
a. Handwriting	1464
b. Significance of Signature	1464
c. Copy; Photograph	1464
B. PHYSICAL EVIDENCE.....	1464
1. Custody and Control	1464
2. Use at Hearing	1464
C. ADMISSIONS	1465
1. Probative Value	1465
a. Repudiated or Recanted Admission	1466
2. Settlement Offer	1467
D. CIRCUMSTANTIAL AND SECONDARY EVIDENCE	1468
1. Common Possession/Multiple Causation.....	1469
2. Contemporaneous Statement.....	1470
3. Flight or Evasion	1470
4. Statistics.....	1470
E. OPINION AND IMPEACHMENT EVIDENCE	1470
1. Physical Condition	1471
2. Character.....	1471
a. Past Misconduct.....	1472
b. Arrest, Conviction.....	1474
c. Reputation	1474
d. Habit.....	1474
3. Evidence in Disability Annuity Appeal; <i>Chavez</i> ; Post-Separation Evidence	1474
F. RECURRENT EVIDENTIARY PROBLEMS.....	1481
1. Polygraph	1481
2. Unsworn Written Statements.....	1482
a. No Hearing.....	1483
b. Hearing Held	1484
c. Sworn Written Statement; Form of Attestation	1484
d. Deposition.....	1487
3. Investigation Reports.....	1488
4. Recordings.....	1490
a. Video	1490
b. Audio.....	1490
5. Transcript of Prior Testimony	1490
6. Expert Witness; Medical Evidence.....	1490
a. Medical Expert Opinion	1493
b. Other Experts.....	1495
7. Statements of Representative, Party.....	1496
a. Hearing Deportment or Demeanor	1496
8. Testimony of Child	1497
9. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract	1497
10. Newspaper Article	1497
11. Drug Test	1497
III. SUBSTITUTES FOR DIRECT EVIDENCE	1501
A. OFFICIAL NOTICE	1502
1. Regulations.....	1502
a. Federal Personnel Manual; Agency Handbook, Publication.....	1502

2.	Related Board Case Records.....	1503
B.	ADVERSE INFERENCES AND PRESUMPTIONS	1503
1.	Silence	1503
2.	Negative Inferences; Omitted Witnesses, Documents.....	1505
a.	Destruction or Loss of Evidence; Spoliation	1506
b.	Negative Evidence.....	1509
3.	Presumption.....	1509
a.	Delivery of Mail, Other Documents.....	1510
C.	STIPULATIONS	1513
1.	Issues of Fact and Law	1515
2.	Stipulations Directed by Judge	1515
D.	PREVIOUS DETERMINATIONS OF DISPUTED FACTS, ISSUES, CLAIMS: <i>RES JUDICATA</i> , COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL, AND LAW OF THE CASE—THE DOCTRINES.....	1515
1.	<i>Res Judicata</i>	1517
a.	Identity of Prior Cause of Action and Issues	1521
b.	Identity of Parties; Privity.....	1522
c.	Complete Relief Available	1523
d.	Jurisdictional Issue.....	1524
e.	Settlement	1526
f.	Withdrawal of Appeal	1527
g.	<i>Res Judicata</i> Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB; Waiver of Defense.....	1527
2.	Collateral Estoppel.....	1529
a.	Error in Law; Change in Law	1532
b.	Proof of a Prior Adjudication	1533
c.	Privity; Appellant as a Party to Prior Case	1533
d.	Privity of Agencies.....	1534
e.	Identity of Prior Issue; Ability Earlier to Raise an Issue	1535
f.	Jurisdictional, Timeliness Issues	1536
g.	Decision of Another Tribunal; Effect of State Law.....	1539
h.	Collateral Estoppel Raised <i>Sua Sponte</i> by MSPB.....	1541
3.	Judicial Estoppel.....	1541
4.	Law of the Case; Mandate Rule	1543
5.	<i>Stare Decisis</i>	1547
E.	<i>RES JUDICATA</i> AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL—THE DOCTRINES APPLIED	1548
1.	Criminal Conviction.....	1548
2.	Pleas to Criminal Charges.....	1551
a.	Guilty Plea	1551
b.	<i>Nolo Contendere</i> and <i>Alford</i> Pleas	1553
c.	Pretrial Diversion	1556
d.	Conviction, Misconduct Distinguished	1557
3.	Acquittal; Reversal of Criminal Conviction.....	1557
4.	Successive MSPB Cases	1558
a.	Dismissal for Adjudicatory Efficiency	1559
b.	WIGI/Removal	1559
c.	Successive RIFs	1560
d.	Whistleblowing Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaint or Appeal.....	1560
e.	USERRA Claims	1567
f.	Suitability Determination	1567
g.	Regulation Review	1568
h.	Prior Action Reversed for Lack of Due Process.....	1568
5.	Other Proceedings.....	1568
a.	Credentialing Committee	1568
b.	Union Trial Board	1569
c.	Labor Arbitration Awards	1570
d.	OPM Annuity Determination.....	1572
e.	Unemployment Compensation Award	1575
f.	OWCP Finding; Social Security Determination	1576
g.	EEOC Decision.....	1577
h.	Comptroller General or GAO Decision.....	1578
i.	Judicial Determination	1579
6.	Potential Exceptions to Application of Collateral Estoppel, <i>Res Judicata</i>	1580

a.	Pendency of an Appeal; District Court Case	1580
b.	Fairness of Adjudication; New Evidence	1581
c.	Fraud; Misrepresentation.....	1581
d.	Change in Law	1583
IV.	EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE	1583
A.	PROCEDURES.....	1583
1.	Objection, Motions to Strike or <i>in Limine</i>	1583
2.	Witness Exclusion.....	1584
a.	Proposing Official	1584
B.	CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY CHALLENGES	1585
1.	Search.....	1585
a.	Wiretap.....	1589
b.	Recording	1589
c.	Drug Testing	1590
2.	Interrogation.....	1594
a.	Misconduct of Investigator	1594
b.	Compelled Testimony; <i>Kalkines</i> Warning.....	1595
c.	Right to Silence, Counsel	1597
d.	Denial of Union Representation.....	1599
C.	OTHER BASES FOR EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE	1600
1.	Claims of Privilege.....	1600
a.	Alcoholism Treatment Records.....	1600
b.	Other Medical Records	1600
c.	Privacy; Attorney-Client Communication.....	1600
2.	Conference With Union Representative.....	1600
3.	Failure to Follow MSPB Procedure	1601

CHAPTER 5: INITIAL DECISION AND PETITION FOR REVIEW..... 1603

I.	INITIAL DECISION.....	1603
A.	INITIAL DECISION FORMAT	1603
1.	Minimum Requirements.....	1603
a.	Bench Decision.....	1605
b.	Notice of Right to Review	1606
2.	Appeal Dismissed by Consent; Mootness of Initial Decision.....	1607
B.	REQUIRED ANALYSIS	1607
1.	Incomplete Analysis; Failure to Mention All Evidence	1608
a.	Incorrect Adjudication Standard.....	1610
b.	Issue Not Raised in Appeal.....	1611
2.	Timeliness and Jurisdictional Issues.....	1611
3.	Adverse Action, Performance Case.....	1611
4.	Annuity Appeal	1612
5.	EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue	1612
a.	Nondispositive EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue.....	1614
6.	Consolidated Appeals.....	1616
7.	Attorney Fees Decision	1616
C.	CREDIBILITY FINDINGS	1616
1.	Necessary Findings	1616
a.	Weight of Evidence Equally Balanced.....	1617
2.	Factors Considered; <i>Hillen</i>	1617
a.	Some Testimony Discredited.....	1620
b.	Alibi Defense	1620
c.	Inconsistencies; Denials; Memory Lapse; Failure to Provide Statement.....	1620
d.	Contemporaneous Notation, Statement; <i>Post Hoc</i> Explanation.....	1621
e.	Self-Serving Testimony; Bias; Criminal Conviction; Past Misconduct	1622
f.	Uncontradicted Testimony.....	1623
g.	Implausible, Inherently Improbable, Imprecise Testimony	1623
3.	Telephonic Hearing	1623
4.	Determination Made Without Hearing	1624
II.	PETITION FOR REVIEW; RECONSIDERATION	1624
A.	PFR PROCESS	1624
1.	Statutory and Regulatory Structure	1625

a.	Internal Board Guidance	1627
2.	Board Treatment of PFR, Reopening Request	1629
a.	Enforcement Issue	1630
3.	Reply to PFR Response	1630
4.	Cross-PFR.....	1631
a.	Conditional Cross-PFR	1632
5.	Effect of Judicial Review on PFR.....	1632
6.	Effect of EEOC Review on PFR.....	1633
7.	Who May Obtain Review	1633
a.	OPM	1633
b.	OSC	1634
c.	Others; Intervenors	1634
d.	Substituted Party	1634
8.	Grounds for PFR.....	1634
a.	Evidentiary Disputes.....	1635
b.	Ineffective Counsel	1635
c.	Frivolous PFR; Sanction	1637
d.	Challenges to Settlement	1637
9.	Time for Filing.....	1637
10.	Service.....	1638
11.	MSPB Processing	1638
a.	Tied Vote; Lack of Quorum	1640
b.	Decision Effective Upon Issuance by Clerk	1641
c.	Joinder.....	1641
12.	Failure to Prosecute; Failure to Respond.....	1641
a.	Withdrawal of PFR	1642
b.	Dismissal Without Prejudice	1642
13.	PFR Settlement Program	1643
14.	Entry of Settlement Agreement Into Record.....	1643
15.	MSPB Final Decision	1644
a.	Short Form Order.....	1644
16.	Authority to Reopen and Reconsider	1645
a.	Jurisdictional Issue	1648
b.	Due Diligence	1649
c.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1653
d.	Change in Law	1654
e.	Fraud	1656
f.	Retirement Appeal.....	1657
g.	Effect of Judicial Review on Petition to Reopen.....	1658
h.	Reopening in Lieu of Excusing Untimely or Defective PFR	1659
i.	Clear Legal Error; Manifest Injustice.....	1660
j.	Discovery of Additional Legal Argument.....	1660
k.	Correction of Case Processing Error.....	1660
B.	INTERIM RELIEF	1661
1.	Effective Date of Interim Relief.....	1664
2.	Effect of Remand or Supplemental Initial Decision on Interim Relief.....	1665
3.	Obligation to Return Employee to Work and Pay; Undue Disruption.....	1665
a.	Undue Disruption Determination	1669
b.	Undue Disruption Notice.....	1670
c.	Implicit Disruption Determination; Strong Overriding Interest	1672
d.	Removal From Workplace or Adverse Action During Interim Relief Period	1676
e.	Return to Work With Changed Duties	1677
f.	Restoration Followed by Appellant's Inability to Work	1678
g.	Pay Entitlement; Overtime; Allowances	1678
h.	Deductibility of Interim Earnings or Severance Pay.....	1680
i.	Prior "Bad Faith" Implementation Standard	1681
4.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714.....	1681
5.	Dismissal of PFR for Failure to Provide Interim Relief.....	1682
a.	Remedy for Inadequate Interim Relief.....	1683
b.	Motion to Dismiss PFR for Lack of Proper Interim Relief	1684
c.	Discriminatory Application of Interim Relief	1685

d.	Effect of Jurisdictional Issue	1685
6.	PFR Not Mooted by Overbroad Interim Relief	1686
7.	Certification and Proof of Interim Relief	1687
a.	Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1688
b.	Technical Error; Supplemental Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1691
c.	Delay in Payment Following Certification or <i>Prima Facie</i> Evidence of Interim Relief.....	1692
d.	Withdrawal of Interim Relief.....	1692
8.	Factors Limiting or Warranting Denial of Interim Relief.....	1693
a.	OWCP Benefits.....	1693
b.	Retirement	1694
c.	Restriction on Extension of Appointment.....	1695
d.	Waiver, Settlement of Interim Relief; Employment Status Change.....	1695
9.	Special Situations	1697
a.	Retirement Appeals	1697
b.	Within-Grade Increase Appeal.....	1698
c.	Suitability Appeal	1698
d.	VEOA Appeal	1698
e.	Mitigation of Removal to Demotion.....	1698
f.	Mitigation of Removal to Suspension.....	1699
g.	Mitigation of Demotion to Suspension.....	1699
h.	Mitigation or Cancellation of Suspension	1700
i.	Enforced Leave Concluded by the Date of the Initial Decision.....	1700
j.	Unified Penalty Involving Reassignment.....	1700
C.	REVIEW OF FACTUAL AND CREDIBILITY FINDINGS	1700
1.	Factual Findings; “Special Deference”	1701
a.	Decision Based on Affidavits, Documents.....	1706
b.	Telephonic, Videoconference Hearing.....	1706
2.	Omitted Findings	1706
3.	Unnecessary Findings.....	1708
4.	Issue of Mental Competence During Appeal Adjudication	1708
D.	REVIEW OF NEW EVIDENCE	1708
1.	What Constitutes Evidence.....	1711
2.	What Evidence Is New	1711
a.	Previously Available.....	1712
b.	Issue First Raised by Judge.....	1713
c.	Claim of Surprise.....	1713
d.	Due Diligence	1714
e.	Issue of Timeliness of Appeal or Other Submission	1717
f.	Issue of Jurisdiction; Exhaustion of Remedies	1718
g.	Evidence From Another MSPB Case.....	1721
3.	Materiality of New Evidence.....	1721
a.	Impeachment, Rebuttal Evidence	1722
b.	Corroborative Evidence.....	1725
c.	Disparate Treatment	1726
d.	OPM, SSA, OWCP, VA Determination; Evidence of Medical, Mental Condition	1726
e.	Adjudication of Past Discipline.....	1727
f.	Reversal of Criminal Conviction	1728
E.	REVIEW OF NEW LAW	1728
F.	REVIEW OF NEW ISSUES OR ISSUES NOT RAISED WITH JUDGE.....	1730
1.	General Rule.....	1730
a.	Jurisdictional Issue	1731
b.	Order Directing Payment in Violation of Federal Statute.....	1732
2.	Determining if Issue or Argument Was Raised Below.....	1733
a.	Annuity.....	1733
b.	Penalty.....	1733
c.	Statutory, Constitutional Interpretation.....	1733
d.	Timeliness of Appeal	1733
e.	Discrimination	1734
f.	Waiver of Issue.....	1734
G.	TIMELINESS OF PFR.....	1735
1.	Request for Extension of Time	1735

2.	Date and Place of Filing	1736
a.	Deficient but Timely PFR.....	1736
3.	Filing by Facsimile	1737
a.	Misguided Facsimile.....	1737
4.	Filing by Commercial Delivery.....	1738
5.	Filing by Hand.....	1738
6.	Filing by Mail.....	1738
a.	Proof of Mailing; Postmark; Mailbox Rule	1740
b.	PFR Lost in the Mail.....	1743
7.	Electronic Filing.....	1745
8.	Procedure on Late Submission.....	1746
a.	Affidavit or Sworn Statement Required.....	1748
b.	Strict Application	1749
c.	Retirement Appeal.....	1750
9.	Justification for Late Filing	1750
a.	Electronic Filing Problem.....	1752
b.	Mailroom Delay in Posting PFR	1755
c.	Foreign Mail Problem.....	1755
d.	Office Equipment, Technology, Related Problems	1755
e.	Merits	1756
f.	Physical or Mental Condition of Appellant or Counsel.....	1756
g.	Ignorance of Law; Late Discovery of Legal Defense; Subsequent MSPB or Court Decision in Another Case.....	1762
h.	Problem With Settlement	1764
i.	Misinterpretation, Ignorance of MSPB Regulation, Instruction.....	1766
j.	Incorrect Information From MSPB, Others	1768
k.	Incomplete Notice of Right to File PFR.....	1768
l.	Delayed Receipt, Misrouting of Initial Decision, PFR; Constructive Receipt	1769
m.	Failure to Receive Initial Decision; E-Filer.....	1771
(i)	Responsibility to Notify Board of Physical or Email Address Change	1775
n.	Effect of Judge's Remand to Agency for Redetermination.....	1776
o.	Withdrawal, Absence of Representative	1777
p.	Inability to Obtain Representation.....	1778
q.	Unexcused Delay or Neglect of Representative.....	1778
r.	Excused Neglect of Representative; Diligence of Appellant.....	1781
s.	Attempt to Obtain Congressional Assistance	1784
t.	Pending Review by Another Adjudicator	1784
u.	Awaiting Transcript, Other Document.....	1785
v.	Delay in Internal Decisionmaking	1786
w.	Military Service.....	1786
x.	Fear of Prosecution; Agency Misrepresentation	1787
y.	Language Difficulties	1787
z.	Other Problems.....	1787
10.	Filing PFR With Wrong Agency or MSPB Office	1790
a.	Mixed Case Appeals.....	1790
b.	Other Misdirected Filings	1790
11.	Case or PFR Misfiled in Court	1792
H.	FORMAT AND SUBSTANCE OF PFR; REPLY; RESPONSE TO REPLY	1793
1.	Allowable Submissions; Length, Format.....	1793
a.	Erroneous Designation of Pleading.....	1795
b.	Error in Formal Requirements	1795
c.	<i>Pro Se</i> Form PFR.....	1795
2.	Signature, Designation of Representative Required	1796
3.	Specific and Supported Objection.....	1797
a.	Factual Error.....	1798
b.	Adjudicatory Error	1798
4.	Response to PFR	1798
5.	Reply to Response.....	1799
6.	Supplemental Authority	1799
7.	Lack of Transcript.....	1799
I.	MOOTNESS OF PFR.....	1800
1.	Cancellation of Adverse Action; Agency Compliance With Initial Decision	1800

a.	Effect of Appellant’s PFR; No Agency PFR Filed	1801
2.	Settlement; Vacatur of Initial Decision	1801
3.	Regulation Review Proceeding	1802
4.	Retirement Appeal.....	1802
5.	Disqualification of Representative	1802
J.	PROCEDURE ON REMAND	1802
1.	Determining Whether a Remand Is Necessary	1802
a.	Board Obtains Evidence During PFR	1803
2.	Evidence, Findings From First Hearing	1803
a.	Effect of MSPB Order Vacating Initial Decision	1804
3.	Remand for Further Discovery	1804
4.	Remand for More Evidence	1804
a.	Subsequent PFR.....	1804
b.	Entry of Interlocutory or Interim Relief on Remand.....	1804
5.	Remand for Compliance	1805
K.	OPM RECONSIDERATION REQUESTS	1805
1.	Governing Statute and Regulation.....	1805
2.	Substantial Impact on Law	1807
a.	Decisions Before 1990.....	1809
3.	Limited to Facts, Issues of Record.....	1809
4.	Timing of Request; Arbitration Award	1810
5.	Mootness.....	1810
6.	Discrimination Law, Rule, or Regulation	1810
L.	STAY REQUESTS	1811
1.	Requested by OPM	1812
a.	Request for Supreme Court Review.....	1815
2.	Requested by Agency.....	1815
a.	Stay of Enforcement Proceeding	1817
3.	Requested By or For Individual	1818
a.	OSC Disciplinary Case	1819
b.	Other OSC Litigation	1821
M.	REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS.....	1821
1.	Award Subject to Review.....	1827
a.	Governing Statute and Regulation; Time for Review	1828
b.	EEO Allegation.....	1829
c.	Remand for Resolution of EEO Issue.....	1834
d.	Attorney Fees Claim.....	1835
2.	MSPB Review Procedure	1836
a.	Time to Seek Review; Notice of Review Rights	1837
3.	Proper Appellant Before MSPB.....	1840
4.	Method, Scope of MSPB Review	1840
a.	Issue Preclusion.....	1843
b.	Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity.....	1844
c.	Allegation of Bias, Unfair Hearing.....	1844
d.	Enforcement of Award Reviewed by MSPB.....	1845
5.	Standard of Review.....	1845
a.	Penalty, Time-Served Suspension; Remedy	1849
b.	Procedures; Timeliness of Grievance	1857
c.	EEO Issue.....	1860
6.	Postal Service Employees.....	1861
a.	Effect of Arbitration Award on Board Appeal.....	1864

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 6: ADVERSE ACTIONS 1869

I.	ADVERSE ACTIONS DEFINED	1869
A.	CANCELATION OF APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION.....	1869
1.	Appointment	1870
a.	Entry on Duty; Action by Appointing Authority; Reliance; SF-50	1874
b.	Citizenship.....	1875
c.	Nepotism	1876

d.	Selective Service Registration.....	1877
e.	Political Influence.....	1879
f.	Withdrawal of Offer to Extend Term Appointment.....	1879
2.	Promotion, Pay Increase.....	1880
B.	TERMINATION BY ADVERSE ACTION OF APPOINTMENT SECURED BY FRAUD; OPM SUITABILITY ACTION.....	1892
C.	CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTION.....	1893
1.	Jurisdictional Showing.....	1896
a.	Specific Allegations Control.....	1906
b.	Totality of Circumstances.....	1908
c.	Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements.....	1911
d.	Jurisdictional Analysis in Untimely Appeal.....	1911
e.	Collateral Attack on Settlement Agreement, Waiver of Appeal Right.....	1912
f.	Allegation of Discrimination.....	1913
2.	Overview of Constructive Adverse Action Appeals.....	1916
a.	Timing of Events.....	1917
3.	Involuntary Downgrading.....	1919
a.	Hearing.....	1919
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation.....	1920
c.	Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause.....	1927
d.	Time Pressure.....	1929
e.	Improper Reassignment.....	1929
f.	Withdrawal of Request for Downgrading.....	1930
g.	Unauthentic Request for Downgrading.....	1930
h.	Discrimination; Intolerable Working Conditions.....	1930
i.	External Problems.....	1934
j.	Correction of Administrative Error.....	1935
4.	Involuntary Resignation.....	1936
a.	Hearing.....	1939
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation.....	1940
c.	Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause.....	1946
d.	Time Pressure.....	1949
e.	Improper Reassignment.....	1952
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Resign.....	1953
g.	Irrevocable Resignation; VSIP.....	1955
h.	Unauthentic, Ambiguous or Conditional Resignation.....	1956
i.	Ineffective Resignation.....	1957
j.	Mental Disability.....	1958
k.	Intolerable Working Conditions.....	1959
l.	Whistleblowing Reprisal.....	1969
m.	Discriminatory Working Conditions.....	1970
n.	Failure to Accommodate Disability.....	1974
o.	Denial of Leave.....	1976
p.	External Problems.....	1977
q.	Probationer.....	1978
r.	Technical Error.....	1978
5.	Involuntary Retirement.....	1978
a.	Hearing.....	1979
b.	Deceit; Misrepresentation.....	1981
(i)	Correction of Benefit; Placement in Wrong Retirement System.....	1993
c.	Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause.....	1994
d.	Time Pressure.....	1996
e.	Involuntary Reassignment.....	1998
f.	Withdrawal of Request to Retire.....	2000
g.	Irrevocable Retirement; VSIP.....	2001
h.	Intolerable Working Conditions.....	2005
i.	Whistleblowing Reprisal.....	2014
j.	Discriminatory Working Conditions.....	2018
k.	Failure to Accommodate Disability.....	2023
l.	Discriminatory Conduct Causes Disability.....	2035
m.	Denial of Leave.....	2036
n.	Mental Disability.....	2037

o.	External Problems	2037
p.	Agency-Initiated Retirement.....	2037
q.	Discontinued Service Retirement.....	2037
r.	Mandatory Retirement	2040
s.	Employing Agency as Party to Appeal Against OPM.....	2040
6.	Constructive Demotion Through Reassignment; <i>Russell</i>	2040
a.	Planned Management Action.....	2044
b.	Position Must Be Upgraded	2046
c.	Identity of Duties	2049
d.	Qualification for Higher-Graded Position	2049
e.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Hearing.....	2050
f.	Evidence of Classification Error	2050
g.	EEO Allegation.....	2050
h.	Timeliness of Appeal	2050
7.	Involuntary Transfer.....	2051
D.	ENFORCED LEAVE; CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION.....	2052
1.	Jurisdictional Analysis; Burden of Proof.....	2056
a.	Hearing.....	2058
b.	EEO Allegation	2059
c.	Effect of Receipt of OWCP Benefit	2060
d.	Disputed Restoration Right	2061
2.	Requirement for Adverse Action Procedure.....	2062
a.	Leave Status Voluntarily Assumed; Failure to Provide Medical Documentation, Perform Available Work.....	2065
b.	Process Due to Employee	2069
c.	Evaluation of Leave Enforced Following Notice to Employee.....	2069
d.	Disability Accommodation	2070
e.	Retirement Application; LWOP	2074
3.	Employee AWOL.....	2074
4.	Employee Blocked From Working Because of Employer's Concern About Fitness; Fitness Examination Requirement	2076
a.	Employee on LWOP	2086
5.	Light and Limited Duty; Medical Restriction.....	2086
a.	Historical Development of Light Duty Analysis.....	2090
b.	Collective Bargaining Contract.....	2095
c.	Disability Accommodation	2099
d.	EEO Settlement	2103
e.	Termination of Light Duty	2104
f.	Postal Service National and Other Collective Bargaining Contracts.....	2106
g.	Furlough	2107
6.	Work Release.....	2107
7.	Bar Order Preventing Entry to Workplace	2107
8.	Temporary Absence Resulting From Intolerable Working Conditions	2109
E.	INDEFINITE SUSPENSION.....	2113
1.	Use.....	2113
2.	Procedure; Duration	2117
a.	Due Process	2123
b.	Regulatory Error.....	2125
3.	Criminal Activity	2127
a.	Indictment; Filing of Information; Referral for Prosecution	2128
b.	Investigation Accompanied by Other Circumstances.....	2130
c.	Arrest.....	2132
4.	Nexus.....	2139
5.	Security Clearance or Other Investigation	2141
a.	Due Process: Separation of Officials Denying Access and Deciding Suspension; Change in Basis for Clearance Suspension.....	2147
b.	Indefinite Prolongation of Suspension.....	2163
c.	Alternatives to Suspension	2165
d.	Discrimination; Accommodation for Disability; Medical Issues; Whistleblowing	2171
6.	Inquiry Into Other Issues	2172
7.	Remedy.....	2177
a.	Action Following Termination of Criminal Proceeding.....	2181

II. SERVICE EFFICIENCY.....	2182
A. BURDEN OF PROOF.....	2184
1. Charges.....	2185
2. Affirmative Defenses.....	2185
3. Preponderance of Evidence.....	2186
a. Uniformity of Standard.....	2187
b. Violation of Criminal Statute.....	2187
c. Intent.....	2187
d. Suspicion; Belief.....	2188
4. <i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	2188
5. Presumption.....	2188
B. PERSONAL FAULT.....	2189
1. Adverse Action to Address Action Involving Another Employee.....	2189
a. EEO Complaint.....	2189
b. Merit Promotion Grievance.....	2189
2. Action Directed by Arbitrator.....	2190
3. Correction of Administrative Error.....	2190
4. <i>Respondeat Superior</i>	2190
C. ADVERSE ACTION RELATED TO DISABILITY.....	2193
1. Medical Standard; <i>Douglas</i> Factors; Accommodation.....	2193
2. Medical Impairment.....	2194
3. Agency-Initiated Retirement.....	2195
a. Assistance in Securing Counsel.....	2198
b. Prior Law: Reasonable Cause to Believe.....	2199
4. Evaluation of Physical Impairment.....	2200
a. Evidence of Recovery Between Date of Removal and MSPB Decision.....	2203
5. Effect of Removal for Inability to Work on OPM Disability Annuity Determination.....	2205
a. Rebuttable Presumption of Annuity Entitlement.....	2205
6. Effect of Grant of Disability Retirement Application on Action Based on Inability to Perform Duties.....	2214
7. Allegation of Disability Discrimination; Lack of Reasonable Accommodation.....	2216
III. SPECIAL CLASSES OF EMPLOYEES.....	2217
A. SENIOR EXECUTIVE SERVICE.....	2217
1. Mitigation of Disciplinary Action.....	2223
2. Performance Case.....	2223
a. Informal Hearing.....	2224
3. Department of Veterans Affairs.....	2225
a. 2014 Legislation.....	2226
B. ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES.....	2231
1. Scope of MSPB Review.....	2235
a. Good Cause.....	2235
b. Penalty Determination.....	2240
c. Affirmative Defenses.....	2241
d. Disability; Accommodation.....	2242
2. Cause for Discipline.....	2243
a. Insubordination.....	2245
b. Performance.....	2246
c. Failure to Follow Performance-Related Directive.....	2250
d. Remarks to Litigant; Comments in Decision; Conduct of Hearing.....	2253
e. Prolonged Absence; Irregular Attendance.....	2254
f. Other Misconduct.....	2255
g. Medical Issues.....	2258
h. Effective Date of Action Sustained by the Board.....	2258
3. Constructive Action Against Judge: <i>Tunik</i>	2259
a. Forced Retirement.....	2266
b. Enforced Leave.....	2267
c. Pre- <i>Tunik</i> Decisions; Judicial Independence.....	2267
4. Furlough; RIF.....	2275
5. Settlement of Complaint.....	2278
6. Voluntary Dismissal of Complaint.....	2279

CHAPTER 7: NEXUS AND PENALTY DETERMINATION.....2281

I.	CONCEPT OF NEXUS.....	2281
A.	MERRITT AND PRESUMPTIONS OF NEXUS; OFF-DUTY CONDUCT	2282
1.	General Approach Toward Proof.....	2285
a.	Actual or Potential Publicity, Notoriety	2285
b.	Potential for Future Harm.....	2286
c.	Investigative Exertion	2286
B.	SPECIFIC NEXUS DETERMINATIONS.....	2286
1.	Arrest	2287
2.	Violent Off-Duty Misconduct.....	2287
a.	Shooting; Killing.....	2287
b.	Assault; Threat.....	2289
3.	Violent Conduct on Agency Premises	2291
4.	Off-Duty Drug Offense	2291
a.	Drug Activity Involving Agency Time or Facilities	2294
5.	Off-Duty Alcohol-Related Offense	2294
a.	Off-Duty Activity Involving Agency Premises.....	2296
6.	Sexual Misconduct.....	2296
7.	Fraud and Theft; Other Integrity Offenses	2308
a.	Off-Duty Offense.....	2308
b.	Preemployment Offense.....	2309
c.	On-Duty or Job-Related Offense.....	2310
8.	Gambling.....	2310
9.	Failure to Pay Debt.....	2310
10.	Grievance Meeting	2313
11.	Conduct Contrary to Agency Mission.....	2313
a.	Real Estate Activity—DHUD	2313
b.	Employee’s Tax Problem—IRS, Other Agencies; Responsibility for Errors of Others.....	2314
c.	Law Enforcement Officer; <i>Giglio</i> Impairment	2319
d.	Driver.....	2324
e.	Strike-Related Conduct	2324
12.	AWOL Removal After Criminal Conviction.....	2324
II.	PENALTIES.....	2324
A.	GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS	2324
1.	<i>Douglas</i> Standards; Decision to Reflect Mitigating Factors or MSPB Imposes Maximum Reasonable Penalty	2326
a.	Consideration of Mitigating Factors	2328
b.	Proposal to List Aggravating Factors; Treatment of Warnings; Due Process Considerations.....	2329
c.	Exemplary Penalty.....	2331
d.	Exaggeration of Charge	2332
2.	Articulation of Relevant Factors.....	2332
a.	By Agency; Decision Notice	2332
b.	By MSPB	2334
3.	Not All Charges Sustained; Maximum Reasonable Penalty.....	2334
a.	Remand to Agency for Redetermination of Penalty.....	2340
4.	All Charges but Not All Specifications Sustained; Partial Specification Sustained.....	2342
5.	Charge Sustained That Was Not Brought	2343
6.	Factors Not Considered Mitigating.....	2343
a.	Disability Discrimination; Impairment.....	2343
b.	Discriminatory Environment	2344
c.	Prohibited Personnel Practice.....	2344
d.	Offer of Settlement	2344
7.	When Mitigation Must Be Raised	2344
8.	OSC Disciplinary Case.....	2345
9.	Impact of Mitigation by Demotion on Labor Agreement Requirement.....	2345
10.	Effect Of OPM Reconsideration Request	2345
11.	Veterans Administration Cases Under 38 USC 714	2346
B.	SPECIFIC MITIGATING OR AGGRAVATING FACTORS.....	2347
1.	Potential for Rehabilitation.....	2347
a.	Deference to Higher Level Management Assessment.....	2347
b.	Forward-Looking Analysis.....	2348
c.	Performance Action.....	2348

d.	Notice of Rule or Policy.....	2349
e.	Temporary Condition; Stress; Alcoholism.....	2350
f.	Long Service.....	2351
g.	Intervening Good Performance; Misconduct Subsequent to Charge Leading to Adverse Action.....	2351
h.	Post-Removal Conduct or Evidence of Rehabilitation.....	2352
i.	Contrition or Remorse; Admission of Misconduct.....	2354
j.	Denial of Misconduct; Vigorous Defense.....	2355
k.	Repeated Misconduct; Last Chance Agreement.....	2356
2.	Psychological Problem; Illness or Treatment; Stress.....	2356
3.	Performance, Evaluations.....	2363
4.	Intent.....	2364
5.	Notoriety.....	2364
6.	Position of Trust; Fiduciary Duty; Loss of Trust.....	2364
7.	Progressive Discipline.....	2367
8.	Table of Penalties; Classification of Offense.....	2369
9.	Disparate; Comparable Penalties.....	2372
a.	Duty of Agency to Inquire Into Comparable Offenses and Penalties.....	2378
b.	Degree of Consistency Required.....	2379
c.	Substantial Similarity of Offenses; Totality of Circumstances.....	2379
d.	Proximity in Time.....	2384
e.	Same Work Unit; Evolving Case Law: Earlier Decisions of <i>Woebcke</i> ; <i>Lewis</i>	2385
f.	Positions of Similar Levels of Trust and Responsibility.....	2393
g.	Selective Prosecution.....	2395
h.	Settlement.....	2395
i.	Comparable Arbitration Awards; Other MSPB Decisions.....	2398
j.	Effect of Criminal Sentence.....	2400
k.	Assertion of Discrimination.....	2400
l.	Post-Removal Comparability Analysis.....	2400
10.	Mandatory Penalty.....	2401
11.	Failure to Maintain Condition of Employment.....	2404
12.	Staleness of Charge.....	2405
13.	Agency Bad Faith, Provocation, Manipulation; Improper Pressure on Appellant; Entrapment.....	2405
14.	Condonation.....	2406
15.	Favorable Attitude of Coworkers; Supervisor.....	2407
16.	Severity of Misconduct.....	2407
a.	Sequential Disciplinary Proposals.....	2407
b.	Multiplicity and Merger of Charges.....	2407
c.	Zero Tolerance Policy.....	2408
17.	Employee Job Level.....	2410
a.	Ineffectiveness as Supervisor; Demotion.....	2410
b.	Reassignment.....	2412
C.	AGENCY CONSIDERATION OF PAST DISCIPLINE.....	2412
1.	Notice Requirement.....	2414
a.	Failure to Include Past Discipline in Proposal: Due Process.....	2415
2.	Proof, Rebuttal of Past Discipline.....	2416
a.	Availability of Challenge to Past Discipline.....	2417
b.	Clearly Erroneous.....	2417
c.	Reprisal.....	2417
d.	Pending Challenge to Past Discipline.....	2418
e.	Past Discipline Reversed After Initial Decision.....	2420
f.	Discipline Imposed After the Appealed Adverse Action.....	2420
g.	Past Discipline Time-Barred.....	2421
h.	Dissimilar Offense.....	2421
i.	Nondisciplinary Sanction.....	2423

CHAPTER 8: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES.....2425

I.	STATUS.....	2425
A.	ABSENCE.....	2425
1.	Impact on Service Efficiency.....	2425
a.	Assigned Post of Duty; Travel Requirement.....	2427
2.	Approved and Disapproved Absence.....	2428

a.	Abuse of Leave	2429
b.	Loafing; Wasting Time	2429
c.	Excessive Leave, LWOP, Absences Beyond Employee's Control; Failure to Maintain a Regular Work Schedule; OWCP Coverage	2429
(i)	Historical Application of <i>Cook</i> and Related Decisions	2434
d.	Unscheduled but Approved Absence Following Failure to Follow Procedure to Request Leave	2440
e.	Disability	2443
3.	Tardiness	2444
4.	Leave-Requesting, Leave-Reporting Requirement	2445
a.	Leave Restriction Notice	2449
b.	Justification for Leave; Medical Certification Requirement; Merger of Charges	2449
c.	Other Certification or Documentation Requirement	2451
d.	Disability Accommodation	2451
5.	Proof of AWOL; Telework Status; Leave Request	2451
6.	Evidence of Illness First Submitted to MSPB	2454
a.	FMLA	2456
7.	LWOP; Other Leave Arrangement; Compensable Injury; Disability Accommodation	2456
a.	Executive Order 5396; Wounded Warriors Federal Leave Act; Disabled Veteran	2460
b.	Advanced Sick Leave	2461
c.	Donated Leave	2461
8.	Family Leave	2461
a.	FMLA Request, Agency Compliance; Medical Documentation	2467
b.	Constructive Request	2475
c.	Belated Submission of Request, Documentation	2478
d.	Abuse of Family Leave	2480
9.	Worker's Compensation Issue	2480
a.	Determining Whether Removal Is Based on Reason Unrelated to OWCP Entitlement	2482
b.	Leave-Reporting Requirement	2483
c.	No Foreseeable End to Absence; Absence When Compensation Ends	2484
10.	Leave Status Pending Disability Retirement	2486
11.	Incarceration; Work-Release Program	2486
12.	Cancellation or Conversion of Approved Leave	2488
13.	Absence Caused by Fear for Safety	2488
14.	Military Leave	2489
15.	Religious Leave	2489
16.	Problem Following Reinstatement Through MSPB Order	2489
17.	Agency Abuse of Discretion	2490
a.	Ambiguous Leave Policy or Directive	2491
b.	Condonation of AWOL	2491
c.	Leave Status Caused by Agency's Wrongful Action	2491
d.	Jury Duty	2491
18.	Aggravating Factors	2491
a.	Prolonged AWOL	2491
b.	Frequent AWOL	2492
c.	Unreliable Attendance	2492
19.	Mitigating Factors	2492
a.	Short, Infrequent AWOL	2493
b.	Longer AWOL	2494
B.	REFUSAL TO ACCEPT REASSIGNMENT	2495
1.	General Rule	2497
a.	SES Employee	2502
2.	Inconvenience or Health Problem	2504
3.	Agency Burden of Proof; Legitimate Reason for Reassignment	2504
a.	Mobility Agreement; Condition of Employment	2507
b.	Return From Overseas Assignment	2508
4.	Misconduct Following Improper Reassignment	2509
5.	Application of RIF Procedures; Procedural Errors	2509
C.	FAILURE TO MAINTAIN OR OBTAIN CONDITION OF POSITION	2509
1.	License, Certification	2509
a.	Lawyer	2509
b.	Driver	2510

c.	Others	2511
d.	Medical Certification, Credential, or Standard	2512
e.	Law Enforcement.....	2513
f.	Certification by Military Authority.....	2513
2.	Failure to Complete Training Course; Validity of Examination.....	2513
a.	Air Traffic Controller	2513
b.	Other Positions	2516
3.	Lack of or Loss of Minimum Qualification; Position Requirement	2518
a.	Indian Child Protection and Family Violence Prevention Act	2519
b.	Lautenberg Amendment.....	2521
c.	Removal From Reserve Status.....	2523
d.	Access to Agency Computer, Network	2528
e.	Failure to Exercise or Obtain Return Right From Overseas Employment.....	2528
4.	Security Clearance Revocation; Sensitive Position.....	2530
a.	Clearance Process.....	2531
b.	Agency Clearance Proceeding.....	2531
c.	Review of Agency Determination; <i>Egan</i> ; Constitutional Due Process.....	2536
d.	Decision to Require a Clearance; Whether Clearance Required as Employment Condition.....	2542
e.	Reassignment to Nonsensitive Position; Mitigation	2547
f.	EEO Issue; Whistleblower Reprisal; Disparate Treatment; USERRA	2549
g.	Regulatory Infraction During Revocation Process.....	2551
h.	Suspension, Removal Under 5 USC 7532.....	2558
i.	Suitability Determination, Security Clearance Distinguished	2559
j.	Sensitive Duties Not Requiring a Clearance: <i>Conyers</i>	2559
k.	Decisions Postdating <i>Conyers</i>	2579
l.	Requirement Similar to Security Clearance; Public Trust Position	2583
m.	TSA Sensitive Security Information.....	2585
n.	Retirement Issue Related to Removal for Loss of Clearance	2586
5.	Lack of Suitability for Continued Employment	2587
6.	Mitigation.....	2588
D.	CONFLICTS OF INTEREST; APPARENT CONFLICTS.....	2588
1.	Conflicts; Improper Business Dealings	2589
2.	Apparent Conflicts.....	2591
3.	Use of Government Office for Private Gain.....	2591
4.	Nonpublic Information	2593
a.	Nondisclosure Agreements	2594
5.	Transaction With Another; Gift; Bribe; Honorarium; Loan	2595
a.	Transaction With Patron, Vendor, Inmate.....	2595
b.	Transaction With Supervisor; Subordinate.....	2596
c.	Compensation for Government Service From Another Source.....	2597
6.	Acting as Agent or Attorney Against Government.....	2597
E.	OUTSIDE EMPLOYMENT	2597
1.	Personal Work on Government Time	2597
a.	Reporting, Approval Requirements.....	2597
b.	Employment in Violation of Agency Restriction; Outside Practice of Law	2598
F.	SPECIAL CATEGORIES OF EMPLOYEES	2598
1.	Guard, Correctional Officer, Police, Investigator, Security Official	2598
2.	Immigration Officer	2599
3.	Ship Employee.....	2599
4.	Supervisor.....	2599
G.	STRIKES.....	2600
1.	Charge of Striking	2600
2.	Basis for Removal	2600
3.	Proof of Participation	2600
4.	Refuting Participation.....	2601
5.	Fear for Personal Safety.....	2601
a.	Insufficient Threat.....	2602
b.	Duress, Coercion Established	2602
6.	Association With Strikers	2602
7.	Influence of Political Leader	2602
8.	Penalty.....	2602

9. Other Issues.....	2602
II. RELATIONSHIPS	2602
A. INSUBORDINATION AND SIMILAR MISCONDUCT	2602
1. Refusal or Failure to Perform Work.....	2604
a. Proof of Intent.....	2604
2. Failure to Follow Instruction.....	2605
3. Failure to Follow Policy, Regulation.....	2607
4. Disruptiveness; Lack of Cooperation.....	2608
5. Recording of Conversation	2608
6. Cumulative Insubordination	2609
7. Dispute Over Position Responsibilities.....	2609
a. Difficulty Following Reinstatement	2610
b. Breach of Settlement Agreement.....	2611
8. Insolence, Abusive Language	2611
a. Abuse of Coworker, Subordinate.....	2611
b. Abuse of Supervisor; Disrespectful or Coarse Language.....	2612
c. Disagreement Over Instruction, Program	2614
9. Misuse of Dispute Resolution Procedure.....	2614
a. EEO Process.....	2615
b. Congressional Communication.....	2615
c. Grievance Proceeding.....	2615
d. Supervisor	2617
e. Interference With Employee Grievance.....	2617
10. Refusal to Take Fitness Examination.....	2617
a. Properly Ordered	2618
b. Improperly Ordered.....	2619
11. Failure to Provide Medical Information; Position Requirement	2622
12. Refusal to Submit to Search or Drug Test	2625
13. Problems During Investigations: Lack of Cooperation; Interference; Self-Incrimination.....	2628
14. Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence	2637
15. Defenses	2637
a. Inability to Comply.....	2638
b. Unclear Order; Unknown Policy.....	2638
c. Constitutional, Similar Challenge	2638
d. Improper Directive; Command Influence.....	2639
e. Federal Labor Law Policy; Collective Bargaining Contract.....	2643
f. Fear for Safety or Other Harm	2644
16. Mitigating Factors.....	2646
B. SEXUAL MISCONDUCT.....	2648
1. Sexual Harassment; Inappropriate Behavior	2649
a. Past Significance of Psychological Harm.....	2655
b. Charge Based on Agency Regulation or Standard of Conduct Not Tied to Title VII	2661
c. Physical Contact.....	2666
d. Offensive Remarks; Photos.....	2669
e. Consensual Conduct Affecting Workplace.....	2674
f. Homosexual Conduct	2675
2. Misconduct Toward Agency Client, Affiliate.....	2675
3. Misconduct Toward Child.....	2675
4. Penalties for Sexual Misconduct.....	2675
a. Demotion, Suspension	2676
b. Removal	2676
5. Defenses	2677
C. CONDUCT HARMING OTHERS; CRIMINAL VIOLATIONS	2678
1. Threat; Inappropriate Conduct.....	2678
a. Metz Test	2680
b. Reaction of Others to Threat	2682
c. Threat Through Another; Rumor.....	2684
d. Conditional Threat.....	2685
e. Statement to Therapist; EAP Counselor; Accommodation Specialist.....	2688
f. Statement to Union Representative	2690
g. Threat Against a Coworker.....	2692

h.	Threat Against a Supervisor.....	2692
i.	Threat Against Others.....	2693
j.	Thought of Violence.....	2693
k.	Inappropriate or Disruptive Statement Not Charged as Threat.....	2694
l.	Mitigation.....	2697
2.	Assault.....	2697
a.	Against Coworker.....	2697
b.	Against Supervisor.....	2698
c.	Against Subordinate.....	2698
d.	Against Others.....	2698
e.	Defenses.....	2699
f.	Mitigation; Aggravation.....	2699
3.	Fighting; Self Defense.....	2701
4.	Gambling.....	2702
5.	Threat of Legal Action, Whistleblowing, or Publicity.....	2703
6.	Lawsuit.....	2704
7.	Discourtesy; Related Problems.....	2705
a.	Profanity.....	2706
8.	Improper Conduct Toward Patient, Ward, Others.....	2706
9.	Invidious Discrimination; Offensive Remark or Conduct; Preferential Treatment; Reprisal.....	2708
a.	Nepotism; Hiring of Friend.....	2712
D.	ACTION AGAINST SUPERVISOR FOR WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL, OTHER PROHIBITED PRACTICES.....	2715
E.	CRITICAL STATEMENTS.....	2719
1.	Constitutional Framework Applied in Federal Sector.....	2726
a.	Private Speech.....	2729
2.	Criticism of Agency or Its Personnel.....	2729
a.	Constitutional Analysis.....	2729
b.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Analysis.....	2732
c.	Defamation; Related Conduct.....	2733
d.	Congressional Communication.....	2735
e.	Political Activity and Speech.....	2736
f.	Concept of Loyalty.....	2738
3.	Internal Criticism.....	2738
a.	Constitutional Analysis.....	2738
b.	Managerial Disagreement.....	2739
c.	Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence.....	2740
d.	Criticism, False Statement About Coworker, Subordinate, Supervisor.....	2740
III.	INTEGRITY.....	2743
A.	FALSIFICATION AND MISREPRESENTATION.....	2743
1.	Proof of Fraud; Falsification.....	2746
a.	Neglect or Mistake.....	2750
b.	Perjury.....	2752
c.	Failure to Correct Report of Another.....	2753
d.	Reliance on Advice of Counsel or Other Individual.....	2753
e.	Cumulative False Statements.....	2754
2.	Employment Application; Security Questionnaire; Lack of Candor.....	2754
a.	Criminal Record.....	2758
b.	Education; Experience.....	2759
c.	Pre-Employment Medical Inquiry.....	2761
3.	Compensation Claim; Voucher.....	2763
a.	Overtime.....	2763
b.	Travel Voucher, Related Documentation.....	2764
c.	OWCP Claim.....	2766
d.	Unemployment Compensation.....	2768
e.	Disability or Leave Claim.....	2768
f.	Pay and Allowances Claim.....	2768
4.	Records of Time, Attendance, Work, and Pay; Negligence.....	2769
5.	Medical Certificate.....	2771
6.	Alteration, Failure to Preserve Documentation and Evidence.....	2771
7.	Investigative Misrepresentation; "Exculpatory No".....	2772
8.	Lack of Candor.....	2773

9. Failure to Report Misconduct	2778
10. Disclosure Statement.....	2778
11. Mitigating, Exculpatory Factors	2778
a. Time, Attendance, Travel Record.....	2781
b. Medical Certificate	2781
c. Request for Medical Information; ADA.....	2781
d. Employment Application.....	2783
B. REMOVAL, MISUSE OF PROPERTY	2784
1. Service Efficiency.....	2784
2. Burden of Proof.....	2785
a. Conversion	2785
b. Unauthorized Possession or Removal of Property; Theft.....	2786
c. Unauthorized Use.....	2787
d. Common Possession	2787
e. Evidence of Intent: Theft and Unauthorized Possession.....	2788
3. Petty Theft.....	2789
a. Shoplifting	2791
b. Significance of Custody and Control of Property.....	2791
4. Government Vehicle.....	2794
a. Deviation From Assigned Route; Minor Personal Use; Public Service Exception	2799
b. Nonstatutory Vehicle Misuse Charge; Impaired Driver.....	2799
5. Unauthorized Use, Theft, or Destruction of Specific Property	2800
a. Computer; Internet	2800
b. Photocopier; Facsimile.....	2802
c. Telephone.....	2802
d. Government Credit Card.....	2802
e. Government Services or Funds	2803
f. Government Records; Official Information; Privacy Act; PII	2804
g. Black Marketing; Diversion of Property	2819
h. Obstruction, Theft, or Mistreatment of Mail	2820
i. Misuse of Official Mail, Delivery Service	2821
j. Concealment of Theft	2821
k. Mitigating Factors	2821
IV. DRUGS AND ALCOHOL.....	2823
A. DRUG AND ALCOHOL OFFENSES	2823
1. Drug Possession, Use, Distribution	2824
a. Possession or Use	2824
b. Sale or Distribution	2827
c. Safe Harbor Provision.....	2827
2. Alcohol	2829
3. Mitigation.....	2830
V. PERFORMANCE.....	2833
A. PERFORMANCE AS BASIS FOR ADVERSE ACTION	2833
1. Performance Evaluations.....	2834
2. Performance Standards	2835
a. <i>Ad Hoc</i> Measure	2835
b. Assigned Standard	2837
c. Measurement of Work Error.....	2838
3. Responsibility for Work Error.....	2839
4. Mitigating Factors; Choice of Penalty	2839
a. Comparative Performance	2840
b. New Duties.....	2840
c. Detail, Special Assignment.....	2842
d. Progressive Discipline	2842
e. Lack of Training	2842
f. Lack of Improvement Period	2843
g. Demotion or Reassignment.....	2843
h. Suspension.....	2844
5. Performance-Based Actions Against VA Employees Under 38 USC 714	2845
B. NEGLIGENCE	2847
1. Endangerment of Employees	2849

2. Public Safety Risk.....	2849
3. Destruction or Loss of Property	2850
4. Medical Error.....	2850
5. Mishandling or Improper Possession of Weapon.....	2850
6. Inattention to Duty; Sleeping on Job.....	2851
7. Failure to Follow Procedure	2851
a. Submission of Inaccurate Information	2852
8. Excessive Expenditure; Waste	2852
C. MEDICAL INABILITY TO PERFORM	2852
1. Specific Medical Or Physical Standard.....	2861
2. Penalty Analysis	2863
3. Disability Accommodation Analysis.....	2864
4. Recovery From Disability.....	2865

CHAPTER 9: PERFORMANCE CASES2869

I. UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE CASES	2869
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS: EMPLOYEE AND AGENCY COVERAGE	2871
1. OPM Regulations.....	2872
a. Critical Elements	2874
B. OVERVIEW OF PERFORMANCE ACTIONS	2875
1. Merit Pay Employee.....	2876
C. OPM APPROVAL OF APPRAISAL SYSTEM.....	2876
1. Change in Appraisal System.....	2878
2. Flexibility Permitted by Appraisal System; Skeletal Plans	2881
3. Extent of OPM Review; Subordinate Organization Within Agency.....	2882
4. Change Directed by OPM.....	2883
D. PERFORMANCE STANDARD CRITERIA	2883
1. Substantive Right.....	2885
a. Identification of Critical Element	2885
2. Scope of Review.....	2885
a. Deference to Agency Management.....	2886
3. Objectivity	2888
a. Timeliness of Work	2890
b. Draft; Intermediate Work Product; Revisions or Rewrites	2891
c. Personal Characteristic: Initiative, Reliability	2891
4. Standards Development; Employee Involvement	2891
5. <i>Wilson and Jackson</i> ; Negative or "Backwards" Standard.....	2892
6. Communication of Standard.....	2896
7. Change in Standard.....	2896
8. Augmentation of Standard; Subjective Standard	2897
9. PIP to Establish, Refine Standard	2900
10. Specific Occupations.....	2903
a. Clerical Employee, Secretary	2903
b. Voucher Examiner	2905
c. Inspector.....	2905
d. Social Security Claims Representative	2905
e. Employee Relations, Human Relations Specialist.....	2905
f. Trade Analyst.....	2906
g. Medical Technologist; Nurse.....	2906
h. Scientist.....	2906
i. Tradesperson.....	2907
j. IT Specialist	2907
k. Supervisory Supply Technician.....	2907
l. Engineer.....	2907
m. Lawyer	2908
n. Paralegal	2908
o. Management Analyst.....	2908
p. Realty Specialist	2908
q. Others	2909
11. Numeric Standard.....	2909
12. Multiple Components.....	2910

13. Classification, Significance of Error	2913
14. Relation of Standards in Element	2913
15. Absolute Standard; <i>Guillebeau</i>	2914
a. Law Before <i>Guillebeau</i>	2918
b. Standard to Be Viewed as a Whole	2919
c. Modification of Absolute Standard	2919
d. Standard That Enumerates Tasks	2920
e. Level of Performance That May Be Exceeded	2921
16. Unreasonable Standard	2921
17. Levels of Performance	2923
a. Five-Tier Appraisal System; Marginal, Minimally Successful, or “Needs Improvement” Level of Performance	2923
b. Multiple Appraisal Levels Derived From Ratings for Critical Elements	2927
c. Two-Level; Pass/Fail Appraisal System	2928
E. OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE	2929
1. Prerequisite of Unacceptable Performance; Pre-PIP Performance; <i>Santos</i>	2930
2. Opportunity Period Requirements	2933
a. Order, Burden of Proof	2933
b. Control Over Work	2934
c. Assistance to Employee	2934
d. Necessity for Specific Warning	2936
e. Statement of Expectations; Job Responsibilities Not Described in PIP	2937
f. Impossibility of Improvement; Unreasonable Expectations	2937
g. Harmful Error Rule	2938
3. Time Allowed for Improvement	2939
a. One-Year Maximum for Evaluation; Pre-PIP Performance	2941
b. Post-PIP Performance; Roller Coaster Employees	2943
c. PIP Extension	2946
d. Performance During Detail	2947
F. PROCEDURE	2947
1. Chapter 43 and 75 Actions Distinguished	2947
a. Executive Order 13,839; Executive Order 14,003	2948
2. Department of Veterans Affairs	2949
3. Failure to Use Chapter 43	2950
a. <i>Lovshin</i> ; Combined Action Under Chapters 75 and 43	2951
b. Conversion of Action	2953
4. Limitations on Use of Chapter 43	2956
5. Proposal, Decision Letter	2957
a. Requirement of Concurrence	2957
b. Unstated Charge	2957
c. Necessity for Specific Instances	2957
d. Notice Period	2959
G. NECESSARY PROOF: SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE	2959
1. Test Defined; Scope of Review	2959
2. Weight, Quality of Substantial Evidence	2960
a. Charges, Work Papers	2961
b. Effect of Prior Performance Evaluation; Rating Issued in Error	2962
c. Statistics; Sampling Method	2963
d. Other Documentation; Testimony	2964
H. DEFENSES	2965
1. Propriety and Comparison of Performance Standards	2965
2. Comparison of Employees’ Performance	2965
3. Adequacy of PIP; Lack of Control of Work; Agency Bad Faith	2966
4. Training	2968
5. Discrimination; Disparate Treatment	2969
6. Reprisal	2973
7. Collective Bargaining Contract	2974
I. PRECLUSION OF MITIGATION	2974
II. WITHIN-GRADE INCREASE DENIALS	2975
A. BASIS FOR APPEAL	2977
B. WHEN JURISDICTION ATTACHES	2977
1. Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract	2983

a.	EEO Allegation	2983
b.	Allegation of Other Prohibited Personnel Practice	2984
C.	BURDEN OF PROOF	2985
1.	Proof of Poor Performance	2985
a.	Role of Performance Standards.....	2986
2.	Substantial Evidence Controls.....	2986
a.	What Constitutes Evidence	2986
D.	DEFENSES.....	2987
1.	Error in ALOC Procedure	2987
a.	Linkage of ALOC and Appraisal System	2987
b.	Waiting Period	2988
c.	Lack of ALOC Determination	2988
d.	Vague ALOC Determination	2989
2.	Reconsideration Errors	2989
a.	Employee Denied Information	2989
b.	Reconsideration Summary Lacking.....	2989
c.	Reconsideration Decision Level	2989
d.	Late Reconsideration Decision	2989
3.	Circumstances of Employee.....	2989
a.	Unfair Work Burden.....	2989
b.	Illness or Disability	2990
c.	Comparative Work Production	2990
d.	Lack of Training	2990

CHAPTER 10: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE.....2991

I.	RIF PROCESS	2991
A.	NATURE OF RIF	2991
1.	Statutory Provisions	2992
2.	OPM Regulations, Guidance.....	2993
a.	Validity of RIF Statute, Regulations	2995
3.	Furlough	2995
a.	Exemptions.....	3007
b.	Emergency Furlough.....	3009
c.	Part-Time, Light Duty Status; Intermittent Appointment; Work Schedule Adjustment.....	3009
d.	Discovery in Furlough Appeal.....	3010
B.	ACTIONS APPEALABLE AS RIF; MSPB JURISDICTION	3012
1.	Regulatory Structure.....	3012
2.	Jurisdictional Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract	3013
3.	Types of Appointees.....	3013
a.	Temporary	3013
b.	Probationer	3014
c.	Demonstration Project	3014
d.	Postal Service Non-Preference Eligible.....	3017
e.	Part-Time.....	3018
f.	Senior Executive Service	3018
g.	Agencies With Independent Statutory Personnel Authority	3021
4.	Possible RIF.....	3022
5.	Action to Avoid RIF	3022
a.	Transfer to Another Agency.....	3023
b.	Resignation.....	3023
c.	Retirement	3023
d.	Detail.....	3023
e.	Reassignment Without Regard to RIF	3024
(i)	Representative Rate	3025
f.	Reassignment During or Following RIF	3026
g.	Reassignment With Pay Reduction in Anticipation of RIF.....	3027
(i)	Postal Reorganizations: 1990s.....	3028
(ii)	Postal Reorganizations: 2000 Onward.....	3035
(iii)	Other Agencies	3040
6.	Grade and Pay Retention; Pay Rate Change; Demotion; Reduction in Hours	3043
7.	Classification Issue	3044

a.	Erosion of Duties.....	3046
b.	Intentional Changes in Duties	3047
8.	Transfer of Function.....	3048
a.	Identification of Positions for Transfer	3050
b.	Employee Who Declines to Move	3052
C.	COMPETITIVE AREA.....	3053
1.	Defined	3053
2.	Criteria.....	3053
3.	Assignment Across Competitive Area	3053
4.	Challenge to Competitive Area.....	3053
a.	Burden of Proof.....	3054
b.	Organizational Structure; One-Person RIF.....	3054
c.	Geographical Structure; Local Commuting Area	3057
D.	COMPETITIVE LEVEL	3057
1.	Defined	3058
2.	Challenge to Competitive Level.....	3059
a.	Primacy of Position Description.....	3060
b.	Testimony Concerning Duties.....	3063
c.	Loss of Productivity; Undue Interruption	3064
d.	Collective Bargaining Contract.....	3065
e.	Challenge to Performance Appraisal.....	3065
3.	Particular Groups of Employees.....	3067
a.	Developmental/Trainee	3067
b.	Temporary.....	3067
c.	Part-Time.....	3067
d.	VA Health Care Professional.....	3067
e.	Bureau of Indian Affairs; Indian Health Service	3070
4.	Impact of Competitive Error Level	3070
a.	Impact of Error.....	3071
b.	Right to Hearing.....	3071
c.	Substantive Review.....	3071
II.	ASSIGNMENT AND RELATED RIGHTS	3072
A.	REGULATORY AND OPERATIONAL BASIS.....	3072
1.	Veteran, Other Preferences.....	3074
2.	Appointment Qualifying for Assignment Right	3076
a.	Excepted Service.....	3076
b.	Detail.....	3076
c.	Intergovernmental Personnel Act	3076
d.	Part-Time/Full-Time.....	3076
3.	Position Subject to Displacement.....	3077
a.	Supervisory.....	3077
b.	Temporary.....	3077
4.	Filling of Vacancies.....	3077
5.	Assessment of Qualifications	3079
a.	Updating Qualifications	3082
b.	Qualifications of Displacing Employee	3083
c.	Merit Promotion Issue.....	3083
d.	Undue Interruption.....	3083
6.	Representative Rate	3084
7.	Amendment of RIF Notice; Change in Position Offer.....	3085
B.	BUMPING.....	3086
C.	RETREAT	3088
1.	Prior Rule	3089
2.	Method of Analysis	3089
3.	Burden of Proof.....	3091
D.	REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS	3092
1.	Reemployment Priority List Before RIF Effective Date	3104
2.	Remedy in Reemployment Priority List Appeal	3105
3.	Transitional Assistance	3106
III.	RIF CHALLENGES.....	3106
A.	BURDEN OF PROOF	3106

1. Agency Responsibility	3107
2. Agency's <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	3107
3. Qualifications; Assignment Right	3107
4. Classification Dispute	3108
B. <i>BONA FIDE RIF: LOSURE</i>	3108
1. Substantive Rights, Harmful Error	3109
2. RIF as Adverse Action.....	3111
3. Challenge to Reorganization	3115
a. Reorganization Defined; Single Position RIF	3115
b. Managerial Discretion.....	3116
c. Funding Decision.....	3116
d. Redistribution of Duties	3118
e. Planning for Future Events	3119
f. Comparative Qualifications as a Factor in Selection of Positions for RIF.....	3119
g. Contribution to Agency Mission; Funding of Individual Position.....	3120
h. Contracting Out Challenge	3120
i. Sham, Paperwork Reorganization: Old, New Position Identical; Delayed Reorganization	3121
j. Merit Promotion, Hiring, Placement During RIF.....	3124
k. Events Preceding, Subsequent to RIF.....	3124
C. DISCRIMINATION DEFENSES	3125
1. Age	3129
2. Religion	3130
D. PROCEDURAL ISSUES.....	3131
1. Internal Procedures	3131
2. Timing of Job Offer; Timing of Release of Employees.....	3131
3. Correction of Retention Standing Error	3131
4. Adequacy of RIF Notice.....	3131

CHAPTER 11: HARMFUL ERROR.....3133

I. STATUTORY STANDARD	3133
A. HARMFUL ERROR DEFINED.....	3133
1. <i>Parker</i>	3135
2. Might Have/Would Have Analysis.....	3135
B. HARMFUL ERROR APPLIED	3136
1. Mixing Harmful Error and Other Doctrines.....	3136
a. Mitigation of Penalty	3136
b. Prohibited Personnel Practice.....	3137
2. Statutory, Regulatory Violation; Action Not in Accordance With Law	3137
a. Unfair Labor Practice	3139
b. Privacy Act; Disclosure of Confidential Information	3141
c. Constitution.....	3142
d. Invalid Regulation	3142
3. Collective Bargaining Contract Violation.....	3143
a. Disputed Coverage	3145
b. Impact of Arbitration Award.....	3145
c. Employment Contract	3146
4. Problem With Representation	3146
a. Cautionary Notes to Counsel	3146
5. Treatment of Affirmative Defense if Action Is Set Aside as Erroneous.....	3147
II. ERROR IN PRELIMINARY PROCEDURES.....	3147
A. AGENCY INVESTIGATION	3147
1. Due Process	3148
2. Right to Counsel; Union Representative.....	3148
3. Entrapment	3151
4. Agency Predecisional Hearing	3151
5. Security Clearance Investigation	3151
B. STALE CHARGES; LACHES	3152
1. General Rule	3152
2. Agency Regulation; Collective Bargaining Contract	3154
3. Performance Case	3155
C. ESTOPPEL; DOUBLE JEOPARDY	3155

1. Estoppel.....	3155
2. Double Jeopardy.....	3155
a. Reinitiation of a Proposal After an Adverse Action Is Canceled.....	3163
b. Action Initiated After Earlier Action Invalidated for Procedural Reason.....	3164
c. Consecutive Adverse Actions.....	3165
d. Action Following Acquittal.....	3166
III. ERRORS IN PROPOSAL NOTICE AND REPLY PROCESS.....	3166
A. BASIC RIGHTS.....	3166
1. Predecision Proposal Not Mandated in Some Cases When Due Process Is Provided Following Decision.....	3168
2. Right to Counsel.....	3171
B. PROPOSAL NOTICE.....	3171
1. Purpose, Sufficiency of Notice; Due Process.....	3171
a. Supporting Evidence.....	3173
b. Technical Deficiencies.....	3175
c. Failure to Provide Notice of Appeal or Statutory Right.....	3175
d. Error in Date.....	3175
e. Other Minor Error.....	3176
f. Assessing Sufficiency of Charge.....	3177
2. Specific Charge; Only Conduct Described.....	3181
a. Conduct Postdating Proposal.....	3186
b. Amendment.....	3186
3. Framing of Charge.....	3186
a. General Charge; Charge Label; Detailed Narrative; <i>Otero</i> and <i>Cross</i>	3186
b. Variation Between Stated Charge and Supporting Narrative or Specification; <i>Nazelrod</i> and <i>Lachance</i>	3190
c. Splitting of Charge.....	3196
d. Independent Elements of Single Charge.....	3198
e. Multiple Specifications Supporting a Single Charge.....	3202
f. Lesser Included Offense.....	3205
4. Past Discipline; Performance Record; Aggravating Factors.....	3205
5. Citation of Standards of Conduct.....	3206
6. Charge Tied to Penalty Table Classification.....	3206
7. Criminal Charge.....	3207
8. Mixing Chapters 43 and 75.....	3207
9. Cumulative Charges; Merger of Charges.....	3207
10. Charge of Unbecoming or Improper or Unprofessional Conduct.....	3210
C. INADEQUATE REPLY AND NOTICE PERIOD.....	3212
1. Calculation.....	3212
2. Not Less Than Seven Days for Reply.....	3212
3. 30-Day Advance Notice of Action.....	3215
4. Service of Notice.....	3216
D. SHORTENED NOTICE PERIOD; CRIME PROVISION.....	3218
1. Procedure to Invoke Shortened Notice.....	3219
2. Reasonable Belief of Crime.....	3220
a. Arrest, Warrant.....	3222
b. Conduct Caused by Mental Impairment.....	3222
3. Emergency Suspension for Reason Other Than Reasonable Belief of Crime.....	3222
4. Indefinite Suspension.....	3223
E. FAILURE TO PROVIDE EVIDENCE FILE, OTHER INFORMATION.....	3223
1. Loss or Destruction of Evidence.....	3226
F. ORAL AND WRITTEN REPLIES.....	3226
1. Proof of Harm; Failure to Consider a Reply; Due Process.....	3229
a. Investigation of Information Provided by the Employee.....	3235
b. Criminal Proceeding Pending.....	3236
2. Waiver of Reply Right.....	3236
a. Extension Request.....	3237
3. Decisionmaker, Reply Officer.....	3240
4. Right to Confrontation.....	3241
5. Right to Information.....	3241
6. Inadequate Representation.....	3241
G. AGENCY DECISIONAL PROCEDURES; <i>EX PARTE</i> COMMUNICATIONS.....	3241
1. Early Law From Courts.....	3242

2.	<i>Sullivan</i> ; Adverse External Influences.....	3244
3.	<i>Stone</i> ; Broadened Due Process Test; Clarifying or Cumulative Information.....	3247
a.	Reinitiation of Action Following Due Process Reversal	3255
4.	Early Law From MSPB.....	3256
5.	Deciding Official Consults Witness, Advisor; Information Not Disclosed to Employee	3258
a.	Information From Witness.....	3259
b.	Impact of 5 USC 2302(b)(2)	3260
c.	Report, Investigation.....	3260
d.	Advisor.....	3260
e.	Past Discipline as Rebuttal to Mitigation	3261
f.	Multiple Charges.....	3261
6.	Proposing and Deciding Official Confer; Same Proposing and Deciding Official.....	3262
7.	Information Pertaining to Aggravation or Mitigation of Penalty; <i>Ward</i>	3263
a.	Mitigating Information.....	3283
b.	Potential Publicity, Notoriety, Other Harm.....	3283
c.	Information or Documents in the Evidence File Not Referenced in the Proposal	3286
d.	Information Provided to the Deciding Official Before the Reply Process Begins	3287
e.	Evaluation of Information Presented During Reply	3288
f.	Penalty Table, Standards of Conduct.....	3289
g.	Performance Cases.....	3291
h.	Harmful Error Analysis Before <i>Ward</i>	3294
8.	Predisposition to Take Adverse Action; Offer to Permit Resignation.....	3294
a.	Biased Proposing Official.....	3299
b.	Malicious Initiation of Action	3299
c.	Deciding Official Who Is Biased, Whose Decision Is Directed, Who Lacks Discretion	3299
9.	Involvement of OSC.....	3302
10.	Changes in Proposing, Deciding Official	3302
11.	Lack of Authority	3306
a.	Deciding Official	3306
b.	Proposing Official	3308
12.	Pending Retirement Application.....	3308
13.	Specificity of Decision Letter.....	3308
a.	No Decision Letter.....	3309
b.	Retroactive Decision Letter.....	3309
c.	Notice of Appeal Rights.....	3309
14.	Delayed Decision.....	3310

CHAPTER 12: DISCRIMINATION3311

I.	DISCRIMINATION ISSUES.....	3311
A.	PROCEDURES IN MIXED CASES.....	3312
1.	Multiple Agency Review Processes.....	3313
2.	Multiple Filing Options; Pleading Requirements; Timing of MSPB Appeal.....	3315
a.	Withdrawal or Abandonment of EEO Allegation	3316
b.	Authority of Judge to Strike Frivolous EEO Allegation; Summary Judgment	3316
3.	Jurisdictional Problems With EEO Complaints	3320
a.	Filing Dates	3320
b.	Timeliness of EEO Complaint	3321
c.	EEO Class Action	3325
d.	EEO Complaint Withdrawn.....	3327
e.	What Constitutes a Complaint.....	3327
f.	Coextensive Issues; Scope of Complaint.....	3328
g.	Premature Appeal	3329
h.	VA Employees' Appeals From Actions Under 38 USC 714.....	3329
4.	Duty of Judge to Resolve Issues and Inform Appellant of Elements of Proof.....	3331
5.	Jurisdiction Over Appealable Action; Constructive Adverse Action	3332
a.	Probationer	3333
b.	Restoration Appeal Involving Employee Partially Recovered From Compensable Injury	3334
6.	Election of Remedies	3334
a.	Election Through Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance	3334
b.	Election Between EEO and Direct MSPB Appeal; Treatment of EEO Complaint	3337

c.	Effect of Subject Matter of Preexisting Complaint on Subsequent Appeal; Complaint Involving Proposed Action.....	3338
7.	MSPB Remand; EEOC Remand	3340
8.	Strategic Considerations.....	3342
B.	BURDEN OF PROOF	3342
1.	<i>Prima Facie</i> Case.....	3344
2.	Analysis Following the <i>Prima Facie</i> Case	3347
a.	Analysis of Motivation, Pretext	3350
b.	Mixed Motives; Proof That Action Would Have Been Taken Without Discriminatory Motive	3352
c.	Element of Intent; Employer Error	3359
d.	Significance of Agency's Proof of Charges	3360
e.	Significance of Agency's Failure to Prove Charge	3361
f.	Comparable Employees; Disparate Treatment	3362
C.	EVIDENCE	3369
1.	Direct Evidence; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators; Taint of Agency Official; Cat's Paw.....	3369
2.	Circumstantial Evidence; Pretext; Presumption	3373
3.	Disparate Impact	3375
4.	Statistics.....	3377
5.	Supervisory Practices; Remarks.....	3378
D.	FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION.....	3378
1.	Race	3379
2.	Age	3380
3.	Religion.....	3386
a.	Mask Requirement	3387
4.	Marital Status.....	3389
5.	Pregnancy.....	3389
6.	Sex; Sexual Orientation; Equal Pay Act.....	3389
7.	Retirement Cases: Application by OPM of Statutory Requirements.....	3390
E.	REPRISAL.....	3390
1.	Convincing Mosaic; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators.....	3402
2.	Collateral Personnel Action of Evidentiary Weight in an EEO Affirmative Defense.....	3406
3.	Taint of Reprisal by Lower Level Official; Cat's Paw	3407
4.	Opposition.....	3408
II.	REHABILITATION ACT: DISABLING CONDITIONS	3409
A.	REGULATORY STRUCTURE.....	3410
1.	Reprisal Under the ADA	3415
B.	<i>PRIMA FACIE</i> CASE; ACCOMMODATION REQUIREMENTS	3415
1.	Accommodation Must be Requested	3419
2.	Individual Regarded or Perceived as Disabled	3419
3.	Individual Associated With Disabled Person	3426
4.	Substantial Limitation of Major Life Activity	3426
a.	Life Activity of Working	3428
5.	Order and Burden of Proof.....	3432
a.	Disparate Treatment	3441
b.	Mixed Motive, "But For" Analysis	3442
6.	Causal Connection.....	3445
7.	Transitory or Temporary Disability.....	3447
a.	Corrected or Mitigated Condition	3449
8.	Limitation on General Employability	3449
a.	Allergy.....	3451
b.	Stress Disorder.....	3453
c.	Other Mental Disability; Proof of Disability.....	3458
9.	Conditions Not Protected by Rehabilitation Act	3459
a.	Gambling Compulsion	3459
b.	Sexual Disorder	3460
c.	Pregnancy	3460
10.	Qualified Disabled Employee.....	3461
a.	Dangerousness; Risk Assessment; Direct Threat	3462
b.	Lack of Medical Release.....	3468
11.	Knowledge of Disability.....	3468
a.	When Disability Claim or Defense Must Be Raised.....	3469

12. Suggesting Nonapparent Accommodation; Duty of Reasonable Inquiry	3471
a. Interactive Process; Medical Documentation.....	3473
C. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH JOB RESTRUCTURING, ASSISTANCE	3476
1. Light Duty and Job Modification.....	3476
a. Lifting Requirements.....	3481
b. Postal Service Collective Bargaining Contracts	3482
c. Inappropriate Job Modification; Increased Job Burden	3483
2. Provision of, Modification to, Job Equipment.....	3483
3. Alteration of Work Schedule, Worksite; Telework	3486
4. Alteration of Training Requirement.....	3497
D. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH REASSIGNMENT	3498
1. <i>Ignacio</i>	3499
2. Evaluation of Reassignment Effort.....	3501
a. Reassignments Across Organizational Lines	3507
3. Collective Bargaining Contract	3513
4. Agency Regulation	3513
5. Restoration From Compensable Injury	3514
6. Demotion; Promotion.....	3514
E. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH MEANS OTHER THAN JOB MODIFICATION OR REASSIGNMENT.....	3516
1. Modification of Agency Policy, Facility.....	3516
2. Job Training; Change in Supervision.....	3517
3. Referral for Counseling.....	3520
F. AGENCY DEFENSES	3520
1. Disqualifying Misconduct	3520
2. Undue Hardship.....	3522
a. Unreasonable Accommodation	3525
b. Restrictions in Collective Bargaining Contract	3526
3. Lack of Qualification for Position.....	3528
a. Failure to Provide Evidence of Fitness for Position With Medical Standard	3529
4. Receipt of Disability Annuity.....	3530
5. Rebuttal	3530
6. Restriction on Remedy.....	3530
G. ALCOHOLISM AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE.....	3531
1. Necessity for Accommodation: <i>Ruzek</i>	3532
a. Suitability.....	3534
b. Postal Service Employee	3534
2. Notice of Disability.....	3535
a. Agency Request for Information.....	3535
3. Proof of Disease	3536
4. Causal Connection: Misconduct Caused by Disease.....	3537
a. Alcohol or Drug Use on the Job	3540
b. Revocation of Driver's License	3541
c. Possession of Drugs.....	3541
d. Misappropriation or Theft of Drugs.....	3542
e. Misappropriation of Funds.....	3542
5. Qualified Disabled Employee; <i>Hougens</i> and Disqualifying Conduct.....	3543
a. Current Substance Abuser	3546
b. Disqualifying Misconduct: Removal Appropriate.....	3548
c. Less Serious Conduct: Concurrent Rehabilitation, Discipline.....	3552
6. Firm Choice, Last Chance Agreement.....	3553
a. Requirement of Collective Bargaining Contract, Agency Regulation	3556
7. Failed Rehabilitation Attempt	3558
8. Undue Hardship.....	3560
III. AVENUES OF FURTHER REVIEW OF EEO DEFENSES	3561
A. EEOC.....	3561
B. SPECIAL PANEL.....	3562
C. EFFECT OF DISTRICT COURT REVIEW	3570

VOLUME III

CHAPTER 13: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES.....3575

I. OVERVIEW.....	3575
A. SIGNIFICANCE OF DISCOVERY.....	3577
II. TYPES OF PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES	3578
A. WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL.....	3580
1. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012.....	3582
2. Statutory Definitions Control; Multiple Disclosures, Personnel Actions	3584
a. "Gross" Waste or Mismanagement	3585
b. Violation of Law, Rule, or Regulation.....	3592
c. Abuse of Authority.....	3601
d. Threat to Public Health and Safety.....	3606
e. Disclosure of Censorship Related to Research, Analysis, or Technical Information.....	3633
3. Form of Whistleblowing.....	3634
a. Disclosure of Potential Harm or Wrongdoing	3634
b. Complaint to Wrongdoer.....	3635
c. Disclosure to Someone Who Cannot Directly Remedy the Problem.....	3637
d. Minor Personal Grievance	3640
e. Internal, Policy Disagreement.....	3640
f. Disclosure Made During Normal Course of Duties.....	3646
g. Normal Duties Not Including Investigation and Disclosure of Wrongdoing	3658
h. Required Report Under Office of Government Ethics Rules, E.O. 12675	3660
i. Communication Indirectly Involving the Government; Private Wrongdoing	3660
j. Communication to News Media; Congress.....	3664
k. Disclosure in Court.....	3665
l. Complaint, Testimony to Inspector General, OSC, Internal Investigative Unit; 5 USC 2302(b)(9)(c).....	3666
m. Disclosure of Information Already Known or Public.....	3668
n. Sequential Allegations.....	3670
4. Whistleblowing No Shield Against Misconduct.....	3670
a. Abusive Whistleblower; Robust Language; Chain of Command.....	3672
5. Personnel Treated as Whistleblowers.....	3675
a. Individual Perceived as Whistleblower; Disclosure Made on Behalf of Another Person	3675
b. Threatened Disclosure.....	3680
c. Whistleblower's Aide, Associate.....	3681
d. Individual Serving as Conduit of Information; Internal Disclosure	3682
e. Former Employee	3683
f. Contractor Employee	3683
6. Protected Disclosure: Reasonableness.....	3685
a. "Reasonably Believes"; False Statement	3685
b. Motivation of Whistleblower.....	3692
c. Information Developed After Disclosure	3693
d. Belief Shared by Other Employees; Disinterested Observer.....	3693
e. Response of Agency to Disclosure	3694
f. Expertise of Whistleblower	3694
g. Specificity of Disclosure	3696
h. Presumed Agency Good Faith; "Irrefragable Proof" Standard.....	3698
7. Dispute Concerning Coverage of Disclosure Under 2302(b)(8) or 2302(b)(9)	3701
8. Disclosures Not Protected or Covered by Whistleblower Law.....	3704
a. Disclosure Prohibited by Law; Regulation Incorporating Statutory Provision; E.O. 13,526.....	3704
b. EEO Complaint, Allegations.....	3715
c. Other Appeals, Charges, FECA Claims, Grievances, and Complaints.....	3722
9. Disclosures in Multiple Forums	3726
B. PROHIBITED PRACTICES OTHER THAN WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL	3729
1. Discrimination Proscribed by Civil Rights Laws; 5 USC 2302(b)(1)(A)	3729
a. Sexual Harassment.....	3729
2. Improper Personnel Recommendation; 5 USC 2302(b)(2).....	3729
3. Obstruction of Competition; 5 USC 2302(b)(4)	3730
4. Influencing Employment Decision; 5 USC 2302(b)(5).....	3730
5. Improper Preference, Promotion; 5 USC 2302(b)(6).....	3731

6.	5 USC 2302(b)(9); Appeal Right; Grievance, Complaint; Refusal to Obey Unlawful Order.....	3734
a.	Refusal to Obey an Order.....	3741
b.	Union Activity Under the WPEA.....	3742
c.	WPEA: Exercise of, Testimony or Assistance in, Appeal, Complaint, or Grievance.....	3743
7.	Discrimination Unrelated to Job Performance; 5 USC 2302(b)(10).....	3746
8.	Discrimination Against Veteran; 5 USC 2302(b)(11).....	3748
9.	Violation of Merit System Principle; 5 USC 2302(b)(12).....	3748
a.	Failure to Provide Effective Training; 5 USC 2301(b)(7); Training for Government Personnel on Whistleblowing Protections.....	3752
10.	Nondisclosure Agreement; Gag Order; 5 USC 2302(b)(13).....	3753
11.	Refusal to Violate Law, Regulation, or Rule.....	3753
III.	INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION.....	3755
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS AND LIMITATIONS.....	3757
1.	Filing a Complaint With OSC.....	3764
a.	OSC Deferral Policy on EEO Charge.....	3765
b.	Proceeding to Compel OSC Action.....	3766
c.	IRA Appeal Against OSC.....	3769
2.	Time for Initiating IRA Appeal With OSC and MSPB.....	3770
a.	Laches in Filing OSC Complaint.....	3771
b.	Case That May Be Either Initiated With OSC or Appealed Directly to MSPB.....	3772
c.	Jurisdiction Limitations of an IRA Rather Than an Adverse Action Appeal.....	3773
d.	Premature Appeal Following Resort to OSC.....	3773
e.	Belated Receipt of OSC Closeout Notice.....	3774
f.	Calculation of Appeal Period; Late IRA Appeal; Waiver.....	3775
g.	Equitable Tolling.....	3777
h.	OSC Reopening.....	3780
B.	JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES.....	3783
1.	Exhaustion of Remedies; Amendment of Appeal.....	3784
2.	Election and Preclusion of Remedies; Managers and Supervisors; Notice of Rights.....	3787
a.	Grievance or MSPB Appeal.....	3789
b.	IRA Appeal, Direct Appeal of Otherwise Appealable Action Distinguished; Issue Preclusion.....	3793
c.	EEO Complaint.....	3797
3.	<i>Rusin</i> Model: Nonfrivolous Allegations Establish Jurisdiction; <i>Hessami</i>	3797
a.	Nonfrivolous Allegations Based on the Written Record; Required Specificity.....	3803
4.	Jurisdictional Analysis Before <i>Rusin</i>	3806
5.	Hearing.....	3807
6.	Variations in Order of Proof; Necessity to Develop Evidence, Consider Entire Record; <i>Whitmore</i>	3807
7.	Collateral Jurisdiction Over EEO Claim Presented in IRA Appeal Not Involving Otherwise Appealable Action.....	3817
8.	Limited Jurisdiction Over Merits Determination, Collateral Prohibited Personnel Practice, Constitutional, Discrimination, and Harmful Error Claims in Otherwise Appealable Action Initiated Through OSC as IRA.....	3818
9.	Status of Particular Agencies and Employees.....	3820
a.	Postal Service.....	3821
b.	Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee.....	3822
c.	Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714.....	3827
d.	National Guard Technician.....	3827
e.	Federal Bureau of Investigation.....	3830
f.	Judicial Branch.....	3834
g.	Federal Reserve Board.....	3834
h.	NAF Employee.....	3834
i.	Independent Counsel.....	3836
j.	Office of Special Counsel.....	3836
k.	Federal Aviation Administration.....	3836
l.	Transportation Security Agency.....	3836
m.	Intelligence, Counterintelligence Agencies; Foreign National.....	3839
n.	Government Corporation.....	3842
o.	Other Entities.....	3842
p.	Experts and Consultants; Personnel Appointed Outside Title 5.....	3843
q.	Lawyer.....	3845
r.	Former Employee.....	3845
s.	Inspector General Office.....	3846
t.	Employee of Agency Other Than the Agency Charged With Reprisal.....	3846

u. Private Sector Employee; Applicant for Employment	3848
v. Uniformed Service	3849
w. Administrator of Federal Benefits	3851
x. Schedule F Employees; Policy Positions	3851
10. Retroactivity of 1989 Whistleblower Amendments; Continuing Violation	3851
C. PLEADING REQUIREMENTS	3852
1. Duty of Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements	3852
2. Specificity of Underlying Disclosure; Labeling of Disclosure Not Required	3854
3. Pleading to OSC	3858
a. Classification or Labeling of Disclosure Not Required	3867
b. Curative Filing With OSC	3870
c. Proof of Scope of Complaint Made to OSC; Post-Complaint Submission	3870
d. Information First Submitted With PFR	3874
e. Serial Complaints to OSC	3875
f. OSC Closeout Letter	3875
4. Pleading to MSPB	3876
D. COVERED AND EXCLUDED PERSONNEL ACTIONS	3879
1. Threatened Personnel Action	3879
a. Proposed Action	3882
b. Action Arising During Compliance Proceedings	3883
2. Failure to Take Personnel Action	3883
3. Performance Appraisal, Rating; Evaluation of Qualifications or Abilities	3885
4. Awards and Acts Preliminary to Awards	3886
5. Denial of Within-Grade Increase	3887
6. Promotion, Appointment	3887
7. Decision Concerning Leave; Change in Duties; Idling; Overtime; Harassment	3888
a. Degree of Significance of Change of Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions	3889
b. Hostile Environment	3894
c. Performance Standards	3896
8. Reprimand; Admonition; Counseling; Performance Warning; Performance Improvement Period	3896
9. Suspension	3901
10. Probationary Termination	3901
11. Reemployed Annuitant	3901
12. Failure to Renew Appointment; Failure to Reinstate	3902
13. Reassignment, Transfer, and Detail	3902
14. Mental Fitness Examination or Testing	3904
15. Other Investigations	3904
16. Security Clearance Suspension, Revocation; Other Certification	3908
17. Training	3913
18. Defamatory Statement; Tort; Arrest; False Allegation; Blacklisting	3914
19. Reduction in Force	3916
20. Classification Issue	3917
21. Constructive Adverse Action	3917
22. Action Affecting Private Sector Employment Opportunity	3921
23. Other Action	3921
E. REMEDIES	3923
1. Transfer	3924
IV. CASES BROUGHT BY OSC	3924
A. STATUTORY BASES	3925
1. Corrective Action Petition; Stay	3925
2. Disciplinary Complaint	3927
3. Board Authority in Disciplinary, Corrective Action Case	3928
4. Judicial or Administrative Finding of Discrimination by Federal Employee; 5 USC 1216(a)(5)	3928
5. Hatch Act; FOIA Violation	3928
B. OSC OPERATIONS	3931
1. Organizational Structure	3932
2. Disclosures to OSC	3932
3. MSPB Referral to OSC	3932
C. RIGHT TO COUNSEL IN OSC INVESTIGATION	3933
D. OSC DISCIPLINARY ACTION	3934
1. Limits on Prosecutorial Authority	3935

a.	Employee Who Takes or Recommends Personnel Action.....	3936
b.	Prior Resort to Agency-Employer for Disciplinary Action.....	3936
2.	OSC Complaint.....	3937
3.	Rights of Employee, Respondent.....	3938
4.	OSC Subpoena; Discovery Procedures.....	3938
5.	Hearing by Administrative Law Judge; MSPB Review.....	3939
6.	Disciplinary Penalty.....	3939
E.	OSC CORRECTIVE ACTION PETITION.....	3944
1.	Regulatory Provisions.....	3946
F.	LITIGATION WITH OSC.....	3947
1.	Purpose of MSPB Hearing.....	3947
a.	Obtaining Records.....	3947
b.	Evidence From Other Investigation.....	3947
c.	Dismissal of OSC Action.....	3947
2.	Settlement.....	3947
V.	BURDEN OF PROOF IN REPRISAL CASE.....	3948
A.	ANALYSIS UNDER WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT.....	3948
1.	Analysis Required by Judge.....	3948
2.	Statutory, Regulatory Provisions.....	3949
3.	Contributing Factor Analysis.....	3949
a.	Order of Proof.....	3951
b.	<i>Per Se</i> Timing/Knowledge Test.....	3952
c.	Evidence Other Than Timing.....	3958
d.	Knowledge by Agency Manager of Appellant's Whistleblowing; Constructive Knowledge; Cat's Paw; Secondary Evidence of Agency Reprisal.....	3962
e.	Disclosure After the Personnel Action; Action Contemplated and in Preparation.....	3970
f.	Settlement Offer.....	3972
g.	Significance of Retaliatory Investigation; Appellant Initiates Investigation; <i>Marano</i>	3972
h.	Charge Arising Out of Conduct During Retaliatory Investigation.....	3981
i.	OSC Corrective Action Case.....	3983
j.	Otherwise Appealable Action.....	3984
4.	Agency's Clear and Convincing Evidence; <i>Carr</i> Factors.....	3984
a.	Evolution of the "Clear and Convincing" Evidentiary Standard Before the Whistleblower Protection Act.....	4003
b.	Constructive Adverse Action.....	4004
c.	Nondisciplinary Cases: Nonselection; Nonpromotion; Reassignments; Changes in Duties.....	4005
5.	Evidence of Reprisal.....	4007
a.	Strength of Agency's Case; Probationer; Term Employee; Reemployed Annuitant.....	4008
b.	Strength of Motive to Retaliate.....	4013
c.	Comparator Employees.....	4015
d.	Preliminary Reprisal Leading to Personnel Action.....	4021
e.	Shifting or Belated Explanations for Agency Action.....	4022
B.	ANALYSIS FOR PROHIBITED PRACTICES NOT COVERED BY WPA, WPEA; VIOLATIONS OF 5 USC 2302(B)(9).....	4022
1.	<i>Mt. Healthy</i>	4026
2.	Importance of Untainted Deciding Official.....	4028
3.	Timing of Action.....	4030
4.	Severity of Charged Misconduct.....	4031
5.	Discipline Related to Refusal of Reassignment.....	4032
6.	Reprisal Against Individual Involved in Union Activity.....	4032
7.	Performance Case.....	4038
8.	OSC and Agency Disciplinary Case Against Individual Charged With Reprisal.....	4038
a.	Analysis by Agency Deciding Official.....	4045
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS.....	4045
VI.	STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS.....	4046
A.	STAY THROUGH INDIVIDUAL APPEAL.....	4046
1.	Basis for Stay Sought by Appellant.....	4048
a.	Intervention by OPM.....	4050
2.	Scope of Stay.....	4050
3.	MSPB Review of Judge's Stay Decision.....	4050
B.	STAY THROUGH OSC PROCEEDING.....	4050
1.	Statutory, Regulatory Provisions.....	4053
2.	Initial Stay.....	4055

a.	Potential for Disruption by Employee's Return to Workplace	4057
b.	Obtaining Clarification of Stay Order	4057
3.	Extension of Stay	4057
a.	Indefinite Stay	4061
4.	Proof Supporting Stay Application	4061
5.	Nature of Relief	4061
a.	Hostile Environment; Protective Order	4063
b.	Restraint on Employee Communication With OSC, Congress	4066
6.	Termination of Stay	4068
7.	Relation of Stay and Appeal Proceedings	4068
8.	Use of Stay to Protect Other Proceeding	4068
a.	EEO Case	4069
b.	Union Rights Under Statute	4069
9.	Effect of Prior Settlement Agreement	4069
10.	Employees Covered by Stay	4069
a.	SES	4069
b.	Presidential Appointee; Policymaker	4069
c.	At Will Employee; Reemployed Annuitant	4069
d.	Former Agency Employee	4069
C.	DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS	4069

CHAPTER 14: RETIREMENT AND RESTORATION RIGHTS4071

I.	RETIREMENT	4071
A.	OVERVIEW OF THE PRINCIPAL RETIREMENT SYSTEMS	4072
1.	Background and History	4073
2.	Conversions	4075
B.	FEDERAL EMPLOYMENT	4076
1.	Effect of Reemployment	4078
C.	COVERED AND CREDITABLE SERVICE	4078
1.	Service Requirements	4080
2.	When-Actually-Employed; Seasonal Employee; Leave Without Pay; Part-Time	4083
3.	Indefinite Appointment	4084
4.	Temporary Employment	4085
5.	Personal Service Contract	4085
6.	Nonappropriated Fund	4091
7.	Others	4091
8.	Effect of Military Service; Deposit for Military Service	4092
a.	National Guard, Other Uniformed Service	4108
(i)	Abandonment of Civilian Career for Military Service	4110
9.	Period of Receipt of OWCP Benefits	4115
10.	Sick Leave Credit	4116
D.	DISABILITY RETIREMENT	4116
1.	Statutory, Regulatory Standards	4118
a.	Concept of Disability	4121
b.	Cause of Disability	4122
c.	Medical Condition Postdating Disability Retirement	4123
2.	Disability Incurred While in the Federal Service	4123
a.	Preexisting Condition	4123
3.	Position Last Occupied	4123
a.	Qualifying Position	4124
4.	Disability Must Continue at Least One Year	4124
a.	Possible Future Disability	4126
5.	Situational or Transitory Condition; Hostile Environment	4127
a.	Workplace Stressor May Be Sufficient	4128
b.	Workplace Stressor May Be Insufficient	4128
c.	Alcoholism or Drug Addiction; Inability to Control Condition	4130
6.	Partial Disability Does Not Qualify	4130
7.	New Condition Raised With Judge or in PFR; Condition That Should Have Been Considered by OPM	4131
a.	Evidence of Progression of Disease Presented in PFR	4132
8.	Reassignment in Lieu of Disability Retirement	4132
a.	Adequacy of Position Offered Through Reassignment	4132

b.	Permanent Light Duty Position	4135
c.	Postal Service: Different Craft.....	4138
d.	OWCP Position Suitability Determination	4141
9.	Effect of Disability Accommodation on Annuity Entitlement.....	4142
a.	Conflicting Agency Evidence Concerning Accommodation	4142
10.	Necessity for Cessation of Pay or Separation From the Federal Service.....	4143
11.	One Year for Disability Retirement Application.....	4143
a.	Waiver; Separation for Medical Reason: Notice Not Provided.....	4145
b.	Waiver; Mental Incompetence.....	4149
c.	Technical Constructions Concerning Filing Date: Method of Filing; Filing With Former Agency.....	4153
12.	Agency-Initiated Disability Retirement Application.....	4155
a.	Service Credit Requirement.....	4157
13.	Application After Employee's Death.....	4157
14.	Bar to Concurrent Receipt of Disability Retirement, OWCP Benefit.....	4158
15.	Withdrawal of Disability Retirement Application	4158
16.	Evidence of Disability.....	4159
a.	Scope of Board Review; <i>Chavez</i>	4161
b.	Significance of Position Description, Qualification Requirements	4165
c.	Objective Medical Evidence	4165
d.	Content of Medical Report.....	4165
e.	Lack of Evidence of Precise Medical Causation Not Determinative	4166
f.	<i>Mullins-Howard</i> : Disability Established Without Unduly Detailed Medical Causation Analysis	4169
g.	Subjective Evidence.....	4174
h.	Testimony of Supervisor; Performance Appraisal.....	4174
i.	Hearsay.....	4174
j.	Absence; Use of Leave	4174
k.	Post-Separation Medical Evidence.....	4175
l.	Medical Condition Not Presented to OPM	4177
m.	Removal for Physical Inability to Perform; <i>Bruner</i> ; Settlement.....	4177
n.	Loss of Military Status	4183
o.	OWCP Determination	4184
p.	Social Security Administration Determination	4184
q.	VA Disability Rating.....	4186
r.	Security Clearance Determination	4187
s.	Agency Medical Disqualification	4188
t.	Removal for Misconduct.....	4188
17.	Refusal to Undergo Diagnostic or Other Procedure.....	4189
a.	Possible Improvement Through Future Surgery or Treatment	4190
18.	Specific Conditions.....	4191
19.	Earnings Recovery.....	4192
a.	Current Rate of Pay	4193
b.	Basic Pay; Cost of Living Adjustment	4194
c.	Bonus.....	4195
d.	Miscellaneous Income	4196
e.	Business Expense.....	4196
f.	Pension Contribution.....	4196
20.	Decline of Earnings.....	4196
a.	Discontinued Service Annuity Upon Recovery of Earning Capacity	4196
21.	Conversion From Disability to Optional Retirement	4197
22.	Conversion From Optional to Disability Retirement	4197
23.	Rescission of Disability Retirement Grant	4197
24.	Recovery From Disability: Burden of Proof	4198
a.	Restoration of Annuity.....	4199
25.	Calculation of Annuity.....	4200
26.	Loss of Annuity for Certain Offenses.....	4201
E.	DEATH BENEFITS; LUMP SUM PAYMENTS	4203
1.	Submission of Designation.....	4209
a.	Signature Requirement.....	4212
2.	Child Who Qualifies to Receive Annuity or Lump Sum Payment.....	4212
3.	Other Distributions.....	4213
a.	Slayer Statute	4213

4.	Time for Application.....	4214
F.	SURVIVOR ANNUITIES.....	4214
1.	Eligibility of Employee for Retirement as Condition to Annuity.....	4217
2.	Application for Annuity.....	4218
3.	Time, Method of Election.....	4219
a.	Effect of Remarriage After Retirement.....	4220
b.	Notice to Annuitant of Necessity to Notify OPM of Remarriage to Secure Annuity.....	4221
c.	Delay in Notice to OPM of Annuity Election.....	4222
d.	Lack of Proper Notice From OPM Concerning Annuity Election.....	4223
e.	Incorrect Information From Employing Agency Concerning Annuity Election.....	4234
f.	Annuity Election Form; Signature; Submission.....	4236
g.	Effect of Mental Incompetence on Timeliness of Election.....	4238
h.	Authority to Act on Behalf of Incompetent Employee to Create Annuity.....	4239
i.	Employee Mentally Incompetent to Make Adverse Election; Fraud.....	4240
j.	Community Property Interests.....	4242
4.	State Law Defines Marital Status; Common Law Marriage; Qualifying Widow.....	4244
a.	Current Spouse; Duration of Marriage; Widow: Issue of Marriage; Children.....	4245
b.	Accidental Death.....	4246
c.	Putative Spouse.....	4246
5.	Calculation.....	4248
a.	Survivor Annuity Based on Disability Annuity.....	4248
b.	Health Benefits.....	4250
c.	Social Security Benefit Offset—CSRS.....	4250
d.	Social Security Benefit—FERS.....	4252
6.	Consent of Spouse to Waiver of Survivor Annuity.....	4253
a.	Consent by Current Spouse to Discontinue Survivor Annuity.....	4259
b.	Attempt to Modify Amount of Spousal Survivor Annuity.....	4261
c.	Consent by Current Spouse for Former Spouse Annuity.....	4261
7.	Marriage of at Least Nine Months; Parent of Issue by Marriage; Exceptions.....	4262
8.	Survivor Annuity for Child Incapable of Self-Support.....	4263
a.	Children in School.....	4269
G.	DISCONTINUED SERVICE ANNUITY.....	4270
H.	LAW ENFORCEMENT RETIREMENT.....	4279
1.	Process of Determining and Appealing LEO Status.....	4280
2.	Agency Head Determination; Timeliness of Request for LEO Status.....	4282
3.	Substantive Criteria for LEO Determination.....	4292
a.	Customs and Border Patrol Officers.....	4304
b.	Decisions Before 2000.....	4306
4.	Evidence Considered.....	4311
5.	Supervisory Credit.....	4314
6.	Military Service.....	4316
7.	Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4317
I.	FIREFIGHTER RETIREMENT.....	4318
J.	AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLER RETIREMENT.....	4326
K.	OTHER ANNUITY INTERESTS.....	4326
1.	Deferred Annuity.....	4326
2.	FERS Minimum Retirement Age Annuity.....	4327
3.	Supplemental, Redetermined Annuity.....	4328
4.	Alternative Form of Annuity.....	4331
5.	Voluntary Early Retirement Authority.....	4335
L.	APPORTIONMENT OF ANNUITY BY COURT ORDER.....	4336
1.	Lifetime Annuity.....	4337
2.	Former Spouse Survivor Annuity.....	4338
a.	Intent to Create Former Spouse Survivor Annuity or Other Benefit.....	4340
b.	Reduction in Lifetime Annuity.....	4342
c.	Wording of Decree.....	4343
d.	Ambiguous Provision in Divorce Decree; Extrinsic Evidence; Rules of Construction.....	4345
3.	Challenge to Court Order Affecting Annuity Interest.....	4349
4.	Qualifying Court Order.....	4350
5.	Amendment to Court Order Affecting Former Spouse Annuity; Construction of Annuity Interest Following Ineffective Amendment.....	4360

6.	Bifurcated Decree.....	4372
7.	Spouse Equity Act of 1984 as Amended.....	4375
M.	ANNUITY CALCULATION ISSUES.....	4377
1.	Estoppel as Basis to Create, Continue, or Adjust Benefit or Overpayment	4378
2.	Refund.....	4380
3.	Redeposit	4387
a.	Personal Service Agreement	4389
4.	High Three Salary Calculation: Basic Pay; Lump Sum Back Pay Settlement.....	4390
5.	Onset of Disability Annuity Payment.....	4393
6.	VA Medical Professional; VA Benefit Reduction.....	4396
7.	Annuity Reduction for VA Employees Removed for Certain Performance or Misconduct.....	4396
8.	Law Enforcement Enhanced Annuity Rate	4397
9.	Minimum, Maximum Annuity	4397
10.	Annuity Allotment	4397
11.	Impact of Receipt of Medicare Benefits, Social Security on CSRS, FERS.....	4397
12.	Deposit for Creditable Service; Annuity Supplement.....	4400
13.	Interest.....	4401
14.	Taxes.....	4401
15.	Cost of Living Adjustment for Reinstated Annuity	4402
16.	Diversion of Annuity Payment.....	4403
17.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4403
18.	Individual Retirement Record.....	4403
19.	Reconstructing Employment Record.....	4406
N.	OVERPAYMENTS.....	4406
1.	Proving the Debt; Evidence Supporting Waiver; OPM Records.....	4407
2.	Basis for Waiver	4408
a.	Annuitant Without Fault and Recovery Against Equity and Good Conscience	4410
b.	Knowledge of Overpayment; Set-Aside Rule	4411
c.	OPM Fault in Creating Overpayment	4413
d.	Unconscionability of Recovery; Recovery Delay	4414
e.	Financial Hardship.....	4419
f.	Ordinary and Necessary Living Expenses; Future Events.....	4420
g.	Assets Available to Satisfy Overpayment; Income/Expense Margin.....	4421
h.	Detrimental Reliance; Set Aside Rule	4422
i.	Adjustment of Repayment Schedule; Length of Recovery	4426
j.	Calculation of Overpayment; Interest.....	4428
k.	Recovery Schedule Adjustment When There Is No Annuity Entitlement	4428
l.	Collection From Survivor for Debt of Original Annuitant	4428
m.	Insurance Issue Related to Overpayment.....	4431
O.	OFFSETS; DEBT COLLECTION FROM ANNUITY	4433
II.	RESTORATION RIGHTS UPON RECOVERY FROM OCCUPATIONAL INJURY OR ILLNESS.....	4438
A.	SEPARATION OR FURLOUGH MUST RESULT FROM COMPENSABLE INJURY	4441
1.	Separation for Reason Other Than Result of Injury or Illness.....	4444
a.	Factual Determination on Cause of Separation	4451
b.	Termination When OWCP Determination Supports Employee's Refusal to Return to Work.....	4453
c.	AWOL Covered by Period of Compensation	4455
d.	Effect of Resignation	4455
e.	Separation by Settlement Agreement.....	4456
B.	SIGNIFICANCE OF OWCP DETERMINATION; RECEIPT OF COMPENSATION.....	4457
1.	Requirement of Medical Examination	4460
C.	MEANING OF "RECOVERY"	4461
1.	Fully Recovered Within a Year.....	4462
2.	Fully Recovered After a Year.....	4465
a.	Priority Consideration: Necessity for Position to Be Filled by Another Person.....	4467
b.	Geographic Extent of Consideration.....	4469
c.	Method, Duration of Priority Consideration	4470
3.	Partially Recovered	4470
a.	Geographic Extent of Consideration: Local Commuting Area.....	4476
b.	Arbitrary or Capricious Restoration Effort	4480
c.	Accommodation Requirement; Disability Discrimination.....	4482
d.	Postal Service Rules; <i>Latham</i> ; <i>Cronin</i>	4485

e.	Other Postal Service Limited Duty Restoration Decisions.....	4498
f.	Discontinuation of Modified Assignment	4500
4.	Physically Disqualified Employee	4500
a.	Geographic Extent of Consideration	4501
D.	PARTICULAR GROUPS OF EMPLOYEES.....	4502
1.	Probationer.....	4502
2.	Reemployed Annuitant.....	4502
3.	Postal Service.....	4503
4.	Nonappropriated Fund	4506
E.	WHEN RESTORATION IS TO OCCUR	4507
1.	Light Duty	4508
2.	Effect of Disability Retirement.....	4509
F.	TIME TO APPLY FOR RESTORATION	4511
1.	Form of Restoration Request	4512
G.	REMEDY.....	4513
1.	Same or Equivalent Position	4514
a.	Return to <i>Status Quo</i>	4514
b.	Interim Promotion.....	4515
2.	Regraded Position.....	4515
3.	Seniority Inapplicable.....	4516
4.	Priority Placement Program	4516
5.	Benefits Upon Restoration	4517
H.	MSPB APPEAL RIGHTS.....	4523
1.	Time for Appeal.....	4523
a.	Lack of Notice of Appeal Right	4524
b.	Settlement	4525
2.	Burden of Proof; Jurisdictional Allegations	4525

CHAPTER 15: ATTORNEY FEES.....4527

I.	ENTITLEMENT STANDARDS	4527
A.	STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS FOR FEES	4527
1.	Use of Counsel; Licensure.....	4528
2.	Governing Statutes and Regulation	4531
a.	Civil Rights Statutes	4532
b.	Whistleblower Protection Act	4532
3.	Jurisdiction Over Action Under Appeal	4533
4.	Miscellaneous Appeals.....	4533
a.	Regulation Review Proceeding	4533
b.	Retirement Appeal.....	4533
c.	OSC Case: Prohibited Personnel Practice and Hatch Act Litigation	4534
d.	Sanction	4544
B.	PREVAILING PARTY STATUS	4544
1.	Mitigation.....	4546
2.	Other Relief.....	4546
3.	Must Prevail Through MSPB Procedures.....	4548
a.	Mixed-Motive Determination	4549
4.	Cancellation of Action Appealed.....	4550
a.	Enforcement Proceeding Mooted by Agency Action.....	4555
5.	Settlement	4559
a.	Prevailing Party Status Through Settlement.....	4559
b.	Relief Through Settlement Must Be Related to MSPB Appeal.....	4561
c.	Interest of Justice Criteria	4561
d.	Jurisdiction to Accept and Enforce Settlement Providing for Fees or Supporting Fee Motion	4561
C.	INTEREST OF JUSTICE: AN OVERVIEW	4566
1.	<i>Allen</i> Criteria	4566
a.	Financial Hardship.....	4567
2.	Preservation of Claims Supporting Entitlement; Significance of Final Merits Decision	4567
a.	Overlapping Fee Entitlement Standards.....	4567
3.	Statutory Examples Not Exclusive.....	4568
D.	BAD FAITH.....	4568
1.	Malicious Action; Inadequate Inquiry.....	4569

2.	Disparate Treatment.....	4569
3.	Action Reversed but Some Charges Sustained	4569
4.	Unreasonable Litigation Tactics; Failure to Settle.....	4569
a.	Fivolous PFR.....	4569
5.	Enforcement.....	4570
E.	CLEARLY WITHOUT MERIT OR WHOLLY UNFOUNDED	4570
1.	Failure to Adhere to Legal Precedent.....	4571
2.	Inadequate Initial Inquiry Into Facts	4571
3.	Lack of Legitimate Basis for Agency Action.....	4571
a.	Development of Dispositive Information During Appeal.....	4572
4.	Mitigation.....	4572
5.	Factual Dispute	4572
6.	Performance Appeal	4574
7.	Retirement Appeal.....	4574
a.	Legal Error by OPM	4577
b.	Incorrect Advice From OPM.....	4578
c.	Issue of Mental Incompetence	4578
F.	KNEW OR SHOULD HAVE KNOWN	4580
1.	Lack of Reasonable Inquiry.....	4581
2.	Disregard of Legal Precedent.....	4582
3.	Regulatory Error.....	4582
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4582
5.	Performance-Based Action	4583
6.	Mitigation.....	4583
a.	Not All Charges Sustained.....	4588
7.	Negligent Presentation of Case.....	4589
8.	Decision of Another Tribunal	4589
9.	Retirement Appeal.....	4589
a.	Failure of OPM to Evaluate Evidence Available During Reconsideration Process; Hearing Evidence.....	4589
b.	Legal Error by OPM	4592
10.	Settlement	4592
G.	GROSS PROCEDURAL ERROR	4593
1.	Denial of Advance Notice or Appeal Right	4595
a.	Involuntary or Constructive Adverse Action	4597
b.	Enforced Leave	4597
c.	Indefinite or Emergency Suspension	4598
2.	Mitigation.....	4598
3.	Performance-Based Action	4598
4.	Reduction in Force.....	4599
H.	SUBSTANTIALLY INNOCENT.....	4599
1.	<i>Yorkshire</i>	4601
2.	MSPB Treatment of <i>Yorkshire</i>	4602
3.	Appellant Who Ensnares the Agency.....	4604
4.	Mitigation: <i>Boese, VanFossen</i>	4604
a.	Factually Close Case.....	4607
b.	Prior Law	4608
5.	Performance-Based Appeal.....	4609
6.	Other Legal Error	4609
I.	OTHER AUTHORITY FOR FEE AWARDS	4609
1.	Back Pay Act	4609
a.	Postal Service Employee	4609
2.	Equal Access to Justice Act	4611
a.	Administrative Law Judge Case	4613
b.	Basis for Compensating Court Time	4615
c.	Prevailing Party	4615
d.	Substantial Justification	4620
e.	Bad Faith; Common Fund	4624
f.	Basis for Awarding MSPB Time.....	4625
g.	Hourly Rate; <i>Pro Bono</i> or Contingent Representation; COLA; Expenses	4625
h.	Procedure; Time for Filing; Application.....	4628
i.	Application to MSPB Cases	4629

3.	Civil Rights Case.....	4629
a.	Result Achieved.....	4632
4.	Prohibited Personnel Practice Case.....	4632
5.	USERRA; VEOA.....	4633
6.	Other Bases for Fee Claims; Equitable Assessment of Fee.....	4635
II.	PROCEDURES FOR OBTAINING FEES.....	4635
A.	HOW FEES ARE INCURRED.....	4635
1.	Attorney-Client Relationship; Fee Payment.....	4635
a.	Law Clerk, Paraprofessional; <i>Pro Se</i> Appellant.....	4636
2.	Union Counsel.....	4637
a.	Demise of the Cost-Plus Formula.....	4637
b.	History of the Cost-Plus Rule.....	4640
c.	Repayment of Fees to Union Required.....	4641
3.	Federally Employed Attorney.....	4641
4.	Public Interest Organization.....	4641
B.	COMPENSABLE SERVICES.....	4641
1.	Work Performed Before Final Adverse Action or Other Decision.....	4642
2.	Research.....	4644
3.	Discovery.....	4644
4.	Settlement, Mediation.....	4644
5.	PFR.....	4644
6.	OPM Reconsideration Petition.....	4645
7.	Time in Court.....	4646
a.	Appropriate Charge for Court Time.....	4650
b.	Practice Notes.....	4650
8.	Preparation of Fee Motion.....	4650
9.	Defense of Fee Motion.....	4650
10.	Enforcement Proceeding.....	4651
11.	Related Proceeding.....	4656
a.	MSPB.....	4657
b.	Grievance.....	4658
c.	Privacy Act.....	4658
d.	Unemployment Compensation.....	4658
e.	Criminal Case.....	4658
f.	EEO Complaint.....	4659
g.	Media Contact; Congressional Activity.....	4661
12.	Anticipated Time; Supplemental Petition.....	4661
13.	Unsuccessful Claim, Issue, or Defense; Limited Success.....	4661
a.	<i>Hensley</i>	4661
b.	Mitigation.....	4668
c.	Tangentially Related Issue.....	4670
d.	Clearly Separate Claim.....	4670
e.	Unsuccessful EEO Claim.....	4670
f.	Unsuccessful Whistleblower Claim.....	4672
C.	REASONABLENESS OF FEES.....	4672
1.	Hourly Rate.....	4673
a.	Evidence of Reasonableness; Fee Agreement; Result Achieved.....	4674
b.	Initial Decision in Another Appeal; Decision of Another Tribunal.....	4682
c.	Settlement.....	4682
d.	Out-Of-Town Counsel.....	4682
e.	Travel Time.....	4682
2.	Contingency Arrangement, Enhancement; <i>City of Burlington</i>	4683
a.	Early Treatment by MSPB of Contingent Adjustments.....	4686
b.	Enhancement for Payment Delay; Interest.....	4687
c.	Enhancement for Quality Work.....	4688
d.	Enhancement for Wear and Tear.....	4691
e.	Traditional Contingency Agreement; Fee Cap.....	4691
f.	Flat Fee Arrangement.....	4692
3.	<i>Laffey Matrix</i>	4692
4.	Below Market Rate.....	4697
5.	Reasonableness of Time Invested.....	4700

a.	Responsibility of Judge	4701
b.	Articulated Analysis Required	4703
c.	Notice to Counsel of Defect in Fee Motion	4705
d.	Expertise and Diligence of Counsel; Likely Outcome	4705
e.	Record Review	4705
f.	Time at Hearing	4707
g.	PFR	4707
h.	<i>Amicus</i> Brief	4707
i.	Time Preparing Attorney Fees Motion	4708
j.	Consolidated Appeals	4708
k.	Multiple Counsel; Duplicative Work	4708
l.	Clerical, Secretarial Work	4710
6.	Examples of Fee Awards	4711
a.	Rates	4711
b.	Amounts	4712
D.	COSTS AND EXPENSES	4712
1.	Transcript	4714
2.	Photocopy; Electronic Production	4714
3.	Travel	4714
4.	Secretarial Expense	4714
5.	Postage; Courier	4714
6.	Fee for Expert, Consultant	4714
7.	Investigator	4715
8.	Accounting Expense	4715
9.	Telephone or Facsimile	4715
10.	Electronic Research	4716
11.	Taxes	4716
12.	EEO, Whistleblower Protection Act, USERRA, and VEOA Cases; Broader Coverage	4716
13.	Direct Recovery of Costs by Appellants	4717
E.	FEE MOTION	4719
1.	Who May File	4720
2.	Time and Place of Filing	4721
a.	Premature Motion	4721
b.	Timing of Agency Response	4722
c.	Late Motion	4722
3.	Motion Must Be Complete When Filed	4726
a.	Incomplete Motion	4726
4.	Developing Evidence to Support Motion	4726
a.	Hearing Concerning Fee Entitlement in Settled Appeal	4727
b.	Hearing and Discovery Concerning Reasonableness	4728
5.	Format of Motion	4728
a.	What to Include	4729
b.	Fee Agreement	4729
c.	Itemization of Time	4730
d.	Retrospective Reconstruction of Time	4731
6.	Supplemental or Corrected Motion	4732
7.	Unopposed, Moot, or Settled Motion	4732
8.	Service of Motion	4732
9.	Opposition to Motion	4732
10.	Initial Decision on Motion	4733
a.	Obligation of Judge to Ensure Due Process	4733
b.	Requirements of Addendum Initial Decision	4733
c.	Initial Decision Controls Basis for Fee Determination	4734
d.	Change in Judge	4735
e.	Hourly Rate Analysis	4735
11.	Waiver of Fee Through Settlement Agreement	4735
a.	Effect of Settlement on Claims of Multiple Counsel	4737
12.	Settlement of Fee Claim	4737
13.	Payment of Fee to Counsel and Client	4739
a.	Payment to Counsel	4739
b.	Repayment of Fee by Counsel to Client	4739

14. PFR of Fee Decision	4740
a. Interim Fee	4740
b. Time Spent on PFR	4740

CHAPTER 16: SETTLEMENT, REMEDIES, AND ENFORCEMENT4743

I. SETTLEMENT.....	4743
A. SETTLEMENT PROCEDURES; ELEMENTS OF SETTLEMENTS.....	4743
1. Regulatory Process	4745
a. Settlement Resources; Mediation Appeals Program	4746
2. Minimum Requirements.....	4747
a. Hatch Act Case.....	4747
3. Filing, Acceptance of Settlement for Enforcement	4748
a. Intent That Agreement Be Subject to MSPB Enforcement Authority	4748
b. Unfiled Settlement.....	4750
c. Oral Advice of Settlement	4751
d. Specific Oral Settlement Agreement Entered Into the Record	4754
e. Distinguishing Oral Agreement and Ongoing or Incomplete Negotiation	4758
f. Oral Agreement to Be Followed by Written Agreement	4761
g. Appellant’s Understanding of Agreement	4763
h. Settlement After Initial Decision.....	4763
4. Jurisdiction to Accept Settlement: <i>Delorme</i>	4764
a. Prior Law	4765
b. Settlement Arising From Disputed Last Chance Agreement.....	4768
5. Flexibility, Scope of Settlement.....	4770
a. Incomplete Settlement; Omitted Terms.....	4770
b. Regulatory Limitations	4771
6. Conditional Settlement; Lapsed Offer; Implicit Term	4772
7. Settlement Requiring Specific Action by Judge	4775
8. Integration or “Zipper” Clause	4776
9. Modification, Amendment of Agreement.....	4779
10. Waiver of Statutory Right; Release.....	4780
a. Unemployment Compensation	4781
b. Workers’ Compensation	4782
c. Older Workers’ Benefit Protection Act.....	4782
d. RIF Benefit	4791
e. Limitation on the Right to Seek Future Federal Employment.....	4792
11. Retirement Benefit.....	4792
12. Settlement Provision Affecting Other Agencies	4793
13. OSC Case	4793
B. SETTING ASIDE A SETTLEMENT	4794
1. Agreement Challenged as Invalid; Use of PFR.....	4795
2. Timing of PFR.....	4797
3. Bases for Setting Aside a Settlement	4798
a. Threat of Unwarranted Action; Duress	4800
b. Hardship.....	4802
c. Disappointment; Confusion	4802
d. Lack of Understanding	4803
e. Mental Incapacity; Stress	4804
f. Time Pressure.....	4807
g. Coercion or Bias by Judge	4807
h. Coercion by Counsel or Union Representative; Lack of Signature by Counsel	4812
i. Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative—Agreement Sustained.....	4814
j. Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant’s Counsel or Union Representative— <i>Bona Fide</i> Challenge to Agreement.....	4817
k. Error or Lack of Authority of Government Counsel.....	4821
l. Fraud; Misrepresentation; Bad Faith; Merit of the Underlying Action	4822
m. Mutual, Unilateral Mistake	4828
n. Lack of Mutual Assent.....	4836
o. Lack of Consideration	4838
p. Incorrect Information From the Agency Concerning Retirement Eligibility	4839
q. Provision Unlawful or Contrary to Public Policy.....	4839

r. Change in Law	4845
4. Partial Invalidity	4846
5. Unfiled Settlement Agreement; Preappeal Settlement	4846
6. Collateral Attack on Settlement Through New Appeal	4849
7. Breach of Settlement: Election Between Rescission or Enforcement.....	4850
a. Agency May Rescind	4851
b. Restoration of Consideration Received; “Tender Back”	4851
c. Enforcement Petition to Rescind Settlement; Late PFR Raising Enforcement Issue	4853
II. APPELLATE REMEDIES	4854
A. REMEDIAL AUTHORITY	4854
1. Statutory Basis for Remedial Authority	4855
2. OPM Regulation.....	4855
3. Collateral Result of Restoration Order; Action Related to Case Under Appeal	4855
a. Effect on Remedial Order of Decision of Another Tribunal	4860
b. Reversal of Criminal Conviction	4860
B. BACK PAY AND RELATED REMEDIES.....	4861
1. Necessary Findings.....	4861
2. Pay Entitlement: Ready, Willing, and Able to Work	4861
a. Effect of Disability Retirement	4868
3. Maximum Recovery Period.....	4868
a. Liability for Event Preceding Adverse Action	4869
4. Method of Payment.....	4869
5. Method of Calculation.....	4869
6. Reinstatement With No or Limited Pay; Time-Served or Other Suspension; Shortened Notice Period	4869
a. After Acquired Evidence	4871
7. Loss of Security Clearance.....	4871
8. Bonus or Award; Differential; Relocation Expense	4872
9. Premium, Overtime, Holiday Pay.....	4874
a. Overtime for Postal Service Employee.....	4878
10. Interest—Back Pay Act	4879
a. Interest—Postal Service Employee	4883
11. Insurance Benefit.....	4884
12. Retirement, TSP Contribution or Loan.....	4885
13. Leave Account; FMLA; Military Leave.....	4890
14. Leave Restoration for MSPB, Related Proceedings; Compensatory Time; Official Time	4893
15. Interim Promotion; WIGI; Pay Increase	4895
16. Applicant for Employment	4899
17. Federal Aviation Administration Employee.....	4900
C. DUTY TO MITIGATE BACK PAY THROUGH INTERIM EMPLOYMENT	4900
1. Employee Other Than Postal Service	4900
2. Postal Service Employee.....	4900
D. DEDUCTIONS FROM BACK PAY	4902
1. Retirement, TSP Contribution.....	4903
2. Debt to Retirement Fund	4904
3. Annuity Entitlement or Adjustment.....	4905
4. Union Dues; Insurance; Medicare.....	4905
5. Taxes; Increased Taxes	4910
6. Unemployment, OWCP, Workers’ Compensation	4912
7. Interim Earnings; Job Search, Relocation Cost; Replacement Earnings; Retirement Income; Fraudulent Earnings Information	4915
8. Other Deductions	4918
E. RETRAINING	4918
F. REEMPLOYMENT RIGHT.....	4919
G. PURGING OF RECORDS; MODIFICATION OF DOCUMENTATION, PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL.....	4919
1. Coding of Personnel Document	4922
2. Adjustment to AWOL Charge.....	4923
H. DAMAGES; REGULATION GOVERNING RECOVERY	4924
1. Availability of Compensatory Damages.....	4927
2. Awards of Compensatory Damages—Civil Rights Acts.....	4932
a. Effect of Receipt of FECA and Insurance Benefits on Recovery of Compensatory Damages	4941
b. Pecuniary Damages.....	4943

3.	Consequential Damages and Costs—Whistleblower Case.....	4943
4.	Compensatory Damages—Whistleblower Case.....	4953
5.	Damages Under VEOA, USERRA.....	4958
6.	Monetary Relief for Prohibited Personnel Practices Not Covered by the WPA or EEO Law.....	4959
7.	Punitive Damages.....	4963
8.	Taxation of Damages, Attorney Fees.....	4963
I.	NONTRADITIONAL REMEDIES	4964
1.	Waiver of Debt.....	4964
2.	Apology; Evidence Destruction	4964
3.	Protection Against Intervening Event	4965
a.	Protection Against Future Event	4965
4.	Front Pay.....	4965
5.	Equitable Relief; Other Remedies.....	4965
III.	ENFORCEMENT.....	4967
A.	ENFORCEMENT OF MSPB DECISION	4967
1.	Authority to Order Compliance; Sanctions.....	4969
a.	Sanction Against Agency.....	4969
2.	Authority to Award Back Pay or Monetary Remedy	4970
a.	Mootness.....	4973
b.	Burden of Proof; Proof of Compliance	4973
3.	Enforcement Procedure.....	4974
a.	Enforcement Petition Regulation, Guidance	4975
b.	Time for Initiating Enforcement	4977
c.	Agency Request for Extension of Time	4981
d.	Duty to Supply Information; Accounting.....	4981
e.	Unclear or Impossible Compliance	4983
f.	Evidence of Compliance; Statement of Intent; Representative’s Statement; Reargument of Merits.....	4984
g.	Hearing.....	4985
h.	Discovery	4985
i.	Referral to Comptroller General.....	4987
j.	Multiple Enforcement Petitions; <i>Res Judicata</i>	4987
k.	Analysis by Judge	4988
l.	Evidence Supplied After Decision of Judge.....	4988
m.	MSPB Review of Initial Decision on Enforcement Petition	4989
4.	Allegation of Reprisal, Bad Faith, Discrimination, or Harassment.....	4991
a.	Discipline Related to Agency Noncompliance	4993
b.	Performance Appraisal Dispute	4993
c.	Remedy Limited to “Forward-Looking Relief”; But-For Analysis.....	4994
5.	Back Pay Dispute	4994
a.	Delay in Payment.....	4996
b.	Damages.....	4997
6.	Reinstatement to the Same Position; <i>Status Quo Ante</i> Remedy	4997
a.	Medical Limitation	5001
b.	Effect of Retirement.....	5002
c.	Obligation Under Collective Bargaining Contract.....	5003
d.	Other Post-Reinstatement Action; Medical Certification Requirement.....	5003
e.	Postal Service Reorganization.....	5004
f.	Security Clearance Problem.....	5005
g.	Demotion	5007
h.	Term or Temporary Appointment.....	5015
i.	Seniority Adjustment	5016
j.	Pay System Change.....	5017
k.	Insurance	5017
l.	Other Working Conditions	5018
7.	Compelling Reason for Reassignment; Detail; Different Duties.....	5019
a.	Replacement Employee	5019
b.	Placement on Administrative Leave Pending Subsequent Removal Attempt.....	5020
c.	Intervening Abolition of Position	5020
d.	Detail or Other Variation of Permanent Position.....	5022
e.	Intervening Adverse Action.....	5023
f.	Reasons Related to Original Action.....	5023

g. Overriding Interest.....	5024
8. Reinstatement With Accommodation for Disability.....	5031
9. Lack of Authority to Enforce Compliance.....	5035
10. Sovereign Immunity Issue.....	5035
B. ENFORCEMENT AND INTERPRETATION OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS	5036
1. Scope of Enforcement Authority.....	5038
a. Only Filed Settlement May Be Enforced; Settlement Enforceable in Different Forum	5038
b. Allegation of Discrimination; Whistleblowing Reprisal	5040
c. Damages.....	5041
2. Agency Enforcement Initiative.....	5042
a. Appellant’s Agreement to Resign or to Take Other Action; Agency Self Help	5043
b. Agreement Not to Reapply for Employment With Agency	5043
c. Agreement to Withdraw EEOC Case or Other Litigation.....	5044
3. Agreement That Appellant First Notify Agency of Noncompliance Allegation.....	5045
a. Agreement That the Parties Attempt to Adjust Disputes Under the Settlement.....	5046
4. Election Between Enforcement and Rescission; Pleading in the Alternative.....	5047
a. Modification of Settlement Provision	5048
5. Role of MSPB Regional or Field Office.....	5048
a. Treatment of Enforcement Issue; Evidence on PFR.....	5049
6. Time for Compliance if None Set in Settlement Agreement.....	5049
7. Time for Initiating Enforcement.....	5050
a. Reasonableness of Timing of Enforcement; Laches Defense	5055
8. Burden of Proof.....	5058
a. Evidence Required	5062
b. Mutual Breach; “Clean Hands”.....	5062
9. Interpretation and Application of Settlement: Legal Principles.....	5064
a. Materiality of Breach	5065
b. Good Faith Required; Bad Faith.....	5071
10. Interpretation of Agreement: External Law; Extrinsic or Parol Evidence; Ambiguous Term; History of Performance; Hearing.....	5075
a. Back Pay, Other Obligation; Omitted Term.....	5081
b. Amendment to Agreement; Counterproposal	5083
11. Specific Settlement Provisions	5083
a. Term of Art	5083
b. Obligation to Reinstatement or Restore to Duty; Precondition to Restoration.....	5084
c. Agreement to Reassign; Work Schedule Change; Light Duty Position; Duration of Agency’s Commitment	5086
d. Employee May Be Terminated or Will Resign or Retire on Specified Condition; Agreement Not to Reapply.....	5089
e. Promotion, Placement Consideration; Priority Consideration	5091
f. Agreement to Provide Affirmative, Neutral, or Controlled Reference.....	5094
g. “Clean Record” or “Clean Paper”; Expungement or Withdrawal of Record; Implicit Requirement; NDAA; Executive Order 13,839; Executive Order 14,003	5103
h. Nondisclosure or Confidentiality Clause.....	5119
i. “Need to Know” Exception to Confidentiality Clause.....	5127
j. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act Provision.....	5131
k. Waiver of Protection of Confidentiality or Affirmative Reference Provision	5131
l. Adjustment of Performance Appraisal, Documentation.....	5133
m. Agreement to Provide Assistance to Employee	5134
n. Agreement to “Cancel” Action; Back Pay, Interest, Damages, or Other Entitlement; Bonus or Award; Lump Sum Provision.....	5135
o. Annuity Issues.....	5140
p. Unemployment Compensation	5145
12. Debt Recoupment	5145
13. Settlement Reached in Another Tribunal.....	5146
14. Settlement Involving Action of Third Party	5146
15. Enforcement Only Through EEO Procedures	5146
16. Privacy Act Issue	5146
17. Provision That Violates Collective Bargaining Contract.....	5147
18. Unlawful Provision.....	5147
19. Damages Unavailable for Breach of Clause Requiring Affirmative Reference, Other Violations.....	5149
20. Reprisal or Harassment	5150
a. Foreclosure of Future Discipline or Other Agency Action for Past Conduct.....	5153

CHAPTER 17: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....5157

I. OVERVIEW OF THE APPELLATE PROCESS	5157
A. NATURE OF REVIEW	5157
1. Final Decision.....	5157
a. Denial of Request for Reopening.....	5160
b. Collateral MSPB Order.....	5163
c. Decision Remanding Case to Judge.....	5164
2. Statutory Basis for Review.....	5165
3. Whistleblower Cases	5166
a. Whistleblower Reprisal: Circuits Other Than the Federal Circuit.....	5167
4. Proper Parties in Court; Standing; Mootness	5167
a. Proper Respondent in Court.....	5169
b. OSC Disciplinary Case	5173
c. Arbitration Award.....	5174
5. <i>Amicus</i> Submission	5176
6. Government Appellate Review Request; Cross-Appeal	5176
a. Review Request by OPM	5176
b. Discrimination Issue	5178
7. Court of Appeals for the Federal Circuit.....	5179
a. Nonprecedential Decision.....	5180
b. Summary Affirmation	5181
c. Court Practice	5182
d. Counsel Authorized to Appear in Appeal; Federal Circuit Admission	5185
e. <i>Pro Se</i> Appeal.....	5185
f. Appointment of Counsel	5186
g. Stay Pending Court Review.....	5186
8. Record and Issues Below	5186
a. Appendix.....	5188
b. New and Material Evidence	5189
B. SCOPE OF REVIEW	5189
1. Arbitrary and Capricious.....	5190
2. Issues of Law, Jurisdiction; Constitutional Issues.....	5190
a. Decisional Rationale Omitted by MSPB; Departure From Precedent	5192
3. Procedural Error by MSPB.....	5194
a. Ruling on Witnesses and Evidence.....	5194
b. Ruling on Discovery.....	5195
c. Timeliness of MSPB Filing.....	5197
4. Substantial Evidence; Factual Dispute.....	5197
a. Credibility	5202
b. Nexus	5206
5. Agency Rule of Conduct.....	5207
6. Penalty Determination	5207
a. Table of Penalties.....	5209
b. Not All Charges Sustained.....	5209
c. Application of <i>Douglas</i> Mitigating Factors.....	5211
d. Performance Action.....	5212
7. Reduction in Force.....	5212
8. Retirement Appeals.....	5213
a. Disability Retirement.....	5214
b. Optional Retirement.....	5221
C. DEFERENCE; INTERPRETATION OF STATUTES, REGULATIONS, LABOR AND OTHER CONTRACTS	5222
1. Agency Statutory Interpretation	5222
a. Regulation Applying Statute; Agency Interpretation of Regulation	5224
2. Agency Handbook, Instruction	5230
3. MSPB Decision.....	5232
4. Principles of Statutory and Regulatory Interpretation	5232
a. Language Controls.....	5233
b. Consideration of the Statutory Scheme.....	5236
c. Avoidance of Absurd Consequences.....	5237
d. Statements of Legislators	5237
e. Amendment; Failure to Amend.....	5237

f. Retroactivity	5238
g. Change in Law	5242
5. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract	5243
6. Settlement; Last Chance Agreement	5244
D. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES	5247
1. Review of Board Decisions That Include EEO Defenses or Both EEO and Whistleblower Reprisal Defenses.....	5250
2. Reprisal.....	5253
a. Individual Right of Action.....	5254
3. Jurisdictional Issue; Constructive Adverse Action; <i>Perry</i>	5255
4. Timeliness, Procedural Issue; <i>Kloeckner</i>	5263
5. Attorney Fees Award, Application.....	5268
6. Transfer To and From District Courts.....	5269
7. District Court Review	5271
a. Time for District Court Review; Tolling or Estoppel; Exhaustion of Remedies.....	5273
b. Effect of Waiver of EEO Claim	5274
c. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies	5274
d. Summary Adjudication of EEO Issues; Disposition of Civil Service Issues	5277
e. Scope of Review.....	5279
f. Compliance With District Court Decision	5280
8. Discharge of Probationer	5280
E. REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS	5282
1. Mixed Case.....	5285
2. Time for Seeking Review	5291
3. Decisional Standards for Arbitrator	5292
a. Arbitrability.....	5296
b. Bargaining History	5297
c. Past Practice.....	5297
d. <i>Functus Officio</i> ; Interim Award	5299
4. Attorney Fees Award.....	5300
5. Review Sought by OPM.....	5301
6. Award Involving Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee	5302
7. Award Involving Nonappropriated Fund Instrumentality Employee.....	5303
8. Award Reviewed by Federal Labor Relations Authority.....	5303
F. VEOA, USERRA CLAIMS.....	5304
II. PREREQUISITES FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW	5305
A. TIME FOR INITIATING JUDICIAL REVIEW.....	5305
1. Equitable Tolling	5309
B. EXHAUSTION OF MSPB ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES	5313
1. Issue Must Be Raised With the MSPB.....	5313
a. Exception to Exhaustion Requirement	5315
2. Necessity for PFR to MSPB.....	5317
a. Challenge to Settlement.....	5319
3. Ripeness for Judicial Review	5319
4. Mandamus; Denial of IRA Stay.....	5321
III. JUDICIAL REMEDIAL AUTHORITY	5322
A. AUTHORITY TO REMAND	5322
1. Remand to Effect Settlement.....	5323
2. Judicial Control of MSPB Procedures	5324
B. AUTHORITY TO TRANSFER.....	5324
C. SANCTIONS	5324
1. Examples of Sanctionable Conduct	5327
IV. JUDICIAL RELIEF OUTSIDE THE REFORM ACT	5329
A. PARTIES TO THE SUIT	5333
1. Sovereign Immunity.....	5333
2. Absolute Immunity.....	5333
3. Qualified Immunity.....	5334
a. Action Against Union.....	5334
B. SUITS BASED ON STATUTE AND CONSTITUTION	5334
1. Administrative Procedure Act.....	5334
a. Use of the APA	5335
b. Scope of Review; Preclusive Effect of the Reform Act.....	5335
c. Scope of Relief	5339

2.	Privacy Act	5339
a.	Scope of the Act.....	5340
b.	Enforcement of the Act	5341
c.	Use of the Privacy Act	5341
d.	Position Classification	5342
3.	Mandamus Act	5342
a.	Position Classification	5343
4.	Tucker Act	5346
a.	Position Classification	5352
b.	Overtime Pay Claim	5352
c.	Environmental Differential, Hazard Pay, Travel Pay	5353
d.	Claims Concerning Tenure, Contract Employment, Promotion, and Bonuses.....	5356
e.	Whistleblower Reprisal Claim	5360
f.	Claims Based on Constitution.....	5362
g.	EEO Settlement	5364
h.	MSPB Settlement.....	5369
5.	Federal Tort Claims Act.....	5371
6.	Back Pay Act	5373
a.	Implied Preclusion Under the CSRA	5376
b.	Promotion Claim.....	5376
7.	Family Medical Leave Act	5377
8.	Overtime, Pay Statutes.....	5378
9.	Unfair Labor Practice.....	5380
10.	Constitution	5380
a.	Property Interest.....	5381
b.	Liberty Interest; Name Clearing Hearing	5382
(i)	Termination of Probationer.....	5384
c.	First Amendment.....	5385
11.	Injunction Action.....	5387
C.	ACTIONS FOR DAMAGES AGAINST INDIVIDUALS AND GOVERNMENT; <i>BIVENS</i>	5393
1.	Preclusion in the Circuits	5398
a.	D.C. Circuit.....	5398
b.	First Circuit	5401
c.	Second Circuit.....	5401
d.	Third Circuit	5401
e.	Fourth Circuit	5401
f.	Fifth Circuit.....	5401
g.	Sixth Circuit.....	5402
h.	Seventh Circuit	5403
i.	Eighth Circuit.....	5404
j.	Ninth Circuit	5404
k.	Tenth Circuit	5405
l.	Eleventh Circuit	5406
2.	Claims Based on State Law; Westfall Act; Federal Tort Claims Act; Defamation; Tort Action Arising From Assault; No FEAR Act; Religious Freedom Restoration Act; FECA.....	5406

CHAPTER 18: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....5415

I.	RESEARCH AND REFERENCES.....	5415
II.	FORMS.....	5416

BIBLIOGRAPHY5437

TABLE OF CASES5445

INDEX5613