TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND NEW DEVELOPMENTS 1

I. INTRODUCTION 1
II. LEGISLATIVE CHANGE 2
III. NEW CASE LAW 2
A. ATTORNEY FEES 2
B. *CARR* FACTORS 2
C. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 13
D. CONTRIBUTING FACTOR 13
E. ELECTION 17
F. EXHAUSTION 17
G. JURISDICTION 18
H. NORMAL COURSE OF DUTIES (5 USC 2302(F)(2)) 23
I. OTHER CIRCUIT JURISDICTION 25
J. PERCEIVED WHISTLEBLOWER 28
K. PERSONNEL ACTION 29
L. PROTECTED ACTIVITY (SECTION (B)(9)) 34
M. PROTECTED DISCLOSURES 38
N. REASSIGNMENT TO NEW AJ 45

CHAPTER 2: OVERVIEW 47

I. INITIAL EFFORTS TO PROTECT FEDERAL EMPLOYEES 47
II. THE CSRA 47
III. THE WPA OF 1989 48
IV. THE 1994 AMENDMENTS 52
V. WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT ACT OF 2012 (WPEA) 53
VI. THE NO FEAR ACT 58
VII. MORE RECENT LEGISLATION 58
VIII. OTHER STATUTES PROVIDING WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION 59
IX. USEFUL MSPB AND OSC REPORTS ON WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION 60
X. HOW THIS BOOK IS ORGANIZED 60

CHAPTER 3: OSC OPERATIONS 63

I. OSC RESPONSIBILITIES AND JURISDICTION 63
II. COMPLAINTS, DISCLOSURES, AND REFERRALS TO OSC 65
A. PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE COMPLAINTS 65
B. REFERRALS FROM MSPB 76
C. OSC *SUA SPONTE* 77
III. PROCESSING PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE COMPLAINTS (E.G., REPRISAL FOR WHISTLEBLOWING) 79
A. THE OSC STATUTORY FRAMEWORK FOR PROCESSING AND INVESTIGATING PPP COMPLAINTS 79
B. OSC'S FRAMEWORK FOR PROCESSING AND INVESTIGATING PPP COMPLAINTS 80
1. ADR, Mediation 84
2. The Complaint, Investigatory Process and IRAs 86
3. Investigating Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaints 87
a. Initial IPD Contacts 90
(i) OSC-54 90
(ii) Initial Assessment 91
(iii) Initial Discussion and Confidentiality 91
(iv) Initial Agency Contact and Agency Liaisons 92
b. The OSC Investigation and the Complainant: What to Do; What to Anticipate 94

c. The OSC Investigation and the Agency: What to Do; What to Anticipate 95
d. Agency Preparation for IPD Investigation 96
e. IPD Interviews of Agency Witnesses 96
f. Subject and Adverse Witness Interviews 101
g. Subject and Witness Rights in OSC Investigations 101
h. Closing the Investigation 102
(i) The Preliminary Determination 102
i. The IPD Decision to Go Forward 102
C. WHISTLEBLOWER DISCLOSURES TO OSC 103
1. Processing Whistleblower Disclosures 112

CHAPTER 4: OSC AND THE MSPB—CORRECTIVE AND DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS 123

I. CORRECTIVE, DISCIPLINARY AND OTHER OSC ACTION GENERALLY 124
A. CORRECTIVE ACTIONS 125
B. DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS 139
1. When the Agency Takes Disciplinary Action 140
2. Requirements, Procedures, and Process for a Disciplinary Action 141
a. The Complaint 141
b. The Rights and Entitlements of the Charged Official and the Answer 142
3. Sanctions Against the Charged Official 143
4. Discovery 144
5. OSC's Burden of Proof 145
a. Element One: Authority of the Charged Official 145
b. Element Two: Whether the Aggrieved Employee Made a Protected Disclosure 146
c. Element Three: Charged Official's Misuse of Authority 147
d. Element Four: Nexus 147
6. The Penalty 148
II. OSC DISCIPLINARY AND AGENCY ADVERSE ACTIONS IN WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL CASES 150
III. OSC REPORTS 151

CHAPTER 5: MSPB PROCESSING OF INDIVIDUALS' REPRISAL AND OTHER PROTECTED ACTIVITY CLAIMS—OAAS AND IRAS 153

I. IRAS AND OAAS 153
II. SOME HISTORY 154
III. THE OAA 155
IV. THE IRA 156
A. COVERED EMPLOYEES AND AGENCIES 159
B. COVERED PERSONNEL ACTIONS 160
1. Stays 165
2. Timeliness 165
3. Front-End Time Requirement 167
4. Premature IRAs 167
5. The Adequate Basis Rule: Exhaustion 168
C. THE CONTENTS OF THE OSC COMPLAINT 171
D. SOME UNIQUE ASPECTS OF AN IRA ACTION AT THE MSPB 171
1. The Content of the IRA Appeal 171
2. Appellant's Jurisdictional Burden and the Pure IRA: Nonfrivolous Allegations 173
E. THE MERITS HEARING 177

CHAPTER 6: WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL CLAIMS AND THE ELECTION OF A REMEDY 181

I. AN ELECTION MUST BE KNOWING AND INFORMED 181
II. A VALID ELECTION WILL LIMIT THE APPELLANT TO CERTAIN ISSUES 182
III. HOW IS IT DETERMINED AS TO WHICH PROCESS IS ELECTED 183

IV. WHAT ABOUT THE ADMINISTRATIVE GRIEVANCE PROCESS? 183
V. THE NATURE OF THE PERSONNEL ACTION AND NOT WHETHER THE TERM "REPRISAL" OR "PROHIBITED PERSONNEL ACTION" IS USED DETERMINES WHETHER AN ELECTION HAS BEEN MADE 183

CHAPTER 7: STAYS 185

I. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY GUIDANCE FOR INDIVIDUAL-APPELLANT STAYS 186
II. A CLOSER SUBSTANTIVE LOOK AT APPELLANT STAY REQUESTS 191
A. WHO MAY REQUEST A STAY 191
B. WHEN TO FILE 192
C. WHERE TO FILE 194
D. HOW TO FILE 194
E. WHAT TO FILE: THE GROUNDS FOR A STAY 195
F. THE AGENCY RESPONSE 195
G. STAY RULINGS: THE PROCEDURAL REQUIREMENTS 196
H. STAY RULINGS: THE MERITS; GROUNDS FOR A STAY; THE ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK 197
I. STAY DURATION; INTERIM COMPLIANCE 203
J. CHALLENGING A STAY: BOARD REVIEW 203
III. OSC STAY REQUESTS 207
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY GUIDANCE FOR OSC STAYS 207
B. APPELLANT'S STAYS IN REAL TIME 213
C. OSC STAY REQUESTS: SUM AND SUBSTANCE 215
D. THE INITIAL STAY 217
E. STAY EXTENSIONS; AGENCY OPPORTUNITY TO COMMENT 219
F. OSC STAY ACTIVITY 223
G. THE ADVOCACY AND TACTICS IN STAY LITIGATION 245
IV. THE VA ACCOUNTABILITY AND WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT OF 2017: HOLDS, STAYS 247

CHAPTER 8: ELEMENTS OF A REPRISAL CLAIM MADE BY EMPLOYEES OR APPLICANTS — A PRIMER 251

I. IRAS AND OAAS 251
II. COVERED IRA EMPLOYEES OR APPLICANTS 253
III. THE COMMON ELEMENTS—PROTECTED DISCLOSURE, RETALIATORY RESULT 254
A. ELEMENT (1)—A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE UNDER (B)(8) OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY UNDER (B)(9) 257
1. 5 USC 2302(b)(8) 257
2. 5 USC 2302(b)(9) 260
a. Recent (b)(9) Cases 261
B. ELEMENT (2)—THE CONNECTION BETWEEN THE DISCLOSURE OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY AND THE PERSONNEL ACTION 264
IV. IRA FILING REQUIREMENTS AND EXHAUSTION—ELEMENTS (3) AND (4) 271
A. CASES ABOUT EXHAUSTION AND FILING 272
V. AGENCY BURDEN—"CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE" 275

CHAPTER 9: A CLOSER LOOK AT THE ELEMENTS: PROTECTED DISCLOSURES AND PROTECTED ACTIVITY 277

I. THE FIRST ELEMENT—A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE 279
A. CATEGORIES OF WHISTLEBLOWING 279
B. NON FRIVOLOUS ALLEGATIONS 280
II. THE REASONABLE BELIEF STANDARD 282
A. ALLEGATIONS MUST BE DETAILED AND SPECIFIC 283
B. FAILURE TO SEEK CLARIFICATION 284
C. BELIEF SHARED BY OTHER EMPLOYEES 285
D. EMPLOYEE'S RELIANCE ON REPORTS OF THOSE WHO ARE IN A POSITION TO KNOW 286
E. EXPERTISE OR PERSONAL KNOWLEDGE OF WHISTLEBLOWER 286
1. Cases Involving the Whistleblower's Expertise or Personal Knowledge 286

F. RESPONSE BY AGENCY TO DISCLOSURE 287
G. RELIANCE ON HEARSAY OR RUMOR 287
H. A SPECULATIVE BELIEF 288
I. SPECIFIC CONDITION OF THE EMPLOYEE 288
J. KNOWLEDGE AT TIME OF DISCLOSURE 289
K. MOTIVATION IS NOT RELEVANT 289
III. THE CATEGORIES OF WRONGDOING 290
A. ANY VIOLATION OF ANY LAW, RULE, OR REGULATION 290
1. Cases Involving "Violation of Any Law, Rule or Regulation" Claims 293
B. ABUSE OF AUTHORITY 297
1. Cases That Have Ruled on the "Abuse of Authority" Standard 299
C. GROSS MISMANAGEMENT OR GROSS WASTE OF FUNDS 303
1. Two Separate Categories but Substantial Similarities 303
2. Debatable Differences Exception 304
3. Debatable Differences Cases Following the WPEA 306
4. Gross Waste of Funds and Gross Mismanagement Cases 310
D. A SUBSTANTIAL AND SPECIFIC DANGER TO PUBLIC HEALTH OR SAFETY 313
1. Cases Involving "Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety" Disclosures 318
2. Cases in Which Appellants Claimed a Reasonable Belief as to a Substantial and Specific Danger to Public Health or Safety Claim 319
IV. PROTECTION WITHOUT A DISCLOSURE 322
A. PERCEIVED WHISTLEBLOWER 322
B. ASSOCIATION WITH A WHISTLEBLOWER 325

CHAPTER 10: WHEN A DISCLOSURE IS NOT A DISCLOSURE 327

I. PROHIBITED BY LAW OR EXECUTIVE ORDER 327
II. DISCLOSURES OF INFORMATION IN THE "NORMAL COURSE OF DUTIES" 329

CHAPTER 11: OTHER ASPECTS OF A *PRIMA FACIE* CASE: A PERSONNEL ACTION AND A CONTRIBUTING FACTOR 335

I. WHETHER THE AGENCY, BASED ON A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE, TOOK, FAILED TO TAKE, OR THREATENED TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION 336
A. A PERSONNEL ACTION 336
B. CASES INVOLVING PERSONNEL ACTIONS 339
1. The Broader Categories of Personnel Actions: 5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(ix) and (xii) 339
a. Cases Involving "Decisions Concerning Pay, Benefits, or Awards, or Concerning Education or Training if the Education or Training May Reasonably Be Expected to Lead to an Appointment, Promotion, Performance Evaluation, or Other Action Described"—5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(ix) 339
b. Cases Involving "Any Other Significant Change in Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions"—5 USC 2302(a)(2)(A)(xii) 340
2. Other Cases Involving Actions Qualifying as "Personnel Actions" 345
3. Other Cases Involving Actions Not Qualifying as "Personnel Actions" 347
C. THE NEWEST "PERSONNEL ACTION": NONDISCLOSURE REQUIREMENTS 348
D. SECURITY CLEARANCE ACTIONS NOT COVERED AS PERSONNEL ACTIONS 349
E. FAILURE TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION 349
F. THREATENING TO TAKE A PERSONNEL ACTION 349
G. CONTRIBUTING FACTOR (WHETHER THE PERSONNEL ACTION WAS "BASED ON" A PROTECTED DISCLOSURE) 351
1. Knowledge/Timing Test 354
a. Timing 354
(i) Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Met 354
(ii) Cases in Which the Timing Standard Was Not Met 357
b. Knowledge 357

2. Other Ways to Prove a Contributing Factor 360

CHAPTER 12: THE AGENCY'S BURDEN: IT WOULD HAVE TAKEN THE ACTION IN THE ABSENCE OF WHISTLEBLOWING OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY 363

I. CLEAR AND CONVINCING EVIDENCE 363
A. THE *CARR* FACTORS, BRIEFLY 363
B. ANALYZING THE AGENCY'S BURDEN: *WHITMORE* 364
II. THE *CARR* FACTORS ANALYSIS 369
A. *CARR* FACTOR ONE: THE STRENGTH OF THE AGENCY'S EVIDENCE IN SUPPORT OF ITS PERSONNEL ACTION 369
B. *CARR* FACTOR TWO: THE EXISTENCE AND STRENGTH OF ANY MOTIVE TO RETALIATE ON THE PART OF THE AGENCY OFFICIALS WHO WERE INVOLVED IN THE DECISION 371
1. Cases Illustrating Considerations in Determining Motive 371
C. *CARR* FACTOR THREE: ANY EVIDENCE THAT THE AGENCY TAKES SIMILAR ACTIONS AGAINST EMPLOYEES WHO ARE NOT WHISTLEBLOWERS, BUT WHO ARE OTHERWISE SIMILARLY SITUATED..... 373
1. Recent Cases Illustrating Considerations in Relation to *Carr* Factor 375
III. OTHER CASES INVOLVING CLEAR AND CONVINCING DETERMINATION NOT SUMMARIZED ABOVE 380

CHAPTER 13: REMEDIES, DAMAGES, AND RELIEF 391

I. CORRECTIVE ACTION, IN GENERAL 391
II. TRANSFER PREFERENCE 393
III. ATTORNEY FEES 394
IV. MAKE WHOLE RELIEF 400
V. COMPENSATORY AND CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES 402
A. PROCESS, PROCEDURE 410
B. BOARD CASE LAW ON CONSEQUENTIAL AND COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 412
VI. INTERIM RELIEF 430

CHAPTER 14: ADMINISTRATIVE AND JUDICIAL REVIEW 435

I. ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW AND PETITIONS FOR REVIEW 437
II. JUDICIAL REVIEW 443
A. REVIEW OF IRAS OR OAAS 445
B. REVIEW OF MSPB DECISIONS ON OSC DISCIPLINARY AND CORRECTIVE ACTIONS 448
1. Disciplinary Actions 448
2. Corrective Actions 449
3. Recent Federal Circuit Decisions 449
III. REVIEW OF AN ARBITRATOR'S DECISION ON A WHISTLEBLOWER REPRISAL OR PROTECTED ACTIVITY CLAIM 450

CHAPTER 15: INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTIONS: FROM THE 1998 ICWPA TO THE PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE (PPD)-19 451

I. STATUTORY EXCLUSIONS 451
II. THE MODEST EXCEPTION 452
III. A MORE SIGNIFICANT EXCEPTION 452
IV. THE HISTORY AND SCOPE OF INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY COVERAGE 452
A. INTELLIGENCE COMMUNITY WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT (ICWPA) OF 1998 452
B. INTELLIGENCE AUTHORIZATION ACT (IAA) FOR FISCAL YEAR 2010 (50 USC 3033) 453
C. PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE (PPD)-19 454
1. The Important Definitions 454
a. Covered Employees and "Intelligence Community Element" 454
b. Personnel Action 455
c. Protected Disclosure 455
2. Prohibited Retaliation in the Intelligence Community 456

3. Prohibited Retaliation Affecting Eligibility for Access to Classified Information 456
4. IG External Review Panel 457
5. Issuance of Policies and Procedures and Notice to Employees 457
6. General Provisions 458
D. TITLE VI OF THE INTELLIGENCE AUTHORIZATION ACT (IAA) FOR FISCAL YEAR 2014 AND BEYOND 458

TABLE OF CASES 459

REFERENCE MATERIALS

(DOWNLOAD AT WWW.DEWEYPUB.COM/REFWPA)

REFERENCE MATERIALS: TABLE OF CONTENTS ..... REF-i

REFERENCE MATERIALS 1: 5 USC 1201–1222 ..... REF-1

REFERENCE MATERIALS 2: 5 USC 2301–2304 ..... REF-17

REFERENCE MATERIALS 3: 5 USC 7501–7543 ..... REF-25

REFERENCE MATERIALS 4: 5 USC 7701–7703 ..... REF-33

REFERENCE MATERIALS 5: 5 CFR 1201 ..... REF-39

REFERENCE MATERIALS 6: 5 CFR 1209 ..... REF-85

REFERENCE MATERIALS 7: 5 CFR 1800–1850 ..... REF-91

REFERENCE MATERIALS 8: WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ENHANCEMENT ACT OF 2012 ..... REF-111

REFERENCE MATERIALS 9: PRESIDENTIAL POLICY DIRECTIVE – PPD-19 ..... REF-123

REFERENCE MATERIALS 10: DR. CHRIS KIRKPATRICK WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT OF 2017 ..... REF-131

REFERENCE MATERIALS 11: OSC FORM 14 ..... REF-139