TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE i

CHAPTER ONE: OVERVIEW 1

CHAPTER TWO: TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS 7

I. TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTION DEFINITION 8
- A. CHARACTERISTICS OF TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS 8
- B. LINK TO HARASSMENT 9
- C. COMMITTED BY SUPERVISOR 11
  - 1. 2024 *Enforcement Guidance on Harassment in the Workplace* 11
  - 2. Circuit Court Split 11
  - 3. *Vance v. Ball State University* 11
  - 4. Acting Supervisors 14
  - 5. Apparent Authority 14
  - 6. Team Leaders 15
  - 7. Cat's Paw and Tangible Employment Actions 15
- D. SPECIFIC EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS 16
  - 1. Threatened Tangible Employment Action 16
  - 2. Reassignment 17
  - 3. Change in Assignment/Duties 18
  - 4. Leave-Related Actions 20
  - 5. Failure to Hire/Promote 20
  - 6. Denial of Career Advancement 21
  - 7. Performance Appraisals 22
  - 8. Negative Employment Reference 26
  - 9. Denial of Overtime 27
  - 10. Deprivations Impacting Job Performance 27
  - 11. Denial of Bonus or Step Increase 27
  - 12. Letter of Counseling, Reprimand 28
  - 13. Constructive Discharge 28
  - 14. Rescinded Actions 30
  - 15. Denial of Reasonable Accommodation 31
  - 16. Schedule Changes 32
  - 17. Reductions in Force 32
  - 18. Denial of Training 32
  - 19. Telework Requests 32
  - 20. Collective Actions/Administrative Matters 32
- E. BENEFICIAL TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS 33

II. ACCEPTANCE/REJECTION OF SEXUAL ADVANCES 34
- A. IMPLIED CONDITION 34

III. CAUSATION 35
- A. CIRCUMSTANTIAL EVIDENCE 35
  - 1. Failure to Rebut Employer's Reason for Action 36
  - 2. Different Decision-Maker 36
  - 3. Temporal Proximity 39
- B. DIRECT EVIDENCE 39
  - 1. Analysis in Direct Evidence Cases 40
  - 2. Defining Direct Evidence 41
- C. MIXED MOTIVES 42

IV. THIRD-PARTY CLAIMS 42

V. OTHER TYPES OF HARASSMENT....43
A. RELIGIOUS COERCION AND TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS....45
B. REPRISAL....46

CHAPTER THREE: HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT—OVERVIEW....51
I. HISTORY OF HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT THEORY....51
A. MERITOR SAVINGS BANK V. VINSON....52
B. *HARRIS V. FORKLIFT SYSTEMS*....54
II. BASIC ELEMENTS OF HOSTILE WORK ENVIRONMENT CLAIM....55
A. ELEMENT ONE—MEMBERSHIP IN A PROTECTED CLASS....56
B. ELEMENT TWO—UNWELCOME REQUIREMENT....56
C. ELEMENT THREE—BASED ON A STATUTORILY PROTECTED CLASS....56
D. ELEMENT FOUR—SEVERE OR PERVASIVE REQUIREMENT....56
E. ELEMENT FIVE—LIABILITY....57
F. AGENCY'S DEFENSES....57
G. AGENCY'S AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE....58

CHAPTER FOUR: TIMELINESS....59
I. THE 45-DAY TIME LIMIT....59
II. THE PROBLEM OF "CONTINUING VIOLATIONS"....59
A. THE ANISMAN ANTIDOTE....61
III. MORGAN AND "UNLAWFUL EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES"....64
A. *MORGAN* ON DISCRETE ACTS....64
B. *MORGAN* ON HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CLAIMS....66
IV. THE LAW SINCE MORGAN FOR HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CLAIMS: TIMELY COUNSELOR CONTACT....71
A. COUNSELING DENIED....71
B. INDEPENDENT OR DISCRETE ACTS AND HARASSMENT....72
1. Independent Acts of Harassment—Relatedness Requirement....72
2. Independent Acts of Harassment—Relief for Complainants....74
3. Claims With Discrete Acts—Relatedness Requirement....75
4. Discrete Acts—Relief for Complainants....79
C. TIMELINESS AND EQUITABLE DOCTRINES....80
1. Minor Complainants....80
2. Incapacitated Complainants....81
3. Waiting for the Agency to Act....81
4. Fear of Reprisal....82
D. RETALIATION CLAIMS....82

CHAPTER FIVE: UNWELCOME CONDUCT....83
I. UNWELCOME REQUIREMENT: OVERVIEW....84
II. TIMING OF REPORTING HARASSING CONDUCT....85
A. DELAYS IN REPORTING....85
B. CONTEMPORANEOUS REPORTS....88
III. PARTICIPATION IN OR SUBMISSION TO CONDUCT....88
A. SUBMISSION TO SEXUAL ADVANCES....89
B. PARTICIPATION IN CONDUCT....89
1. "Solicit or Incite"....89
2. Context....90
3. Totality of the Circumstances Analysis....93
4. Activities Outside Work....93
C. CONSENSUAL RELATIONSHIPS....95
IV. REACTION OF THE COMPLAINANT....97
V. HARASSMENT BASED ON RELIGION AND WELCOMENESS DETERMINATIONS....98

CHAPTER SIX: BASIS OF CONDUCT 101
I. ESTABLISHING THE EVIDENTIARY LINK, THE ABRIDGED VERSION 103
II. CAUSATION 104
III. PROTECTED STATUS—SEX 105
A. SEXUAL CONDUCT 106
1. Physical Sexual Conduct 107
2. Other Sexual Conduct 108
3. Sexually Charged Comments 108
B. GENDER-BASED CONDUCT 111
1. Conduct Inherently Tied to Protected Status 111
2. Facially Neutral Conduct Directed at Protected Employees 113
3. "Sex-Plus" Harassment 116
4. Attire and Dress Codes 118
5. Gender Stereotyping 120
C. PREGNANCY 123
D. MARITAL STATUS AND CAREGIVER RESPONSIBILITIES 124
E. GENDER IDENTIFICATION /TRANSGENDER STATUS AND SEXUAL ORIENTATION 125
1. Overview 125
2. Gender Identification/Transgender Status 126
a. Transgender Status and Bathroom Usage 132
2. Sexual Orientation 135
3. The Courts on Gender Identification, Transgender Status, and Sexual Orientation 143
a. *Bostock v. Clayton* 143
b. Pre-*Bostock* Court Decisions 146
4. Religious Objections 148
F. SEX OF PERPETRATOR AND VICTIM 148
1. Same-Sex Harassment 148
2. The "Equal Opportunity" Harasser 150
a. The Evolution of "Equal Opportunity Harasser" Law in the Courts 150
b. *Brown v. Henderson* 153
c. The Commission's Position on "Equal Opportunity Harassers" 155
G. CONDUCT DIRECTED TOWARD OTHERS 158
1. Paramour Favoritism 159
IV. ALL OTHER PROTECTED STATUSES, GENERALLY 161
A. BASED ON RACE/COLOR 162
1. Evidence of Race-Based Discrimination 163
2. Based on Race—Racial Commentary and Slurs 165
3. Based on Race—Conduct and Symbols of Racism 169
4. Based on Race—Same Race Harassment 171
B. BASED ON NATIONAL ORIGIN 172
C. BASED ON RELIGION 175
D. BASED ON DISABILITY 181
E. BASED ON AGE 186
F. BASED ON REPRISAL 187
G. ASSOCIATIONAL DISCRIMINATION 189
V. INTERSECTION OF TWO OR MORE ALLEGED BASES OF DISCRIMINATION 194
VI. BALANCING CONFLICTING PROTECTED BASES 198

CHAPTER SEVEN: SEVERE OR PERVASIVE CONDUCT 199
I. THE BASICS 199
A. SEVERE *OR* PERVASIVE 199
B. OBJECTIVE AND SUBJECTIVE ELEMENTS 200
C. STATING A CLAIM FOR RELIEF 200
D. TOTALITY OF THE CIRCUMSTANCES 201
E. SLIDING SCALE 202

F. RETALIATION HARASSMENT/REPRISAL 203
G. RELIGION-BASED HARASSMENT 205
II. THE SEVERE OR PERVASIVE REQUIREMENT 205
A. ONE-TIME AND ISOLATED INCIDENTS 205
1. Sexual Harassment 206
2. Sex-Based Harassment 208
3. Racial/Color Harassment 210
a. Slurs 210
b. Racist Symbols 213
4. National Origin Harassment 214
5. Religious Harassment 215
6. Disability Harassment 217
7. Age Harassment 218
8. Retaliatory Harassment 218
B. REPEATED INCIDENTS/FREQUENCY OF THE CONDUCT 218
1. Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment 219
2. Racial Harassment 220
3. National Origin Harassment 222
4. Religious and Disability Harassment 223
C. MICROAGGRESSIONS 224
D. CONTEXT 224
E. DURATION OF THE CONDUCT 226
1. Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment 226
2. Racial Harassment 227
3. Religious Harassment 228
F. PASSAGE OF TIME BETWEEN INCIDENTS 230
1. Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment 230
2. Race and National Origin Harassment 231
3. Religious Harassment 232
G. CONDUCT DIRECTED AT OTHERS 232
1. Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment 233
2. Race and National Origin-Based Harassment 234
3. Age Harassment 236
4. Religion-Based Harassment 236
H. CONDUCT OUTSIDE OF THE COMPLAINANT'S PRESENCE 236
1. Sexual and Sex-Based Harassment 237
2. Race and National Origin Harassment 238
3. Disability Harassment 240
4. Religious Harassment 241
I. PHYSICAL CONTACT OR CONDUCT 241
1. Sexual Contact 241
2. Non-Sexual and Incidental Physical Touching 244
3. Physical Conduct vs. Actual Contact 245
J. VERBAL CONDUCT/ABUSE—COMMENTS, RUMORS, SLURS 246
K. ROUTINE SUPERVISION 248
L. CHANGES TO DUTIES/ASSIGNMENTS/INCREASED WORK SCRUTINY 248
M. CHANGES IN THE WORK ENVIRONMENT 251
1. Exposure to Harm 251
2. Exposure to Known Harasser 251
N. FAILURE TO ACCOMMODATE 253
O. PERPETRATOR AND RECIPIENT OF CONDUCT 253
1. Harassing Conduct by Supervisor 253
2. Vulnerability of Employee 254
3. Subordinate to Supervisor Harassment 255

4. Third Party Harassment ... 256
P. CONDUCT INVOLVING DISCRETE ACTS ... 257
Q. OFFENSIVE PICTURES OR SYMBOLS ... 259
1. Sexual Harassment ... 259
2. Religious Harassment ... 259
3. Racial Harassment ... 260
R. INFERIORITY/INTELLIGENCE/CULTURAL REFERENCES ... 260
S. LINGUISTIC CHARACTERISTICS/LANGUAGE PROFICIENCY ... 261
T. OFF-PREMISES CONDUCT ... 263
U. HARASSMENT VIA SOCIAL MEDIA ... 264
1. Claims of Harassment via Social Media ... 266
2. Link to Workplace/Agency Involvement ... 267
3. Religion-Based Harassment and Proselytizing ... 270
V. MISGENDERING/PRONOUN USAGE/DEADNAMING ... 271
W. COVID-RELATED ... 276
1. EEOC'S Technical Assistance on Pandemic-Related Harassment Due to National Origin, Race, or Other Protected Characteristics ... 276
a. Addressing COVID-Related Harassment ... 276
b. Responding to COVID-Related Harassment ... 276
2. COVID and Harassment ... 277

CHAPTER EIGHT: THE OBJECTIVE AND SUBJECTIVE ELEMENTS ... 279
I. REASONABLE PERSON ... 280
A. REASONABLE WOMAN ... 282
B. CHARACTERISTICS OTHER THAN GENDER ... 285
II. SUBJECTIVE STANDARD ... 287
A. SERIOUS PSYCHOLOGICAL HARM IS NOT NECESSARY ... 288
1. Must Affect Terms or Conditions of Employment ... 290
B. THE EMPLOYEE'S CONDUCT ... 291

CHAPTER NINE: LIABILITY FOR HARASSMENT ... 295
I. OVERVIEW OF LIABILITY FOR HARASSMENT ... 295
II. THE LIABILITY PROBLEM ... 296
A. *RESPONDEAT SUPERIOR*/VICARIOUS LIABILITY ... 297
B. 29 CFR § 1604.11 ... 297
C. *MERITOR SAVINGS BANK V. VINSON* ... 298
III. RESOLVING THE LIABILITY PROBLEM ... 300
A. THE RULES OF AGENCY ... 300
B. THE RULES OF LIABILITY ... 300
1. The "Alter Ego" Theory ... 301
IV. HARASSMENT BY SUPERVISORS ... 302
A. BURLINGTON INDUSTRIES V. ELLERTH ... 303
B. FARAGHER V. CITY OF BOCA RATON ... 310
C. *VANCE V. BALL STATE UNIVERSITY*/DEFINITION OF "SUPERVISOR" ... 319
D. APPARENT AUTHORITY ... 327
E. TANGIBLE EMPLOYMENT ACTIONS ... 327
F. HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT CLAIMS ... 327
1. Reasonable Care ... 328
a. Anti-Harassment Policy Requirement ... 328
2. Efficacy of the Agency's Policies, Practices, and Training ... 330
3. Failure to Avoid Harm ... 332
V. HARASSMENT BY COWORKERS AND THIRD PARTIES ... 336
A. KNOWLEDGE OF EMPLOYER ... 336
1. Actual Knowledge ... 337
2. Constructive Knowledge ... 339

3. Harasser Unknown 340
4. Who Reports Misconduct 342
B. THIRD PARTY HARASSMENT 342
1. Employee Organizations 343
VI. HARASSMENT BY SUBORDINATE 344
VII. PROMPT AND EFFECTIVE CORRECTIVE ACTION AND REMEDIAL MEASURES 345
A. DUTY TO PROMPTLY AND ADEQUATELY INVESTIGATE 346
1. "Prompt" 346
2. "Adequate" 349
3. "Investigate" 350
B. DUTY TO TAKE INTERIM ACTIONS 352
C. PROMPT AND EFFECTIVE CORRECTIVE ACTION 354
1. Effectiveness of Action 355
2. Severity/Pervasiveness of Conduct 358
3. Duty of Further Inquiry 361
4. Treatment of Victim 362
D. REMEDIAL MEASURES 362
VIII. SPECIFIC CORRECTIVE ACTIONS TAKEN BY AGENCY 363
A. SEPARATING THE VICTIM AND HARASSER 363
B. REMOVING/MODIFYING WORK 365
C. REASSIGNING THE COMPLAINANT 365
D. RETURNING THE ALLEGED HARASSER TO THE WORKPLACE 366
E. AGENCY ADVERSE ACTIONS AGAINST ALLEGED HARASSERS 368
F. COUNSELING 368
IX. REMEDIES AND DAMAGES AVAILABLE TO THE COMMISSION 369
A. EQUITABLE REMEDIES 369
1. Tangible Employment Actions 369
2. Hostile Environment Cases 370
B. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES 370
C. CORRECTIVE AND PREVENTIVE RELIEF 371
1. Disciplinary Actions 372

CHAPTER TEN: AVOIDING LIABILITY 375
I. ANTI-HARASSMENT POLICIES, PROCEDURES, AND PROGRAMS 375
A. POLICY REQUIREMENTS 375
1. Confidentiality Issues 376
B. POSTING AND DISTRIBUTION 377
C. REPORTING HARASSMENT 377
D. ENFORCEMENT 378
II. RESPONDING TO HARASSMENT COMPLAINTS 378
A. PROMPT INVESTIGATIONS 378
B. CORRECTIVE ACTIONS 379
C. ACTIONS PENDING INVESTIGATIONS 380
III. TRAINING 380

TABLE OF CASES 383

INDEX 389