SUMMARY TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE i

GLOSSARY iii

CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION 1

CHAPTER 2: APPEAL 917

CHAPTER 3: DISCOVERY 1289

CHAPTER 4: HEARING 1347

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 5: EVIDENCE 1499

CHAPTER 6: INITIAL DECISION 1663

CHAPTER 7: PETITION FOR REVIEW 1687

CHAPTER 8: ADVERSE ACTIONS 1943

CHAPTER 9: NEXUS 2371

CHAPTER 10: PENALTY DETERMINATION 2417

CHAPTER 11: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES 2525

VOLUME III

CHAPTER 12: PERFORMANCE ACTIONS 2993

CHAPTER 13: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE 3123

CHAPTER 14: HARMFUL ERROR 3267

CHAPTER 15: DISCRIMINATION 3455

CHAPTER 16: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES 3731

CHAPTER 17: RETIREMENT 4271

VOLUME IV

CHAPTER 18: RESTORATION RIGHTS 4669

CHAPTER 19: ATTORNEY FEES 4761

CHAPTER 20: SETTLEMENT 4983
CHAPTER 21: REMEDIES.....5099
CHAPTER 22: ENFORCEMENT.....5219
CHAPTER 23: SANCTIONS 5415
CHAPTER 24: JUDICIAL REVIEW.....5441
CHAPTER 25: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS.....5711
BIBLIOGRAPHY 5733
TABLE OF CASES 5741
INDEX 5923

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME I

PREFACE i

GLOSSARY iii

CHAPTER 1: MSPB STRUCTURE AND JURISDICTION 1

I. REFORM ACT 1
A. CAPSULE HISTORY 1
B. OFFICE OF SPECIAL COUNSEL 4
II. BOARD ORGANIZATION AND ADMINISTRATIVE OPERATION 5
A. IMPARTIAL ADJUDICATION 6
1. *De Novo* Review of Agency Actions 7
a. Deference to OPM Regulations 7
b. Consideration of Agency Regulations 8
2. Prohibition Against Advisory Opinion; Internal Guidance; Request for Advisory Opinion 9
B. ORGANIZATION 10
1. Clerk 11
2. Office of Appeals Counsel 11
C. ADMINISTRATIVE JUDGES 14
1. Delegations of Authority 17
a. Administrative Law Judges Adjudicating Specialized Cases 18
2. *Judges' Handbook*; Internal Guidance 18
3. Qualifications, Performance Standards for Administrative Judge 18
a. Judges' Position Description, Performance Standards 18
b. Regional Director (Chief Administrative Judge) Position Description and SES Performance Plan 19
4. Regulatory Responsibilities of Judge 20
a. Waiver of Procedural Regulations 21
5. Quality Review 22
D. BOARD DECISIONS; PRECEDENTIAL SIGNIFICANCE 22
1. Nonprecedential Decisions, Final Orders 23
2. Arbitration Award 24
3. Sensitive, Public Interest Appeal 24
4. Referral to OPM, OSC 24
E. BOARD RECORDS 24
1. Gaining Access; Review Procedure 28
2. Precluding Access 28
a. Sealing of Record or Files 28
b. Attempt to Preclude Publication of Decision 31
c. Expungement of Record 32
d. Redaction of Initial Decision 32
e. Classified Information 32
F. RULEMAKING PETITIONS 33
G. RESPONSIBILITY OF PARTIES IN BOARD CASES 34
III. JURISDICTIONAL OVERVIEW 34
A. SOURCES OF JURISDICTION 36
1. Original Jurisdiction Cases 37
2. Appealable Actions 37
a. Adverse Action 39
b. Performance-Based Action 39
c. Demonstration Project 39
3. Jurisdiction Through Agency Regulation 40
B. PRELIMINARY APPELLATE JURISDICTIONAL ANALYSIS 41
1. Lack of Jurisdiction; Failure to State a Claim 42
IV. EMPLOYEES WHO MAY APPEAL; APPEALABLE ISSUES 43
A. NATURE OF CIVIL SERVICE APPOINTMENTS 44

B. CONCEPTS COMMON TO DEFINITION OF "EMPLOYEE" FOR COMPETITIVE AND EXCEPTED SERVICE 45
1. Current Continuous Service 45
a. Break in Service 47
b. Effect of Grievance or Other Settlement; Collective Bargaining Contract 51
c. Service During Detail or in Acting Position 51
d. Period of Non-Pay Status 51
2. Not Serving a Probationary or Trial Period Under an Initial Appointment 52
3. Counting Service Time in a Prior Position or Appointment; *McCormick* 53
a. Time in Nonpermanent Appointment as a Component of Current Continuous Service 59
C. COMPETITIVE SERVICE EMPLOYEES 64
1. Other Than a Temporary Appointment Limited to One Year or Less 66
D. EXCEPTED SERVICE EMPLOYEES 68
1. 1990 Civil Service Due Process Amendments; Nonpreference Eligible Employees 69
a. Excepted Service Employees Excluded From Due Process Amendments; Statutory Appointment Discretion 69
2. Preference Eligible Status 77
a. Campaign Badge 81
b. Documentation 83
c. Disabled Veteran 83
d. Derivative Preference Eligible Status 85
3. Same or Similar Position 87
a. Factual Dispute Concerning Similarity of Positions, Line of Work 96
b. In an Executive Agency 98
4. Appointment Pending Conversion to Competitive Service 101
E. PROBATION OR TRIAL PERIOD 105
1. Probationary Classification Issues 107
a. Appointment From Register 107
b. Transfer 109
c. Reassignment; Promotion 111
d. Temporary Appointment Pending Establishment of a Register (TAPER) 111
e. Direct Hire Authority 111
f. Career Reinstatement 111
2. Department of Defense 114
3. Calculating Year of Service 115
a. Incorrect Determination of Duration of Probation 117
b. Effective Time and Date of Inexplicit Termination Notice 122
c. Significance of SF-50; Unclear Appointment Date 122
d. WAE Appointment 124
e. Military Service 124
4. Counting or Tacking of Prior Service 125
a. Same Agency 132
b. Same Line of Work 133
5. Agreement to Serve Probationary Period; Waiver of Preexisting Appeal Rights 136
6. Imposition of Probation Following Break in Service 139
7. Creation of Probationary Period Not Required by Statute or Regulation 139
8. Representation by Agency That Probation Is Not Required; Equitable Estoppel 140
9. Lack of Notice of Probationary Period 143
F. APPEAL RIGHTS OF PROBATIONER 143
1. Appeal of Probationary Termination; E.O. 14284; Civil Service Rule XI 145
a. Actions Other Than Termination 149
2. Classification of Probationers and Their Appeals 149
a. Competitive Service Term Appointee; Trial Period 150
b. Probationary Supervisor 151
3. Jurisdictional Issue; Right to Hearing 156
a. Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract; Agency Regulation 158
b. Other Contract 159
c. Harmful Error Analysis; *Stephen* 159
d. Relation to Suitability Determination 161
4. Preappointment Conditions 165
a. Harmful Error Analysis: Lack of Proper Advance Notice, Other Procedural Error 165
b. Entitlement to Hearing 170
c. Measure of Substantive Review 171

5. Postappointment Reasons ... 171
a. Pre- and Postappointment Distinctions ... 172
6. Defective or Untimely Termination Notice ... 177
a. Termination by Unauthorized Official ... 180
7. Discrimination and Partisan Politics ... 181
a. Nonfrivolous Allegations ... 182
b. Partisan Political Reason ... 183
c. Marital Status ... 187
d. Other Discrimination or Reprisal ... 194
8. Constitutional Claim ... 194
9. Involuntary Resignation ... 196
G. LOSS OF APPEAL RIGHTS BY CHANGE IN POSITION ... 196
1. Movement Between Positions in Same Agency; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation ... 197
a. Movement to Position Through Settlement Agreement ... 205
2. Movement From One Agency to Another; Transfer; Lack of Notice of Requirement of Probation ... 205
H. TEMPORARY AND TERM APPOINTMENTS ... 208
1. Competitive Service Temporary, Term Appointees ... 211
2. Excepted Service Preference Eligible Temporary Appointees ... 217
3. Excepted Service Nonpreference Eligible Temporary Appointees ... 217
4. Particular Temporary or Irregular Schedule Appointments ... 218
a. TAPER ... 218
b. Seasonal; On-Call ... 218
c. Intermittent ... 221
d. Full-Time/Part-Time ... 223
e. Postal Service Light Duty ... 223
f. Indefinite Appointment ... 223
5. Jurisdictional Effect of Lapse of Term or Temporary Appointment ... 223
6. Appeal if Termination Occurs Before End of Expiration of Limited Appointment ... 226
I. PARTICULAR APPOINTMENTS ... 227
1. Nonappropriated Fund ... 227
2. Veterans Readjustment Act ... 228
3. Reemployed Annuitant ... 233
a. Exceptions ... 235
4. Senior Executive Service ... 237
5. Administrative Law Judge ... 237
6. Disabled Employee ... 237
7. Employees in Confidential, Policy-Making, Policy-Determining Positions; Presidential Appointee ... 241
a. White House, Executive Office ... 244
b. Policy/Career Schedule and Schedule F Positions; Civil Service Rule VI ... 245
8. Inferior Officers; Immigration Judges ... 248
9. Alien; Noncitizen ... 249
10. Students ... 250
a. Federal Career Intern Program ... 251
b. Student Temporary Employment Program; Recent Graduates Program; Student Career Experience Program ... 257
c. Pathways ... 259
11. Judicial Branch ... 260
12. Government Corporation ... 261
13. Postal Service ... 262
a. One Year of Qualifying Service; Current Continuous Service in Same or Similar Position ... 266
b. Postal Supervisors, Managers ... 272
c. Postal Personnel Officials, Confidential Employees ... 277
d. Postal Service Employees Who Lack Preference Eligibility, Have No Negotiated Grievance Procedures, and Who Are Neither Managers Nor Personnelists ... 283
14. Contractors ... 285
15. Stafford Act ... 286
16. Others ... 287
J. AGENCIES WITH SPECIALIZED PERSONNEL SYSTEMS: BOARD JURISDICTIONAL EXCLUSIONS AND MODIFICATIONS 288
1. Department of Homeland Security ... 288
a. Human Resources Management System's Rise and Demise ... 288
b. Transportation Security Agency: Screeners; Non-Screeners; Other Employees ... 289

(i) Probationer 293
(ii) Other TSA Employees 294
c. RIF 297
2. Federal Aviation Administration 297
a. 2012 Legislation Restoring Back Pay Authority as a Component of Board Jurisdiction 300
b. 2000 Legislation Restoring Board Jurisdiction; Back Pay Issues 301
c. 1996 Legislation Removing Board Jurisdiction 309
3. Department of Defense National Security Personnel System 309
4. District of Columbia 309
5. Central Intelligence Agency; Defense Department Intelligence; Other Intelligence or Security Agencies 310
6. Federal Bureau of Investigation 311
7. Canal Zone 312
8. National Archives 312
9. National Guard Technicians, Other Employees 312
10. Tennessee Valley Authority Employees 319
11. Library of Congress; GAO; Congressional Employees 319
a. Ramspeck Act 320
12. Smithsonian Institution 320
13. Bureau of Indian Affairs 320
14. MSPB Employees 321
15. Department of Veterans Affairs 321
a. USERRA Coverage 336
b. Actions Against Healthcare Professionals Not Involving Professional Conduct or Competence 337
(i) Involuntary Retirement, Resignation 338
c. Veterans Canteen Service 340
16. Agriculture: Stabilization and Conservation Service; Cooperative Extension Services 342
17. Department of Defense Education Activity 343
18. Office of Independent Counsel 344
19. Foreign Service 344
20. World Bank 344
K. NATURE OF PERSONNEL ACTION APPEALED 345
1. Possible Adverse Action; Proposal 345
2. Suspension 345
a. Paper Suspension 346
b. Consolidation of Short Suspensions 346
c. Calculating Duration of Suspension 348
d. Erroneous Imposition of Suspension Exceeding 14 Days 348
e. Indefinite Suspension 349
3. Position Change 349
a. Rank Reduction 351
b. Loss of Earnings Opportunities; Change in Work Schedule 351
c. Disciplinary Reassignment; Unified Penalties; Reassignment Leading to Reduction in Pay 352
4. Pay and Benefits; Classification; Debt; Leave 354
a. Classification 355
b. Pay System Conversion; Grade Reduction 357
c. Correction of Pay, Grade 361
d. Reduction in Pay; Locality Pay Issue; Failure to Obtain Pay Increase 367
e. Misrepresentation Concerning Pay Rates 372
f. Termination of Premium Pay; Bonus; LEAPA; Seniority, Overtime Adjustments 373
g. Retirement Credit, Contributions, and Incentives; Individual Retirement Record 379
h. Debt Collection, Recoupment, Retirement Funds: Agency, OPM Involvement 380
i. Leave Dispute; Administrative Leave; Notice, Investigation Leave 384
j. Pay and Compensation Claims: Role of OPM 388
5. Severance Pay 389
6. Promotion Claim 389
a. Termination of Temporary Promotion 390
b. Loss of Promotion Opportunities 392
c. Nonselection 394
d. Lower Graded Position Through Return Right—Overseas Employee 396
7. Back Pay Dispute 397
a. Retirement Payment 397
8. Resignation 397

a. Abandonment of Position 397
9. Mandatory Retirement 399
10. OWCP Benefits 400
11. Insurance Programs 401
12. Requests for Reinstatement: Non-Military Personnel 407
a. Failure to Rehire 407
b. Reinstatement Rights—Occupational Illness or Injury; Others 408
13. Performance Standard; Rating; PIP 408
14. Miscellaneous Actions 409
L. NATURE OF STATUTORY VIOLATION ALLEGED 410
1. Prohibited Personnel Practices; Discrimination 410
2. Merit System Principles Violations 413
3. Constitutional Violation 414
M. EFFECT OF COLLECTIVE BARGAINING CONTRACT GRIEVANCE OR RELATED PROCEDURES; 5 USC 7121 419
1. Postal Service Employees 423
a. Effect of EEO Allegation or EEO Complaint 424
2. Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714 425
3. Administrative Grievance System 426
4. Statutory Grievance System; Foreign Service Grievance Board 426
5. Employee Choice: Adverse Action; Performance Case 426
6. Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity 426
a. Appeal Right With EEO Allegation 428
b. USERRA Claim 431
c. RIF 435
d. Acceptable Level of Competence Determination; Within-Grade Increase 436
7. Problems Arising From Choice of Collective Bargaining Contract Procedure 436
a. Incorrect or Inadequate Notice From Agency 437
b. Dispute Over Bargaining Unit Status or Arbitrability; Ineffective Elections; Cross-Filing; Withdrawal of Grievance 439
c. Defunct Union 442
d. Union Action on Behalf of Employee 444
e. What Constitutes Filing of Grievance 446
f. Premature Elections 447
g. Belated Grievance 448
h. Failure to Obtain Arbitration Hearing 448
8. Indefinite Suspension 451
9. Last Chance Agreement 452
10. Appeal Right With Arbitration Award; Employees of Agencies Other Than Postal Service 452
11. Unfair Labor Practice Charge 453
N. GRADE AND PAY RETENTION 454
1. *Atwell* 457
a. Restoration Action 459
2. Absence of Retention; Benefits Declined 459
3. Appeal of RIF; Classification 460
4. Termination of Pay Retention 462
V. APPEAL RIGHTS BASED ON MILITARY SERVICE AND VETERANS PREFERENCE 462
A. REGULATIONS GOVERNING USERRA, VEOA CLAIMS 467
B. JUDGE'S RESPONSIBILITY 469
C. HEARING ENTITLEMENT; BOARD DISPOSITION 470
1. USERRA 470
2. VEOA 472
D. EXCLUSIVITY OF VEOA OR USERRA APPEAL; JOINDER OF CLAIMS 474
E. UNIFORMED SERVICE EMPLOYMENT AND REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT 475
1. USERRA Statutory Structure 480
a. Related EEO Violation; Prohibited Personnel Practice Allegation 485
b. Affirmative Defense 487
2. Time for USERRA Appeal 488
a. Laches 490
b. Waiver of Right to Appeal 491
3. Permissive Exhaustion of Labor Department Remedy 493
a. Referral to OSC 495
4. Liberal Pleading Standard 497

a. Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegations 502
b. Summary Disposition of Claim 504
5. Burden of Proof 504
a. Analysis of Alleged Discrimination or Reprisal Based on Military Service 509
b. Reprisal Against Exercise of USERRA Rights 514
c. Circumstantial Evidence; Statistics 517
d. Preselection 521
e. Discrimination Motivated by Lower-Level Supervisor; Cat's Paw 522
f. Disability Incurred While in Military Service; Use of Leave for Disability 524
g. Disparate Impact Theory Inapplicable 525
6. Recovery Period 527
a. Nonretroactive Substantive Application 529
b. Vietnam Era Veterans' Readjustment Assistance Act of 1974 532
7. Covered Personnel; Agencies 533
a. Contractor Employee 538
b. Relatives of Service Members 540
8. Military Restoration Rights 541
a. National Guard USERRA Discrimination and Restoration Claims 544
b. Length of Service Before Loss of Restoration Right 549
c. Conditions of Discharge From Military Service 550
d. Effect of Release From Service for Disability 550
e. Delay in Requesting Restoration Following Military Service 554
f. Elimination of Position Through RIF 554
9. Other Personnel Action, Benefits; Damages 556
a. Dismissal From Employment; Demotion; Abandonment of Civilian Career 556
b. Constructive Adverse Action 563
c. Suspension 563
d. Failure to Appoint 563
e. Failure to Consider Employee for Vacant Positions; Nonpromotion; Manipulation or Abolition of Positions 570
f. Denial of Priority Consideration 574
g. Performance Appraisal; References 574
h. Noncompetitive Promotion; Bid Assignment; Escalator Principle; Interim Promotion 575
i. Reassignment 582
j. Retirement Benefits 583
k. Education Benefits 583
l. Military Leave; *Butterbaugh* 584
m. Charge to Leave 592
n. Differential Pay 593
o. Harassment; Hostile Working Environment; Remedy 595
p. Change in Employment Status; Reemployment; Benefits Following Restoration to Duty 600
q. Ready Reserve Status 608
F. VETERANS EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES ACT 608
1. Statutory Structure 612
a. Definition of Agency 613
b. Burden of Proof 615
c. Related EEO Violation, Prohibited Personnel Practice, Other Challenges 615
d. OSC Involvement 616
2. Covered Personnel 617
a. Training Status 619
b. Disabled Veteran 621
3. Student, Intern Recruitment Programs 621
a. Federal Career Intern Program 621
b. Outstanding Scholar Program 630
c. Pathways Recent Graduates Program; PALACE Acquire Program 636
4. Particular Agencies; Positions 642
a. Postal Service 642
b. Foreign Service 644
c. Nonappropriated Fund 645
d. Public Health Service 646
e. VA Medical Professionals 646

f. FAA, TSA Employees 648
g. National Guard Technicians 650
h. Title 10 Intelligence Position 651
i. Statutory Exclusions 652
5. Time for VEOA Appeal 653
6. Mandatory Exhaustion of DOL Remedy; Time for Complaint 654
a. Specificity Required for DOL Complaint 659
b. Equitable Tolling of DOL Time Limit; Waiver of Administrative Exhaustion Requirement 660
c. Effect of Settlement Reached by DOL 674
d. Termination of Proceedings to Pursue Case in Court 674
7. Liberal Pleading Standard 675
8. Basis for Veterans Preference 677
a. Excepted Service Position; "Positive Factor"; Attorneys, Others; Passover Process 679
9. Application of Veterans Preference to Appointment Process 694
a. Necessity for Application 695
b. Appointment Through Reinstatement; Reassignment 696
c. Impact of Collective Bargaining Contract 698
d. Background Investigation 699
e. Failure to Provide Proper Veterans Preference; Reconstruction 699
f. Improper Appointment Authority; Priority Consideration 701
g. Manipulation of Appointments; Cancelation of Vacancy 703
h. Geographic Extent of Competition 710
i. Category Rating System 711
j. Rule of Many 716
k. Rule of Three 716
10. Qualifications for Position; Exclusion From Consideration; Consideration of Experience; Multiple Referral Certificates 718
a. Education 729
b. Time-In-Grade 730
c. Medical Fitness 732
d. Age Limit on Appointment 733
e. Consideration for Position but Nonselection; Limitation on Consideration Imposed by Applicant 738
f. Improper Assessment of Qualifications 739
11. Appointment and Promotion Processes Challenges 742
a. Competitive Appointment Procedures; Exceptions to Competitive Requirements; Expedited Hiring for Acquisitions Positions 742
b. Merit Promotion With Internal Candidates Only; Reassignment; Reinstatement 749
c. Merit Promotion, Open to External Candidates; Canceled Announcement; "Right to Compete" Claim 752
d. Position Announced Under Both Open Competition and Merit Promotion Procedures 765
e. Veterans Readjustment Act Appointment 770
12. Remedial Structure; Reconstruction of Selection Process; Removal of Selectee 772
a. Passover 787
b. Mootness; Review of Agency-Initiated Reconstruction Effort 792
13. Damages, Other Benefits 793
14. Disciplinary Case 799
15. Reassignment; Transfer 799
16. Retirement Benefit 800
VI. SUITABILITY DETERMINATION 800
A. APPELLATE PROCEDURES 808
B. APPLICATION TO COMPETITIVE SERVICE APPOINTEES 809
1. Employees Serving in Probationary or Trial Periods 809
C. SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS BY AGENCIES OPERATING UNDER AUTHORITY DELEGATED BY OPM 809
1. Evidence of Material, Intentional False Statement, or Deception or Fraud 812
2. Constructive Suitability Determination 814
3. Nonselection for Position; Constructive Suitability Determination Under Delegated Authority 815
a. Decisions Under OPM Regulations Predating 2008 824
4. Impact of 2008 OPM Suitability Regulations 830
D. ADJUDICATION STANDARDS 832
1. Mitigation; EEO Defenses 835
2. Disparate Treatment; Comparator 835
3. Rehabilitation 835

E. EVIDENCE 836
1. Collateral Estoppel; *Res Judicata* 837
F. BASES FOR SUITABILITY DETERMINATIONS 838
1. Falsification of Employment Document 839
2. Drug Involvement 840
3. Criminal or Dishonest Conduct 840
4. Other Problems 841
G. BAR ORDERS 842
H. REMEDIES 842
1. Mootness 844
I. RELATION OF SUITABILITY AND PASSOVER DETERMINATIONS 844
J. RELATION OF OPM-DIRECTED SUITABILITY REMOVAL AND ADVERSE ACTION APPEAL RIGHTS, MITIGATION ANALYSIS; *AGUZIE*; 2015 LEGISLATIVE MODIFICATION 846
VII. OPM REGULATION REVIEW; CHALLENGES TO AGENCY IMPLEMENTATION OF OPM REGULATIONS; CHALLENGES TO OPM EMPLOYMENT PRACTICES 859
A. REGULATION AND REGULATION IMPLEMENTATION REVIEW PROCEDURES 859
1. General Criteria for Regulation Review and Regulation Implementation Review 860
a. Distinction Between Regulation Review, Implementation Review 864
2. Pleading Requirements; Scope of Review 865
a. Discretionary Review; Likelihood of Success 866
b. Likelihood of Harm 866
c. Likelihood Issues Will Be Addressed in a Different Board Appeal or a Different Forum 866
d. Standing; "Interested Person" 868
e. Covered Personnel Action 869
3. Examples of Regulation Review 869
a. Administrative Law Judge Examination Authority 869
b. SES Reassignment, Work Schedule 869
c. Administration of Leave 871
d. OPM Qualification Standards 871
e. Scope of Administrative Grievance Procedure 872
f. Other Issues 872
4. Examples of Regulation Implementation Review 874
a. SES Performance Appraisal Dispute 875
B. EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE CHALLENGES 876
1. Time and Place for Filing Appeal 882
2. Agency Misapplication of Valid OPM Requirement; Agency Employment Practices; Nonselections 883
3. Standing to Raise Challenge 891
4. General Characteristics of Tests Rather Than Individual Examination Results 892
5. Scope of Competition 893
6. Position Qualification Standard; Educational Requirement 893
7. Medical and Physical Qualification Requirements 899
8. OPM Involvement in Agency Selection 901
9. Selection and Examination Practices for Administrative Law Judges 903
a. Rule of Three 909
10. Passover Determination 911
11. Time-In-Grade Restriction 913
12. Eligibility Rating and Suitability Determination 914
13. Failure to Promote 914
14. Remedy 915
VIII. CHALLENGES TO ADVERSE PERSONNEL RECORDS NOTATIONS 915

CHAPTER 2: APPEAL 917

I. INITIATING AN APPEAL 917
A. RULES AND PRACTICES OF GENERAL APPLICATION 917
1. Dates of Filing 917
2. Service of Pleadings 917
3. Filing Regulation; Electronic Filing; Technical Difficulties 918
4. Processing of Appeal 924
B. TIME FOR FILING APPEAL 925
1. Treatment of Timeliness Issues 926
2. Jurisdiction or Timeliness as Alternate Bases for Dismissal 927

3. Regulatory Provisions 930
a. Allegations of Discrimination—Mixed Case 931
b. Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure 931
c. Computation of Time 931
d. Technical Constructions 932
e. Request for Extension of Time to Appeal 933
4. Suspension Appeal 933
a. Indefinite Suspension; Enforced Leave 933
5. Individual Right of Action Appeal 938
6. USERRA Appeal 938
7. Negative OPM Reconsideration Decision Appeal 939
a. Failure to Seek Timely Reconsideration; Requests to Extend Time to Request Reconsideration 943
b. Belated Receipt of Reconsideration Decision 949
c. Relation of Scope of Reconsideration Request and Appeal 949
d. Failure of OPM to Act on Reconsideration Request; Failure of OPM to Advise of Reconsideration Right 949
e. Overpayment Determinations 955
8. Law Enforcement Officer Retirement Credit Appeal 956
9. Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714; Mixed Cases; Equitable Tolling 957
a. Hybrid Employees 961
C. METHOD AND PLACE OF FILING 964
1. Method of Filing 964
a. Mail 964
b. Significance of Postmark: Presumptive Filing Date 964
c. Significance of Actual Mailing Date; Mailstream Rule: Actual Filing Date 965
d. Commercial Delivery 965
e. Facsimile 965
f. Personal Delivery 966
g. Electronic Filing 966
2. Irregular and Misdirected Filings 967
a. Appeal To or From Congressional Office 967
b. Misfiled Mixed-Case Appeal 967
c. Non-Mixed Appeal Filed With Employing Agency 970
d. Appeal Misdirected Within Board, to OPM, or to OSC 971
e. Incomplete Appeal 971
D. PREMATURE APPEALS 972
1. Abeyance Arrangement 972
2. Premature Appeal That Ripens Into Appealable Action During Regional Adjudication or During PFR 973
3. Retirement Appeal 975
4. Mixed and Whistleblowing Cases 977
E. TIMELINESS OF APPEALS 977
1. Judge's Responsibility to Provide Notice Concerning a Timeliness Issue 978
a. Mental or Physical Illness; *Lacy* Notice 981
b. Duty of Appellant to Produce Evidence Concerning Timeliness 983
c. Duty of Agency and Judge to Produce and Develop Evidence Concerning Timeliness 983
2. Waiver of Time Limit for Appeal; *Alonzo* 986
a. Prejudice to Respondent; Laches 989
b. Current Law on Waiver; Multifactor Analysis 990
c. Historical Position on Waiver 995
d. Retirement Appeals 996
3. Application for Waiver 998
a. Due Diligence 999
4. Collective Bargaining Contract Stay Provision; Postal Service Employee; Agency-Initiated Stay 999
5. Hearing on Timeliness Issue 1001
F. JUSTIFICATION FOR LATE FILING 1004
1. Sickness or Hospitalization 1004
a. Supporting Evidence 1005
b. Mental Impairment 1006
c. Effect of Continuing Mental Disorder on Filing Deadline 1007
2. Substitute Employment, Travel, or Other Activities 1010
3. Military Service 1010
4. Incarceration; Criminal Proceeding 1012

5. Need to Obtain Documentation 1013
6. Need to Obtain Counsel 1014
7. Unfamiliarity With Board Procedures and Law; Ambiguous Agency Communications 1014
a. Language Difficulties 1015
b. Miscalculation of Time for Appeal 1016
8. Lack of Notice of Appeal Rights 1016
a. Failure to Provide Notice 1017
b. Belated Receipt of Adverse Action Decision 1022
c. Constructive Receipt of Decision Notice 1024
d. Proof Concerning Delivery of Notice of Appeal Rights 1027
e. Notice of Appeal Rights to Appellant's Representative 1027
f. Appellant's Responsibility When Decision Notice or Information About Appeal Rights Is Not Received 1028
g. Constructive Adverse Action; Notice if Agency Learns of Employee's Protest 1029
h. Constructive Adverse Action Without Notice of Employee's Protest to Agency 1031
(i) *Jones*, *Krizman* and Beyond 1038
i. Agency on Notice but Fails to Provide Appeal Rights; Secondary Information Concerning Appeal Rights 1042
j. Adverse Action or Performance-Based Appeal Arising From Last Chance or Other Settlement Agreement 1043
k. Lack of Notice Concerning Restoration and Reemployment Appeal Rights 1046
l. Enforced Leave 1049
m. Prior or Subsequent Notice of Filing Deadline 1050
n. Agency Misrepresentation 1050
o. Threats by Agency Personnel 1053
p. Mixed Case Notice Problem 1053
q. Problem With or Delayed Receipt of Domestic, Certified, or International Mail, or Commercial Delivery; Address Change 1054
9. Appeal Lost in Mail 1061
10. Facsimile Problem 1063
11. Electronic Filing Problem 1063
12. Problem Caused by Adjudicators; Misdirected Appeal 1064
a. Board 1064
b. EEOC; Agency EEO Processes 1064
c. OPM 1064
13. Uncertainty as to Outcome of a Related Case; Pending Settlement Negotiations or Investigation; Case Taken to Court 1066
a. Grievances 1066
b. Mediation Request 1067
14. Inadequate Representation 1067
a. Delay Not Excused 1068
b. Delay Excused; Counsel's Delay Balanced Against Appellant's Best Efforts; Retirement Cases 1070
c. Delay Excused; Obstruction or Misrepresentation by Counsel 1072
d. Delay Excused; Inconsequential Delay by Representative 1076
15. Other Problems 1077
G. TIME FOR RAISING NEW APPELLATE ISSUES AND CLAIMS 1077
1. Issues and Defenses 1077
a. Liberal Construction of Pleadings; *Pro Se* Appellants; Issues Raised at Hearing 1077
b. EEO Affirmative Defenses 1078
2. Additional Appealable Action 1078
H. MOOT, WITHDRAWN, AND WAIVED APPEALS 1079
1. Mootness of Appeal 1079
a. Cancelation of Action Appealed 1080
b. Restoration of *Status Quo Ante*; Enforcement Petition; Administrative Leave 1082
c. Initiation of New Action Based on Events Leading to Canceled Action 1091
d. Procedure Followed if Action Not Completely Rescinded 1091
e. Procedure Following Remand to Judge 1092
f. Settlement Independent of Board Appeal 1092
g. Complete Relief Through Other Means; Stay of Pending Litigation 1103
h. Collateral Issues Following Rescission of Action; Claim for Attorney Fees or General Damages; Interest 1103
i. EEO Allegation; Claim for Compensatory Damages 1104
j. Whistleblower Protection Act: Claim for Damages, Other Relief 1107
k. Uniformed Services Employment and Reemployment Rights Act 1113
l. Criminal Conviction 1115

m. Consecutive Adverse Actions 1115
n. OPM Rescinds Reconsideration or Final Decision; Overpayment Recovery; Withdrawal of or Additional Retirement Application; Disputed Retirement Calculations 1115
o. Administrative Law Judge Complaint 1122
p. Other Problems 1123
2. Effect of Retirement on Appealable Action 1123
a. Effect of Cleansing Personnel File When Removal Is Accompanied by Retirement; Effect of Claim for Damages 1132
b. Resignation or Retirement Before Termination 1136
c. Reduction in Force Appeal 1136
d. Prior Law; Disability Retirement 1137
3. Withdrawal of Appeal 1138
a. Withdrawal to Pursue EEO Complaint; Withdrawal of EEO Claim 1142
b. Withdrawal to Pursue Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance Procedure 1144
c. Confusion Between Necessity for Withdrawal of Appeal, Continuance, and Withdrawal of Appeal Without Prejudice to Refile 1145
d. Unauthorized Act of Representative 1146
e. Duress; Misrepresentation; Incompetence 1149
f. Mistake 1152
g. Misleading or Incomplete Information From Judge 1152
h. Attempts to Refile, Reinstate, or Reopen Withdrawn Appeals 1155
4. Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile ("DWOP"); Use of Automatic Refiling 1159
a. Reasons for DWOP 1163
b. Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension 1164
c. Procedures for Obtaining Dismissal; Refiling 1166
d. Refiling Date 1166
e. Effect of PFR 1169
f. Agency-Initiated Request; Prior Practice 1170
g. Dismissal Initiated by Judge or Board 1170
5. Delay in Refiling After DWOP 1171
a. Retirement Appeal 1176
b. Imperfect Attempt to Refile; Confusion Caused by Judge 1177
c. Late Refiling; Independent Right of Appeal 1178
6. Waiver of Appeal Through Last Chance or Other Preappeal Agreement 1178
a. Jurisdictional Analysis 1181
b. Public Policy; Appeal Preclusion; Consideration; Conflict With Regulation 1191
c. Ambiguous Term; Failure to Waive Future Appeal Rights 1192
d. Due Process Considerations; Notice 1196
e. Last Chance Agreement Superseded by Independent Adverse Action 1197
f. Lack of Authority of Representative to Enter Agreement 1199
g. Agreement to Accept Demotion, Suspension 1199
h. Bad Faith, Coercion, Lack of Mental Capacity 1200
i. Illegal or Punitive Term 1205
j. Jurisdictional Prerequisite: LCA Compliance or Breach 1206
k. Burden of Proof 1208
l. Hearing Entitlement 1210
m. Condition Unrelated to Underlying Action; Ambiguous Condition; Condition Described in Notice of LCA Violation 1213
n. Discrimination, Reprisal 1219
o. Claim Collateral to Breach of Agreement 1220
p. Duration of Agreement 1220
7. Personnel Action Resulting From Settlement Not Constituting Last Chance Agreement 1221
8. Settlement Reached During Board Appeal 1223
II. FORMAT AND PRELIMINARY PROCESSING OF APPEAL 1223
A. ESSENTIAL INFORMATION 1223
B. FORMAT 1224
1. Determination of Whether Submission Constitutes an Appeal 1225
2. Signature 1226
3. Appeal Filed Through Representative 1226
4. "John Doe" Appeal: Protecting Appellant's Privacy 1227
5. Agency-Initiated Retirement Appeal 1230

6. Class Action, Consolidated Appeals, and Joinder; Bifurcated Appeals....1230
a. Consolidation....1230
b. Joinder; Compulsory Joinder....1233
c. Class Action....1235
d. Bifurcated Appeals....1237
7. Substitution; Survival of Claim....1237
a. Individual Right of Action Appeal....1239
C. INTERVENTION....1239
1. Intervention of Right....1240
a. OPM....1240
b. OSC....1241
2. Permissive Intervention....1241
3. Rights of Intervenor....1244
4. *Amicus Curiae*....1244
D. STEPS TAKEN AFTER APPEAL IS FILED....1245
1. Acknowledgment of Appeal....1247
a. Philippines Retirement Appeal....1247
2. Amendment of Appeal....1247
3. Service of Pleadings....1248
4. Deficient Appeal....1248
5. Affirmative Defense Order; Requirement of Specific Allegations....1250
E. AGENCY RESPONSE TO APPEAL....1251
1. Narrative Response to Appeal....1252
2. Motion to Dismiss Appeal....1253
3. Delay in Appeal Response....1253
4. Designation of Agency Representative....1253
F. JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES....1254
1. Nonfrivolous Jurisdictional Allegation....1257
2. Judge Must Ensure Jurisdictional Issues Are Identified; *Burgess* Notice....1258
3. Agency Representative's Responsibilities....1262
4. Hearing on Jurisdictional Issue....1263
G. REPRESENTATIVES....1263
1. Right to Representation....1264
a. Inadequate Representation....1266
b. Service on Representative....1267
2. Disqualification of Representative; State Disciplinary Rules....1268
a. Conflicts....1269
b. Representative as Witness....1272
H. *PRO SE* AND INADEQUATELY REPRESENTED PARTIES....1272
1. *Pro Se* Appellant....1272
2. Assistance to Mentally Incompetent Appellant; *French* Procedure....1274
I. *EX PARTE* COMMUNICATIONS....1278
1. What They Are....1279
2. How *Ex Parte* Communications Are Treated....1282
III. INTERLOCUTORY APPEALS....1282
A. INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL PROCEDURE....1282
1. Regulation....1282
2. Application of Regulation....1285
a. Rulings on Bias and Intervention....1286
b. Direct Appeal to Board....1287
3. Stay of Proceeding....1287

CHAPTER 3: DISCOVERY....1289

I. OVERVIEW....1289
A. REGULATORY STRUCTURE....1290
B. FEDERAL RULES....1293
1. Federal Rules of General Application....1293
C. PRELIMINARY STEPS....1295
1. Initial Disclosures....1296
D. LIMITATIONS....1296
1. Jurisdictional or Timeliness Issue....1297

E. MOTION TO COMPEL 1298
F. FORMS OF DISCOVERY 1301
1. Interrogatories 1301
2. Document Request 1302
3. Request for Admissions 1303
4. Deposition 1304
5. Medical, Psychiatric Examinations 1306
6. Motion for More Definite Statement of Appeal 1308
G. DISCOVERY FROM NONPARTIES 1308
II. STRATEGIC CONSIDERATIONS 1309
A. BURDEN 1309
1. Effect of EEO, Reprisal Allegations 1310
2. Discovery During Pendency of Criminal Proceedings 1310
B. PRIVILEGED INFORMATION 1311
1. *In Camera* Inspection 1311
2. Law Enforcement Privilege 1312
3. Attorney-Client Privilege 1314
4. Attorney Work Product Privilege 1318
5. Agency Deliberative Process Privilege 1321
6. Executive and Investigative Privileges; OSC File 1323
7. OPM Suitability File 1323
8. Agency Investigative File 1324
9. Statutory Confidentiality Limitations 1324
C. PRIVACY ACT 1325
D. FAILURE TO USE DISCOVERY 1327
E. INFORMAL DISCOVERY; CONTROL BY AGENCIES OF EMPLOYEES' TIME 1329
F. PROTECTIVE ORDER 1330
III. ENTRY OF DISCOVERY MATERIAL INTO RECORD 1330
IV. SUBPOENAS 1332
A. WHEN A SUBPOENA IS USED 1332
B. OBTAINING, SERVING SUBPOENA 1332
1. Witnesses Outside United States 1334
C. CHALLENGE; ENFORCEMENT 1334
D. WITNESS FEES; TRAVEL ALLOWANCES 1335
V. REVIEW OF DISCOVERY RULINGS 1336
A. RULINGS ON DISPUTES 1336
1. Synopsis of Testimony 1336
2. Relevance, Overbroad Request 1337
3. Mitigation; Disparate Treatment 1338
4. Deposition of Agency Head 1338
5. Electronic Records 1339
6. Inspection Rather Than Production of Documents 1339
7. OSC Case 1340
B. EFFECT OF DENIAL OF DISCOVERY 1340
1. Due Process Considerations 1343
2. Preservation of Issue 1345

CHAPTER 4: HEARING 1347

I. HEARING 1347
A. RIGHT TO HEARING 1347
1. *De Novo* Hearing 1348
a. Role of Intervenor 1349
2. Jurisdictional Hearing; Documentary Evidence 1349
a. Timeliness Issue 1353
b. No Material Disputed Facts 1353
3. Counsel 1355
4. Control by Judge 1355
a. Hearing at Initiative of Judge 1358
5. Official Time; Resources Available to Appellant 1358
B. WAIVER OR FORFEITURE OF HEARING 1359
1. Inability to Travel to Hearing Site 1362

2. Failure to Request Hearing 1362
a. Remands; New Law 1364
3. Untimely Hearing Request 1364
a. Effect of Amendment of Appeal 1365
b. Failure to Receive Hearing Notice 1365
4. Withdrawal of Hearing Request 1366
a. Postponement Denied 1367
b. Events Beyond Appellant's Control 1367
5. Strategic Considerations—Intentional Waiver 1368
6. Adjudication After Waiver, Failure to Attend Hearing 1368
7. Adjudication Without Hearing; Responses to Evidentiary Submissions 1369
C. POSTPONEMENT OF HEARING 1373
1. Timing of Hearing 1373
2. Policy on Continuances 1374
a. Dismissal Without Prejudice to Refile 1375
b. Case Suspension 1375
3. Continuance Procedure 1376
a. Request; Form of Sworn Statement 1377
b. Failure to Make Request 1377
c. Status of Pending Motion 1377
d. Proceeding After Denial of Motion 1378
4. Good Cause Requirement 1378
a. Need to Prepare 1378
b. Awaiting Outcome of Another Case 1378
c. Unavailability of Representative; New Representative 1378
(i) Case Proceeds to Hearing 1381
d. Medical Condition of Appellant 1381
e. Pending Criminal Proceeding; Indefinite Suspension 1382
f. Incarceration 1385
g. Military Service 1386
h. Missing or Unavailable Witness 1386
i. Change in Hearing Location 1387
5. Continuance Denial—Review Standard 1387
D. VENUE OF HEARING 1388
1. Change of Venue 1388
a. Cost to Appellant 1390
2. Requesting a Change of Venue 1390
3. Venue Determination Review Standard 1390
E. HEARING PRELIMINARIES 1390
1. Change, Resignation, or Death of Judge 1390
2. Interaction With Judge 1391
3. Prehearing Submission 1391
4. Prehearing Conference 1392
a. Stipulations 1395
b. Waiver or Withdrawal of Affirmative Defense 1396
c. Dismissal of Charge 1396
5. Memorandum or Order Summarizing Conference 1396
a. Preservation of Objection; Incomplete Summary 1397
b. Treatment of EEO and Other Affirmative Defenses; Waiver; Summary Judgment 1400
F. CONDUCT OF HEARING; RESPONSIBILITIES OF JUDGE 1405
1. Hearing Error: Measure of Harm 1406
a. Timing of Submission of Pleadings 1407
b. Timing of Initial Decision 1407
2. Control and Exclusion of Representative or Participant 1407
3. Maintaining Order 1409
a. Exclusion From Hearing Room of an Individual Whose Presence May Intimidate a Witness 1409
b. Security Arrangement 1410
4. Witness Control; Sequestration 1411
5. Conduct of Questioning 1413
a. Multiple Representatives 1413
6. Permitting Record Development 1414

a. Videoconference, Telephone Hearing 1415
b. Bifurcated Hearing 1419
c. Hearing Subpoena 1421
7. Ensuring Record Development; *Pro Se* Appellant; EEO File 1421
a. Duty of Judge to Inform an Appellant of Governing Law; *Pro Se* Appellant; Liberal Construction of Pleadings 1423
b. Raising Issue *Sua Sponte* 1425
c. Annuity Appeal 1427
d. Preserving Review Right Through Objection 1428
8. Public Hearing; Closing Hearing 1428
9. Media Coverage 1429
10. Timing of Hearing 1430
11. Hearing Accommodation for Disabled Appellant; Interpreter 1430
12. Allocation of Burden of Proof 1432
13. Opening Statement 1432
14. Closing Argument, Brief 1432
G. PREVENTION OF INTERFERENCE WITH BOARD PROCEEDINGS 1433
1. Protective Order 1433
2. Protective Order for Appellant 1434
3. Interference With Witness, Representative 1436
a. Agency Restriction on Appearance of Employee as Witness 1439
H. POSTHEARING ACTIVITIES 1440
1. Closing Record 1440
a. Ensuring Notice of Record Closing 1441
b. Clarifying Scope of Record; Off-The-Record Discussions 1442
c. Timing of Evidentiary Submissions, Responses 1442
d. Effect of Closing Record 1444
2. Regional Authority After Initial Decision 1444
a. Judge's Request to Reopen Record to Correct Error 1445
II. HEARING RECORD 1445
A. RIGHT TO AND NECESSITY FOR A RECORD OR TRANSCRIPT 1445
1. Current Board Practice 1446
2. Past Treatment of Transcript 1447
3. Past Internal Board Guidance on Transcript 1447
4. Federal Circuit Commentary on Transcript 1448
a. Arbitration Hearing 1449
5. Use of Recording 1449
B. PROBLEMS CONCERNING TRANSCRIPT AND RECORD 1450
1. Off-The-Record Discussion 1450
2. Hearing Recording Omission; Transcript Error 1450
3. Correction of Transcript 1452
4. Unofficial Transcript 1452
III. MOTION PRACTICE 1453
A. USE OF MOTIONS 1453
1. Dispositive Motion 1455
a. Motion to Dismiss Filed Before Hearing 1455
b. Motion to Dismiss Filed During Hearing 1456
c. Summary Judgment 1457
B. FORM AND TIMING OF MOTIONS 1462
IV. WITNESSES 1463
A. WITNESS REQUEST 1463
1. Obligation to Permit Relevant Testimony 1463
a. Competence to Testify 1463
b. Appellant 1464
c. Decisionmaker 1464
d. Agency Head 1464
2. Obligation to Request Witness 1465
a. Witness List 1466
b. Rebuttal Witness 1467
3. Repetitious Testimony 1468
4. Offer of Proof 1468

5. Compelling Witness Attendance 1468
a. Appellant 1469
b. Others; Former Employee; Subpoena 1469
6. Duty Status of Federal Employee Witness; Pay, Travel, Per Diem 1469
a. Official Time 1470
7. Protecting Record; Missing Witness 1471
a. Preservation of Objection 1471
8. Judge May Call Witness 1472
9. Obtaining Testimony by Alternate Means 1472
10. Right of Witness to Representation 1472
a. Self-Incrimination 1472
11. Witness Denial—Review Standard 1472
B. EXAMINATION OF WITNESSES 1474
1. Control of Questioning 1475
a. Questioning by Judge 1475
b. Leading Questions 1476
c. Production of Witness Statement, Document Relied on During Testimony 1477
d. Taking Witness Out of Order 1478
V. DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGE 1478
A. PRESUMPTION OF HONESTY AND IMPARTIALITY 1478
1. Competence of Judge 1480
B. TREATMENT OF BIAS ALLEGATIONS 1480
1. Procedure; Documenting Record; Sworn Statement; Interlocutory Appeal Request 1482
2. Extrajudicial Source of Bias 1484
3. Treatment of Bias Allegation by Judge, Board 1485
4. Specific Bias Allegations 1485
a. Relationship With Party or Witness 1486
b. Relationship With Counsel 1488
c. Improper Communication 1489
d. Examination of Witness 1490
e. Remarks About Counsel, Party, Merits, Settlement; Remarks During Hearing; *Ex Parte* Communication 1490
f. Prior Ruling Against Party 1495
g. Erroneous Ruling 1495
h. Incorrect Factual Conclusion 1495
i. Hasty or Late Decision 1496
5. Change in Judge Without Finding of Bias 1496

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 5: EVIDENCE 1499
I. FUNDAMENTALS 1499
A. RELEVANCE, MATERIALITY, AND FAIRNESS 1499
1. Informal Adjudication 1499
2. Relevance and Materiality 1500
a. *De Novo* Review 1500
b. Conditional Admission of Evidence 1500
3. Protecting the Record 1500
a. Offer of Proof 1500
4. Fairness in Development of Evidence 1500
a. Erroneous Exclusion of Evidence 1500
b. Erroneous Admission of Evidence 1501
c. Manipulation or Redaction of Evidence 1502
B. NATURE OF CHARGES 1503
1. Evidentiary Value of Charge 1503
a. Response to Charge 1504
C. HEARSAY 1504
1. *Borninkhof* 1506
2. Judicial Interpretations 1508
3. 5 USC 2302(b)(2): Investigative Statement 1508

II. EVALUATION OF EVIDENCE 1509
A. DOCUMENTS 1509
1. Response to Appeal 1509
2. Medical Report, Records 1510
3. Notes of Witness; Memorandum of Conversation 1511
4. Time and Attendance Record 1511
5. Business Record 1511
6. Procedure for Introducing Document; Demonstrative Evidence 1512
7. Authentication 1513
a. Handwriting 1514
b. Significance of Signature 1514
c. Copy; Photograph 1514
B. PHYSICAL EVIDENCE 1514
1. Custody and Control 1514
2. Use at Hearing 1514
C. ADMISSIONS 1515
1. Probative Value 1515
a. Repudiated or Recanted Admission 1516
2. Settlement Offer 1517
3. Subsequent Remedial Measures 1518
D. CIRCUMSTANTIAL AND SECONDARY EVIDENCE 1518
1. Common Possession/Multiple Causation 1520
2. Contemporaneous Statement 1520
3. Flight or Evasion 1520
4. Statistics 1521
E. OPINION AND IMPEACHMENT EVIDENCE 1521
1. Physical Condition 1521
2. Character 1521
a. Past Misconduct 1523
b. Arrest, Conviction 1524
c. Reputation 1524
d. Habit 1525
3. Evidence in Disability Annuity Appeal; *Chavez*; Post-Separation Evidence 1525
F. REGULATION; LAW 1532
G. EVIDENCE FROM OTHER BOARD HEARING; OTHER JUDICIAL PROCEEDING 1532
H. RECURRENT EVIDENTIARY PROBLEMS 1532
1. Polygraph 1532
2. Unsworn Written Statements 1533
a. No Hearing 1535
b. Hearing Held 1535
3. Sworn Written Statement; Form of Attestation; Affidavit 1536
4. Deposition 1539
5. Investigation Report 1539
6. Recording 1541
a. Video 1542
b. Audio 1542
7. Transcript of Prior Testimony 1542
8. Expert Witness; Medical Evidence 1542
a. Medical Opinion 1544
b. Other Experts 1547
9. Statement of Representative, Party 1547
10. Hearing Deportment or Demeanor 1548
11. Testimony of Child 1549
12. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract 1549
13. Newspaper Article 1549
14. Drug Test 1549
III. SUBSTITUTES FOR DIRECT EVIDENCE 1553
A. OFFICIAL NOTICE 1553
1. Regulation 1554
a. Federal Personnel Manual; Agency Handbook, Publication 1554
2. Related Board Case Record 1555

B. ADVERSE INFERENCES AND PRESUMPTIONS 1555
1. Silence 1555
2. Negative Inference; Omitted Witness, Document 1557
a. Destruction or Loss of Evidence; Spoliation 1558
b. Negative Evidence 1562
3. Presumption 1562
a. Delivery of Mail, Other Document 1563
C. STIPULATIONS 1567
1. Issues of Fact and Law 1568
2. Stipulations Directed by Judge 1569
D. PREVIOUS DETERMINATIONS OF DISPUTED FACTS, ISSUES, CLAIMS: *RES JUDICATA*, COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL, AND LAW OF THE CASE—THE DOCTRINES 1569
1. *Res Judicata* 1570
a. Identity of Prior Cause of Action and Issues 1575
b. Identity of Parties; Privity 1576
c. Complete Relief Available 1576
d. Jurisdictional Issue 1577
e. Settlement 1580
f. Withdrawal of Appeal 1581
g. *Res Judicata* Raised *Sua Sponte* by Board; Waiver of Defense 1581
2. Collateral Estoppel 1583
a. Error in Law; Change in Law; Differing Legal Standards 1587
b. Proof of a Prior Adjudication 1588
c. Privity; Appellant as a Party to Prior Case 1588
d. Privity of Agencies 1589
e. Identity of Prior Issue; Ability Earlier to Raise an Issue 1590
f. Jurisdictional, Timeliness Issues 1591
g. Decision of Another Tribunal; Effect of State Law 1594
h. Collateral Estoppel Raised *Sua Sponte* by Board 1596
3. Judicial Estoppel 1597
4. Law of the Case; Mandate Rule 1599
5. *Stare Decisis* 1603
E. *RES JUDICATA* AND COLLATERAL ESTOPPEL—THE DOCTRINES APPLIED 1604
1. Criminal Conviction 1604
a. Conviction, Misconduct Distinguished 1607
2. Plea to Criminal Charge 1607
a. Guilty Plea 1607
b. *Nolo Contendere* and *Alford* Plea 1609
c. Pretrial Diversion 1612
3. Acquittal; Reversal of Criminal Conviction 1613
4. Successive Board Cases 1614
a. Dismissal for Adjudicatory Efficiency 1615
b. WIGI/Removal 1616
c. Successive RIFs 1616
d. Whistleblowing Prohibited Personnel Practice Complaint or Appeal 1616
e. USERRA Claims 1625
f. Suitability Determination 1625
g. Regulation Review 1626
h. Prior Action Reversed for Lack of Due Process 1626
5. Other Proceedings 1626
a. Credentialing Committee 1626
b. Union Trial Board 1627
c. Labor Arbitration Award 1627
d. OPM Annuity Determination 1630
e. Unemployment Compensation Award 1633
f. OWCP Finding; Social Security Determination 1634
g. EEOC Decision 1635
h. Comptroller General or GAO Decision 1636
i. Judicial Determination 1637
6. Potential Exceptions to Application of Collateral Estoppel, *Res Judicata* 1638

a. Pendency of an Appeal; District Court Case 1639
b. Fairness of Adjudication; New Evidence 1639
c. Fraud; Misrepresentation 1639
d. Change in Law 1641
IV. EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE 1641
A. PROCEDURE 1641
1. Objection, Motions to Strike or *in Limine* 1641
2. Witness Exclusion 1642
a. Proposing Official 1642
B. CONSTITUTIONAL AND STATUTORY CHALLENGES 1643
1. Search 1643
a. Wiretap 1648
b. Recording 1648
c. Drug Testing 1649
2. Interrogation 1653
a. Misconduct of Investigator 1653
b. Compelled Testimony; *Kalkines* Warning 1654
c. Right to Silence, Counsel 1658
d. Denial of Union Representation 1659
e. Administrative Procedure Act 1660
C. OTHER BASES FOR EXCLUSION OF EVIDENCE 1661
1. Privilege; Confidentiality; Privacy 1661
a. Alcoholism Treatment Record 1661
b. Other Medical Records 1661
c. Attorney-Client Communication 1661
d. Conference With Union Representative 1661
2. Failure to Follow Board Procedure 1662

CHAPTER 6: INITIAL DECISION 1663

I. INITIAL DECISION: PURPOSE 1663
A. INITIAL DECISION FORMAT 1663
1. Minimum Requirements 1663
a. Bench Decision 1665
b. Notice of Right to Review 1666
II. REQUIRED ANALYSIS 1667
A. INCOMPLETE ANALYSIS; FAILURE TO MENTION ALL EVIDENCE 1668
1. Incorrect Adjudication Standard 1671
2. Issue Not Raised in Appeal 1671
3. *Dictum*; Reasonable Construction 1671
B. TIMELINESS AND JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES 1671
C. ADVERSE ACTION, PERFORMANCE CASE 1672
D. ANNUITY APPEAL 1672
E. EEO, PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICE ISSUE 1673
1. Nondispositive EEO, Prohibited Personnel Practice Issue 1674
F. CONSOLIDATED APPEALS 1676
G. ATTORNEY FEES DECISION 1676
III. CREDIBILITY FINDINGS 1676
A. NECESSARY FINDINGS 1677
1. Weight of Evidence Equally Balanced 1678
B. FACTORS CONSIDERED; *HILLEN* 1678
1. Some Testimony Discredited 1681
2. Alibi Defense 1681
3. Inconsistencies; Denials; Memory Lapse; Failure to Provide Statement 1681
4. Contemporaneous Notation, Statement; *Post Hoc* Explanation 1682
5. Self-Serving Testimony; Bias; Criminal Conviction; Past Misconduct 1683
6. Uncontradicted Testimony 1684
7. Implausible, Inherently Improbable, Imprecise Testimony 1684
C. TELEPHONIC OR VIDEO HEARING 1684
D. DETERMINATION MADE WITHOUT HEARING 1685

CHAPTER 7: PETITION FOR REVIEW 1687
I. PETITION FOR REVIEW; RECONSIDERATION 1687
A. PFR PROCESS 1687
1. Statutory and Regulatory Structure 1688
a. Internal Board Guidance 1690
2. Board Treatment of PFR, Reopening Request 1692
a. Enforcement Issue 1693
3. Reply to PFR Response 1693
4. Cross-PFR; Response 1694
a. Conditional Cross-PFR 1695
5. Effect of Judicial Review on PFR 1695
6. Effect of EEOC Review on PFR 1696
7. Who May Obtain Review 1696
a. OPM 1696
b. OSC 1697
c. Others; Intervenors 1697
d. Substituted Party 1697
8. Grounds for PFR 1698
a. Evidentiary Disputes 1698
b. Ineffective Counsel 1699
c. Frivolous PFR; Sanction 1700
d. Challenges to Settlement 1700
9. Time for Filing PFR 1701
10. Service 1702
11. Board Processing 1702
a. Tied Vote; Lack of Quorum 1704
b. Decision Effective Upon Issuance by Clerk 1705
c. Joinder 1705
12. Failure to Prosecute; Failure to Respond 1705
a. Withdrawal of PFR 1705
b. Dismissal Without Prejudice 1706
13. PFR Settlement Program 1707
14. Entry of Settlement Agreement Into Record 1707
15. Board Final Decision 1707
a. Short Form Order 1708
16. Authority to Reopen and Reconsider 1709
a. Jurisdictional Issue 1712
b. Due Diligence 1713
c. Reversal of Criminal Conviction 1717
d. Change in Law 1718
e. Fraud 1720
f. Retirement Appeal 1721
g. Effect of Judicial Review on Reopening 1722
h. Reopening in Lieu of Excusing Untimely or Defective PFR 1724
i. Clear Legal Error; Manifest Injustice 1724
j. Discovery of Additional Legal Argument 1725
k. Correction of Case Processing Error 1725
l. Incorrect Interpretation of Charges 1725
II. INTERIM RELIEF 1725
A. EFFECTIVE DATE OF INTERIM RELIEF 1729
B. EFFECT OF REMAND OR SUPPLEMENTAL INITIAL DECISION ON INTERIM RELIEF 1729
C. OBLIGATION TO RETURN EMPLOYEE TO WORK AND PAY; UNDUE DISRUPTION 1730
1. Undue Disruption Determination 1733
2. Undue Disruption Notice 1734
3. Implicit Disruption Determination; Strong Overriding Interest 1736
4. Removal From Workplace or Adverse Action During Interim Relief Period 1741
5. Return to Work With Changed Duties 1742
6. Restoration Followed by Appellant's Inability to Work 1743
7. Pay Entitlement; Overtime; Allowances 1743
8. Deductibility of Interim Earnings or Severance Pay 1745
9. Prior "Bad Faith" Implementation Standard 1746

D. DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS; 38 USC 714 1746
E. DISMISSAL OF PFR FOR FAILURE TO PROVIDE INTERIM RELIEF 1747
1. Remedy for Inadequate Interim Relief 1748
2. Motion to Dismiss PFR for Lack of Proper Interim Relief 1749
3. Discriminatory Application of Interim Relief 1750
4. Effect of Jurisdictional Issue 1751
F. PFR NOT MOOTED BY OVERBROAD INTERIM RELIEF 1751
G. CERTIFICATION AND PROOF OF INTERIM RELIEF 1752
1. Evidence of Interim Relief 1753
2. Technical Error; Supplemental Evidence of Interim Relief 1756
3. Delay in Payment Following Certification or *Prima Facie* Evidence of Interim Relief 1757
4. Withdrawal of Interim Relief 1758
H. FACTORS LIMITING OR WARRANTING DENIAL OF INTERIM RELIEF 1758
1. OWCP Benefits 1759
2. Retirement 1759
3. Restriction on Extension of Appointment; Funding From Federal Grants 1761
4. Waiver, Settlement of Interim Relief; Employment Status Change 1761
I. SPECIAL SITUATIONS 1763
1. Retirement Appeals 1763
2. Within-Grade Increase Appeal 1764
3. Suitability Appeal 1764
4. VEOA Appeal 1764
5. Mitigation of Removal to Demotion 1764
6. Mitigation of Removal to Suspension 1765
7. Mitigation of Demotion to Suspension 1765
8. Mitigation or Cancelation of Suspension 1765
9. Enforced Leave Concluded by Date of Initial Decision 1765
10. Adjustment of Date of Employee's Return to Duty 1766
11. Unified Penalty Involving Reassignment 1766
III. BASES FOR REVIEW 1766
A. FACTUAL FINDINGS; "SPECIAL DEFERENCE" 1767
1. Decision Based on Affidavits, Documents 1772
2. Telephonic, Videoconference Hearing 1772
3. Omitted Findings 1772
4. Unnecessary Findings 1774
5. Issue of Mental Competence During Appeal Adjudication 1774
B. NEW EVIDENCE 1775
1. What Constitutes Evidence 1778
2. What Evidence Is New 1778
a. Previously Available 1779
b. Issue First Raised by Judge 1780
c. Claim of Surprise 1780
d. Due Diligence 1780
e. Issue of Timeliness of Appeal or Other Submission 1783
f. Issue of Jurisdiction; Exhaustion of Remedies 1785
g. Evidence From Another Board Case 1788
3. Materiality of New Evidence 1788
a. Impeachment, Rebuttal Evidence 1789
b. Corroborative Evidence 1792
c. Disparate Treatment 1793
d. OPM, SSA, OWCP, VA Determination; Evidence of Medical, Mental Condition 1794
e. Adjudication of Past Discipline 1794
f. Reversal of Criminal Conviction 1795
C. NEW LAW 1796
D. REVIEW OF NEW ISSUES OR ISSUES NOT RAISED WITH JUDGE 1797
1. General Rule 1797
a. Jurisdictional Issue 1799
b. Order Directing Payment in Violation of Federal Statute 1800
2. Determining if Issue or Argument Was Raised Below 1800
a. Annuity 1801
b. Statutory, Constitutional Interpretation 1801

c. Timeliness of Appeal 1801
d. Discrimination 1801
e. Waiver of Issue 1802
IV. TIMELINESS OF PFR 1802
A. REQUEST FOR EXTENSION OF TIME 1803
B. DATE AND PLACE OF FILING 1804
1 Deficient but Timely PFR 1804
C. FILING BY FACSIMILE 1805
1 Misguided Facsimile 1805
D. FILING BY COMMERCIAL DELIVERY 1806
E. FILING BY HAND 1806
F. FILING BY MAIL 1806
1. Proof of Mailing; Postmark; Mailbox Rule 1808
2. PFR Lost in Mail 1811
G. ELECTRONIC FILING 1813
H. PROCEDURE ON LATE SUBMISSION 1815
1. Affidavit or Sworn Statement Required 1816
2. Strict Application 1817
3. Retirement Appeal 1818
I. JUSTIFICATION FOR LATE FILING; LENGTH OF DELAY, OTHER FACTORS 1819
1. Electronic Filing Problem 1820
2. Mailroom Delay in Posting PFR 1824
3. Foreign Mail Problem 1824
4. Office Equipment, Technology, Email, Related Problems 1824
5. Merits 1825
6. Physical or Mental Condition of Appellant or Counsel 1825
7. Ignorance of Law; Late Discovery of Legal Defense; Subsequent Board or Court Decision in Another Case 1832
8. Problem With Settlement 1834
9. Misinterpretation, Ignorance of Board Regulation, Instruction 1835
10. Incorrect Information From Board, Others 1837
11. Incomplete Notice of Right to File PFR 1838
12. Delayed Receipt, Misrouting of Initial Decision, PFR; Constructive Receipt 1839
13. Failure to Receive Initial Decision; E-Filer 1841
a. Responsibility to Notify Board of Physical or Email Address Change 1844
14. Effect of Judge's Remand to Agency for Redetermination 1846
15. Withdrawal, Absence of Representative 1846
16. Inability to Obtain Representation 1847
17. Unexcused Delay or Neglect of Representative 1848
18. Excused Neglect of Representative; Diligence of Appellant 1851
19. Attempt to Obtain Congressional Assistance 1853
20. Pending Review by Another Adjudicator; Settlement Attempts 1853
21. Awaiting Transcript, Other Document 1854
22. Delay in Internal Decisionmaking 1856
23. Military Service 1856
24. Fear of Prosecution; Agency Misrepresentation 1856
25. New Evidence 1856
26. Language Difficulties 1857
27. Other Problems 1857
J. FILING PFR WITH WRONG AGENCY OR BOARD OFFICE 1860
1. Mixed-Case Appeals 1860
2. Other Misdirected Filings 1860
K. CASE OR PFR MISFILED IN COURT 1862
V. FORMAT AND SUBSTANCE OF PFR; REPLY; RESPONSE TO REPLY 1862
A. ALLOWABLE SUBMISSIONS; LENGTH, FORMAT 1863
1. Erroneous Designation of Pleading 1865
2. Error in Formal Requirements 1865
3. *Pro Se* Form PFR 1865
B. SIGNATURE, DESIGNATION OF REPRESENTATIVE REQUIRED 1867
C. SPECIFIC AND SUPPORTED OBJECTION 1867
1. Factual Error 1868
2. Adjudicatory Error 1868

D. RESPONSE TO PFR 1868
E. REPLY TO RESPONSE 1869
F. SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY 1870
G. LACK OF TRANSCRIPT 1870
VI. MOOTNESS OF PFR 1871
A. CANCELATION OF ADVERSE ACTION; AGENCY COMPLIANCE WITH INITIAL DECISION 1871
1. Effect of Appellant's PFR; No Agency PFR Filed 1871
B. SETTLEMENT; VACATUR OF INITIAL DECISION 1872
C. REGULATION REVIEW PROCEEDING 1872
D. RETIREMENT APPEAL 1873
E. DISQUALIFICATION OF REPRESENTATIVE 1873
VII. PROCEDURE ON REMAND 1873
A. DETERMINING WHETHER REMAND IS NECESSARY 1873
1. Board Obtains Evidence During PFR 1874
B. EVIDENCE, FINDINGS FROM FIRST HEARING 1874
1. Effect of Board Order Vacating Initial Decision 1876
C. REMAND FOR FURTHER DISCOVERY 1876
D. REMAND FOR MORE EVIDENCE 1876
1. Subsequent PFR 1876
E. ENTRY OF INTERLOCUTORY OR INTERIM RELIEF ON REMAND 1876
F. REMAND FOR COMPLIANCE 1877
VIII. OPM RECONSIDERATION REQUESTS 1877
A. GOVERNING STATUTE AND REGULATION 1877
B. SUBSTANTIAL IMPACT ON LAW 1879
1. Decisions Before 1990 1881
C. LIMITED TO FACTS, ISSUES OF RECORD 1882
D. TIMING OF REQUEST; ARBITRATION AWARD 1882
E. MOOTNESS 1882
F. EEO ISSUE 1882
IX. STAY REQUESTS 1883
A. REQUESTED BY OPM 1884
1. Request for Supreme Court Review 1887
B. REQUESTED BY AGENCY 1888
1. Stay of Enforcement Proceeding 1890
C. REQUESTED BY OR FOR INDIVIDUAL 1890
1. OSC Disciplinary Case 1892
2. Other OSC Litigation 1893
X. REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS 1893
A. AWARD SUBJECT TO REVIEW; MATTERS EXCLUDED FROM REVIEW 1899
1. Governing Statute and Regulation; Time for Review 1900
2. EEO Allegation; Accommodation Requirement 1902
a. Remand for Resolution of EEO Issue 1907
3. Attorney Fees Claim 1908
B. REVIEW PROCEDURE 1909
1. Time to Seek Review; Notice of Review Rights 1911
C. PROPER APPELLANT 1913
D. METHOD, SCOPE OF REVIEW 1914
1. Issue Preclusion 1917
2. Collective Bargaining Contract Exclusivity 1918
3. Allegation of Bias, Unfair Hearing 1918
4. Enforcement of Award Reviewed 1918
E. STANDARD OF REVIEW 1919
1. Penalty, Time-Served Suspension; Remedy 1923
2. Procedures; Timeliness of Grievance 1931
3. EEO Issue 1934
F. POSTAL SERVICE EMPLOYEES 1935
1. Effect of Arbitration Award on Board Appeal 1937

CHAPTER 8: ADVERSE ACTIONS 1943

I. ADVERSE ACTIONS DEFINED 1943
A. CANCELATION OF APPOINTMENT, PROMOTION 1943

1. Appointment 1944
a. Entry on Duty; Action by Appointing Authority; Reliance; SF-50 1948
b. Citizenship 1949
c. Nepotism 1951
d. Selective Service Registration 1951
e. Political Influence 1953
f. Withdrawal of Offer to Extend Term Appointment 1954
2. Promotion, Pay Increase 1954
3. Regularization of Appointment by OPM 1967
B. CONSTRUCTIVE ADVERSE ACTION 1967
1. Jurisdictional Showing 1970
a. Specific Allegations Control 1980
b. Totality of Circumstances 1982
c. Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements 1985
d. Jurisdictional Analysis in Untimely Appeal 1986
e. Collateral Attack on Settlement Agreement, Waiver of Appeal Rights 1986
f. Allegation of Discrimination, Reprisal 1988
2. Overview of Constructive Adverse Action Appeals 1991
a. Timing of Events 1992
3. Involuntary Downgrading 1993
a. Hearing 1994
b. Deceit; Misrepresentation 1994
c. Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause 2002
d. Time Pressure 2003
e. Improper Reassignment 2004
f. Withdrawal of Request for Downgrading 2004
g. Unauthentic Request for Downgrading 2005
h. Discrimination; Intolerable Working Conditions 2005
i. External Problems 2009
j. Correction of Administrative Error 2010
4. Involuntary Resignation 2011
a. Hearing 2014
b. Deceit; Misrepresentation 2015
c. Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause 2021
d. Time Pressure 2024
e. Improper Reassignment 2028
f. Withdrawal of Request to Resign 2028
g. Irrevocable Resignation; VSIP 2031
h. Unauthentic, Ambiguous or Conditional Resignation 2032
i. Ineffective Resignation 2033
j. Mental Disability 2034
k. Intolerable Working Conditions 2035
l. Whistleblowing Reprisal 2046
m. Discriminatory Working Conditions 2047
n. Failure to Accommodate Disability; Medical Conditions 2051
o. Denial of Leave 2053
p. External Problems 2055
q. Probationer 2055
r. Technical Error 2055
5. Involuntary Retirement 2055
a. Hearing 2057
b. Deceit; Misrepresentation 2058
(i) Correction of Benefit; Placement in Wrong Retirement System 2071
c. Action Threatened or Taken Without Good Cause 2072
d. Time Pressure 2074
e. Involuntary Reassignment 2076
f. Withdrawal of Request to Retire 2078
g. Irrevocable Retirement; VSIP 2079
h. Intolerable Working Conditions 2083
i. Whistleblowing Reprisal 2093
j. Discriminatory Working Conditions 2097

k. Failure to Accommodate Disability 2101
l. Discriminatory Conduct Causes Disability 2117
m. Denial of Leave 2118
n. Mental Disability 2119
o. External Problems 2119
p. Agency-Initiated Retirement 2119
q. Discontinued Service Retirement 2119
r. Mandatory Retirement 2121
s. Employing Agency as Party to Appeal Against OPM 2121
6. Constructive Demotion Through Reassignment; *Russell* 2122
a. Planned Management Action 2126
b. Position Must Be Upgraded 2128
c. Identity of Duties 2131
d. Qualification for Higher-Graded Position 2131
e. Jurisdictional Analysis; Hearing 2132
f. Evidence of Classification Error 2132
g. EEO Allegation 2132
h. Timeliness of Appeal 2132
7. Involuntary Transfer 2133
C. ENFORCED LEAVE; CONSTRUCTIVE SUSPENSION 2134
1. Jurisdictional Analysis; Burden of Proof 2138
a. Hearing 2140
b. EEO Allegation 2141
c. Effect of Receipt of OWCP Benefit 2142
d. Disputed Restoration Right 2143
2. Requirement for Adverse Action Procedure 2144
a. Leave Status Voluntarily Assumed; Failure to Provide Medical Documentation, Perform Available Work 2147
b. Process Due to Employee 2152
c. Evaluation of Leave Enforced Following Notice to Employee 2152
d. Disability Accommodation 2152
e. Retirement Application; LWOP 2157
3. Employee AWOL 2157
4. Employee Blocked From Working Because of Employer's Concern About Fitness; Fitness Examination Requirement 2159
a. Employee on LWOP 2169
5. Light and Limited Duty; Medical Restriction 2169
a. Historical Development of Light Duty Analysis 2174
b. Collective Bargaining Contract 2179
c. Disability Accommodation 2182
d. EEO Settlement 2187
e. Termination of Light Duty 2187
f. Postal Service National and Other Collective Bargaining Contracts 2189
g. Furlough 2190
6. Work Release 2190
7. Bar Order Preventing Entry to Workplace; Related AWOL Charge 2191
8. Temporary Absence Resulting From Intolerable Working Conditions 2193
D. INDEFINITE SUSPENSION 2197
1. Use 2197
2. Procedure; Duration 2201
a. Criminal Proceedings 2202
b. Clearance Suspension 2206
c. Due Process 2207
d. Regulatory Error 2209
3. Criminal Activity 2211
a. Indictment; Filing of Information; Referral for Prosecution 2212
b. Investigation Accompanied by Other Circumstances 2214
c. Arrest 2217
d. Nexus; Alternative to Suspension 2224
4. Security Clearance or Other Investigation 2226
a. Due Process: Separation of Officials Denying Access and Deciding Suspension; Change in Basis for Clearance Suspension 2232

b. Alternatives to Clearance-Related Suspension....2248
c. Discrimination; Accommodation for Disability; Medical Issues; Whistleblowing....2254
5. Inquiry Into Other Issues....2255
a. Indefinite Prolongation of Suspension....2260
6. Remedy....2263
a. Action Following Termination of Criminal Proceeding....2268
II. SERVICE EFFICIENCY; CAUSE PROMOTING SERVICE EFFICIENCY....2268
A. BURDEN OF PROOF....2271
1. Charges....2271
2. Affirmative Defenses....2271
3. Preponderance of Evidence....2272
a. Uniformity of Standard....2273
b. Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714....2273
c. Violation of Criminal Statute....2273
d. Intent....2274
e. Suspicion; Belief....2275
4. *Prima Facie* Case....2275
5. Presumptions....2275
B. PERSONAL FAULT....2275
1. Adverse Action to Address Action Involving Another Employee....2275
a. EEO Complaint....2275
b. Merit Promotion Grievance....2276
2. Action Directed by Arbitrator....2276
3. Correction of Administrative Error....2276
4. *Respondeat Superior*; Supervisors and Managers....2276
C. ADVERSE ACTION RELATED TO DISABILITY....2279
1. Medical Standard; *Douglas* Factors; Accommodation....2280
2. Medical Impairment....2281
3. Agency-Initiated Retirement....2282
a. Assistance in Securing Counsel....2285
b. Prior Law: Reasonable Cause to Believe....2286
4. Evaluation of Physical Impairment....2287
a. Evidence of Recovery Between Date of Removal and Board Decision....2290
5. Effect of Removal for Inability to Work on OPM Disability Annuity Determination....2292
a. Rebuttable Presumption of Annuity Entitlement....2292
6. Effect of Grant of Disability Retirement Application on Action Based on Inability to Perform Duties....2300
7. Allegation of Disability Discrimination; Lack of Reasonable Accommodation....2302
III. SPECIAL CLASSES OF EMPLOYEES....2304
A. SENIOR EXECUTIVE SERVICE....2304
1. Mitigation of Disciplinary Action....2310
2. Performance Case....2311
a. Informal Hearing....2311
3. Department of Veterans Affairs....2313
a. 2014 Legislation....2314
4. Drug Enforcement Administration; FBI....2319
B. ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGES....2320
1. Scope of Board Review....2324
a. Good Cause....2324
b. Penalty Determination....2329
c. Affirmative Defenses....2330
d. Disability; Accommodation....2333
2. Cause for Discipline....2333
a. Insubordination....2335
b. Performance....2336
c. Failure to Follow Performance-Related Directive....2340
d. Remarks to Litigant; Comments in Decision; Conduct of Hearing....2343
e. Prolonged Absence; Irregular Attendance....2345
f. Other Misconduct....2346
g. Medical Issues....2348
h. Effective Date of Action Sustained by Board....2348
3. Constructive Action Against Judge: *Tunik*....2349

a. Forced Retirement....2357
b. Enforced Leave....2358
c. Pre-*Tunik* Decisions; Judicial Independence....2358
4. Furlough; RIF....2366
5. Settlement of Complaint....2369
6. Voluntary Dismissal of Complaint; Mootness....2370

CHAPTER 9: NEXUS....2371

I. CONCEPT OF NEXUS....2371
A. *MERRITT* AND PRESUMPTIONS OF NEXUS; OFF-DUTY CONDUCT....2372
1. General Approach Toward Proof....2375
a. Actual or Potential Publicity, Notoriety....2376
b. Potential for Future Harm....2376
c. Investigative Exertion....2376
II. SPECIFIC NEXUS DETERMINATIONS....2376
A. ARREST....2377
B. VIOLENT OFF-DUTY MISCONDUCT....2378
1. Shooting; Killing....2378
2. Assault; Threat....2380
C. VIOLENT CONDUCT ON AGENCY PREMISES....2381
D. OFF-DUTY DRUG OFFENSE....2381
1. Drug Activity Involving Agency Time or Facilities....2384
E. OFF-DUTY ALCOHOL-RELATED OFFENSE....2385
1. Off-Duty Activity Involving Agency Premises....2386
F. SEXUAL MISCONDUCT....2386
G. FRAUD AND THEFT; OTHER INTEGRITY OFFENSE....2398
1. Off-Duty Offense....2398
2. Preemployment Offense....2400
3. On-Duty or Job-Related Offense....2400
H. GAMBLING....2401
I. FAILURE TO PAY DEBT....2401
J. GRIEVANCE MEETING CONDUCT....2403
K. CONDUCT CONTRARY TO AGENCY MISSION....2404
1. Real Estate Activity—DHUD....2404
2. Employee's Tax Problem—IRS, Other Agencies; Responsibility for Errors of Others....2404
3. Law Enforcement Officer; *Giglio* Impairment....2409
4. Driver....2415
5. Strike-Related Conduct....2415
L. AWOL REMOVAL AFTER CRIMINAL CONVICTION....2415

CHAPTER 10: PENALTY DETERMINATION....2417

I. GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS....2417
A. *DOUGLAS* STANDARDS; DECISION TO REFLECT MITIGATING FACTORS OR BOARD DETERMINES MAXIMUM REASONABLE PENALTY....2420
1. Consideration of Mitigating Factors....2422
2. Proposal to List Aggravating Factors; Treatment of Warnings; Due Process Considerations....2422
3. Exemplary Penalty....2425
4. Exaggeration of Charge....2425
B. ARTICULATION OF RELEVANT FACTORS....2425
1. By Agency; Decision Notice....2426
2. By Board....2427
C. NOT ALL CHARGES SUSTAINED; MAXIMUM REASONABLE PENALTY DETERMINED....2428
1. Remand to Agency for Redetermination of Penalty....2434
D. ALL CHARGES BUT NOT ALL SPECIFICATIONS SUSTAINED; PARTIAL SPECIFICATION SUSTAINED....2436
E. CHARGE SUSTAINED THAT WAS NOT BROUGHT....2437
F. FACTORS NOT CONSIDERED MITIGATING....2437
1. Disability Discrimination; Impairment....2437
2. Discriminatory Environment....2438
3. Prohibited Personnel Practice....2438
4. Offer of Settlement....2438
G. WHEN MITIGATION MUST BE RAISED....2438

H. OSC DISCIPLINARY CASE 2439
I. IMPACT OF MITIGATION BY DEMOTION ON LABOR AGREEMENT REQUIREMENT 2439
J. EFFECT OF OPM RECONSIDERATION REQUEST 2439
K. VETERANS ADMINISTRATION CASES UNDER 38 USC 714 2440
II. MITIGATING OR AGGRAVATING FACTORS 2441
A. POTENTIAL FOR REHABILITATION 2441
1. Deference to Higher Level Management Assessment 2441
2. Forward-Looking Analysis 2442
3. Performance Action 2442
4. Notice of Rule or Policy 2443
5. Temporary Condition; Stress; Alcoholism 2445
6. Long Service 2445
7. Intervening Good Performance; Misconduct Subsequent to Charge Leading to Adverse Action 2446
8. Post-Removal Conduct or Evidence of Rehabilitation; New Evidence 2447
9. Contrition or Remorse; Admission of Misconduct 2448
10. Denial of Misconduct; Vigorous Defense 2450
11. Repeated Misconduct; Last Chance Agreement 2451
B. PSYCHOLOGICAL PROBLEM; ILLNESS OR TREATMENT; STRESS 2451
C. PERFORMANCE, EVALUATION 2458
D. INTENT 2459
E. NOTORIETY 2459
F. POSITION OF TRUST; FIDUCIARY DUTY; LOSS OF TRUST 2460
G. PROGRESSIVE DISCIPLINE 2463
H. PENALTY TABLE; CLASSIFICATION OF OFFENSE 2465
I. DISPARATE, COMPARABLE PENALTIES; *SINGH* 2469
1. Duty of Agency to Inquire Into Comparable Offenses and Penalties 2476
2. Degree of Consistency Required 2476
3. Substantial Similarity of Offenses; Totality of Circumstances 2477
4. Proximity in Time 2482
5. Same Work Unit; Evolving Case Law: Earlier Decisions of *Woebcke*; *Lewis* 2482
6. Positions of Similar Levels of Trust and Responsibility 2491
7. Selective Prosecution 2493
8. Settlement 2493
9. Comparable Arbitration Awards; Other Board Decisions 2497
10. Effect of Criminal Sentence 2498
11. Assertion of Discrimination 2498
12. Post-Removal Comparability Analysis 2499
J. MANDATORY PENALTY 2500
K. FAILURE TO MAINTAIN CONDITION OF EMPLOYMENT 2503
L. STALENESS OF CHARGE 2503
M. AGENCY BAD FAITH, PROVOCATION, MANIPULATION; IMPROPER PRESSURE ON APPELLANT; ENTRAPMENT 2504
N. CONDONATION 2505
O. FAVORABLE ATTITUDE OF COWORKERS; SUPERVISOR 2505
P. SEVERITY OF MISCONDUCT 2505
1. Sequential Disciplinary Proposals 2506
2. Multiplicity and Merger of Charges 2506
3. Zero Tolerance Policy 2507
Q. EMPLOYEE JOB LEVEL 2508
1. Ineffectiveness as Supervisor; Demotion 2509
2. Reassignment 2510
III. AGENCY CONSIDERATION OF PAST DISCIPLINE 2511
A. NOTICE REQUIREMENT 2513
1. Failure to Include Past Discipline in Proposal: Due Process 2514
B. PROOF, REBUTTAL OF PAST DISCIPLINE 2515
1. Availability of Challenge to Past Discipline 2515
2. Clearly Erroneous 2516
3. Reprisal 2516
4. Pending Challenge to Past Discipline 2517
5. Past Discipline Reversed After Initial Decision 2519
6. Discipline Imposed After Appealed Adverse Action 2520
7. Past Discipline Time-Barred 2520

8. Past Discipline Resolved by Settlement 2521
9. Dissimilar Offense 2521
10. Nondisciplinary Sanction 2523

CHAPTER 11: SUBSTANTIVE OFFENSES 2525

I. STATUS 2525
A. ABSENCE 2525
1. Impact on Service Efficiency; Proof 2525
a. Assigned Post of Duty; Travel Requirement 2528
2. Approved and Disapproved Absence 2528
a. Abuse of Leave 2530
b. Loafing; Wasting Time 2530
c. Excessive Leave, LWOP, Absences Beyond Employee's Control; Failure to Maintain a Regular Work Schedule; OWCP Coverage 2530
(i) Historical Application of *Cook* and Related Decisions 2536
d. Unscheduled but Approved Absence Following Failure to Follow Procedure to Request Leave 2543
e. Disability 2546
3. Tardiness 2547
4. Leave-Requesting, Leave-Reporting Requirement 2547
a. Leave Restriction Notice 2552
b. Justification for Leave; Medical Certification Requirement; Merger of Charges 2552
c. Other Certification or Documentation Requirement 2554
d. Disability Accommodation 2554
5. Proof of AWOL; Telework Status; Leave Request 2555
6. Evidence of Illness First Submitted to Board 2557
a. FMLA 2560
7. LWOP; Other Leave Arrangement; Compensable Injury; Disability Accommodation 2560
a. E.O. 5396; Wounded Warriors Federal Leave Act; Disabled Veteran 2564
b. Advanced Sick Leave 2564
c. Donated Leave 2565
8. Family Leave 2565
a. FMLA Request, Agency Compliance; Medical Documentation 2572
b. Constructive Request 2581
c. Belated Submission of Request, Documentation 2585
d. Abuse of Family Leave 2586
9. Workers' Compensation Issue 2586
a. Determining Whether Removal Is Based on Reason Unrelated to OWCP Entitlement 2588
b. Leave-Reporting Requirement 2589
c. No Foreseeable End to Absence; Absence When Compensation Ends 2590
10. Leave Status Pending Disability Retirement 2592
11. Incarceration; Work-Release Program 2593
12. Cancelation or Conversion of Approved Leave 2594
13. Absence Caused by Fear for Safety 2594
14. Military Leave 2595
15. Religious Leave 2595
16. Jury Duty 2596
17. Problem Following Reinstatement Through Board Order 2596
18. Agency Abuse of Discretion 2596
a. Ambiguous Leave Policy or Directive 2597
b. Condonation of AWOL 2597
c. Leave Status Caused by Agency's Wrongful Action 2597
19. Aggravating Factors 2598
a. Prolonged AWOL 2598
b. Frequent AWOL 2598
c. Unreliable Attendance 2598
20. Mitigating Factors 2599
a. Short, Infrequent AWOL 2600
b. Longer AWOL 2601
B. REFUSAL TO ACCEPT REASSIGNMENT 2602
1. General Rule 2603
a. SES Employee 2609

2. Inconvenience or Health Problem 2610
3. Agency Burden of Proof; Legitimate Reason for Reassignment 2611
a. Mobility Agreement; Condition of Employment 2614
b. Return From Overseas Assignment 2615
4. Misconduct Following Improper Reassignment 2615
5. Application of RIF Procedures; Procedural Errors 2615
C. FAILURE TO MAINTAIN OR OBTAIN CONDITION OF POSITION 2615
1. License, Certification 2616
a. Lawyer 2616
b. Driver 2616
c. Others 2618
d. Medical Certification, Credential, or Standard 2619
e. Law Enforcement 2620
f. Certification by Military Authority 2620
2. Failure to Complete Training Course; Validity of Examination 2621
a. Air Traffic Controller 2621
b. Other Positions 2623
3. Lack of or Loss of Minimum Qualification; Position Requirement 2625
a. Indian Child Protection and Family Violence Prevention Act 2626
b. Lautenberg Amendment 2629
c. Removal From Reserve Status 2631
d. Access to Agency Computer, Network 2636
e. Failure to Exercise or Obtain Return Right From Overseas Employment 2636
f. Foreign Residency or Status Requirement 2638
4. Security Clearance Revocation; Sensitive Position 2638
a. Clearance Process 2638
b. Agency Clearance Proceeding 2639
c. Review of Agency Determination; *Egan*; Constitutional Due Process 2643
d. Decision to Require a Clearance; Whether Clearance Required as Employment Condition 2651
e. Reassignment to Nonsensitive Position; Mitigation 2656
f. EEO Issue; Whistleblower Reprisal; Disparate Treatment; USERRA 2658
g. Regulatory Infraction During Revocation Process 2661
h. Suspension, Removal Under 5 USC 7532 2668
i. Suitability Determination, Security Clearance Distinguished 2669
j. Sensitive Duties Not Requiring a Clearance: *Conyers* 2669
k. Decisions Postdating *Conyers* 2689
l. Requirement Similar to Security Clearance; Public Trust Position 2692
m. TSA Sensitive Security Information 2695
n. Retirement Issue Related to Removal for Loss of Clearance 2696
5. Lack of Suitability for Continued Employment 2697
6. Mitigation 2698
D. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST; APPARENT CONFLICTS 2698
1. Conflicts; Improper Business Dealings 2699
2. Apparent Conflicts 2701
3. Use of Government Office for Private Gain; Misuse of Position 2702
4. Nonpublic Information 2704
a. Nondisclosure Agreements 2705
5. Transaction With Another; Gift; Bribe; Honorarium; Loan 2706
a. Transaction With Patron, Vendor, Inmate 2706
b. Transaction With Supervisor; Subordinate 2707
c. Compensation for Government Service From Another Source 2708
6. Acting as Agent or Attorney Against Government 2708
E. OUTSIDE EMPLOYMENT 2708
1. Personal Work on Government Time 2708
a. Reporting, Approval Requirements 2708
b. Employment in Violation of Agency Restriction; Outside Practice of Law 2709
F. SPECIAL CATEGORIES OF EMPLOYEES 2709
1. Guard, Correctional Officer, Police, Investigator, Security Official 2709
2. Immigration Officer 2710
3. Ship Employee 2710
4. Supervisor 2710

G. STRIKES 2711
1. Charge of Striking 2711
2. Basis for Removal 2711
3. Proof of Participation 2711
4. Refuting Participation 2712
5. Fear for Personal Safety 2712
a. Insufficient Threat 2713
b. Duress, Coercion Established 2713
6. Association With Strikers 2713
7. Influence of Political Leader 2713
8. Penalty 2713
9. Other Issues 2713
II. RELATIONSHIPS 2714
A. INSUBORDINATION AND SIMILAR MISCONDUCT 2714
1. Refusal or Failure to Perform Work 2715
a. Proof of Intent 2716
2. Failure to Follow Instruction 2717
3. Failure to Follow Policy, Regulation 2718
4. Disruptiveness; Lack of Cooperation 2720
5. Recording of Conversation 2720
6. Cumulative Insubordination 2720
7. Dispute Over Position Responsibilities 2721
a. Difficulty Following Reinstatement 2722
b. Breach of Settlement Agreement 2722
8. Insolence, Abusive Language 2722
a. Abuse of Coworker, Subordinate 2723
b. Abuse of Supervisor; Disrespectful or Coarse Language 2724
c. Disagreement Over Instruction, Program 2726
9. Misuse of Dispute Resolution Procedure 2726
a. EEO Process 2727
b. Congressional Communication 2728
c. Grievance Proceeding 2728
d. Supervisor 2730
e. Interference With Employee Grievance 2730
10. Refusal to Take Fitness Examination 2730
a. Properly Ordered 2731
b. Improperly Ordered 2732
11. Failure to Provide Medical Information; Medical Standards 2735
12. Refusal to Submit to Search or Drug Test 2738
13. Problems During Investigations: Lack of Cooperation; Interference; Self-Incrimination 2741
14. Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence 2751
15. Defenses 2751
a. Inability to Comply 2751
b. Unclear Order; Unknown Policy 2751
c. Constitutional, Similar Challenge 2752
d. Improper Directive; Command Influence 2752
e. Federal Labor Law Policy; Collective Bargaining Contract 2757
f. Fear for Safety or Other Harm 2758
16. Mitigating Factors 2760
B. SEXUAL MISCONDUCT 2762
1. Sexual Harassment; Inappropriate Behavior 2763
a. Past Significance of Psychological Harm 2769
b. Charge Based on Agency Regulation or Standard of Conduct Not Tied to Title VII 2775
c. Physical Contact 2780
d. Offensive Remarks; Photos 2783
e. Consensual Conduct Affecting Workplace 2788
f. Same-Sex Misconduct 2789
2. Misconduct Toward Agency Client, Affiliate 2789
3. Misconduct Toward Child 2790
4. Penalties for Sexual Misconduct 2790
a. Demotion, Suspension 2790

b. Removal 2790
5. Defenses 2791
C. CONDUCT HARMING OTHERS; CRIMINAL VIOLATIONS 2792
1. Threat; Inappropriate Conduct 2793
a. *Metz* Test 2794
b. Reaction of Others to Threat 2797
c. Threat Through Another; Rumor 2798
d. Conditional Threat 2800
e. Statement to Therapist; EEO or EAP Counselor; Accommodation Specialist 2802
f. Statement to Union Representative 2805
g. Threat Against a Coworker 2806
h. Threat Against a Supervisor 2807
i. Threat Against Others 2808
j. Thought of Violence 2808
k. Inappropriate or Disruptive Statement Not Charged as Threat 2808
l. Mitigation 2812
2. Assault 2812
a. Against Coworker 2812
b. Against Supervisor 2813
c. Against Subordinate 2813
d. Against Others 2813
e. Defenses 2814
f. Mitigation; Aggravation 2814
3. Fighting; Self Defense; Provocation 2816
4. Gambling 2818
5. Threat of Legal Action, Whistleblowing, or Publicity 2818
6. Lawsuit 2819
7. Discourtesy; Related Problems 2820
a. Profanity 2821
8. Improper Conduct Toward Patient, Ward, Others 2821
9. Invidious Discrimination; Offensive Remark or Conduct; Preferential Treatment; Reprisal 2823
a. Nepotism; Hiring of Friend 2828
D. ACTION AGAINST SUPERVISOR FOR WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL, OTHER PROHIBITED PRACTICES 2830
E. CRITICAL STATEMENTS 2834
1. Constitutional Framework 2841
a. Private Speech 2844
2. Criticism of Agency or Its Personnel 2845
a. Constitutional Analysis 2845
b. Prohibited Personnel Practice Analysis 2848
c. Defamation; Related Conduct 2850
d. Congressional Communication 2851
e. Political Activity and Speech 2852
f. Concept of Loyalty 2854
3. Internal Criticism 2855
a. Constitutional Analysis 2855
b. Managerial Disagreement 2855
c. Administrative Law Judge; Judicial Independence 2856
d. Criticism, False Statement About Coworker, Subordinate, Supervisor 2856
III. INTEGRITY 2859
A. FALSIFICATION AND MISREPRESENTATION 2859
1. Proof of Fraud; Falsification 2862
a. Neglect or Mistake 2866
b. Perjury 2869
c. Failure to Correct Report of Another 2869
d. Reliance on Advice of Counsel or Other Individual 2869
e. Cumulative False Statements 2871
2. Employment Application; Security Questionnaire; Lack of Candor 2871
a. Criminal Record 2875
b. Education; Experience 2876
c. Pre-Employment Medical Inquiry 2878
3. Compensation Claim; Voucher 2879

a. Overtime 2879
b. Travel Voucher, Related Documentation 2881
c. OWCP Claim 2883
d. Unemployment Compensation 2884
e. Disability or Leave Claim 2884
f. Pay and Allowances Claim 2884
4. Records of Time, Attendance, Work, and Pay 2885
5. Medical Certificate 2888
6. Alteration, Failure to Preserve Documentation and Evidence 2889
7. Investigative Misrepresentation; "Exculpatory No" 2889
8. Lack of Candor 2891
9. Failure to Report Misconduct 2896
10. Disclosure Statement 2896
11. Mitigating, Exculpatory Factors 2897
a. Time, Attendance, Travel Record 2899
b. Medical Certificate 2899
c. Request for Medical Information; ADA 2900
d. Employment Application 2901
B. REMOVAL, MISUSE OF PROPERTY 2902
1. Service Efficiency 2902
2. Burden of Proof 2903
a. Conversion 2904
b. Unauthorized Possession or Removal of Property; Theft 2904
c. Unauthorized Use 2905
d. Common Possession 2906
e. Evidence of Intent: Theft and Unauthorized Possession 2906
3. Petty Theft 2907
a. Shoplifting 2909
b. Custody and Control of Property 2909
4. Government Vehicle 2912
a. Deviation From Assigned Route; Minor Personal Use; Public Service Exception 2917
b. Nonstatutory Vehicle Misuse Charge; Impaired Driver 2917
5. Unauthorized Use, Theft, or Destruction of Specific Property 2918
a. Computer; Internet 2918
b. Photocopier; Facsimile 2920
c. Telephone 2921
d. Government Credit Card 2921
e. Government Services or Funds 2922
f. Government Records; Official Information; Privacy Act; Tax Information; PII; Information Compiled for Use by Attorney 2923
g. Black Marketing; Diversion of Property 2939
h. Obstruction, Theft, or Mistreatment of Mail 2939
i. Misuse of Official Mail, Delivery Service 2940
j. Concealment of Theft 2940
k. Mitigating Factors 2940
IV. DRUGS AND ALCOHOL 2942
A. DRUG POSSESSION, USE, DISTRIBUTION 2943
1. Possession or Use 2943
2. Sale or Distribution 2946
3. Safe Harbor 2947
B. ALCOHOL 2948
C. MITIGATION 2949
V. PERFORMANCE 2953
A. PERFORMANCE AS BASIS FOR ADVERSE ACTION 2953
1. Performance Evaluations 2954
2. Performance Standards 2955
a. *Ad Hoc* Measure 2956
b. Assigned Standard 2958
c. Measurement of Work Error 2959
3. Responsibility for Work Error 2959
4. Mitigating Factors; Choice of Penalty 2960

a. Comparative Performance 2961
b. New Duties 2961
c. Detail, Special Assignment 2963
d. Progressive Discipline 2963
e. Lack of Training 2963
f. Lack of Improvement Period 2963
g. Demotion or Reassignment 2964
h. Suspension 2965
5. Performance-Based Actions Against VA Employees Under 38 USC 714 2965
B. NEGLIGENCE AND SIMILAR CHARGES 2968
1. Endangerment of Employees 2970
2. Public Safety Risk 2971
3. Destruction or Loss of Property 2971
4. Medical Error 2971
5. Mishandling or Improper Possession of Weapon 2972
6. Inattention to Duty; Sleeping on Job 2972
7. Failure to Follow Procedure 2972
a. Submission of Inaccurate Information 2973
8. Excessive Expenditure; Waste 2973
C. MEDICAL INABILITY TO PERFORM 2973
1. Specific Medical or Physical Standard 2983
2. Penalty Analysis 2986
3. Disability Accommodation Analysis 2987
4. Recovery From Disability 2988

VOLUME III

CHAPTER 12: PERFORMANCE ACTIONS 2993
I. UNACCEPTABLE PERFORMANCE CASES 2993
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY PROVISIONS: EMPLOYEE AND AGENCY COVERAGE 2995
1. OPM Regulations 2996
B. OVERVIEW OF PERFORMANCE ACTIONS 2998
1. Merit Pay Employee 3000
C. OPM APPROVAL OF APPRAISAL SYSTEM 3000
1. Change in Appraisal System 3001
2. Flexibility Permitted by Appraisal System; Skeletal Plans 3005
3. Extent of OPM Review; Subordinate Organization Within Agency 3006
4. Change Directed by OPM 3007
D. CRITICAL ELEMENTS 3007
E. PERFORMANCE STANDARD CRITERIA 3008
1. Substantive Right 3009
a. Identification of Critical Element 3010
2. Scope of Review 3010
a. Deference to Agency Management 3011
3. Objectivity 3012
a. Timeliness of Work 3016
b. Draft; Intermediate Work Product; Revisions or Rewrites 3016
c. Personal Characteristic: Initiative, Reliability 3016
4. Standards Development; Employee Involvement 3017
5. *Wilson* and *Jackson*; Negative or "Backwards" Standard 3017
6. Communication of Standard 3021
7. Change in Standard 3022
8. Augmentation of Standard; Subjective Standard; Supervisory Instructions 3023
9. PIP to Establish, Refine Standard 3026
10. Occupations 3029
a. Clerical Employee, Secretary 3029
b. Voucher Examiner 3031
c. Inspector 3031
d. Social Security Claims Representative 3031
e. Employee Relations, Human Relations Specialist 3031
f. Trade Analyst 3032

g. Medical Technologist; Nurse; Physician 3032
h. Scientist 3032
i. Tradesperson 3033
j. IT Specialist 3033
k. Supervisory Supply Technician 3034
l. Engineer 3034
m. Lawyer 3034
n. Paralegal 3034
o. Management Analyst 3034
p. Realty Specialist 3035
q. Others 3035
11. Numeric Standard 3035
12. Multiple Components 3037
13. Classification, Significance of Error 3039
14. Relation of Standards in Element 3039
15. Absolute Standard; *Guillebeau* 3040
a. Law Before *Guillebeau* 3044
b. Standard to Be Viewed as a Whole 3045
c. Modification of Absolute Standard 3046
d. Standard That Enumerates Tasks 3046
e. Level of Performance That May Be Exceeded 3047
16. Unreasonable Standard 3047
17. Levels of Performance 3049
a. Five-Tier Appraisal System; Marginal, Minimally Successful, or "Needs Improvement" Level of Performance 3049
b. Multiple Appraisal Levels Derived From Ratings for Critical Elements 3056
c. Two-Level; Pass/Fail Appraisal System 3057
F. OPPORTUNITY TO IMPROVE; PERFORMANCE IMPROVEMENT PERIOD ("PIP") 3058
1. Prerequisite of Unacceptable Performance; Pre-PIP Performance; *Santos* 3059
2. Opportunity Period Requirements 3062
a. Order, Burden of Proof 3063
b. Control Over Work 3063
c. Assistance to Employee 3063
d. Necessity for Specific Warning 3066
e. Statement of Expectations; Job Responsibilities Not Described in PIP 3066
f. Impossibility of Improvement; Unreasonable Expectations 3066
g. New Standards 3068
h. Harmful Error 3068
3. Time Allowed for Improvement 3069
a. One-Year Maximum for Evaluation; Pre-PIP Performance 3071
b. Post-PIP Performance; Roller Coaster Employees 3073
c. PIP Extension 3076
d. Performance During Detail 3077
G. PROCEDURE 3077
1. Chapter 43 and 75 Actions Distinguished 3077
a. E.O. 13839; E.O. 14003 3078
2. Department of Veterans Affairs 3079
3. Failure to Use Chapter 43 3081
a. *Lovshin*; Combined Action Under Chapters 75 and 43 3081
b. Conversion of Action 3083
4. Limitations on Use of Chapter 43 3087
5. Proposal, Decision Letter 3087
a. Requirement of Concurrence 3087
b. Unstated Charge 3087
c. Necessity for Specific Instances 3088
d. Notice Period 3089
H. NECESSARY PROOF: SUBSTANTIAL EVIDENCE 3090
1. Test Defined; Scope of Review 3090
2. Weight, Quality of Substantial Evidence 3091
a. Charges, Work Papers 3091
b. Effect of Prior Performance Evaluation; Rating Issued in Error 3092
c. Statistics; Sampling Method 3093

d. Other Documentation; Testimony....3095
I. DEFENSES....3095
1. Propriety and Comparison of Performance Standards....3096
2. Comparison of Employees' Performance....3096
3. Adequacy of PIP; Lack of Control of Work; Agency Bad Faith....3097
4. Training....3098
5. Discrimination; Disparate Treatment; Disability and Accommodation....3100
6. Reprisal....3105
7. Collective Bargaining Contract....3106
J. PRECLUSION OF MITIGATION....3106
II. WITHIN-GRADE INCREASE DENIALS....3107
A. BASIS FOR APPEAL....3109
B. WHEN JURISDICTION ATTACHES....3109
1. Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract....3115
a. EEO Allegation....3115
b. Allegation of Other Prohibited Personnel Practice....3116
C. BURDEN OF PROOF....3117
1. Proof of Poor Performance....3117
a. Role of Performance Standards....3118
2. Necessary Proof: Substantial Evidence....3118
a. What Constitutes Evidence....3118
D. DEFENSES....3119
1. Error in ALOC Procedure....3119
a. Linkage of ALOC and Appraisal System....3119
b. Waiting Period....3120
c. Lack of ALOC Determination....3121
d. Vague ALOC Determination....3121
2. Reconsideration Errors....3121
a. Employee Denied Information....3121
b. Reconsideration Summary Lacking....3121
c. Reconsideration Decision Level....3121
d. Late Reconsideration Decision....3122
3. Circumstances of Employee....3122
a. Unfair Work Burden....3122
b. Illness or Disability....3122
c. Comparative Work Production....3122
d. Lack of Training....3122

CHAPTER 13: REDUCTIONS IN FORCE....3123

I. RIF PROCESS....3123
A. NATURE OF RIF....3123
1. Statutory Provisions....3124
2. OPM Regulations, Guidance....3125
a. Validity of RIF Statute, Regulations....3127
3. Furlough....3127
a. Exemptions....3139
b. Emergency Furlough....3141
c. Part-Time, Light Duty Status; Intermittent Appointment; Work Schedule Adjustment....3141
d. Discovery in Furlough Appeal....3143
B. ACTIONS APPEALABLE AS RIF; BOARD JURISDICTION....3144
1. Regulatory Structure....3145
2. Jurisdictional Effect of Collective Bargaining Contract....3146
3. Nature of Appointment....3147
a. Temporary....3147
b. Probationer....3147
c. Demonstration Project....3147
d. Postal Service Non-Preference Eligible....3150
e. Part-Time....3151
f. Senior Executive Service....3152
g. Agencies With Independent Statutory Personnel Authority....3155
4. Possible RIF....3156

5. Action to Avoid RIF 3156
a. Transfer to Another Agency 3156
b. Resignation 3156
c. Retirement 3156
d. Detail 3157
e. Reassignment Without Regard to RIF 3157
(i) Representative Rate 3158
f. Reassignment During or Following RIF 3160
g. Reassignment With Pay Reduction in Anticipation of RIF 3160
(i) Postal Reorganizations: 1990s 3161
(ii) Postal Reorganizations: 2000 Onward 3168
(iii) Other Agencies 3173
6. Grade and Pay Retention; Pay Rate Change; Demotion 3176
7. Classification Issue 3177
a. Erosion of Duties 3179
b. Intentional Changes in Duties 3180
8. Transfer of Function 3181
a. Identification of Positions for Transfer 3183
b. Employee Who Declines to Move 3186
C. COMPETITIVE AREA 3186
1. Defined 3186
2. Criteria 3186
3. Assignment Across Competitive Area 3187
4. Challenge to Competitive Area 3187
a. Burden of Proof 3187
b. Organizational Structure; One-Person RIF 3187
c. Geographical Structure; Local Commuting Area 3190
D. COMPETITIVE LEVEL 3190
1. Defined 3191
2. Challenge to Competitive Level 3192
a. Primacy of Position Description 3193
b. Testimony Concerning Duties 3196
c. Loss of Productivity; Undue Interruption 3197
d. Collective Bargaining Contract 3198
e. Challenge to Performance Appraisal 3198
3. Nature of Appointment 3200
a. Developmental/Trainee 3200
b. Temporary 3200
c. Part-Time 3200
d. VA Health Care Professional 3200
e. Bureau of Indian Affairs; Indian Health Service 3204
4. Competitive Level Error 3204
a. Impact of Error 3204
b. Right to Hearing 3205
c. Substantive Review 3205
II. ASSIGNMENT AND RELATED RIGHTS 3205
A. REGULATORY AND OPERATIONAL BASIS 3205
1. Veteran, Other Preferences 3208
2. Nature of Appointment 3209
a. Excepted Service 3209
b. Detail 3210
c. Intergovernmental Personnel Act 3210
d. Part-Time/Full-Time 3210
3. Position Subject to Displacement 3210
a. Supervisory 3210
b. Temporary 3210
4. Filling of Vacancies 3210
5. Assessment of Qualifications 3213
a. Updating Qualifications 3216
b. Qualifications of Displacing Employee 3216
c. Merit Promotion Issue 3216

d. Undue Interruption 3216
6. Representative Rate 3217
7. Amendment of RIF Notice; Change in Position Offer 3218
B. BUMPING 3219
C. RETREAT 3222
1. Prior Rule 3222
2. Method of Analysis 3222
3. Burden of Proof 3225
D. REEMPLOYMENT RIGHTS 3225
1. Reemployment Priority List Before RIF Effective Date 3237
2. Remedy in Reemployment Priority List Appeal 3239
3. Transitional Assistance 3239
III. RIF CHALLENGES 3240
A. BURDEN OF PROOF 3240
1. Agency Responsibility 3240
2. Agency's *Prima Facie* Case 3240
3. Qualifications; Assignment Right 3241
4. Classification Dispute 3241
B. *BONA FIDE* RIF: *LOSURE* 3242
1. Substantive Rights, Harmful Error 3242
2. RIF as Adverse Action 3245
3. Challenge to Reorganization 3248
a. Reorganization Defined; Single Position RIF 3249
b. Managerial Discretion 3249
c. Funding Decision 3250
d. Redistribution of Duties 3252
e. Planning for Future Events 3252
f. Comparative Qualifications as a Factor in Selection of Positions for RIF 3253
g. Contribution to Agency Mission; Funding of Individual Position 3253
h. Contracting Out Challenge 3254
i. Sham, Paperwork Reorganization: Old, New Position Identical; Delayed Reorganization 3254
j. Merit Promotion, Hiring, Placement During RIF 3257
k. Events Preceding, Subsequent to RIF 3257
C. DISCRIMINATION DEFENSES 3259
1. Age 3263
2. Religion 3264
D. PROCEDURAL ISSUES 3264
1. Internal Procedures 3264
2. Timing of Job Offer; Timing of Release of Employees 3264
3. Correction of Retention Standing Error 3264
4. Adequacy of RIF Notice 3265

CHAPTER 14: HARMFUL ERROR 3267

I. STATUTORY STANDARD 3267
A. HARMFUL ERROR DEFINED 3267
1. *Parker* 3269
2. Might Have/Would Have Analysis 3269
B. HARMFUL ERROR APPLIED 3270
1. Mixing Harmful Error and Other Doctrines 3270
a. Mitigation of Penalty 3270
b. Prohibited Personnel Practice 3271
2. Statutory, Regulatory Violation; Action Not in Accordance With Law 3271
a. Unfair Labor Practice 3273
b. Privacy Act; Disclosure of Confidential Information 3275
c. Constitution 3276
d. Invalid, Conflicting Regulation 3277
3. Collective Bargaining Contract Violation 3277
a. Disputed Coverage 3280
b. Impact of Arbitration Award 3280
c. Employment Contract 3280
4. Problem With Representation 3280

a. Cautionary Notes to Counsel 3281
5. Treatment of Affirmative Defense if Action Is Set Aside as Erroneous 3281
II. ERROR IN PRELIMINARY PROCEDURES 3282
A. AGENCY INVESTIGATION 3282
1. Due Process 3283
2. Right to Counsel; Union Representative 3283
3. Entrapment 3286
4. Agency Predecisional Hearing, Factfinding, Interview 3286
5. Security Clearance Investigation 3287
B. STALE CHARGES; LACHES 3287
1. General Rule 3287
2. Agency Regulation; Collective Bargaining Contract 3290
3. Performance Action 3290
C. ESTOPPEL; DOUBLE JEOPARDY 3290
1. Estoppel 3290
2. Double Jeopardy 3291
a. Reinitiation of a Proposal After an Adverse Action Is Canceled 3299
b. Action Initiated After Earlier Action Invalidated for Procedural Reason 3300
c. Consecutive Adverse Actions 3301
d. Action Following Acquittal 3302
III. ERRORS IN PROPOSAL NOTICE AND REPLY PROCESS 3302
A. BASIC RIGHTS 3302
1. Due Process Provided Following Decision 3304
2. Right to Counsel 3307
B. PROPOSAL NOTICE 3307
1. Purpose, Sufficiency of Notice; Due Process 3307
a. Supporting Evidence 3309
b. Technical Deficiencies 3311
c. Failure to Provide Notice of Appeal or Statutory Right 3311
d. Error in Date 3312
e. Other Minor Error 3312
f. Assessing Sufficiency of Charge 3314
2. Specific Charge; Only Conduct Described 3318
a. Conduct Postdating Proposal 3323
b. Amendment 3323
3. Framing of Charge 3323
a. General Charge; Charge Label; Detailed Narrative; *Otero* and *Cross* 3323
b. Variation Between Stated Charge and Supporting Narrative or Specification; *Nazelrod* and *Lachance* 3327
c. Splitting of Charge 3333
d. Independent Elements of Single Charge 3336
e. Multiple Specifications Supporting a Single Charge 3340
f. Lesser Included Offense 3343
4. Past Discipline; Performance Record; Aggravating Factors 3343
5. Citation of Standards of Conduct 3343
6. Charge Tied to Penalty Table Classification 3343
7. Criminal Charge 3344
8. Mixing Chapters 43 and 75 3345
9. Cumulative Charges; Merger of Charges 3345
10. Charge of Unbecoming, Improper, Inappropriate, or Unprofessional Conduct 3348
C. REPLY AND NOTICE PERIOD 3350
1. Calculation 3350
2. Not Less Than Seven Days for Reply 3351
3. 30-Day Advance Notice of Action 3354
4. Service of Notice 3355
D. SHORTENED NOTICE PERIOD; CRIME PROVISION 3357
1. Procedure to Invoke Shortened Notice 3358
2. Reasonable Belief of Crime 3358
a. Arrest, Warrant 3361
b. Conduct Caused by Mental Impairment 3361
3. Emergency Suspension for Reason Other Than Reasonable Belief of Crime 3361
4. Indefinite Suspension 3362

E. FAILURE TO PROVIDE EVIDENCE FILE, OTHER INFORMATION 3362
1. Loss or Destruction of Evidence 3365
F. ORAL AND WRITTEN REPLIES 3366
1. Proof of Harm; Failure to Consider a Reply; Due Process 3368
a. Investigation of Information Provided by Employee 3375
b. Criminal Proceeding Pending 3376
2. Waiver of Reply Right 3376
a. Extension Request 3376
3. Decisionmaker, Reply Officer 3380
4. Right to Confrontation 3380
5. Right to Information 3380
6. Inadequate Representation 3381
G. AGENCY DECISIONAL PROCEDURES; *EX PARTE* COMMUNICATIONS 3381
1. Early Law From Courts 3381
2. *Sullivan*; Adverse External Influences 3384
3. *Stone*; Broadened Due Process Test; Clarifying or Cumulative Information 3387
a. Reinitiation of Action Following Due Process Reversal 3395
4. Early Law From Board 3396
5. Deciding Official Consults Witness, Advisor; Information Not Disclosed to Employee 3398
a. Information From Witness 3399
b. Impact of 5 USC 2302(b)(2) 3400
c. Report, Investigation 3400
d. Advisor 3400
e. Past Discipline as Rebuttal to Mitigation 3401
f. Multiple Charges 3401
6. Proposing and Deciding Official Confer; Same Proposing and Deciding Official 3402
7. Information Pertaining to Aggravation or Mitigation of Penalty; *Ward*; Confirmatory Information 3404
a. Mitigating Information 3419
b. Cumulative Information 3420
c. Potential Publicity, Notoriety, Other Harm 3421
d. Information or Documents in Evidence File Not Referenced in Proposal 3424
e. Information Provided or Known to Deciding Official Before Reply Process Begins 3425
f. Evaluation of Information Presented During Reply 3427
g. Penalty Table, Standards of Conduct 3429
h. Performance Case 3432
i. *Giglio* Impairment 3434
j. Harmful Error Analysis Before *Ward* 3435
8. Predisposition to Take Adverse Action; Offer to Permit Resignation; Involvement in Proceedings Leading to Proposed Adverse Action 3436
a. Biased Proposing Official 3441
b. Malicious Initiation of Action 3441
c. Deciding Official Who Is Biased, Whose Decision Is Directed, Who Lacks Discretion to Alter Proposed Penalty 3442
9. Involvement of OSC 3445
10. Changes in Proposing, Deciding Official 3445
11. Lack of Authority 3450
a. Deciding Official 3450
b. Proposing Official 3451
12. Pending Retirement Application 3451
13. Decision Letter 3452
a. No Decision Letter 3452
b. Inconsistent Decisions 3452
c. Retroactive Decision 3452
d. Delayed Decision 3453
e. Notice of Appeal Rights 3453

CHAPTER 15: DISCRIMINATION 3455

I. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES RAISED IN BOARD APPEALS 3455
A. PROCEDURES IN MIXED CASES 3456
1. Multiple Agency Review Processes 3458
2. Multiple Filing Options; Pleading Requirements; Timing of Board Appeal 3459
a. Withdrawal or Abandonment of EEO Allegation 3460

b. Authority of Judge to Strike Frivolous EEO Allegation; Summary Judgment 3461
3. Jurisdictional Problems With EEO Complaints 3464
a. Filing Dates 3464
b. Timeliness of EEO Complaint 3466
c. EEO Class Action 3470
d. EEO Complaint Withdrawn 3471
e. What Constitutes a Complaint 3472
f. Coextensive Issues; Scope of Complaint 3473
g. Premature Appeal 3474
h. VA Employees' Appeals From Actions Under 38 USC 714 3474
4. Duty of Judge to Resolve Issues and Inform Appellant of Elements of Proof 3476
5. Jurisdiction Over Appealable Action; Constructive Adverse Action 3477
a. Notice of EEOC Processing Rights Following Mixed-Case Jurisdictional Dismissal 3479
b. Probationers 3479
c. Restoration Appeal Involving Employee Partially Recovered From Compensable Injury 3479
6. Election of Remedies 3480
a. Election Through Collective Bargaining Contract Grievance 3480
b. Election Between EEO and Direct Board Appeal; Treatment of EEO Complaint 3483
c. Effect of Subject Matter of Preexisting Complaint on Subsequent Appeal; Complaint Involving Proposed Action 3484
7. Board Remand; EEOC Remand 3485
8. Strategic Considerations 3488
B. BURDEN OF PROOF 3488
1. *Prima Facie* Case 3491
2. Analysis Following *Prima Facie* Case 3494
a. Analysis of Motivation, Pretext 3497
b. Mixed Motives; Proof That Action Would Have Been Taken Without Discriminatory Motive 3498
c. Element of Intent; Employer Error 3505
d. Significance of Agency's Proof of Charges 3507
e. Significance of Agency's Failure to Prove Charges 3508
f. Comparator; Disparate Treatment 3509
3. Retirement Case: Application by OPM of Statutory Requirements 3516
C. EVIDENCE 3516
1. Direct Evidence; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators; Taint of Agency Official; Cat's Paw 3517
2. Circumstantial Evidence; Pretext; Presumption 3521
3. Disparate Impact 3523
4. Disparate Treatment; "But For" Analysis 3524
5. Statistics 3526
6. Supervisory Practices; Remarks 3527
D. FORMS OF DISCRIMINATION 3528
1. Race 3528
2. Age 3530
3. Religion 3535
a. Mask Requirement 3537
4. Marital Status 3538
5. Pregnancy 3538
6. Sex; Sexual Orientation; Equal Pay Act 3539
E. REPRISAL 3539
1. Convincing Mosaic; Evidence Considered as a Whole; Comparators 3552
2. Collateral Personnel Action of Evidentiary Weight in EEO Affirmative Defense 3556
3. Taint of Reprisal by Lower Level Official; Cat's Paw 3557
4. Participation in EEO Process; Opposition to Discriminatory Practices 3558
II. REHABILITATION ACT: DISABLING CONDITIONS 3560
A. REGULATORY STRUCTURE 3561
1. Reprisal Under ADA 3566
B. *PRIMA FACIE* CASE; ACCOMMODATION REQUIREMENTS 3566
1. Accommodation Must Be Requested 3570
2. Individual Regarded or Perceived as Disabled 3570
3. Individual Associated With Disabled Person 3577
4. Substantial Limitation of Major Life Activity 3577
a. Life Activity of Working 3580

5. Order and Burden of Proof....3584
a. Disparate Treatment....3592
b. Mixed Motive, "But For" Analysis....3593
6. Causal Connection....3597
7. Transitory or Temporary Disability....3599
a. Corrected or Mitigated Condition....3601
8. Limitation on General Employability....3602
a. Allergy....3604
b. Stress Disorder....3606
c. Other Mental Disability; Proof of Disability....3611
9. Conditions Not Protected by Rehabilitation Act....3612
a. Gambling Compulsion....3612
b. Sexual Disorder....3612
c. Pregnancy....3613
10. Qualified Disabled Employee....3613
a. Dangerousness; Risk Assessment; Direct Threat....3615
b. Lack of Medical Release....3621
11. Agency Knowledge of Disability....3621
a. When Disability Claim or Defense Must Be Raised....3622
12. Suggesting Nonapparent Accommodation; Duty of Reasonable Inquiry....3624
a. Interactive Process; Medical Documentation....3626
b. Agency Delay....3630
C. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH JOB RESTRUCTURING, ASSISTANCE....3630
1. Light Duty and Job Modification....3630
a. Lifting Requirement....3635
b. Postal Service Collective Bargaining Contracts....3637
c. Inappropriate Job Modification; Increased Job Burden....3638
2. Provision of, Modification to, Job Equipment....3638
3. Alteration of Work Schedule, Worksite; Leave; Telework....3640
4. Alteration of Training, Education Requirement....3652
D. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH REASSIGNMENT....3653
1. *Ignacio*....3655
2. Evaluation of Reassignment Effort....3658
a. Reassignment Across Organizational Lines....3663
3. Collective Bargaining Contract....3670
4. Agency Regulation....3670
5. Restoration From Compensable Injury....3671
6. Demotion; Promotion....3671
E. ACCOMMODATION THROUGH MEANS OTHER THAN JOB MODIFICATION OR REASSIGNMENT....3672
1. Modification of Agency Policy, Facility....3672
2. Job Training; Change in Supervision....3673
3. Referral for Counseling....3676
F. AGENCY DEFENSES....3677
1. Disqualifying Misconduct....3677
2. Undue Hardship....3679
a. Unreasonable Accommodation....3682
b. Restrictions in Collective Bargaining Contract....3683
3. Lack of Qualification for Position....3685
a. Failure to Provide Evidence of Fitness for Position With Medical Standard....3686
4. Receipt of Disability Annuity....3687
5. Rebuttal....3687
6. Restriction on Remedy....3687
G. ALCOHOLISM AND SUBSTANCE ABUSE....3688
1. Necessity for Accommodation: *Ruzek*....3689
a. Suitability....3691
b. Postal Service Employee....3692
2. Notice of Disability....3692
a. Agency Request for Information....3692
3. Proof of Disease....3693
4. Causal Connection: Misconduct Caused by Disease....3694
a. Alcohol or Drug Use on Job....3697

b. Revocation of Driver's License 3698
c. Possession of Drugs 3698
d. Misappropriation or Theft of Drugs 3699
e. Misappropriation of Funds 3699
5. Qualified Disabled Employee; *Hougens* and Disqualifying Conduct 3700
a. Current Substance Abuser 3703
b. Disqualifying Misconduct: Removal Appropriate 3705
c. Less Serious Conduct: Concurrent Rehabilitation, Discipline 3709
6. Firm Choice, Last Chance Agreement 3710
a. Requirement of Collective Bargaining Contract, Agency Regulation 3713
7. Failed Rehabilitation Attempt 3715
8. Undue Hardship Defense 3718
III. VENUES FOR FURTHER REVIEW OF EEO DEFENSE 3718
A. EEOC 3718
B. SPECIAL PANEL 3719
C. EFFECT OF DISTRICT COURT REVIEW 3727

CHAPTER 16: PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES 3731

I. OVERVIEW 3731
A. SIGNIFICANCE OF DISCOVERY 3733
II. TYPES OF PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES 3734
A. WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL 3736
1. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act of 2012 3738
2. Statutory Definitions Control; Multiple Disclosures, Personnel Actions 3740
a. "Gross" Waste or Mismanagement 3741
b. Violation of Law, Rule, or Regulation 3749
c. Abuse of Authority 3758
d. Threat to Public Health and Safety 3765
e. Disclosure of Censorship Related to Research, Analysis, or Technical Information 3793
3. Form of Whistleblowing 3793
a. Disclosure of Harm or Wrongdoing; Potential Harm; "Real and Immediate" 3793
b. Complaint to Wrongdoer 3794
c. Disclosure to Someone Who Cannot Directly Remedy Problem 3797
d. Minor Personal Grievance 3799
e. Internal, Policy Disagreement 3799
f. Disclosure Made During Normal Course of Duties 3806
g. Normal Duties Not Including Investigation and Disclosure of Wrongdoing; Post-WPEA 3820
h. Required Report Under Office of Government Ethics Rules, E.O. 12675 3822
i. Communication Indirectly Involving Government; Private Wrongdoing 3822
j. Communication to News Media; Congress 3827
k. Disclosure in Court 3828
l. Complaint, Testimony to Inspector General, OSC, Internal Investigative Unit, EEO Office; 5 USC 2302(b)(9)(C) 3829
m. Disclosure of Information Already Known or Public 3833
n. Sequential Allegations 3836
4. Whistleblowing No Shield Against Misconduct 3836
a. Abusive Whistleblower; Robust Language; Chain of Command 3837
5. Personnel Treated as Whistleblowers 3841
a. Individual Perceived as Whistleblower; Disclosure Made on Behalf of Another Person 3841
b. Threatened Disclosure 3847
c. Whistleblower's Aide, Associate 3849
d. Individual Serving as Conduit of Information; Internal Disclosure 3850
e. Former Employee 3851
f. Contractor Employee 3851
6. Protected Disclosure: Reasonableness 3853
a. "Reasonably Believes"; False Statement 3853
b. Motivation of Whistleblower 3861
c. Information Developed After Disclosure 3861
d. Belief Shared by Other Employees; Disinterested Observer 3862
e. Response of Agency to Disclosure 3863
f. Expertise of Whistleblower 3863
g. Specificity of Disclosure 3865

h. Presumed Agency Good Faith; "Irrefragable Proof" Standard 3868
7. Dispute Concerning Coverage of Disclosure Under 2302(b)(8) or 2302(b)(9) 3871
8. Disclosures Not Protected or Covered by Whistleblower Law 3874
a. Disclosure Prohibited by Law; E.O. 13526 3874
b. EEO Complaint, Allegations; *Holman* and Coverage Under 5 USC 2302(b)(9)(C) 3884
c. Other Appeals, Charges, FECA Claims, Grievances, and Complaints 3894
9. Disclosures in Multiple Forums 3898
B. PROHIBITED PRACTICES OTHER THAN WHISTLEBLOWING REPRISAL 3901
1. Discrimination; 5 USC 2302(b)(1) 3901
a. Sexual Harassment 3901
2. Improper Personnel Recommendation; 5 USC 2302(b)(2) 3902
3. Obstruction of Competition; 5 USC 2302(b)(4) 3902
4. Influencing Employment Decision; 5 USC 2302(b)(5) 3903
5. Improper Employment Preference; 5 USC 2302(b)(6) 3903
6. 5 USC 2302(b)(9); Appeal Rights; Grievance, Complaint; Union Activity; Unlawful Order 3906
a. Refusal, Failure to Obey an Order 3915
b. Union Activity Under WPEA 3918
c. WPEA: Exercise of, Testimony or Assistance in, Appeal, Complaint, or Grievance 3919
7. Discrimination Unrelated to Job Performance; 5 USC 2302(b)(10) 3922
8. Discrimination Against Veteran; 5 USC 2302(b)(11) 3924
9. Violation of Merit System Principle; 5 USC 2302(b)(12) 3924
a. Failure to Provide Effective Training; Required Training on Whistleblowing Protections 3928
10. Nondisclosure Requirement, Agreement; 5 USC 2302(b)(13) 3929
11. Improperly Accessing Medical Record of Employee or Applicant; 5 USC 2302(b)(14) 3930
III. INDIVIDUAL RIGHT OF ACTION 3930
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS AND LIMITATIONS 3932
1. Complaint to OSC 3939
a. OSC Deferral Policy on EEO Charge 3940
b. Proceeding to Compel OSC Action 3940
c. Individual Right of Action Against OSC 3943
2. Time for Initiating IRA Appeal With OSC and Board 3944
a. Laches in Filing OSC Complaint 3945
b. Case That May Be Either Initiated With OSC or Appealed Directly to Board 3947
c. Premature Appeal Following Resort to OSC 3948
d. Belated Receipt of OSC Closeout Notice 3949
e. Calculation of Appeal Period; Late IRA Appeal; Waiver 3950
f. Equitable Tolling 3952
g. OSC Reopening 3956
B. JURISDICTIONAL ISSUES 3959
1. Exhaustion of Remedies; Amendment of Appeal 3960
2. Election and Preclusion of Remedies; Managers and Supervisors; Notice of Rights 3964
a. Grievance or Board Appeal 3967
b. IRA Appeal, Direct Appeal of Otherwise Appealable Action Distinguished; Issue Preclusion 3970
c. EEO Complaint 3975
3. *Rusin* Model: Nonfrivolous Allegations Establish Jurisdiction; *Hessami* 3976
a. Nonfrivolous Allegations Based on Written Record; Specificity 3982
4. Jurisdictional Analysis Before *Rusin* 3984
5. Hearing 3986
6. Variations in Order of Proof; Necessity to Develop Evidence, Consider Entire Record; *Whitmore* 3987
7. Collateral Jurisdiction Over EEO Claim Presented in IRA Appeal Not Involving Otherwise Appealable Action 3997
8. Limited Jurisdiction Over Merits Determination, Collateral Prohibited Personnel Practice, Constitutional, Discrimination, and Harmful Error Claims in Otherwise Appealable Action Initiated Through OSC as IRA 3997
9. Particular Agencies and Employees 4000
a. Postal Service 4001
b. Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee 4002
c. Department of Veterans Affairs; 38 USC 714 4007
d. National Guard Technician; 2017 NDAA 4007
e. Federal Bureau of Investigation 4010
f. Judicial Branch 4015
g. Federal Reserve Board 4015
h. NAF Employee 4015

i. Independent Counsel 4017
j. Office of Special Counsel 4017
k. Inspector General Office 4017
l. Federal Aviation Administration 4018
m. Transportation Security Agency 4018
n. Intelligence, Counterintelligence Agencies; Foreign National 4021
o. Government Corporation 4024
p. Other Entities 4024
q. Experts and Consultants; Personnel Appointed Outside Title 5 4025
r. Lawyer 4027
s. Former Employee 4027
t. Employee of Agency Other Than Agency Charged With Reprisal 4028
u. Private Sector Employee; Applicant for Employment 4030
v. Uniformed Service 4031
w. Administrator of Federal Benefits 4032
x. Schedule F and Policy/Career Schedule Employees; Policy Positions 4033
10. Retroactivity of 1989 Whistleblower Amendments; Continuing Violation 4033
C. PLEADING REQUIREMENTS 4034
1. Duty of Judge to Inform Appellant of Jurisdictional Requirements 4034
2. Specificity of Underlying Disclosure 4036
3. Pleading to OSC 4040
a. Classification or Labeling of Disclosure Not Required 4049
b. Curative Filing With OSC 4053
c. Proof of Scope of Complaint Made to OSC; Post-Complaint Submission 4053
d. Information First Submitted With PFR 4058
e. Serial Complaints to OSC 4058
f. OSC Closeout Letter 4058
4. Pleading to Board 4059
D. COVERED AND EXCLUDED PERSONNEL ACTIONS 4062
1. Threatened Personnel Action 4062
a. Proposed Action 4066
2. Failure to Take Personnel Action 4067
a. Failure to Renew Appointment; Failure to Reinstate 4069
3. Performance Appraisal, Rating; Evaluation of Qualifications or Abilities 4069
4. Award and Acts Preliminary to Award 4070
5. Denial of Within-Grade Increase 4071
6. Promotion, Appointment 4071
7. Decision Concerning Leave; Change in Duties; Idling; Overtime; Harassment 4072
a. Degree of Significance of Change of Duties, Responsibilities, or Working Conditions; *Skarada* 4074
b. Hostile Environment 4079
c. Performance Standards, Requirements 4083
8. Reprimand; Admonition; Counseling; Performance Warning; Performance Improvement Period 4083
9. Suspension 4088
10. Probationary Termination 4088
11. Reemployed Annuitant 4089
12. Reassignment, Transfer, and Detail 4090
13. Mental Fitness Examination or Testing 4092
14. Other Investigations 4092
15. Security Clearance Suspension, Revocation; Other Certification 4097
16. Training 4102
17. Defamatory Statement; Tort; Arrest; False Allegation; Blacklisting 4103
18. Reduction in Force 4104
19. Classification Issue 4105
20. Constructive Adverse Action 4105
a. Action Arising During Compliance Proceedings 4110
21. Action Affecting Private Sector Employment Opportunity 4110
22. Other Action 4111
E. REMEDIES 4113
1. Transfer 4115
IV. CASES BROUGHT BY OSC 4115
A. STATUTORY BASES 4116

1. Corrective Action Petition; Stay 4116
2. Disciplinary Complaint 4118
3. Board Authority in Disciplinary, Corrective Action Case 4118
4. Judicial or Administrative Finding of Discrimination by Federal Employee; 5 USC 1216(a)(5) 4118
5. Hatch Act; FOIA Violation 4119
B. OSC OPERATIONS 4122
1. Organizational Structure 4122
2. Disclosures to OSC 4123
3. Board Referral to OSC 4123
C. RIGHT TO COUNSEL IN OSC INVESTIGATION 4124
D. OSC DISCIPLINARY ACTION 4125
1. Limits on Prosecutorial Authority 4125
a. Employee Who Takes or Recommends Personnel Action 4127
b. Prior Resort to Agency-Employer for Disciplinary Action 4127
2. OSC Complaint 4128
3. Rights of Employee, Respondent 4129
4. OSC Subpoena; Discovery Procedures 4129
5. Hearing by Administrative Law Judge; Board Review 4130
6. Disciplinary Penalty 4130
E. OSC CORRECTIVE ACTION PETITION 4135
1. Regulatory Provisions 4137
F. LITIGATION WITH OSC 4138
1. Purpose of Board Hearing 4138
a. Obtaining Records 4138
b. Evidence From Other Investigation 4138
c. Dismissal of OSC Action 4138
2. Settlement 4138
V. BURDEN OF PROOF IN REPRISAL CASE 4139
A. ANALYSIS UNDER WHISTLEBLOWER PROTECTION ACT 4139
1. Analysis Required by Judge; Affirmative Defense; IRA Appeal 4139
2. Statutory, Regulatory Provisions 4140
3. Contributing Factor Analysis 4141
a. Order of Proof 4143
b. *Per Se* Timing/Knowledge Test 4144
c. Evidence Other Than Timing 4150
d. Knowledge by Agency Manager of Appellant's Whistleblowing; Constructive Knowledge; Cat's Paw; Secondary Evidence of Agency Reprisal 4155
e. Disclosure After Personnel Action; Action Contemplated and in Preparation 4163
f. Settlement Offer 4166
g. Significance of Retaliatory Investigation; Appellant Initiates Investigation; *Marano* 4166
h. Charge Arising Out of Conduct During Retaliatory Investigation 4176
i. OSC Corrective Action Case 4179
j. Otherwise Appealable Action 4180
4. Agency's Clear and Convincing Evidence; *Carr* Factors 4180
a. Definition of "Clear and Convincing" Evidentiary Standard Before Whistleblower Protection Act 4200
b. Constructive Adverse Action 4201
c. Nondisciplinary Cases: Nonselection; Nonpromotion; Reassignments; Changes in Duties 4201
5. Evidence of Reprisal 4203
a. Strength of Agency's Case; Probationer; Term Employee; Reemployed Annuitant 4205
b. Strength of Motive to Retaliate; Harm to Agency Reputation 4211
c. Comparator Employees 4213
d. Preliminary Reprisal Leading to Personnel Action 4220
e. Shifting or Belated Explanations for Agency Action 4220
B. ANALYSIS FOR PROHIBITED PRACTICES NOT COVERED BY WPA, WPEA; VIOLATIONS OF 5 USC 2302(B)(9) 4221
1. *Mt. Healthy* 4224
2. Importance of Untainted Deciding Official 4227
3. Timing of Action 4229
4. Severity of Charged Misconduct 4230
5. Discipline Related to Refusal of Reassignment 4231
6. Reprisal Against Individual Involved in Union Activity 4231
7. Performance Case 4236

8. OSC and Agency Disciplinary Case Against Individual Charged With Reprisal 4237
a. Analysis by Agency Deciding Official 4243
C. DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS 4243
VI. STAYS OF PERSONNEL ACTIONS 4244
A. STAY THROUGH INDIVIDUAL APPEAL 4244
1. Basis for Stay Sought by Appellant 4246
a. Intervention by OPM 4249
2. Scope of Stay 4249
3. Board Review of Judge's Stay Decision 4249
B. STAY THROUGH OSC PROCEEDING 4249
1. Statutory, Regulatory Provisions 4251
2. Initial Stay 4254
a. Potential for Disruption by Employee's Return to Workplace 4256
b. Obtaining Clarification of Stay Order 4256
3. Extension of Stay 4256
a. Indefinite Stay 4260
4. Proof Supporting Stay Application 4260
5. Nature of Relief 4260
a. Hostile Environment; Protective Order 4262
b. Restraint on Employee Communication With OSC, Congress 4264
6. Termination of Stay 4266
7. Relation of Stay and Appeal Proceedings 4267
8. Use of Stay to Protect Other Proceeding 4267
a. EEO Case 4267
b. Union Rights Under Statute 4267
9. Effect of Prior Settlement Agreement 4267
10. Employees Covered by Stay 4268
a. SES 4268
b. Presidential Appointee; Policymaker 4268
c. At Will Employee; Reemployed Annuitant 4268
d. Former Agency Employee 4268
C. DEPARTMENT OF VETERANS AFFAIRS 4268

CHAPTER 17: RETIREMENT 4271

I. OVERVIEW OF PRINCIPAL RETIREMENT SYSTEMS 4272
A. BACKGROUND AND HISTORY 4273
B. CONVERSIONS; COVERAGE ERRORS 4275
II. FEDERAL EMPLOYMENT 4276
A. EFFECT OF REEMPLOYMENT 4278
III. COVERED AND CREDITABLE SERVICE 4278
A. SERVICE REQUIREMENTS 4281
B. WHEN-ACTUALLY-EMPLOYED; SEASONAL EMPLOYEE; LEAVE WITHOUT PAY; PART-TIME 4283
C. INDEFINITE APPOINTMENT 4285
D. TEMPORARY EMPLOYMENT 4286
E. PERSONAL SERVICE CONTRACT 4286
F. NONAPPROPRIATED FUND 4292
G. OTHERS 4293
H. EFFECT OF MILITARY SERVICE; DEPOSIT FOR MILITARY SERVICE 4293
1. National Guard, Other Uniformed Service 4312
a. Abandonment of Civilian Career for Military Service 4313
I. PERIOD OF RECEIPT OF OWCP BENEFITS 4318
J. SICK LEAVE CREDIT 4320
IV. DISABILITY RETIREMENT 4320
A. STATUTORY, REGULATORY STANDARDS 4321
1. Concept of Disability 4324
2. Cause of Disability 4326
3. Medical Condition Postdating Disability Retirement 4327
B. DISABILITY INCURRED WHILE IN FEDERAL SERVICE 4327
1. Preexisting Condition 4327
C. POSITION LAST OCCUPIED 4327
1. Qualifying Position 4328

D. DISABILITY MUST CONTINUE AT LEAST ONE YEAR 4328
1. Possible Future Disability 4330
E. SITUATIONAL OR TRANSITORY CONDITION; HOSTILE ENVIRONMENT; SUBSEQUENT WORK HISTORY 4331
1. Workplace Stressor May Be Sufficient 4332
2. Workplace Stressor May Be Insufficient 4333
3. Alcoholism or Drug Addiction; Inability to Control Condition 4334
F. PARTIAL DISABILITY DOES NOT QUALIFY 4335
G. NEW CONDITION RAISED WITH JUDGE OR IN PFR; CONDITION THAT SHOULD HAVE BEEN CONSIDERED BY OPM 4335
1. Evidence of Progression of Disease Presented in PFR 4336
H. REASSIGNMENT IN LIEU OF DISABILITY RETIREMENT 4336
1. Adequacy of Position Offered Through Reassignment 4337
2. Permanent Light Duty Position 4339
3. Postal Service: Different Craft 4343
4. OWCP Position Suitability Determination 4345
I. EFFECT OF DISABILITY ACCOMMODATION ON ANNUITY ENTITLEMENT 4346
1. Conflicting Agency Evidence Concerning Accommodation 4347
J. NECESSITY FOR CESSATION OF PAY OR SEPARATION FROM FEDERAL SERVICE 4348
K. ONE YEAR FOR DISABILITY RETIREMENT APPLICATION 4348
1. Waiver; Tolling; Separation for Medical Reason: Notice Not Provided 4350
2. Waiver; Mental Incompetence 4354
3. Technical Constructions Concerning Filing Date: Method of Filing; Filing With Former Agency 4359
L. AGENCY-INITIATED DISABILITY RETIREMENT APPLICATION 4362
1. Service Credit Requirement 4364
M. APPLICATION AFTER EMPLOYEE'S DEATH 4364
N. BAR TO CONCURRENT RECEIPT OF DISABILITY RETIREMENT, OWCP BENEFIT 4364
O. WITHDRAWAL OF DISABILITY RETIREMENT APPLICATION 4365
P. EVIDENCE OF DISABILITY 4366
1. Scope of Board Review; *Chavez* 4367
2. Significance of Position Description, Qualification Requirements 4371
3. Objective Medical Evidence 4371
4. Content of Medical Report 4372
5. Lack of Evidence of Precise Medical Causation Not Determinative 4373
6. *Mullins-Howard*: Disability Established Without Unduly Detailed Medical Causation Analysis 4376
7. Subjective Evidence 4381
8. Testimony of Supervisor; Performance Appraisal 4381
9. Hearsay 4381
10. Absence; Use of Leave 4381
11. Post-Separation Medical Evidence 4382
12. Medical Condition Not Presented to OPM 4384
13. Removal for Physical Inability to Perform; *Bruner*; Settlement 4385
14. Loss of Military Status 4391
15. OWCP Determination 4392
16. Social Security Administration Determination 4392
17. VA Disability Rating 4395
18. Security Clearance Determination 4395
19. Agency Medical Disqualification 4396
20. Removal for Misconduct 4397
Q. REFUSAL TO UNDERGO DIAGNOSTIC OR OTHER PROCEDURE, TREATMENT 4398
1. Possible Improvement Through Future Surgery or Treatment 4399
R. SPECIFIC CONDITIONS 4399
S. EARNINGS RECOVERY 4400
1. Current Rate of Pay 4402
2. Basic Pay; Cost of Living Adjustment 4403
3. Bonus 4404
4. Miscellaneous Income 4404
5. Business Expense 4405
6. Pension Contribution 4405
T. DECLINE OF EARNINGS 4405
1. Discontinued Service Annuity Upon Recovery of Earning Capacity 4405
U. CONVERSION FROM DISABILITY TO OPTIONAL RETIREMENT 4406

V. CONVERSION FROM OPTIONAL TO DISABILITY RETIREMENT....4406
W. RESCISSION OF DISABILITY RETIREMENT GRANT....4406
X. RECOVERY FROM DISABILITY: BURDEN OF PROOF....4407
1. Restoration of Annuity....4408
Y. CALCULATION OF ANNUITY....4409
Z. LOSS OF ANNUITY FOR CERTAIN OFFENSES....4410
V. DEATH BENEFITS; LUMP SUM PAYMENTS....4412
A. SUBMISSION OF DESIGNATION....4419
1. Signature Requirement....4422
B. CHILD WHO QUALIFIES TO RECEIVE ANNUITY OR LUMP SUM PAYMENT....4422
C. OTHER DISTRIBUTIONS....4423
1. Slayer Statute....4423
D. TIME FOR APPLICATION....4424
VI. SURVIVOR ANNUITIES....4424
A. ELIGIBILITY OF EMPLOYEE FOR RETIREMENT AS CONDITION TO ANNUITY....4427
B. APPLICATION FOR ANNUITY....4428
C. TIME, METHOD OF ELECTION....4429
1. Effect of Remarriage After Retirement....4431
2. Notice to Annuitant of Necessity to Notify OPM of Remarriage to Secure Annuity....4431
3. Delay in Notice to OPM of Annuity Election....4432
4. Lack of Proper Notice From OPM Concerning Annuity Election....4433
5. Incorrect Information From Employing Agency Concerning Annuity Election....4444
6. Annuity Election Form; Signature; Submission....4447
7. Effect of Mental Incompetence on Timeliness of Election....4448
8. Authority to Act on Behalf of Incompetent Employee to Create Annuity....4450
9. Employee Mentally Incompetent to Make Adverse Election; Fraud....4451
10. Community Property Interests....4454
D. MARITAL STATUS; COMMON LAW MARRIAGE; QUALIFYING WIDOW....4455
1. Putative Spouse....4457
E. MARRIAGE OF AT LEAST NINE MONTHS; PARENT OF ISSUE BY MARRIAGE; EXCEPTIONS....4459
1. Accidental Death....4460
F. BENEFITS FOR CHILDREN....4461
1. Child Incapable of Self-Support....4461
2. Child in School....4468
G. CALCULATION....4469
1. Survivor Annuity Based on Disability Annuity....4469
2. Health Benefits....4471
3. Social Security Benefit Offset—CSRS....4471
4. Social Security Benefit—FERS....4473
H. CONSENT OF SPOUSE TO WAIVER OF SURVIVOR ANNUITY....4474
1. Consent by Current Spouse to Discontinue Survivor Annuity....4480
2. Attempt to Modify Amount of Spousal Survivor Annuity....4482
3. Consent by Current Spouse for Former Spouse Annuity....4483
VII. DISCONTINUED SERVICE ANNUITY....4483
VIII. LAW ENFORCEMENT RETIREMENT....4492
A. PROCESS OF DETERMINING AND APPEALING LEO STATUS....4493
B. AGENCY HEAD DETERMINATION; TIMELINESS OF REQUEST FOR LEO, AIR TRAFFIC CONTROL STATUS....4495
C. SUBSTANTIVE CRITERIA FOR LEO DETERMINATION....4505
1. Customs and Border Patrol Officers....4518
2. Decisions Before 2000....4521
D. EVIDENCE CONSIDERED....4525
E. SUPERVISORY CREDIT....4528
F. MILITARY SERVICE....4531
G. EFFECT OF DISABILITY RETIREMENT....4532
IX. FIREFIGHTER RETIREMENT....4533
X. AIR TRAFFIC CONTROLLER RETIREMENT....4541
XI. OTHER ANNUITY INTERESTS....4541
A. DEFERRED ANNUITY....4541
B. FERS MINIMUM RETIREMENT AGE ANNUITY....4542
C. SUPPLEMENTAL, REDETERMINED ANNUITY....4543
D. ALTERNATIVE FORM OF ANNUITY....4547

E. VOLUNTARY EARLY RETIREMENT AUTHORITY; RETIREMENT INCENTIVE 4550
XII. APPORTIONMENT OF ANNUITY BY COURT ORDER 4552
A. LIFETIME ANNUITY 4552
B. FORMER SPOUSE SURVIVOR ANNUITY 4554
1. Intent to Create Former Spouse Survivor Annuity or Other Benefit 4556
2. Reduction in Lifetime Annuity 4559
3. Apportionment of Supplemental Annuity 4560
4. Wording of Decree 4563
5. Ambiguous Provision in Divorce Decree; Extrinsic Evidence; Rules of Construction 4565
C. CHALLENGE TO COURT ORDER AFFECTING ANNUITY INTEREST 4569
1. Qualifying Court Order 4571
2. Bifurcated Decree 4581
D. AMENDMENT TO COURT ORDER AFFECTING FORMER SPOUSE ANNUITY; CONSTRUCTION OF ANNUITY INTEREST FOLLOWING INEFFECTIVE AMENDMENT 4584
E. SPOUSE EQUITY ACT OF 1984 AS AMENDED 4596
XIII. ANNUITY CALCULATION ISSUES 4598
A. ESTOPPEL AS BASIS TO CREATE, CONTINUE, OR ADJUST BENEFIT OR OVERPAYMENT 4598
B. REFUND 4600
C. REDEPOSIT; SERVICE CREDIT UPON REEMPLOYMENT 4609
1. Personal Service Agreement 4613
D. HIGH THREE SALARY CALCULATION: BASIC PAY; LUMP SUM BACK PAY SETTLEMENT 4614
E. ONSET OF DISABILITY ANNUITY PAYMENT 4617
F. VA MEDICAL PROFESSIONAL; VA BENEFIT REDUCTION FOR MILITARY RETIREMENT PAY 4620
G. ANNUITY REDUCTION FOR VA EMPLOYEES REMOVED FOR DEFINED PERFORMANCE OR MISCONDUCT 4620
H. LAW ENFORCEMENT ENHANCED ANNUITY RATE 4621
I. MINIMUM, MAXIMUM ANNUITY 4621
J. ANNUITY ALLOTMENT 4621
K. IMPACT OF RECEIPT OF MEDICARE BENEFITS, SOCIAL SECURITY ON CSRS, FERS 4621
L. DEPOSIT FOR CREDITABLE SERVICE; ANNUITY SUPPLEMENT 4624
M. INTEREST 4625
N. TAXES 4626
O. COST OF LIVING ADJUSTMENT FOR REINSTATED ANNUITY 4626
P. DIVERSION OF ANNUITY PAYMENT 4627
Q. REEMPLOYED ANNUITANT 4627
R. INDIVIDUAL RETIREMENT RECORD 4627
S. EXCESS DEDUCTIONS 4630
T. RECONSTRUCTING EMPLOYMENT RECORD 4630
XIV. OVERPAYMENTS 4631
A. PROVING DEBT; EVIDENCE SUPPORTING WAIVER; OPM RECORDS 4631
B. BASIS FOR WAIVER 4633
1. Annuitant Without Fault and Recovery Against Equity and Good Conscience 4635
2. Knowledge of Overpayment; Set-Aside Rule 4639
3. OPM Fault in Creating Overpayment 4641
4. Unconscionability of Recovery; Recovery Delay 4642
5. Financial Hardship 4647
6. Ordinary and Necessary Living Expenses; Future Events 4649
7. Assets Available to Satisfy Overpayment; Income/Expense Margin 4650
8. Detrimental Reliance; Set Aside Rule 4651
9. Adjustment of Repayment Schedule; Length of Recovery 4655
10. Calculation of Overpayment; Interest 4656
11. Recovery Schedule Adjustment When There Is No Annuity Entitlement 4657
12. Collection From Survivor for Debt of Original Annuitant 4657
13. Insurance Issue Related to Overpayment 4660
XV. OFFSETS; DEBT COLLECTION FROM ANNUITY 4662

VOLUME IV

CHAPTER 18: RESTORATION RIGHTS 4669
I. RESTORATION RIGHTS UPON RECOVERY FROM OCCUPATIONAL INJURY OR ILLNESS 4669
A. SEPARATION OR FURLOUGH MUST RESULT FROM COMPENSABLE INJURY 4672
1. Separation for Reason Other Than Result of Injury or Illness 4675

a. Factual Determination on Cause of Separation 4681
b. Termination When OWCP Determination Supports Employee's Refusal to Return to Work 4683
c. AWOL Covered by Period of Compensation 4686
d. Effect of Resignation 4686
e. Separation by Settlement Agreement 4687
B. SIGNIFICANCE OF OWCP DETERMINATION; RECEIPT OF COMPENSATION 4687
1. Requirement of Medical Examination 4691
C. MEANING OF "RECOVERY" 4692
1. Fully Recovered Within a Year 4694
2. Fully Recovered After a Year 4696
a. Priority Consideration: Necessity for Position to Be Filled by Another Person 4698
b. Geographic Extent of Consideration 4700
c. Method, Duration of Priority Consideration 4701
3. Partially Recovered 4701
a. Geographic Extent of Consideration: Local Commuting Area 4708
b. Arbitrary or Capricious Restoration Effort 4711
c. Accommodation Requirement; Disability Discrimination 4714
d. Postal Service Rules; *Latham; Cronin* 4717
e. Discontinuation of Modified Assignment 4732
4. Physically Disqualified Employee 4732
a. Geographic Extent of Consideration 4734
D. NATURE OF APPOINTMENT 4734
1. Probationer 4735
2. Reemployed Annuitant 4735
3. Postal Service 4736
4. Nonappropriated Fund 4739
E. WHEN RESTORATION IS TO OCCUR 4739
1. Light Duty 4741
2. Effect of Disability Retirement 4741
F. TIME TO APPLY FOR RESTORATION 4743
1. Form of Restoration Request 4744
II. REMEDY 4745
A. SAME OR EQUIVALENT POSITION 4746
1. Return to *Status Quo* 4746
2. Interim Promotion 4747
B. REGRADED POSITION 4748
C. SENIORITY INAPPLICABLE 4748
D. PRIORITY PLACEMENT PROGRAM 4748
E. BENEFITS UPON RESTORATION 4750
III. BOARD APPEAL RIGHTS 4756
A. TIME FOR APPEAL 4756
1. Lack of Notice of Appeal Rights 4756
2. Settlement 4757
B. BURDEN OF PROOF; JURISDICTIONAL ALLEGATIONS 4757

CHAPTER 19: ATTORNEY FEES 4761

I. ENTITLEMENT STANDARDS 4761
A. STATUTORY AND REGULATORY BASIS FOR FEES 4761
1. Use of Counsel; Licensure 4762
2. Governing Statutes and Regulation 4765
a. Civil Rights Statutes 4766
b. Whistleblower Protection Act 4767
3. Jurisdiction Over Action Under Appeal 4767
4. Miscellaneous Appeals 4767
a. Regulation Review Proceeding 4767
b. Retirement Appeal 4767
c. OSC Case: Prohibited Personnel Practice and Hatch Act Litigation 4768
5. Sanction 4778
B. PREVAILING PARTY STATUS 4778
1. Mitigation 4781
2. Other Relief 4781

3. Must Prevail Through Board Procedures....4783
a. Mixed-Motive Determination....4783
4. Cancelation of Action Appealed; Mootness....4784
a. Enforcement Proceeding....4791
5. Settlement....4794
a. Prevailing Party Status Through Settlement....4794
b. Relief Through Settlement Must Relate to Board Appeal....4796
c. Interest of Justice Criteria....4797
d. Jurisdiction to Accept and Enforce Settlement Providing for Fees or Supporting Fee Motion....4797
C. INTEREST OF JUSTICE: OVERVIEW....4802
1. *Allen* Criteria....4802
a. Financial Hardship....4803
2. Preservation of Claims Supporting Entitlement; Significance of Final Merits Decision....4803
a. Overlapping Fee Entitlement Standards....4803
3. Statutory Examples Not Exclusive....4804
D. BAD FAITH....4804
1. Malicious Action; Inadequate Inquiry....4805
2. Disparate Treatment....4805
3. Action Reversed but Some Charges Sustained....4805
4. Unreasonable Litigation Tactics; Failure to Settle....4805
a. Frivolous PFR....4805
5. Enforcement....4806
E. CLEARLY WITHOUT MERIT OR WHOLLY UNFOUNDED....4806
1. Factual Dispute....4806
2. Failure to Adhere to Legal Precedent....4808
3. Inadequate Initial Inquiry Into Facts....4809
4. Lack of Legitimate Basis for Agency Action....4809
a. Development of Dispositive Information During Appeal....4809
5. Mitigation....4809
6. Performance Appeal....4810
7. Retirement Appeal....4810
a. Legal Error by OPM....4813
b. Incorrect Advice From OPM....4814
c. Issue of Mental Incompetence....4814
F. KNEW OR SHOULD HAVE KNOWN....4816
1. Lack of Reasonable Inquiry....4817
2. Disregard of Legal Precedent....4818
3. Regulatory Error....4818
4. Reduction in Force....4818
5. Performance-Based Action....4819
6. Mitigation....4819
a. Not All Charges Sustained....4824
7. Negligent Presentation of Case....4825
8. Decision of Another Tribunal....4825
9. Retirement Appeal....4825
a. Failure of OPM to Evaluate Evidence Available During Reconsideration Process; Hearing Evidence....4825
b. Legal Error by OPM....4828
10. Settlement....4829
G. GROSS PROCEDURAL ERROR....4829
1. Denial of Advance Notice or Appeal Rights....4832
a. Involuntary or Constructive Adverse Action....4833
b. Enforced Leave....4833
c. Indefinite or Emergency Suspension....4835
2. Mitigation....4835
3. Performance-Based Action....4835
4. Reduction in Force....4835
H. SUBSTANTIALLY INNOCENT....4836
1. *Yorkshire*....4838
2. Board Treatment of *Yorkshire*....4839
3. Appellant Who Ensnares Agency....4840
4. Mitigation: *Boese*, *VanFossen*....4840

a. Factually Close Case....4844
b. Prior Law....4844
5. Performance-Based Appeal; Medical Inability to Perform....4845
6. Other Legal Error....4845
I. OTHER AUTHORITY FOR FEE AWARDS....4846
1. Back Pay Act....4846
a. Postal Service Employee....4846
2. Equal Access to Justice Act....4848
a. Administrative Law Judge Case....4850
b. Basis for Compensating Court Time....4851
c. Prevailing Party....4852
d. Substantial Justification....4858
e. Bad Faith; Common Fund....4862
f. Basis for Awarding Board Time....4862
g. Hourly Rate; *Pro Bono* or Contingent Representation; COLA; Expenses....4863
h. Procedure; Time for Filing; Application....4865
i. Application to Board Cases....4866
3. Civil Rights Case....4867
a. Result Achieved....4870
4. Prohibited Personnel Practice Case....4870
5. USERRA; VEOA....4871
6. Other Bases for Fee Claims; Equitable Assessment of Fee....4873
II. PROCEDURES FOR OBTAINING FEES....4873
A. HOW FEES ARE INCURRED....4873
1. Attorney-Client Status; Fee Payment....4873
a. Law Clerk, Paraprofessional; *Pro Se* Appellant....4874
2. Union Counsel....4875
a. Demise of Cost-Plus Formula....4875
b. History of Cost-Plus Rule....4878
c. Repayment of Fees to Union....4879
3. Federally Employed Attorney....4879
4. Public Interest Organization....4880
B. COMPENSABLE SERVICES....4880
1. Work Performed Before Final Adverse Action or Other Decision....4880
2. Research....4883
3. Discovery....4883
4. Settlement, Mediation....4883
5. PFR....4883
6. OPM Reconsideration Petition....4883
7. Preparation of Fee Motion....4885
8. Defense of Fee Motion....4885
9. Enforcement Proceeding....4886
10. Related Proceeding....4891
a. Board....4892
b. Grievance....4893
c. Privacy Act....4893
d. Unemployment Compensation....4893
e. Criminal Case....4893
f. EEO Complaint....4894
g. Media Contact; Congressional Activity....4896
11. Anticipated Time; Supplemental Petition....4896
12. Unsuccessful Claim, Issue, or Defense; Limited Success....4896
a. *Hensley*....4896
b. Mitigation....4903
c. Tangentially Related Issue....4905
d. Clearly Separate Claim....4905
e. Unsuccessful EEO Claim....4906
f. Unsuccessful Whistleblower Claim....4907
13. Time in Court....4908
a. Appropriate Charge for Court Time....4911
b. Practice Notes....4912

C. REASONABLENESS OF FEES 4912
1. Hourly Rate 4912
a. Evidence of Reasonableness; Fee Agreement; Result Achieved 4914
b. Initial Decision in Another Appeal; Decision of Another Tribunal 4921
c. Settlement 4921
d. Out-Of-Town Counsel 4921
e. Travel Time 4922
2. Contingency Arrangement, Enhancement; *City of Burlington* 4922
a. Early Treatment by Board of Contingent Adjustments 4925
b. Enhancement for Payment Delay; Interest 4926
c. Enhancement for Quality Work 4929
d. Enhancement for Wear and Tear 4931
e. Traditional Contingency Agreement; Fee Cap 4931
f. Flat Fee Arrangement 4932
3. *Laffey* Matrix 4932
4. Below Market Rate 4937
5. Reasonableness of Time Invested 4941
a. Responsibility of Judge 4941
b. Articulated Analysis Required 4944
c. Notice to Counsel of Defect in Fee Motion 4945
d. Record Review 4946
e. Time at Hearing 4947
f. PFR 4947
g. *Amicus* Brief 4947
h. Time Preparing Fee Motion 4948
i. Consolidated Appeals 4948
j. Expertise and Diligence of Counsel; Likely Outcome 4948
k. Multiple Counsel; Duplicative Work 4948
l. Clerical, Secretarial Work 4951
6. Examples of Fee Awards 4952
a. Rates 4952
b. Amounts 4952
D. COSTS AND EXPENSES 4953
1. Transcript 4954
2. Photocopy; Electronic Production 4954
3. Travel 4954
4. Secretarial Expense 4955
5. Postage; Courier 4955
6. Expert, Consultant 4955
7. Investigator 4955
8. Accounting Expense 4956
9. Telephone or Facsimile 4956
10. Electronic Research 4956
11. Taxes 4957
12. EEO, Whistleblower Protection Act, USERRA, and VEOA Cases; Broader Coverage 4957
13. Direct Recovery of Costs by Appellants 4958
E. FEE MOTION 4960
1. Who May File 4961
2. Time and Place of Filing 4961
a. Premature Motion 4962
b. Timing of Agency Response 4962
c. Late Motion 4962
3. Motion Must Be Complete When Filed 4966
a. Incomplete Motion 4967
4. Developing Evidence to Support Motion 4967
a. Hearing Concerning Fee Entitlement in Settled Appeal 4967
b. Hearing and Discovery Concerning Reasonableness 4969
5. Format of Motion 4969
a. What to Include 4970
b. Fee Agreement 4971
c. Itemization of Time 4971

d. Retrospective Reconstruction of Time 4972
6. Supplemental or Corrected Motion 4973
7. Unopposed, Moot, or Settled Motion 4973
8. Service of Motion 4974
9. Opposition to Motion 4974
10. Initial Decision on Motion 4974
a. Obligation of Judge to Ensure Due Process 4974
b. Requirements of Addendum Initial Decision 4975
c. Merits Decision Controls Basis for Fee Determination 4975
d. Change in Judge 4976
e. Hourly Rate Analysis 4977
11. Waiver of Fee Through Settlement Agreement 4977
a. Effect of Settlement on Claims of Multiple Counsel 4978
12. Settlement of Fee Claim 4979
13. Payment of Fee to Counsel and Client 4980
a. Payment to Counsel 4980
b. Repayment of Fee by Counsel to Client 4981
14. PFR of Fee Decision 4981
a. Interim Fee 4981
b. Time Spent on PFR 4981

CHAPTER 20: SETTLEMENT 4983

I. SETTLEMENT PROCEDURES; ELEMENTS OF SETTLEMENTS 4983
A. REGULATORY PROCESS 4985
1. Settlement Resources; Mediation Appeals Program 4986
B. MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS 4987
1. Hatch Act Case 4988
C. FILING, ACCEPTANCE OF SETTLEMENT FOR ENFORCEMENT 4988
1. Intent That Agreement Be Subject to Board Enforcement Authority 4988
2. Unfiled Settlement 4991
3. Oral Advice of Settlement 4991
4. Specific Oral Settlement Agreement Entered Into Record 4994
5. Distinguishing Oral Agreement and Ongoing or Incomplete Negotiation 4998
6. Oral Agreement to Be Followed by Written Agreement 5001
7. Appellant's Understanding of Agreement 5003
8. Settlement After Initial Decision 5003
D. JURISDICTION TO ACCEPT SETTLEMENT: *DELORME* 5004
1. Prior Law 5005
2. Settlement Arising From Disputed Last Chance Agreement 5009
E. FLEXIBILITY, SCOPE OF SETTLEMENT 5010
1. Incomplete Settlement; Omitted Terms 5010
2. Regulatory Limitations 5012
F. CONDITIONAL SETTLEMENT; LAPSED OFFER; IMPLICIT TERM 5012
G. SETTLEMENT REQUIRING SPECIFIC ACTION BY JUDGE 5015
H. INTEGRATION OR "ZIPPER" CLAUSE 5016
I. MODIFICATION, AMENDMENT OF AGREEMENT 5021
J. WAIVER OF STATUTORY RIGHT; RELEASE 5021
1. Unemployment Compensation 5023
2. Workers' Compensation 5024
3. Older Workers' Benefit Protection Act 5024
4. RIF Benefit 5033
5. Limitation on Right to Seek Future Federal Employment 5034
K. RETIREMENT BENEFIT 5034
L. SETTLEMENT PROVISION AFFECTING OTHER AGENCIES 5035
M. OSC CASE 5035
II. SETTING ASIDE A SETTLEMENT 5036
A. AGREEMENT CHALLENGED AS INVALID; USE OF PFR 5037
B. TIMING OF PFR 5039
C. BASES FOR SETTING ASIDE A SETTLEMENT 5040
1. Threat of Unwarranted Action; Duress 5042
2. Hardship 5044

3. Disappointment; Confusion 5045
4. Lack of Understanding 5045
5. Mental Incapacity; Stress 5046
6. Time Pressure 5049
7. Coercion or Bias by Judge 5049
8. Coercion by Counsel or Union Representative; Lack of Signature by Counsel 5054
9. Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant's Counsel or Union Representative—Agreement Sustained 5057
10. Error or Lack of Authority of Appellant's Counsel or Union Representative—*Bona Fide* Challenge to Agreement 5060
11. Error or Lack of Authority of Government Counsel 5064
12. Fraud; Misrepresentation; Bad Faith; Merit of Underlying Action 5065
13. Mutual, Unilateral Mistake 5071
14. Lack of Mutual Assent 5078
15. Lack of Consideration 5081
16. Incorrect Information From Agency Concerning Retirement Eligibility 5082
17. Provision Unlawful or Contrary to Public Policy 5082
18. Change in Law 5088
D. PARTIAL INVALIDITY 5088
E. UNFILED SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT; PREAPPEAL SETTLEMENT 5089
F. COLLATERAL ATTACK ON SETTLEMENT THROUGH NEW APPEAL 5091
G. BREACH OF SETTLEMENT: ELECTION BETWEEN RESCISSION OR ENFORCEMENT 5092
1. Agency May Rescind 5093
2. Restoration of Consideration Received; "Tender Back" 5094
3. Enforcement Petition to Rescind Settlement; Late PFR Raising Enforcement Issue 5096

CHAPTER 21: REMEDIES 5099

I. APPELLATE REMEDIES 5099
A. REMEDIAL AUTHORITY 5099
1. Statutory Basis 5099
2. OPM Regulation 5099
3. Collateral Result of Restoration Order; Action Related to Appeal 5099
a. Effect on Remedial Order of Decision of Another Tribunal 5104
b. Reversal of Criminal Conviction 5105
B. BACK PAY AND RELATED REMEDIES 5105
1. Necessary Findings 5106
2. Pay Entitlement: Ready, Willing, and Able to Work 5106
a. Effect of Disability Retirement 5112
3. Maximum Recovery Period 5114
a. Liability for Event Preceding Adverse Action 5114
4. Method of Payment 5114
5. Method of Calculation 5114
6. Reinstatement With No or Limited Pay; Time-Served or Other Suspension; Shortened Notice Period 5115
a. After-Acquired Evidence 5116
7. Bonus or Award; Differential; Relocation Expense 5117
8. Premium, Overtime, Holiday Pay 5118
a. Overtime for Postal Service Employee 5123
9. Interest—Back Pay Act 5124
a. Interest—Postal Service Employee 5128
10. Insurance Benefit 5129
11. Retirement, TSP Contribution or Loan 5129
12. Leave Account; FMLA; Military Leave 5134
13. Leave Restoration for Board, Related Proceedings; Compensatory Time; Official Time 5138
14. Interim Promotion; WIGI; Pay Increase 5140
15. Loss of Security Clearance 5144
16. Applicant for Employment 5145
17. Federal Aviation Administration Employee 5146
C. DUTY TO MITIGATE BACK PAY THROUGH INTERIM EMPLOYMENT 5146
1. Employee Other Than Postal Service 5146
2. Postal Service Employee 5146
D. DEDUCTIONS FROM BACK PAY 5148
1. Retirement, TSP Contribution 5149
2. Debt to Retirement Fund 5150

3. Annuity Entitlement or Adjustment....5151
4. Union Dues; Insurance; Medicare....5151
5. Taxes; Increased Taxes....5156
6. Unemployment, OWCP, Workers' Compensation....5158
7. Interim Earnings; Job Search, Relocation Cost; Replacement Earnings; Retirement Income; Fraudulent Earnings Information....5161
8. Other Deductions....5164
E. RETRAINING....5165
F. REEMPLOYMENT RIGHT....5165
G. PURGING OF RECORDS; MODIFICATION OF DOCUMENTATION, PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL....5166
1. Coding of Personnel Document....5169
2. Adjustment to AWOL Charge....5169
II. DAMAGES; REGULATION GOVERNING RECOVERY....5170
A. AVAILABILITY OF COMPENSATORY DAMAGES....5173
B. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES—CIVIL RIGHTS ACTS....5179
1. Effect of Receipt of FECA and Insurance Benefits....5189
2. Pecuniary Damages....5190
C. CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES AND COSTS—WHISTLEBLOWER CASE....5191
D. COMPENSATORY DAMAGES—WHISTLEBLOWER CASE....5200
1. Adverse Actions....5207
E. DAMAGES UNDER VEOA, USERRA....5208
F. MONETARY RELIEF FOR PROHIBITED PERSONNEL PRACTICES NOT COVERED BY WPA OR EEO LAW....5209
G. PUNITIVE DAMAGES....5212
H. TAXATION OF DAMAGES, ATTORNEY FEES....5213
III. NONTRADITIONAL REMEDIES....5214
A. WAIVER OF DEBT....5214
B. APOLOGY; EVIDENCE DESTRUCTION....5214
C. PROTECTION AGAINST INTERVENING EVENT....5214
1. Protection Against Future Event....5215
D. FRONT PAY....5215
E. EQUITABLE RELIEF; OTHER REMEDIES....5215

CHAPTER 22: ENFORCEMENT....5219

I. ENFORCEMENT OF BOARD DECISION....5219
A. AUTHORITY TO ORDER COMPLIANCE....5220
1. Sanction Against Agency....5221
B. AUTHORITY TO AWARD BACK PAY OR MONETARY REMEDY....5223
1. Mootness....5225
2. Burden of Proof; Proof of Compliance....5226
C. ENFORCEMENT PROCEDURE....5227
1. Enforcement Petition Regulation, Guidance....5228
2. Time for Initiating Enforcement....5230
3. Agency Request for Extension of Time....5234
4. Duty to Supply Information; Accounting....5234
5. Unclear or Impossible Compliance....5237
6. Evidence of Compliance; Statement of Intent; Representative's Statement; Reargument of Merits....5237
7. Hearing....5238
8. Discovery....5239
9. Referral to Comptroller General....5240
10. Multiple Enforcement Petitions; *Res Judicata*....5240
11. Analysis by Judge....5242
12. Evidence Supplied After Decision of Judge....5242
13. Board Review of Initial Decision on Enforcement....5242
D. ALLEGATION OF REPRISAL, BAD FAITH, DISCRIMINATION, OR HARASSMENT....5245
1. Discipline Related to Agency Noncompliance....5246
2. Performance Appraisal Dispute....5246
3. Remedy Limited to "Forward-Looking Relief"; But-For Analysis....5247
E. BACK PAY DISPUTE....5248
1. Delay in Payment....5250
2. Damages....5251
F. REINSTATEMENT TO SAME POSITION; *STATUS QUO ANTE* REMEDY....5251

1. Medical Limitation 5255
2. Effect of Retirement 5256
3. Obligation Under Collective Bargaining Contract 5257
4. Other Post-Reinstatement Action; Medical Certification Requirement 5257
5. Postal Service Reorganization 5258
6. Security Clearance Problem 5259
7. Demotion 5261
8. Term or Temporary Appointment 5269
9. Seniority Adjustment 5271
10. Pay System Change 5272
11. Insurance 5272
12. Other Working Conditions 5272
G. COMPELLING REASON FOR REASSIGNMENT; DETAIL; DIFFERENT DUTIES 5273
1. Replacement Employee 5274
2. Placement on Administrative Leave Pending Subsequent Removal Attempt 5274
3. Detail or Other Variation of Permanent Position 5275
4. Reasons Related to Original Action 5276
5. Intervening Abolition of Position 5276
6. Intervening Adverse Action 5278
7. Overriding Interest 5279
H. REINSTATEMENT WITH ACCOMMODATION FOR DISABILITY 5287
I. LACK OF AUTHORITY TO ENFORCE COMPLIANCE 5291
J. SOVEREIGN IMMUNITY ISSUE 5291
II. ENFORCEMENT AND INTERPRETATION OF SETTLEMENT AGREEMENTS 5291
A. SCOPE OF ENFORCEMENT AUTHORITY 5293
1. Only Filed Settlement May Be Enforced 5294
a. Settlement Enforceable in Different Forum 5295
2. Allegation of Discrimination; Whistleblowing Reprisal 5295
3. Damages 5297
B. AGENCY ENFORCEMENT INITIATIVE 5297
1. Agreement to Resign or to Take Other Action; Agency Self Help 5298
2. Agreement Not to Reapply for Employment 5299
3. Agreement to Withdraw EEOC Case or Other Litigation 5300
C. AGREEMENT THAT APPELLANT FIRST NOTIFY AGENCY OF NONCOMPLIANCE 5301
1. Agreement That Parties Attempt to Adjust Disputes 5301
D. ELECTION BETWEEN ENFORCEMENT AND RESCISSION; PLEADING IN ALTERNATIVE 5302
1. Modification of Settlement Provision 5303
E. ROLE OF BOARD REGIONAL OR FIELD OFFICE 5304
1. Treatment of Enforcement Issue; Evidence on PFR 5304
F. TIME FOR COMPLIANCE IF NONE SET IN SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT 5304
G. TIME FOR INITIATING ENFORCEMENT 5306
1. Reasonableness of Timing of Enforcement; Laches Defense 5311
H. BURDEN OF PROOF 5314
1. Evidence Required 5317
I. MUTUAL BREACH; "CLEAN HANDS" 5318
J. INTERPRETATION AND APPLICATION OF SETTLEMENT: LEGAL PRINCIPLES 5319
1. Materiality of Breach 5320
2. Good Faith Required; Bad Faith 5327
K. INTERPRETATION OF AGREEMENT: EXTERNAL LAW; EXTRINSIC OR PAROL EVIDENCE; AMBIGUOUS TERM; HISTORY OF PERFORMANCE; HEARING 5331
1. Back Pay, Other Obligation; Omitted Term; Accounting 5337
2. Amendment to Agreement; Counterproposal 5340
L. SPECIFIC SETTLEMENT PROVISIONS 5340
1. Term of Art 5340
2. Obligation to Reinstate or Restore to Duty; Precondition to Restoration 5341
3. Agreement to "Cancel" Action; Back Pay, Interest, Damages, or Other Entitlement; Bonus or Award; Lump Sum Provision 5343
4. Agreement to Reassign; Work Schedule Change; Light Duty Position; Duration of Agency's Commitment 5348
5. Employee May Be Terminated or Will Resign or Retire on Specified Condition; Agreement Not to Reapply 5351
6. Promotion, Placement Consideration; Priority Consideration 5353
7. Agreement to Provide Affirmative, Neutral, or Controlled Reference 5357

8. "Clean Record" or "Clean Paper"; Expungement or Withdrawal of Record; Implicit Requirement; NDAA; E.O. 13839; E.O. 14003; E.O. 14148 5365
9. Nondisclosure or Confidentiality Clause 5382
a. "Need to Know" Exception to Confidentiality Clause 5390
10. Whistleblower Protection Enhancement Act Provision 5394
11. Waiver of Protection of Confidentiality or Affirmative Reference Provision 5394
12. Adjustment of Performance Appraisal, Documentation 5395
13. Agreement to Provide Assistance to Employee 5397
14. Annuity Issues 5397
15. Unemployment Compensation 5403
M. DEBT RECOUPMENT 5403
N. SETTLEMENT REACHED IN ANOTHER TRIBUNAL 5404
O. SETTLEMENT INVOLVING ACTION OF THIRD PARTY 5404
P. ENFORCEMENT ONLY THROUGH EEO PROCEDURES 5404
Q. PRIVACY ACT ISSUE 5404
R. PROVISION THAT VIOLATES COLLECTIVE BARGAINING CONTRACT 5405
S. UNLAWFUL PROVISION 5405
T. DAMAGES UNAVAILABLE FOR BREACH OF CLAUSE REQUIRING AFFIRMATIVE REFERENCE, OTHER VIOLATIONS 5406
U. REPRISAL OR HARASSMENT 5408
1. Foreclosure of Future Discipline or Other Agency Action for Past Conduct 5411

CHAPTER 23: SANCTIONS 5415
I. FAILURE TO RESPOND TO APPEAL 5417
A. DEFAULT JUDGMENT 5417
II. FAILURE TO PROSECUTE APPEAL 5418
A. DISMISSAL WARRANTED 5419
1. Failure to Provide Basis for Appeal 5421
2. Failure to Designate Representative 5421
3. Failure to Comply With Judge's Order 5422
B. DISMISSAL UNWARRANTED 5424
1. Failure to Attend Hearing 5425
2. Inadvertent or Isolated Failure to Obey Judge's Orders 5426
3. Medical, Mental Impairment 5428
4. Late Appeal 5428
III. FAILURE TO COOPERATE IN DISCOVERY 5428
A. SANCTION AGAINST AGENCY 5429
1. Material in Control of Third Party 5432
B. SANCTION AGAINST APPELLANT 5433
IV. FAILURE TO FOLLOW PREHEARING OR HEARING PROCEDURES 5436
A. SANCTION AGAINST APPELLANT; PREJUDICE TO AGENCY 5437
B. SANCTION AGAINST AGENCY 5439

CHAPTER 24: JUDICIAL REVIEW 5441
I. OVERVIEW OF REVIEW PROCESS 5441
A. ELEMENTS OF REVIEW 5441
1. Final Decision 5441
a. Denial of Request for Reopening 5445
b. Collateral Board Order 5448
c. Decision Remanding Case to Judge 5449
2. Statutory Basis for Review 5450
3. Whistleblower Cases 5452
a. Whistleblower Reprisal: Circuits Other Than Federal Circuit 5452
4. Proper Parties in Court; Standing; Mootness 5453
a. Proper Respondent in Court 5455
b. OSC Disciplinary Case 5459
c. Arbitration Award 5460
5. *Amicus* Submission 5462
6. Government Appellate Review Request; Cross-Appeal 5462
a. Review Request by OPM 5463
b. Discrimination Issue 5464
7. Federal Circuit 5465

a. Nonprecedential Decision....5466
b. Summary Affirmation....5468
c. Court Practice....5468
d. Counsel Authorized to Appear in Appeal; Federal Circuit Admission....5472
e. *Pro Se* Appeal....5472
f. Appointment of Counsel....5473
g. Stay Pending Court Review....5473
8. Record and Issues Below....5473
a. Appendix....5475
b. New and Material Evidence....5475
B. SCOPE OF REVIEW....5476
1. Arbitrary and Capricious; Abuse of Discretion....5477
2. Issues of Law, Jurisdiction; Constitutional Issues....5478
a. Decisional Rationale Omitted by Board; Departure From Precedent....5479
3. Procedural Error by Board....5482
a. Ruling on Witnesses and Evidence....5482
b. Ruling on Discovery....5483
c. Timeliness of Board Filing....5485
4. Substantial Evidence; Factual Dispute....5485
a. Credibility....5490
b. Nexus....5494
5. Agency Rule of Conduct....5494
6. Penalty Determination....5494
a. Penalty Table....5497
b. Not All Charges Sustained....5497
c. Application of *Douglas* Mitigating Factors....5499
d. Performance Action....5500
7. Reduction in Force....5500
8. Retirement Appeals....5501
a. Disability Retirement....5502
b. Optional Retirement....5510
C. DEFERENCE; INTERPRETATION OF STATUTES, REGULATIONS, LABOR AND OTHER CONTRACTS....5510
1. Agency Statutory Interpretation....5510
a. Regulation Applying Statute; Agency Interpretation of Regulation....5514
2. Agency Handbook, Instruction....5519
3. Board Decision....5521
4. Principles of Statutory and Regulatory Interpretation....5521
a. Language Controls....5522
b. Consideration of Statutory Scheme....5526
c. Avoidance of Absurd Consequences....5527
d. Statements of Legislators....5528
e. Amendment; Failure to Amend....5528
f. Retroactivity....5528
g. Change in Law....5533
5. Interpretation of Collective Bargaining Contract....5534
6. Settlement; Last Chance Agreement....5535
D. DISCRIMINATION ISSUES....5538
1. Review of Board Decisions That Include EEO Defenses or Both EEO and Whistleblower Reprisal Defenses....5542
2. Reprisal....5544
a. Individual Right of Action....5546
3. Jurisdictional Issue; Constructive Adverse Action; *Perry*....5547
4. Timeliness, Procedural Issue; *Kloeckner*....5554
a. Nonmonetary Conditions Imposed By Arbitrator....5560
5. Attorney Fees Award, Application....5560
6. Transfer To and From District Courts....5561
7. District Court Review....5562
a. Time for District Court Review; Tolling or Estoppel....5565
b. Effect of Waiver of EEO Claim....5566
c. Exhaustion of Administrative Remedies....5566
d. Summary Adjudication of EEO Issues; Disposition of Civil Service Issues....5569
e. Scope of Review....5571

f. Compliance With District Court Decision 5572
8. Discharge of Probationer 5572
E. REVIEW OF ARBITRATION AWARDS 5574
1. Mixed Case 5577
2. Time for Seeking Review 5583
3. Decisional Standards for Arbitrator 5584
a. Arbitrability 5589
b. Bargaining History 5590
c. Past Practice 5590
d. *Functus Officio*; Interim Award 5592
4. Attorney Fees Award 5593
5. Review Sought by OPM 5594
6. Award Involving Department of Veterans Affairs Title 38 Employee 5595
7. Award Involving Nonappropriated Fund Instrumentality Employee 5597
8. Award Reviewed by Federal Labor Relations Authority 5597
F. VEOA, USERRA CLAIMS 5598
II. PREREQUISITES FOR JUDICIAL REVIEW 5598
A. TIME FOR OBTAINING REVIEW 5598
1. Equitable Tolling 5603
B. EXHAUSTION OF BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE REMEDIES 5609
1. Issue Must Be Raised With Board 5609
a. Exception to Exhaustion Requirement 5611
2. Necessity for PFR to Board 5613
a. Challenge to Settlement 5615
3. Ripeness for Judicial Review 5615
a. Denial of IRA Stay 5617
III. JUDICIAL REMEDIAL AUTHORITY 5617
A. AUTHORITY TO REMAND 5617
1. Remand to Effect Settlement 5619
2. Judicial Control of Board Procedures 5619
B. MANDAMUS 5619
C. AUTHORITY TO TRANSFER 5620
D. SANCTIONS 5621
1. Examples of Sanctionable Conduct 5623
IV. JUDICIAL RELIEF OUTSIDE REFORM ACT 5625
A. PARTIES TO SUIT 5629
1. Sovereign Immunity 5630
2. Absolute Immunity 5630
3. Qualified Immunity 5630
a. Action Against Union 5630
B. SUITS BASED ON STATUTE AND CONSTITUTION 5630
1. Administrative Procedure Act 5630
a. Use of APA 5631
b. Scope of Review; Preclusive Effect of Reform Act 5632
c. Scope of Relief 5635
2. Privacy Act 5635
a. Scope of Statute 5637
b. Enforcement of Statute 5637
c. Use of Statute 5637
d. Position Classification 5638
3. Mandamus Act 5639
a. Position Classification 5639
4. Tucker Act 5642
a. Position Classification 5648
b. Overtime Pay Claim 5649
c. Environmental Differential, Hazard Pay, Travel Pay 5650
d. Claims Concerning Tenure, Contract Employment, Promotion, and Bonuses 5652
e. Whistleblower Reprisal Claim 5657
f. Claims Based on Constitution 5659
g. EEO Settlement 5661
h. Board Settlement 5666

5. Federal Tort Claims Act 5668
6. Back Pay Act 5670
a. Implied Preclusion Under CSRA 5673
b. Promotion Claim 5674
7. Family Medical Leave Act 5674
8. Overtime, Pay Statutes 5675
9. Unfair Labor Practice 5677
10. Constitution 5677
a. Property Interest 5678
b. Liberty Interest; Name Clearing Hearing 5680
(i) Termination of Probationer 5681
c. First Amendment 5682
11. Injunction Action 5684
C. ACTIONS FOR DAMAGES AGAINST INDIVIDUALS AND GOVERNMENT; *BIVENS* 5691
1. Preclusion in Circuit Courts 5695
a. D.C. Circuit 5695
b. First Circuit 5698
c. Second Circuit 5698
d. Third Circuit 5698
e. Fourth Circuit 5699
f. Fifth Circuit 5699
g. Sixth Circuit 5700
h. Seventh Circuit 5700
i. Eighth Circuit 5701
j. Ninth Circuit 5701
k. Tenth Circuit 5703
l. Eleventh Circuit 5704
2. Claims Based on State Law; Westfall Act; Federal Tort Claims Act; Defamation; Tort Action Arising From Assault; No FEAR Act; Religious Freedom Restoration Act; FECA 5704

CHAPTER 25: RESEARCH, REFERENCE MATERIALS, AND FORMS 5711

I. RESEARCH AND REFERENCES 5711
II. FORMS 5712

BIBLIOGRAPHY 5733

TABLE OF CASES 5741

INDEX 5923